**Determination and reduced life expectancy model and molecular docking
analyses of estrogenic potentials of 17 β -estradiol, bisphenol A and nonylphenol
on expression of vitellogenin gene (*vtgI*) in zebrafish**

Hualong Chen ^a, Ling Zhao ^{a,*}, Qiming Jimmy Yu ^b

^a *School of Environment, Jinan University, Guangzhou 511443, China.*

^b *School of Engineering and Built Environment, Griffith University, Nathan Campus,
Brisbane, Queensland 4111, Australia.*

*** Corresponding Author**

E-mail address: zhaoling@jnu.edu.cn

Abstract:

This study determined and evaluated the estrogenic potentials on hepatic vitellogenin gene (*vtg1*) of adult male zebrafish which were exposed to low level concentrations (ng/L-μg/L levels) of individual and binary mixtures of 17β-estradiol (E_2), bisphenol A (BPA) and nonylphenol (NP) through the use of reduced life expectancy (RLE) model and molecular docking analysis. The order of in vivo estrogenic potentials of individual and binary exposure of E_2 , BPA and NP was as follows: $E_2+BPA > E_2 > E_2+NP > BPA > BPA+NP >>> NP$. Binary mixtures of E_2 , BPA and NP had weak synergistic effects under the exposure concentration ranges. With the expression of hepatic *vtg1* gene, the hepatic toxicity was analyzed by using the RLE model. All plots of the linear RLE model had negative slopes indicating that EC_{50} was negatively correlated with the natural logarithm of exposure time ($\ln ET_{50}$). The RLE model analyses can be useful to evaluate the exposure time effects of zebrafish by using EC_{50} as toxicity endpoint. Molecular docking analysis revealed that the interaction potential of E_2 (Binding energy: -10.1 kcal/mol) for the zebrafish $ER\alpha$ -LBD was the most potent (stable), followed by BPA (-8.0 kcal/mol) and NP (-6.8 kcal/mol). Molecular docking analysis can be useful to understand interactive effects of E_2 , BPA and NP.

Keywords:

Reduced life expectancy model; Molecular docking analysis; Estrogenic potential; Bisphenol A; Nonylphenol; Zebrafish.

1. Introduction

Estrogenic effects of environmental chemicals on organisms and humans have become a serious health risk concern around the world (Yamamoto et al., 2001; Renou et al., 2008; Clarke et al., 2015). It has been reported that xenoestrogens, such as bisphenol A (BPA) and nonylphenol (NP) are widely found in water, soil, municipal sewage and landfill leachate (Soares et al., 2008; Villeneuve et al., 2012). Among them, landfill leachate can infiltrate the groundwater and therefore cause environmental pollution (Liu et al., 2015). Studies have indicated that both BPA and NP were detected at the same time in groundwater contaminated by landfill leachate (Buszka et al., 2009). Due to their low water solubilities and high octanol–water partition coefficients, xenoestrogens tend to be relative stable in the environment (Meylan et al., 1999; Ying et al., 2002). Even at the low concentrations (ng/L–μg/L levels), they can have serious consequences for human and wildlife endocrine systems (Hernando et al., 2006). Therefore, it is important to study the estrogen effects of low concentrations of BPA and NP on organisms and to evaluate the potential risks of landfill leachate to the environment.

The *vgt* genes (mainly *vgt1*) produce vitellogenin (VTG) in zebrafish hepatocytes by transcriptional expression, which can be used as a biomarker to appraise the effect of endocrine disrupters (Teta and Naik, 2017; Chen et al., 2018). Research indicates that individual exposures of chemical induce the expression of *vgt1* gene and the plasma VTG in male zebrafish, and, the *vgt1* gene can response quickly to exposure (Van den Belt et al., 2003; Jin et al., 2009b; Yamaguchi et al., 2015). Studies have

shown that the mixture of xenoestrogens has combined effects on the zebrafish *vtg1* gene (Urbatzka et al., 2012), but the nature of the combined effects of the mixtures based on the low concentrations (ng/L- μ g/L levels) and the contributions of the molecular structure of each compound in the mixture to the combined effect, as well as the effect of the length of the exposure periods have rarely been reported.

BPA and NP often produce estrogen effects on organisms in low concentrations and long periods, so it is necessary to evaluate the impact of this situation over the life expectancy of organisms. This exposure time effect is of significance in environmental risk assessment. (Verma et al., 2013) based on the influence of exposure time, established a reduced life expectancy (RLE) model to study the time response relationship in lethal toxicity. The RLE model established a relationship between the internal lethal concentration (ILC_{50}) and the natural logarithm of exposure time ($\ln LT_{50}$) with the normal life expectancy of the organism as a limiting point (Connell et al., 2016). The LC_{50} (lethal concentration) and EC_{50} (effect concentration) are often used in toxicity endpoints in various tissues, both of which are related to nominal concentrations and $\log K_{ow}$ (octanol partition coefficient) (Verma et al., 2014). By analogy, the RLE model to analyze the relationship between LC_{50} and exposure time can be extended to describe the relationship between EC_{50} and exposure time.

Molecular docking analysis is based on a new heuristic search algorithm, which can mimic the three-dimensional structure of the binding of the endocrine disruptor ligand to the $ER\alpha$ -ligand binding domain ($ER\alpha$ -LBD) (Thomsen and Christensen,

2006). Although various studies have compared the affinity difference between BPA and NP with natural estrogen E₂, they are generally based on data from in vitro experiments with recombinant yeast methods (Routledge and Sumpter, 1996). They are unable to obtain information such as the difference between the type of intermolecular interactions and the key amino acid residues used to stabilize the conformation obtained by molecular docking. On the other hand, the structure-response of BPA and NP binding with ER α should give a reasonable explanation for the concentration-response and time-response of the xenoestrogens.

In the present study, adult male zebrafish were exposed to low concentrations (ng/L- μ g/L levels) of BPA, NP together with the natural estrogen E₂ and their binary mixtures. The hepatic *vtg1* gene was used as a biomarker for exploring the concentration-time-structure response relationship. The effect of exposure periods on estrogenic effects were evaluated by using the RLE model, and molecular docking was used to evaluate the contribution of the molecular structure of each compound in the mixture. The research results are of significance for the risk assessment of endocrine disruptors in the environment.

2. Materials and methods

2.1 Experimental animals and reagents

Adult male zebrafish (approximately four months old) were exposed in semi-static system (20 L glass aquaria) using active carbon treated tap water. Renewals were conducted for each 3 days, with 100% of the water refreshed. Throughout the experiment, the water temperature was maintained at 28.5 $\pm$ 0.2 °C, the

dissolved oxygen remained at 6.5 ± 0.3 mg/L, the pH was 7.6 ± 0.5 , and the photoperiod was 14 h light and 10 h dark. The average weight and length of zebrafish were 0.190 ± 0.003 g and 2.220 ± 0.005 cm. The zebrafish were fed twice daily with estrogen-free frozen brine shrimp at 4% (w/w) body weight. The zebrafish were housed in the above-mentioned condition for at least 15-day during the pre-exposure period. E₂ (98% purity), BPA (98% purity) and NP (98% purity) were purchased from Sigma–Aldrich.

2.2 Single compound exposure experiments

The zebrafish were exposed to each compound individually at the following conditions, E₂ (2.5, 5, 10, 25, 50 ng/L), BPA (25, 50, 100, 250, 500 µg/L), or NP (0.25, 0.5, 1, 2.5, 5 µg/L) via waterborne, semi-static renewal exposure for five exposure periods (3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days). The exposure concentrations were set with reference to the detection levels of BPA and NP in landfill leachates. The concentrations of BPA in landfill leachates of Japan ranged from 1.3–17,200 µg/L (Yamamoto et al., 2001); The concentrations of NP in landfill leachates collected in Sweden ranged from 0.1–7.3 µg/L (Kalmykova et al., 2013). E₂ has a short half-life and it is not the main pollutant in the landfill leachate. Its exposure concentrations were set with reference to the detection levels of E₂ in sewage treatment plants. The concentrations of E₂ in influents of Japanese STPs ranged from 3.2–55 ng/L (Nasu et al., 2001).

2.3 Binary exposure experiments

Concentrations of binary mixtures of E₂, BPA and NP were added at proportions of the average of each respective EC₅₀ of individual exposure at the five exposure

periods (3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days). In order to unify the TU ratio of individual compound in combined exposure solutions by the Toxic Unit (TU) method (Son et al., 2016), we used the EC_{50} of NP of 5 $\mu\text{g/L}$, and the nominal concentration of NP in combined exposure solutions was obtained accordingly. Five different concentrations for binary mixtures of E_2 , BPA and NP were prepared at concentrations of $\Sigma 0.75\text{TU}$, $\Sigma 1.0\text{TU}$, $\Sigma 1.25\text{TU}$, $\Sigma 1.5\text{TU}$, and $\Sigma 1.75\text{TU}$ (their corresponding sums of toxic unit, ΣTU) by applying the Toxic unit (TU) approach. The data in columns 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7 of “Table 2 in the results section” correspond to the nominal concentration of single compound in combined exposure solutions. The data in columns 8 of “Table 2” correspond to the nominal concentration of the binary mixture.

2.4 Experimental conditions

One tank was used for each concentration. Control tank containing ethanol at 0.01% were set up concurrently with test tanks. The nominal concentration of E_2 , BPA, NP and their binary mixtures were re-added into the test tanks after the water refreshed for each 3 days, to maintain the concentration to be the same as those at the beginning of the experiments. At the end of each exposure period (3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days), eight fishes were randomly selected from the aquarium; six fishes were divided into three parallel controls and two fish for backup; fish were anesthetized by immersing in tricaine methane sulfonate (MS222) and then dissected, and livers were removed. The livers were frozen immediately in liquid nitrogen and dry ice until the RNA was isolated.

2.5 Zebrafish hepatic *vtg1* mRNA analysis

Total RNA was extracted from the livers of zebrafish from each of the exposed groups and the control group, according to the manufacturer's protocol. The total RNA of zebrafish liver tissue extracted by TRIzol method was measured by UV spectrophotometer. The A260/A280 ratio was 1.91 ± 0.07 , between 1.8 and 2.0, without protein and DNA contamination. Syntheses of cDNA and gene expression were conducted according to the methods described previously (Woods and Kumar, 2011). The reverse transcribed cDNA template was amplified to detect the template quality of the reverse transcription. Amplification reactions were carried out in duplicates with qPCR using SYBR Green detection according to protocols established by the manufacturer. The PCR primers were designed with Primer Premier 5.0: *vtg1* (GenBank Number of AF406784.1) forward primer 5'-AACGAACAGCGAGAAAGAGATTG-3'; reverse primer 5'-GATGGGAACAGCGACAGGA-3'; β -actin (GenBank Number of AF057040.1) forward primer 5'-GTGCTGTTTTCCCCTCCATTGTTG-3'; β -actin reverse primer 5'-GTGTCATCTTCTCTCTGTTGGCTTT-3'. The present study analyzed the melting curves of β -actin PCR product to verify that the designed primer worked well. The quantification of target gene expression was based on the comparative cycle threshold (Ct) method. The β -actin expression was used as internal control for all expression data normalization.

2.6 Reduction life expectancy (RLE) model

The linear RLE model (Verma et al., 2015) was developed with the use of the concept of reduction in life expectancy and the model equation is given below:

$$LC_{50} = [(\ln NLT_{50}) - \ln LT_{50}] / d \quad (1)$$

or

$$LC_{50} = -a \ln LT_{50} + b \quad (2)$$

where LC_{50} is the lethal concentration, LT_{50} is the exposure time, NLT_{50} is the normal life expectancy of the organism, d is a constant, a is $1/d$ and b is $\ln NLT_{50} / d$.

The nonlinear RLE model (Verma et al., 2014) was developed based on the concept that the curvature could be described by taking the LC_{50} to an exponent value

v. The nonlinear RLE model can be expressed as:

$$\ln(LT_{50}) = -a(LC_{50})^v + b \quad (3)$$

where a is a slope coefficient, b the intercept related to NLT and v the exponent for LC_{50} . The value of v is nonlinearity constant.

2.7 Molecular docking simulations

The homology model for the zebrafish $ER\alpha$ -LBD and the analysis of the interaction potential between E_2 , BPA and NP and the zebrafish $ER\alpha$ -LBD were described previously (Webb and Sali, 2014). The crystal structures of the human $ER\alpha$ -LBD (Estrogen receptor alpha ligand binding domain) were obtained from the Protein Data Bank (PDB). The human $ER\alpha$ -LBD chain B (PDB ID: 3DT3) as template were constructed a model of homologous $ER\alpha$ -LBD, and modeling structure was optimized by the molecular mechanics method. The assessment results of the zebrafish $ER\alpha$ -LBD modeling showed that no amino acids fell into outlier regions, indicating that the conformation of all amino acids was reasonable. The protein of PDB code 1JJ4 (E_2) and 3UU7 (BPA) were generated by AutoDock Tools (Huey and

Morris, 2003), while the small molecule NP structure were drawn by chemoffice and optimized using the MM2 force field. Docking produces a small molecular conformation file and analyzes it with PyMol (DeLano, 2002). The lowest affinity conformation was selected as the final solution.

Automated docking calculations were carried out by AutoDock Vina (Trott and Olson, 2010) to explore the binding modes between ER α and compounds. The crystal structure of zebrafish ER α -LBD (GenBank ID: AAK16740.1) was available in National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI). The amino acid sequences of zebrafish ER α -LBD were aligned with those of compounds to yield a readily superimposable three-dimensional model. It was calculated that the predicted binding affinities (kcal/mol) on the scoring function of AutoDock Tools (Huey and Morris, 2003). For each compound, eight independent docking runs were performed and the one with the lowest binding affinities was chosen for analysis. By the program PyMol (DeLano, 2002), the intermolecular interactions between ER α -LBD and compounds were visualized.

2.8 Statistical analysis

Prism software (GraphPad-Prism Software Inc., San Diego, CA) was used to analyze the statistical significance between the hepatic *vtg* mRNA expression and the exposure concentration and time induced by individual and combined exposure. Two-way ANOVA was performed to detect statistically significant differences between any groups. Values were considered significant when $P < 0.05$. The EC₅₀ values of hepatic *vtg* mRNA levels at the 3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days were analyzed using

SPSS software (Inc, 1994). Since the exposure time was only 15 days, the data sets available for individual and combined exposure tests were used to evaluate the linear relationship between EC_{50} and $\ln ET_{50}$ with the linear RLE model as expressed in Equation (4). The EC_{50} at the 3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days was plotted against $\ln ET_{50}$ and linear regression analysis were used to obtain the regression equation and correlation coefficient using Origin software (Microcal Software Inc., Northampton, Massachusetts, USA). Results are shown as mean $\pm$ standard error of the mean (S.E.M), unless otherwise indicated.

3. Results

3.1 relative mRNA levels of zebrafish hepatic *vtg1*

To determine the response of the *vtg1* gene and EC_{50} values to individual and binary exposure of E_2 , BPA and NP at the zebrafish levels, the relative mRNA levels of *vtg1* by q-PCR analysis were measured. Fig. 1 shows a dose-dependent increase of *vtg1* mRNA expression occurred in zebrafish following exposure to E_2 , BPA, NP and their binary mixtures for 3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days. The relative mRNA levels of *vtg1* in the E_2 +BPA ($\Sigma 1.75$ TU) (Fig. 1D) treated groups for 15 days were about 780 folds higher than that in the control group ($P < 0.001$). Compared with the control group, the *vtg1* mRNA levels increased significantly in the 5 μ g/L of NP (Fig. 1C), 25 and 50 ng/L of E_2 (Fig. 1A), 250 and 500 μ g/L of BPA (Fig. 1B), E_2 +BPA ($\Sigma 1.25$ TU and $\Sigma 1.5$ TU) (Fig. 1D), E_2 +NP ($\Sigma 1.25$ TU, $\Sigma 1.5$ TU and $\Sigma 1.75$ TU) (Fig. 1E) and BPA+NP ($\Sigma 1.25$ TU, $\Sigma 1.5$ TU and $\Sigma 1.75$ TU) (Fig. 1F) treated groups for 15 days ($P < 0.01$); the *vtg1* mRNA levels increased significantly in the E_2 +NP ($\Sigma 1.75$ TU) (Fig. 1E) and

BPA+NP ($\Sigma 1.75\text{TU}$) (Fig. 1F) treated groups for 12 days. However, there was no significant difference between other treated groups and control group ($P>0.05$). The estrogenic potentials of E_2 +BPA ($\Sigma 1.75\text{TU}$) (Fig. 1D) was the most potent, which were about 1.27, 3.14, 1.93 and 3.33 times more potent than that of 50 ng/L of E_2 (Fig. 1A), 500 $\mu\text{g/L}$ of BPA (Fig. 1B), E_2 +NP ($\Sigma 1.75\text{TU}$) (Fig. 1E) and BPA+NP ($\Sigma 1.75\text{TU}$) (Fig. 1F) for 15 days, whereas no significant estrogenic potential appeared after exposed to the various concentrations of NP (Fig. 1C).

3.2 EC_{50} values of *vtg1* mRNA expressions

The relationship between the EC_{50} values of relative *vtg1* mRNA level and the nominal concentrations (or sums of toxic units obtained from binary mixture) of E_2 , BPA, E_2 +BPA, E_2 +NP and BPA+NP was ascertained using SPSS (Inc, 1994) for Logistic probit analysis. The EC_{50} was observed for zebrafish exposed to E_2 , BPA, E_2 +BPA, E_2 +NP and BPA+NP at the 3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days (Table 2). The EC_{50} values of individual and binary exposure were found to increase at the first 3 and 6 days and then decrease at the 6, 9, 12 and 15 days. In the NP treated groups no EC_{50} values were observed, as it did not reach the LOEC of 100 $\mu\text{g/L}$ NP for *vtg1* mRNA induction (Jin et al., 2009a). Moreover, the combined toxic effects of binary mixtures of E_2 , BPA, and NP on the biomarker *vtg1* gene of zebrafish were evaluated using TU approach. The EC_{50} values for E_2 +BPA, E_2 +NP and BPA+NP for 3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days were calculated as 95 % confidence interval covers 1.0 (Table 2), respectively.

3.3 Development of RLE model based on the toxicity endpoints of EC_{50} values

Based on the EC_{50} values of *vtg1* mRNA levels exposed to different

concentrations of E₂, BPA, NP and their binary mixture for 3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days, the effect of exposure times can be further investigated by using the RLE model. Consistent with previous studies, LC₅₀ (lethal concentration) and EC₅₀ (effect concentration) are frequently used in various tissues as toxicity endpoints, which is related to nominal concentration and logK_{ow} (octanol partition coefficient) (Verma et al., 2014). And due to the ILC₅₀ is related to the LC₅₀ (Verma et al., 2015), the relationship could be extended from the IEC₅₀ to the EC₅₀. Consequently, the relationship could be extended from the LC₅₀ to the EC₅₀ in the RLE model. Based on this extension a RLE model for estrogenic effect was proposed and may be described by the equation given below:

$$EC_{50} = -a \ln ET_{50} + b \quad (4)$$

where EC₅₀ is the effective concentration, ET₅₀ is the exposure time, NLT₅₀ is the normal life expectancy of the organism, and a and b are constants as previously defined. The plots of the natural log of exposure time (lnET₅₀) against EC₅₀ in this study based on Equation (4) are shown in Fig. 2. Since the relationship between EC₅₀ and the exposure time obtained in this study is linear, the Equation (3) is not extended by analogy.

Fig. 2 indicates that relationship between toxicity endpoints (denote by EC₅₀) of E₂, BPA, E₂+BPA, E₂+NP and BPA+NP and exposure time were obtained. All plots irrespective of endocrine disrupters type had negative slopes indicating that toxicity was related to lnET₅₀ and EC₅₀ as toxicity endpoints decreased consistently in all cases. The characteristics of all plots of exposure data and calculated normal life

expectancy (NLT) with reported NLT obtained from published papers with zebrafish are listed in Table 3. The slope of E₂, BPA, E₂+BPA, E₂+NP and BPA+NP is -4.43E-9, -4.18E-5, -0.2300, -0.2217 and -0.2104, respectively. The intercept of E₂, BPA, E₂+BPA, E₂+NP and BPA+NP is 3.12E-8, 2.94E-4, 1.6358, 1.5783 and 1.4990, respectively. With data sets of E₂, BPA, E₂+BPA, E₂+NP and BPA+NP, the correlation coefficient was greater than 0.96. The reported NLT ranging from 930 to 1980 days and the calculated NLT ranging from 1123 to 1240 days in Table 3. The calculated NLT was within the reported NLT of the literature.

3.4 Molecular docking analysis of zebrafish ER α and Ligands

Zebrafish ER α sequence was selected to construct the homology model, and to analyse the interaction potential between the zebrafish ER α -LBD and E₂, BPA and NP, and to further identify the key amino acids in the zebrafish ER α that interact with E₂, BPA and NP. It can be seen from Fig. 3 that both E₂ and BPA could bind to the key amino acids through hydrogen bonds. They all could bind to the zebrafish ER α via one and more hydrogen bonds and the hydroxyl group on the phenol ring acts as the hydrogen bond donor in the zebrafish ER α -LBD. The binding pocket of E₂, BPA and NP in the ER α -LBD was a hydrophobic cavity composed of Leu79, Met83, Phe99, Ile119 and others. Table 4 lists the intermolecular interactions, the key amino acids for stabilized combination and the interaction potential of E₂, BPA and NP binding for ER α -LBD. The interaction potential of E₂ (Binding energy: -10.1 kcal/mol) for the zebrafish ER α -LBD was the most potent (stable), followed by BPA (-8.0 kcal/mol) and NP (-6.8 kcal/mol) (Table 4).

Shown in Fig. 3A is a combination of E₂ and the key amino acids of Phe99, Ile119 and others, which were formed by Van der Waals and hydrophobic stacking interactions. The phenolic hydroxyl of E₂ on one side formed hydrogen-bonded to stabilized the combination with the side chain atoms of the key amino acids of Arg89 and Glu48 (polar residue). Shown in Fig. 3B is a combination of BPA and the key amino acids of Leu79, Met83 and others, which were formed by Van der Waals and hydrophobic stacking interactions. The docking simulation revealed that BPA adopted a binding mode with one phenol rings to the key amino acids of Arg89 on one side, which has a Pi-sigma interaction to stabilized combination. Also, the phenolic hydroxyl of BPA on one side was hydrogen-bonded to the N atom of Ala45 (non-polar residue) skeleton and the O atom of Leu41 (non-polar residue) skeleton, in order to stabilized the combination. Shown in Fig. 3C is a combination of NP and the key amino acids of which were formed by Van der Waals and hydrophobic stacking interactions. However, it shows no stronger hydrogen-bonded and Pi-sigma interactions and its binding capacity in three ligands was the weakest.

4. Discussions

4.1 Effect difference of *vtg1* mRNA induction

Relative mRNA expressions of *vtg1* increased significantly for treated groups for E₂ and BPA and binary mixtures. This could be explained by the fact that the concentration levels were kept at above the LOEC of ≤ 0.1 $\mu\text{g/L}$ E₂ for *vtg1* mRNA induction (Jin et al., 2009a) and the LOEC of 500 $\mu\text{g/L}$ BPA for *vtg1* mRNA transcription (Herrera and Jagadeeswaran, 2004) in zebrafish. For NP treated groups

with 5 µg/L of NP for 15 days and other NP treated groups no significant transcriptional changes (Fig. 1C) ($P>0.05$) were observed, and this could be ascribed to the fact that its concentration didn't reached the LOEC of 100 µg/L NP for *vtg* mRNA induction (Jin et al., 2009a). However, there were significant induction of *vtg* mRNA levels in treated groups when exposed to binary mixture of E₂+NP (Fig. 1E) and BPA+NP (Fig. 1F). This phenomenon may be related to the binding differences of E₂, BPA, and NP with the zebrafish ERα (see Section 4.6 below).

4.2 Interactive effects in binary mixtures based on EC₅₀ values

The EC₅₀ values for all binary mixtures expressed in TU as shown in Table 1 were all slightly above the value of 1.0 and therefore the combined effect was categorized as an interactive type and hence the toxicity of the mixtures had a weak synergistic effect on the biomarker *vtg* gene of zebrafish. The results showed that binary mixtures of E₂, BPA, and NP could produce an interactive effects under the low concentrations of exposure of their corresponding sums of toxic unit (Σ TU), which was consistent with the combined effect of the different xenoestrogens to result in an increase of the estrogenic effects, even when each individual exposure was present at low concentrations or below thresholds (Lv et al., 2007; Sun et al., 2009).

4.3 Ranking of estrogenic potentials

From the estrogenic effect data, the estrogenic potentials of low concentrations of BPA and NP with the natural estrogen E₂ and their binary mixtures could be ranked as in the following order: E₂+BPA > E₂ > E₂+NP > BPA > BPA+NP >>> NP. This was in agreement with the estrogenic potential of binary mixture obtained in other studies.

For example, MVLN cells were exposed to E₂ and BPA mixture in fixed ratios produced a significant response, and showed a further increased estrogenic effect above the E₂ exposure (Bonefeld-Jorgensen et al., 2007); the fixed ratios of E₂ and NP mixture produced a 17-fold increase in plasma VTG induction in juvenile rainbow trout, and the induction fold was higher than that of NP exposure (Thorpe et al., 2001); the *vtg* mRNA expression from the adult swordtail liver were exposed to the mixture of BPA and NP was more potent than a single exposure to NP (Kwak et al., 2001). Although the experimental organisms and exposure endpoints of the different studies were different, the ranking of estrogenic potential difference between E₂, BPA and NP and their mixture was similar.

4.4 Correlation between exposure period and liver injury of zebrafish

The respectively EC₅₀ values of individual and binary exposure of E₂, BPA, and NP were found to firstly increase and then decrease during the expose period at the 3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days (Table 1), which was a whole exposure period of effect levels, rather than a specific effect level. This was consistent with in previously studies that plasma concentrations of endocrine disrupters rises first and descends later with exposure time (Mielke and Gundert-Remy, 2009). This tendency may explained as follows. Firstly, there was some water loss in zebrafish during the treatment, and some effect loss of the compounds being dissolved in water, which led the higher observed EC₅₀ values to activated estrogen-responsive genes. Secondly, the compound continues to accumulate in the liver of zebrafish with increased exposure time, and the estrogen-responsive genes were activated with the lower EC₅₀ values. And lastly, the

concentrations of endocrine disrupters and the estrogenic sensitivity observed for the zebrafish decreased because of the increased metabolism of the zebrafish hepatocytes and then the zebrafish liver injury became exacerbated (Lindholst et al., 2003). It was noteworthy that the liver toxicity could caused reduced life expectancy of zebrafish as evidenced by the explanation of EC_{50} values trend of expressions of the zebrafish hepatic *vtg1*.

4.5 Application of RLE model based on the EC_{50} values

The time-response relationships of xenoestrogens seen in the linear RLE model were more sensitive and intuitive (Fig. 2). There are two points in the RLE model, which are relatively fixed. One is the EC_{50} for the compounds at relative short exposure time and the other one is the normal life expectancy of the zebrafish. The characteristics of these relationships are shown in Table 3, which was highly correlated with the intercept representing the EC_{50} as extrapolated to an $\ln ET_{50}$ of zero and the slope indicates the rate of descent in the EC_{50} per unit of natural log of exposure time. The more prolonged the exposure, the greater the toxic effect of the compounds and the lower the EC_{50} which was consistent with the previously studies (Connell and Yu, 2008; Connell et al., 2016). However, it takes a long time for the compound to bioconcentrate into the fish after exposure, it's impossible to obtain a zero time for the RLE model (Connell et al., 2016), which was similar with respect to the explanation of EC_{50} tendency in currently study. In addition, the use of calculated NLE as a limiting reference point is novel since it limits the toxicity endpoints of EC_{50} to the range of corresponding exposure time, which was consistent with in

previous studies based on lethal toxicity for the RLE model (Verma et al., 2013). Therefore, it also provides a new perspective that EC_{50} value was similarly used as LC_{50} value as toxicity endpoint used for time-response analysis in the linear RLE model.

4.6 Interpretation of interactive effects based on the molecular docking

For E_2 +BPA mixtures, E_2 and BPA have similar to binding energy (Table 4), so they have the equivalent chance to bind to the zebrafish $ER\alpha$. The concentrations of E_2 and BPA were much higher than those of other two mixtures (Table 2). When the concentrations of E_2 +BPA were elevated, the mixtures would have more opportunities to bind to the zebrafish $ER\alpha$. Thus, the combined effects of E_2 +BPA were of a synergistic type. For BPA+NP mixtures, the situation was a similar. Since the concentrations of NP in mixtures were lower (Table 2), the combined effects of E_2 +BPA are higher than that of BPA+NP (Fig. 1), and the combined effects of BPA+NP was also synergistic. For E_2 +NP mixtures, two factors were affecting the binding energies. Firstly, the binding energy of E_2 was much higher than that of NP (Table 4), so E_2 can bind to the zebrafish $ER\alpha$ much easier than NP; and thus, E_2 may bind to more the zebrafish $ER\alpha$ than NP. Secondly, the estrogenic activity of E_2 was much higher than that of NP and BPA (Routledge and Sumpter, 1996), and the concentration of NP in mixtures was lower (Table 4). So the combined effects of E_2 +NP was higher than that of BPA+NP mixtures, and was lower than that of E_2 +BPA mixtures; and the combined effect of E_2 +NP was also synergistic. This was in agreement with the order of estrogenic potential of individual and binary mixtures.

These analyses were also referred to in previously studies (Zhang et al., 2011; Yao et al., 2013). Therefore, it was understandable that the synergistic of combined effects considering the similar action mechanism and similar molecular structure of the E₂, BPA and NP.

5. Conclusions

This study investigated the concentration-time-structure response of the low concentrations of BPA and NP with the natural estrogen E₂ and their binary mixtures. The relative mRNA levels of *vtg1* in adult male zebrafish was effectively upregulated following exposure to individual and binary mixture of E₂, BPA and NP. Also, the binary mixtures of E₂, BPA, and NP had an weak synergistic effect under the low concentrations exposure. With the expression of hepatic *vtg1* gene, the hepatic toxicity could be described by the reduced life expectancy model of zebrafish. The RLE model analyses can be useful to evaluate the exposure time effects of zebrafish by using EC₅₀ as toxicity endpoint. The molecular docking analysis can be useful to understand interactive effects of xenoestrogens. The study method used may be applicable not only for zebrafish but also for other species of teleost fish and even other organisms.

Conflict of interest statement

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

Acknowledgments

This study was financially supported by National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grant No.41676110).

References

- Bonefeld-Jorgensen, E.C., Long, M., Hofmeister, M.V., Vinggaard, A.M., 2007. Endocrine-disrupting potential of bisphenol A, bisphenol A dimethacrylate, 4-n-nonylphenol, and 4-n-octylphenol in vitro: new data and a brief review. *Environ Health Perspect* 115 Suppl 1, 69-76.
- Buszka, P.M., Yeskis, D.J., Kolpin, D.W., Furlong, E.T., Zaugg, S.D., Meyer, M.T., 2009. Waste-Indicator and Pharmaceutical Compounds in Landfill-Leachate-Affected Ground Water near Elkhart, Indiana, 2000–2002. *Bulletin of Environmental Contamination and Toxicology* 82, 653-659.
- Chen, M., Zhang, J., Pang, S., Wang, C., Wang, L., Sun, Y., Song, M., Liang, Y., 2018. Evaluating estrogenic and anti-estrogenic effect of endocrine disrupting chemicals (EDCs) by zebrafish (*Danio rerio*) embryo-based vitellogenin 1 (vtg1) mRNA expression. *Comp Biochem Physiol C Toxicol Pharmacol* 204, 45-50.
- Clarke, B.O., Anumol, T., Barlaz, M., Snyder, S.A., 2015. Investigating landfill leachate as a source of trace organic pollutants. *Chemosphere* 127, 269-275.
- Connell, D., Yu, J., 2008. Use of exposure time and life expectancy in models for toxicity to aquatic organisms. *Mar Pollut Bull* 57, 245-249.
- Connell, D.W., Yu, Q.J., Verma, V., 2016. Influence of exposure time on toxicity-An overview. *Toxicology* 355-356, 49-53.
- Dede, A., 2017. Expression of key synaptic proteins in Zebrafish (*Danio Rerio*) brain following caloric restriction and its mimetic and their relationship with gender. Bilkent University.

- 463 DeLano, W.L., 2002. The PyMOL user's manual. DeLano Scientific, San Carlos, CA
464 452.
- 465 Gerhard, G.S., Kauffman, E.J., Wang, X., Stewart, R., Moore, J.L., Kasales, C.J.,
466 Demidenko, E., Cheng, K.C., 2002. Life spans and senescent phenotypes in two
467 strains of Zebrafish (*Danio rerio*). *Experimental gerontology* 37, 1055-1068.
- 468 Hernando, M.D., Mezcuca, M., Fernandez-Alba, A.R., Barcelo, D., 2006.
469 Environmental risk assessment of pharmaceutical residues in wastewater
470 effluents, surface waters and sediments. *Talanta* 69, 334-342.
- 471 Herrera, M., Jagadeeswaran, P., 2004. Annual fish as a genetic model for aging. *The*
472 *Journals of Gerontology Series A: Biological Sciences and Medical Sciences* 59,
473 B101-B107.
- 474 Huey, R., Morris, G., 2003. AutoDock tools. La Jolla, CA, USA: The Scripps
475 Research Institute.
- 476 Inc, S., 1994. SPSS 6.1 for Windows student version. Prentice Hall.
- 477 Jin, Y., Chen, R., Sun, L., Qian, H., Liu, W., Fu, Z., 2009. Induction of
478 estrogen-responsive gene transcription in the embryo, larval, juvenile and adult
479 life stages of zebrafish as biomarkers of short-term exposure to endocrine
480 disrupting chemicals. *Comp Biochem Physiol C Toxicol Pharmacol* 150,
481 414-420.
- 482 Kalmykova, Y., Bjorklund, K., Stromvall, A.M., Blom, L., 2013. Partitioning of
483 polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons, alkylphenols, bisphenol A and phthalates in
484 landfill leachates and stormwater. *Water Res* 47, 1317-1328.

- 485 Keller, E.T., Keller, J.M., Gillespie, G., 2006. The use of mature zebrafish (*Danio*
486 *rerio*) as a model for human aging and disease. *Handbook of Models for Human*
487 *Aging*. Elsevier, pp. 309-316.
- 488 Kwak, H.I., Bae, M.O., Lee, M.H., Lee, Y.S., Lee, B.J., Kang, K.S., Chae, C.H., Sung,
489 H.J., Shin, J.S., Kim, J.H., 2001. Effects of nonylphenol, bisphenol A, and their
490 mixture on the viviparous swordtail fish (*Xiphophorus helleri*). *Environmental*
491 *toxicology and chemistry* 20, 787-795.
- 492 Lindholm, C., Wynne, P.M., Marriott, P., Pedersen, S.N., Bjerregaard, P., 2003.
493 Metabolism of bisphenol A in zebrafish (*Danio rerio*) and rainbow trout
494 (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) in relation to estrogenic response. *Comparative*
495 *Biochemistry and Physiology Part C: Toxicology & Pharmacology* 135,
496 169-177.
- 497 Liu, J., Cao, X., Ai, Y., Zhou, D., Han, Q., 2015. Study on detecting leachate leakage
498 of municipal solid waste landfill site. *Waste Management & Research* 33,
499 588-592.
- 500 Lv, X., Zhou, Q., Song, M., Jiang, G., Shao, J., 2007. Vitellogenic responses of
501 17 β -estradiol and bisphenol A in male Chinese loach (*Misgurnus*
502 *anguillicaudatus*). *Environ Toxicol Pharmacol* 24, 155-159.
- 503 Meylan, W.M., Howard, P.H., Boethling, R.S., Aronson, D., Printup, H., Gouchie, S.,
504 1999. Improved method for estimating bioconcentration/bioaccumulation factor
505 from octanol/water partition coefficient. *Environmental Toxicology and*
506 *Chemistry* 18, 664-672.

- 507 Mielke, H., Gundert-Remy, U., 2009. Bisphenol A levels in blood depend on age and
508 exposure. *Toxicol Lett* 190, 32-40.
- 509 Nasu, M., ., Goto, M., ., Kato, H., ., Oshima, Y., ., Tanaka, H., . 2001. Study on
510 endocrine disrupting chemicals in wastewater treatment plants. *Water Science &*
511 *Technology A Journal of the International Association on Water Pollution*
512 *Research* 43, 101-108.
- 513 Renou, S., Givaudan, J.G., Poulain, S., Dirassouyan, F., Moulin, P., 2008. Landfill
514 leachate treatment: Review and opportunity. *J Hazard Mater* 150, 468-493.
- 515 Routledge, E.J., Sumpter, J.P., 1996. Estrogenic activity of surfactants and some of
516 their degradation products assessed using a recombinant yeast screen.
517 *Environmental toxicology and chemistry* 15, 241-248.
- 518 Soares, A., Guieysse, B., Jefferson, B., Cartmell, E., Lester, J.N., 2008. Nonylphenol
519 in the environment: a critical review on occurrence, fate, toxicity and treatment
520 in wastewaters. *Environ Int* 34, 1033-1049.
- 521 Son, J., Lee, Y.S., Kim, Y., Shin, K.I., Hyun, S., Cho, K., 2016. Joint toxic action of
522 binary metal mixtures of copper, manganese and nickel to *Paronychiurus kimi*
523 (Collembola). *Ecotoxicol Environ Saf* 132, 164-169.
- 524 Sun, L., Zha, J., Wang, Z., 2009. Interactions between estrogenic chemicals in binary
525 mixtures investigated using vitellogenin induction and factorial analysis.
526 *Chemosphere* 75, 410-415.
- 527 Teta, C., Naik, Y.S., 2017. Vitellogenin induction and reduced fecundity in zebrafish
528 exposed to effluents from the City of Bulawayo, Zimbabwe. *Chemosphere* 167,

- 529 282-290.
- 530 Thomsen, R., Christensen, M.H., 2006. MolDock: a new technique for high-accuracy
531 molecular docking. *J Med Chem* 49, 3315-3321.
- 532 Thorpe, K.L., Hutchinson, T.H., Hetheridge, M.J., Scholze, M., Sumpter, J.P., Tyler,
533 C.R., 2001. Assessing the biological potency of binary mixtures of
534 environmental estrogens using vitellogenin induction in juvenile rainbow trout
535 (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). *Environmental Science & Technology* 35, 2476-2481.
- 536 Trott, O., Olson, A.J., 2010. AutoDock Vina: improving the speed and accuracy of
537 docking with a new scoring function, efficient optimization, and multithreading.
538 *J Comput Chem* 31, 455-461.
- 539 Urbatzka, R., Rocha, E., Reis, B., Cruzeiro, C., Monteiro, R.A., Rocha, M.J., 2012.
540 Effects of ethinylestradiol and of an environmentally relevant mixture of
541 xenoestrogens on steroidogenic gene expression and specific transcription
542 factors in zebrafish. *Environ Pollut* 164, 28-35.
- 543 Van den Belt, K., Verheyen, R., Witters, H., 2003. Comparison of vitellogenin
544 responses in zebrafish and rainbow trout following exposure to environmental
545 estrogens. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety* 56, 271-281.
- 546 Verma, V., Yu, Q.J., Connell, D.W., 2013. Reduced life expectancy model for effects
547 of long term exposure on lethal toxicity with fish. *ISRN Toxicol* 2013, 230763.
- 548 Verma, V., Yu, Q.J., Connell, D.W., 2014. Evaluation of effects of long term exposure
549 on lethal toxicity with mammals. *Environ Pollut* 185, 234-239.
- 550 Verma, V., Yu, Q.J., Connell, D.W., 2015. A comparison of Reduced Life Expectancy

- (RLE) model with Haber's Rule to describe effects of exposure time on toxicity. Environ Pollut 204, 26-31.
- Villeneuve, D.L., Garcia-Reyero, N., Escalon, B.L., Jensen, K.M., Cavallin, J.E., Makynen, E.A., Durhan, E.J., Kahl, M.D., Thomas, L.M., Perkins, E.J., Ankley, G.T., 2012. Ecotoxicogenomics to support ecological risk assessment: a case study with bisphenol A in fish. Environ Sci Technol 46, 51-59.
- Webb, B., Sali, A., 2014. Protein structure modeling with MODELLER. Protein Structure Prediction, 1-15.
- Woods, M., Kumar, A., 2011. Vitellogenin induction by 17beta-estradiol and 17alpha-ethynylestradiol in male Murray rainbowfish (*Melanotaenia fluviatilis*). Environ Toxicol Chem 30, 2620-2627.
- Yamaguchi, A., Ishibashi, H., Arizono, K., Tominaga, N., 2015. In vivo and in silico analyses of estrogenic potential of bisphenol analogs in medaka (*Oryzias latipes*) and common carp (*Cyprinus carpio*). Ecotoxicol Environ Saf 120, 198-205.
- Yamamoto, T., Yasuhara, A., Shiraishi, H., Nakasugi, O., 2001. Bisphenol A in hazardous waste landfill leachates. Chemosphere 42, 415-418.
- Yao, Z., Lin, Z., Wang, T., Tian, D., Zou, X., Gao, Y., Yin, D., 2013. Using molecular docking-based binding energy to predict toxicity of binary mixture with different binding sites. Chemosphere 92, 1169-1176.
- Ying, G.-G., Kookana, R.S., Ru, Y.-J., 2002. Occurrence and fate of hormone steroids in the environment. Environment international 28, 545-551.
- Zhang, H.C., Hu, X.L., Yin, D.Q., Lin, Z.F., 2011. Development of molecular

docking-based binding energy to predict the joint effect of BPA and its analogs.

Hum Exp Toxicol 30, 318-327.

Figure Captions

Fig. 1. Dose-dependent expression of hepatic *vtg1* in adult male zebrafish exposed to various concentrations of E₂, BPA and NP, and their binary mixtures for 3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days. Data normalized to housekeeping gene of β -actin. Fold change of dates are presented as mean $\pm$ SEM (n=3) relative to controls. The baseline (y=1) indicates the level of control (0.01% ethanol). Statistically significant differences are shown by an asterisk, * for p<0.05, ** for p<0.01 and *** for p<0.001. Relative expression levels of *vtg1* are plotted on a log scale (except for NP in Fig. 1C).

Fig. 2. Plots of EC₅₀ versus lnET₅₀ for zebrafish with linear regression lines for E₂, BPA, E₂+BPA, E₂+NP and BPA+NP data sets. Normal life expectancy (NLT) is indicated, where red dots on x-axis represents reported NLT range of zebrafish. The green, magenta, violet, orange and olive lines are displayed as regression lines for E₂, BPA, E₂+BPA, E₂+NP and BPA+NP, respectively. The horizontal and vertical dash lines indicate specific EC₅₀ values and corresponding ET₅₀ values.

Fig. 3. Predicted binding modes obtained from molecular docking analysis of E₂ (A), BPA (B) and NP (C) for zebrafish estrogen receptor α (ER α) docked in the zebrafish ER α -LBD.

Fig. 1. Dose-dependent expression of hepatic *vtgI* in adult male zebrafish exposed to various concentrations of E₂, BPA and NP, and their binary mixtures for 3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days. Data normalized to housekeeping gene of β -actin. Fold change of dates are presented as mean $\pm$ SEM (n=3) relative to controls. The baseline (y=1) indicates the level of control (0.01% ethanol). Statistically significant differences are shown by an asterisk, * for p<0.05, ** for p<0.01 and *** for p<0.001. Relative expression levels of *vtgI* are plotted on a log scale (except for NP in Fig. 1C).

Fig. 2. Plots of EC_{50} versus $\ln ET_{50}$ for zebrafish with linear regression lines for E_2 , BPA, E_2 +BPA, E_2 +NP and BPA+NP data sets. Normal life expectancy (NLT) is indicated, where red dots on x-axis represents reported NLT range of zebrafish. The green, magenta, violet, orange and olive lines are displayed as regression lines for E_2 , BPA, E_2 +BPA, E_2 +NP and BPA+NP, respectively. The horizontal and vertical dash lines indicate specific EC_{50} values and corresponding ET_{50} values.

Fig. 3. Predicted binding modes obtained from molecular docking analysis of E₂ (A), BPA (B) and NP (C) for zebrafish estrogen receptor α (ER α) docked in the zebrafish ER α -LBD.

Tables

Table 1. Logistic probit analysis of EC₅₀ values of *vtg1* mRNA expressions and nominal concentrations (or sums of toxic units obtained from binary mixture) of E₂, BPA, E₂+BPA, E₂+NP and BPA+NP for 3, 6, 9, 12 and 15 days.

Endocrine disrupters	Exposure time (day)	EC ₅₀	95% lower confidence limit	95% upper confidence limit
E ₂ (ng/L)	3	24.01	21.35	27.10
	6	26.54	17.64	41.42
	9	22.72	5.34	50.50
	12	19.07	10.74	31.67
	15	18.49	9.69	31.49
BPA (μg/L)	3	244.99	118.89	465.61
	6	248.11	69.33	466.79
	9	193.88	126.77	278.73
	12	183.26	113.34	290.99
	15	166.29	105.21	264.01
E ₂ +BPA (TU)	3	1.169	0.440	1.572
	6	1.253	0.695	1.436
	9	1.210	0.626	1.537
	12	1.128	0.681	1.503
	15	1.115	0.843	1.352
E ₂ +NP (TU)	3	1.122	0.076	1.468
	6	1.188	0.680	1.726
	9	1.169	0.655	1.676
	12	1.115	0.594	1.530
	15	1.077	0.704	1.362
BPA+NP (TU)	3	1.039	0.293	1.448
	6	1.151	0.193	2.048
	9	1.093	0.652	1.432
	12	1.070	0.631	1.385
	15	1.054	0.533	1.390

Table 2. Equivalent toxicity of concentrations of binary mixtures of E₂, BPA and NP (µg/L) and their corresponding sums of toxic units (ΣTU) obtained from individual exposure toxicity studies.

Toxic unit		Mixture combination					
TU(x,y)	E2+BPA		E2+NP		BPA+NP		ΣTU ^a
0.375	0.008	77.7	0.008	1.9	77.7	1.9	0.75
0.5	0.011	103.7	0.011	2.5	103.7	2.5	1
0.625	0.014	129.6	0.014	3.1	129.6	3.1	1.25
0.75	0.017	155.5	0.017	3.8	155.5	3.8	1.5
0.875	0.019	181.4	0.019	4.4	181.4	4.4	1.75

Table 3. Regression analysis of zebrafish toxicity data for E₂, BPA, E₂+BPA, E₂+NP and BPA+NP with the modified linear RLE model.

Endocrine disrupters	Slope (a)*	Intercept (b)*	Regression coefficient (R ²)	Calculated NLT (d)**	Reported NLT (d)
E ₂	-4.43E-09	3.12E-08	0.9788	1156	
BPA	-4.18E-05	2.94E-04	0.9851	1123	930 (Herrera and Jagadeeswaran, 2004)
E ₂ +BPA	-0.2300	1.6358	0.9727	1227	1080 (Dede, 2017)
E ₂ +NP	-0.2217	1.5783	0.9695	1234	1260 (Gerhard et al., 2002)
BPA+NP	-0.2104	1.4990	0.9665	1240	1350 (Herrera and Jagadeeswaran, 2004)
					1980 (Keller et al., 2006)

The slope (a) and intercept (b) were obtained from the regression equations.

* for $EC_{50} = -\ln ET_{50} + b$, ** for $\ln NLT_{50} = b/a$.

Table 4. Molecular modeling of ligand interaction between zebrafish estrogen receptor α (ER α) ligand-binding domains (LBDs).

Ligand	Intermolecular interactions	Key amino acids for stabilized combination	Binding energy (kcal/mol)
E ₂	hydrogen bonds	Arg89 and Glu48	-10.1
	Pi-sigma interaction	Arg89	
BPA	hydrogen bonds	the N atom of Ala45 skeleton and the O atom of Leu41 skeleton	-8.0
NP	no	no	-6.8

Highlights

- Binary mixtures of 17 β -estradiol (E₂), bisphenol A (BPA) and nonylphenol (NP) have weak synergistic effects on hepatic vitellogenin gene (*vgtI*) of adult male zebrafish.
- The reduced life expectancy (RLE) model for lethal toxicity was extended to study the effect of exposure time on EC₅₀ of zebrafish hepatic *vgtI* levels.
- A new interpretation for interaction potential of E₂, BPA, NP and their binary mixtures was given through the analyses of molecular docking.

In silico investigation

Zebrafish hepatic *vtg* mRNA analysis

Figure 2: Relative mRNA levels of Hsp70 in the liver of rainbow trout exposed to different concentrations of TBT (0.75, 1, 1.25, 1.5, and 1.75 TU) for 4d, 6d, 8d, 12d, and 15d. The y-axis is logarithmic, representing relative mRNA levels of Hsp70. The legend indicates: 4d (brown), 6d (yellow), 8d (blue), 12d (purple), and 15d (pink). Error bars represent standard deviation. Asterisks indicate significant differences (p < 0.05) compared to the control group.