MUSIC TEACHER ATTRIBUTES, IDENTITY AND EXPERIENCES INFORMING TEACHER EDUCATION

SCOTT D HARRISON
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to acknowledge Mandy Lupton and Craig Zimitat for their guidance and assistance in completing this volume. Their wisdom, patience, encouragement and eye for detail have been greatly appreciated. My thanks also extend to Elizabeth Stephens for her assistance with proofreading, formatting and editing of the written document. I am extremely grateful to the students and teachers who participated in the surveys and interviews. The book would not have been possible without them. I would especially like to thank my wife Jessica for her encouragement, patience and support through the long hours of the preparation of this document.

DEDICATION

FOR LACHLAN AND ZOE
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 1</th>
<th>Context</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2</td>
<td>Relationship to existing knowledge</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Identifying teacher identity</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The peculiar identity of the music teacher</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Attributes in the construction of music teacher identity</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Content and delivery of music teacher education courses</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Preliminary studies</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3</td>
<td>Project Structure</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rationale for methodology</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recruitment of participants</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Data classification and analysis</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Structure of data collection</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4</td>
<td>General Pre-service Teachers</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5</td>
<td>Pre-service Music Teachers</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 6</td>
<td>Experienced Music Teachers</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7</td>
<td>Experienced Music Teachers: in depth</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Early influences</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Musician, teacher, music teacher</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ideal initial teacher education</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professional learning</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Qualities and attributes</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Advice from experienced teachers to beginning teachers</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 8</td>
<td>So What?</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Early influences</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transition to teaching training programs</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-service course content and delivery</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transition from university to workplace</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beyond initial training</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 9</td>
<td>Implications for Music Teacher Education</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td></td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td></td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 Personality attributes in successful teachers 10
Table 2 Staff factors observed in site visits 11
Table 3 Comparison of pre-service and early-career teachers perceptions 18
Table 4 General pre-service teacher responses on music teaching and learning 32
Table 5 General pre-service general teacher on how arts enhance learning 34
Table 6 Qualities/attributes considered important by general pre-service teachers 35
Table 7 Music pre-service teacher responses on music teaching and learning 39
Table 8 Qualities/attributes considered important by pre-service music teachers 42
Table 9 Qualities/attributes considered important by experienced music teachers 56
CHAPTER ONE

CONTEXT

Aims

This book aims to examine the identity of teachers through the perceptions of pre-service and experienced teachers. Teachers in both career phases were asked to identify qualities that contribute to music teacher identity and to give “histories” of themselves in written, verbal and visual forms. Pre-service teachers (generalists and specialists)\(^1\) were asked to reflect on their experiences of “becoming” teachers and to give their assessment of desirable course components. Experienced teachers\(^2\) were given an opportunity to provide evidence of knowledge accumulated through their ongoing teacher practice. The volume contends that dialogue between the two phases (pre-service and experienced) of the music teacher can be employed to improve music teacher education programs in pre-service and professional learning contexts.

The questions that underpin this book are:

1. What knowledge, skills and attributes does a music teacher need to possess?
2. How do these qualities contribute to constructing music teacher identity?
3. How can the knowledge, skills and attributes required of music teachers be shaped into the essential components of teacher education in music?

Context

The book is located in the Australian music education environment. In 2004 and 2005, National Review of School Music Education in Schools took place in Australia. The final report (Pascoe et al., 2005) was wide ranging in its scope and influence and found that courses involving the development of teachers who “maintain their own musical knowledge,

\(^1\) Generalist teachers were those who had typically undertaken one undergraduate “arts” course. On graduation, these students will teach general primary classes. Specialist teachers had taken four or more music courses and will teach music on graduation.

\(^2\) Teachers with 5 or more years experience
understanding and skills” were considered essential in pre-service teacher education, along with development of “attitudes, dispositions and values” (p. 113). The Review findings have stimulated a closer examination of this field, particularly in relation to improving teacher education programs (Ballantyne, 2005, 2006; Dillon, 2006; Harrison, 2006; Temmerman, 2006).

Prior to the National Review of School Music Education, Auh’s (2004, p.13) work, relating to pre-service music teachers, referred to Richardson’s (1996) findings for teachers’ beliefs in general teacher training, namely:

1. Personal experience, which includes belief about self, other and various aspects of life involving family, school, society and culture;
2. Experience with schooling and instruction, which builds a set of beliefs about the nature of teaching; and
3. Experience with formal knowledge, which consists of school subject knowledge and pedagogical knowledge.

This book examines these three aspects of teacher training and applies them to music teaching and learning. This chapter has introduced the central themes and issues to be discussed. Chapter 2 investigates the recent literature in the field with a view to establishing existing knowledge and to provide a platform for the fieldwork. The review will also incorporate preliminary studies conducted by the author in 2003 and 2004. Chapter 3 outlines the methodology employed in the project, describing how the research design was conceived, how participants were identified and how the data were gathered and analysed. Chapters 4 and 5 examine pre-service teachers’ responses: Chapter 4 focuses on general pre-service teachers while Chapter 5 examines pre-service specialist teachers. In Chapters 6 and 7 the responses of experienced teachers are presented: Chapter 6 presents questionnaire responses and Chapter 7 reports on in-depth interviews with six of the experienced teachers. In Chapter 8, the findings are discussed and a time chronology of the development of music teacher identity is offered. Chapter 9 draws some conclusions for revitalising music teacher education, presenting a model for the teaching of knowledge, skills and attributes in universities and professional learning.
CHAPTER TWO
RELATIONSHIP TO EXISTING KNOWLEDGE

Given the role of the teacher educator in developing appropriate courses of study, an examination of recent literature in this field is of vital importance, as Asmus (2000, p. 5) contended: “Music teacher education has never before needed a base of substantive information about how to best prepare music teachers as it does now.” Furthermore, Leglar (1993, p. 67) claimed that very few institutions seem to be philosophically committed to research in music teacher education. Ironically, music education researchers and teacher educators regularly lament the reluctance of classroom teachers to base practice on research, yet few of them are actively engaged in the rigorous examination of their own practices.

While aspects of the literature from other authors, alongside preliminary studies by this author have been explored to some extent in Chapter Eight, the main purpose of this chapter is to provide a direct segue into the study itself.

Identifying Teacher Identity

Good teachers, according to Palmer (1998, p. 11), are able to “weave a complex web of connections about themselves”. By way of illuminating this further, Palmer (p. 13) describes identity as

an evolving nexus where all the forces that constitute my life converge in the mystery of self… identity is a moving intersection of the inner and outer forces that make me what I am, converging in the irreducible mystery of being human.

Beijaard (1995) and Korthagen (2004 p. 82) use the definition of identity as “who or what someone is, the various meanings people attach to themselves and the means attributed by others”, while Bullough, (1997 p. 21) claims that teacher identity is “what beginning teachers believe about teaching and learning and self-as-a-teacher… teacher education must begin by exploring the teaching self”.

Welmond (2002, in Robinson & McMillan, 2006, p. 330) suggests that teacher identity is dynamically contested, shaped by and constructed within potentially contradictory interests
Chapter Two

and ideologies, competing conceptions of rights and responsibilities of teachers and differing ways of understanding success or effectiveness. Flores and Day (2006, p. 219) develop this proposal, contending that learning to become a teacher has

multi-dimensional, idiosyncratic and context specific nature which entails an interplay between different, and sometimes conflicting, perspectives, beliefs and practices… for some new teachers feelings of isolation, mismatch between idealistic expectations and classroom reality and lack of support and guidance have been identified as key features.

Identity is influenced by personal, social and cognitive response (Flores and Day, 2006, p. 220). They present a model of teacher identity that encapsulates elements of biography, pre-service programs and school culture, suggesting that pre-service programs might be strengthened by the provision of opportunities to experience and reflect on personal biography and school context.

Identity is therefore shaped by experience, training and context. A significant aspect of context relates to the tasks teachers perform. According to O’Connor (2005), teachers’ work is complex, multidimensional and subject to change in an era of globalisation and shifting pedagogical paradigms. Becoming a teacher involves taking on a variety of personally and professionally challenging roles. The emotionally demanding nature of teaching also requires more than merely technical skills (O’Connor, p. 12). Beginning teachers need to have “the opportunity to articulate beliefs, ideals and values and to realise these in professionally and personally meaningful teaching assignments” (Pietsch and Williamson, 2005, July, p. 370). A lack of opportunity for this realisation to take place can result, according to Pietsch and Williamson, in the professional identity of the beginning teacher being curtailed. Ofman (2000) refers to “core qualities” and claims they are potentially always present. Harrison (2005) pursued this notion in questioning whether teacher qualities can be taught. In this discussion, Harrison cites Almus (1987, p. 175), who refers to core qualities as “essential” aspects for teachers to possess. Korthagen (2004, p. 78) asks, “what are the essential qualities of good teachers and how can we help people become good teachers?” and describes the process of locating core qualities that can assist teachers in enhancing the core qualities of their students. These core qualities are a product of environment, behaviour, competencies and beliefs that contribute to identity and mission in the teacher, represented as a layered
“onion ring” construct. Of particular interest in this research is the interface between behaviour, competencies and beliefs to create identity.

An extensive body of research exists that investigates the skills, attributes and qualities of teachers. The purpose of such studies has been to enhance the learning experiences of tertiary students by discovering means of enhancing these skills and attributes. Attributes are described as a “quality or characteristic of…” (Geddes & Grosset, 2000). Personal qualities (e.g., creativity, trust, care, courage, sensitivity, decisiveness, spontaneity, commitment, and flexibility) are also referred to by Tickle (2000).

In summary, Beijaard et al. (2004, p. 109) identified three types of study into the professional identity of teachers:

1. Studies in which the focus was on teachers’ professional identity formation;
2. Studies in which the focus was on the identification of teachers’ professional identity as perceived by themselves or as identified by the researchers from the data they collected; and
3. Studies in which professional identity was (re)presented by teachers’ stories told and written.

This volume aims to interrogate elements of all three types of study. It focuses on elements that contribute to the formation of a teacher’s identity, drawing on the work of Sugrue (1997) who found that student teachers’ personalities are significantly shaped by: immediate family; significant others or extended family; apprenticeship of observation; atypical teaching episodes; policy context, teaching traditions and cultural archetypes; and tacitly acquired understandings. The research also reflects on the existing literature, comments on teachers’ perceptions of themselves and asks pre-service and experienced teachers to tell their stories in questionnaire, interview and visual representation.

In relation to teacher identity, Beijaard et al. (2004, p. 122) also found that the concept of professional identity was problematic in relation to definition: it was either defined differently or not defined in the literature in the field. This was particularly the case in studies into teachers’ characteristics of professional identity. The review of literature conducted by Beijaard et al. showed much variety, ranging from the identification of characteristics that
emerged from the data to teachers’ perceptions of such characteristics that were already formulated by the researcher. Beijaard et al. (2004, p. 122) claim, “on the basis of the studies on teachers’ characteristics of professional identity, it is not possible to indicate which specific characteristics particularly shape teachers’ professional identity.” As the research design (described in Chapter 3 below) focuses on the transmission of music teacher identity through formal and informal aspects of music teacher education, Jorgensen’s (2003) artistic learning paradigms, incorporating formal elements of instruction, practice, example and reflection along with the informal aspects of osmosis, participation, observation and sensibility provides a useful framework for the classification of data in the later chapters of this volume. A more complete explanation of this approach is made apparent in the chapter pertaining to implications for music teacher education (see Chapter 9).

The peculiar identity of the music teacher

While the investigation of specific music teacher attributes and their contribution to identity is based in the general education literature, it is also developing as an independent body of work: music teachers’ identity is, in many respects, peculiar to them. In general education, Goodsen and Cole (1994) and Volkman and Anderson (1998) claim identity is formed through the role teachers perform. The nature of the music teachers’ roles, encompassing teaching and performative tasks, along with the embedding of co-curricular involvement within required duties, are the most significant contributors to this difference. Woodford, speaking about music teacher education (2002, p. 675), states that music teacher identity is socially constructed, in the sense that knowledge of self and others and of appropriate behaviour within particular social roles and contexts is acquired through prior experience […] The pursuit of identity defined as the imaginative view or role that individuals project for themselves in particular social positions, occupations or situations is central to social construction educational models.

Jorgensen (2003, p. 130) claims that music teachers are typically preoccupied with a wide variety of tasks, including developing imagination, interpretive creativity, the ability to listen, skills in improvising, and performing and critical judgment. Professional identities of music teachers, according to Hargreaves, Welch, Purves, and Marshall (2003), are consolidated within the pre-service music course and change very little once they reach their first teaching
post. Hargreaves and Marshall (2003) also noted that as pre-service teachers become early-career teachers, one of the small changes to take place was that perceptions of the required skills for successful music teaching change, with teachers increasingly emphasising communication and interpersonal rather than musical performance skills.

The balance between teaching and performance is one of the major concerns for the music teacher: that is, the nexus between musician and teacher and how this contributes to the formation of their identity. Mark (1998, p. 19) comments that a solution to this tension is found when “programs for music teachers overcome the historical and institutionally conditioned barriers between the disciplines involved and proceed towards true interdisciplinary study.” The music teachers’ identity is typically framed as musician or teacher. Roberts (1991, p. 34) suggests that music education majors conceptualise themselves as “musicians” rather than “teachers”. This, in turn, results in conflict in their teacher role identities.

In Australia, Ballantyne (2006) found that secondary teachers “view themselves as discipline specialists … musicians or music teachers.” Ballantyne (2005, p. 39) advocates a deconstructing of these categories during tertiary training to ensure their links with efficacy can be addressed in the work environment in which music teachers

…experience professional and physical isolation within the school; a high workload and multiple responsibilities associated with the extra-curricular music program.

Teachers who perceive themselves as “good” musicians need to separate this from being good teachers. The converse is also true. Teachers in all career phases therefore need to have the capacity to see beyond subject matter to develop generic skills through identifying underlying images and beliefs about music teachers. Pacsoe et al. (2005, p. 135) summarise the distinctive nature of the music teacher in Australia in these terms:

Music teachers focus on both process and performance outcomes… music teachers sing, talk and play instruments through the length of their teaching day… this involves considerable out of class and out of school hours work in ensembles, rehearsals and performance… In addition to multiple teaching roles – as ensemble and performance director, teacher – music teachers have roles in resource management.
It is perhaps Bouij (1998) who describes this tension most adequately. Bouij’s (1998) study into Swedish teachers describes this aspect of development of music teacher identity taking into account aspects of the teacher/musicians’ professional role as teacher or performer.

The role of attributes in the construction of music teacher identity

Beijaard et al. (2004), as discussed earlier, claim that is not possible to identify specific characteristics that shape teachers’ professional identity. A case could be put to suggest that music teacher attributes are significantly different from those required for other types of teaching. This assumption is related to the notion that music teachers have different relationships and environments within which they interact with students. An example of this can be found in the work of Martinez and McNally (1994, n. p.) in which they describe a beginning teacher:

In English… she tended to follow existing units and… had been particularly uncertain about grading of students’ work. By contrast, she was extremely competent and confident in her music curriculum knowledge of content and pedagogy. Sitting in her music class was a delightful reminder of the best of teaching: enthusiastic learners and teacher sharing the excitement of a knowledge base, with the teacher flexibly shifting her teaching in easy response to the learners’ needs and interests… She happily revealed her love of music… her joy was infectious, the learning outputs as high as the teacher satisfaction.

Music classes were more “successful” because of the teacher’s affinity with the subject matter (Martinez and McNally, 1994). Recent literature investigating the relationship of music teachers to their students has focussed on a wide variety of interrelated issues from specific music skills through to broader personality traits. Young and Shaw (1999, p. 673) found that “subject-matter knowledge” rated highly in teacher success regardless of the teacher’s overall effectiveness rating. Earlier studies, (Berliner, 1986; Collier, 1987) also suggested that knowing one’s subject matter is an attribute of effective teaching. The need to continually develop knowledge and skills was noted by Bidner (2001, p. 4): “music teacher educators have to keep abreast of the standards for effective teaching so that students are appropriately prepared.” Teachout (1997), and Hamann, Baker, McAllister and Bauer (2000, p. 102)
confirmed the desire for teachers to possess both teaching and personal skills. Jorgensen (2003, p. 131) concurs:

Transforming teaching is first and foremost a personal business. It necessitates the sorts of teachers who are dedicated and knowledgeable musicians; understand their personal strengths and weaknesses; and have a clear vision of what they seek to accomplish, high expectations of themselves and others, tempered with compassion and realism, a love of musics of which they are exponents and the particular people, young or old, whom they instruct and a desire to communicate their knowledge to their students… this requires people who are people of integrity who are bright, articulate, tactful, compassionate, and astute, the best of communicators, the very cream of society.

Mark (1998, p. 9) commented, in a study with 45 German music educators, that pedagogical, artistic, instrumental and vocal abilities, experience with music technology and competence as composer and arranger were considered highly in the selection of music teachers at entry to university. In a similar Viennese study, Mark (1998) reported that after pedagogical competencies, “the ability to animate” (i.e., create a stimulating atmosphere in which learning can take place) was ranked by music educators as a significant attribute. The findings of Warren and Rohwer (2004) confirm this, with teaching skills ranked as the most desirable attributes, followed by personality characteristics and musical skills. Ballantyne (2006) also noted that early-career music teachers’ passion for music teaching seems to be related to their love of the subject area.

Writing in the New handbook of research on music teaching and learning and drawing on sources across more than 40 years, Pembrook and Craig (2002, p. 796) summarise the research in the field of music teacher attributes into three spheres: internal qualities, relating to others and social control/ group management, as demonstrated in Table 1.
Table 1 *Personality Attributes in Successful Music Teachers*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Internal qualities</th>
<th>Relating to others</th>
<th>Social control/ Group management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broad interests</td>
<td>Caring/empathetic</td>
<td>Authoritative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confident/secure/strong ego/strength/tough minded</td>
<td>Chatty</td>
<td>Co-operative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conscientious/responsible</td>
<td>Emotional sensitivity</td>
<td>Dramatic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative/imaginative</td>
<td>Encouraging</td>
<td>Expressive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotionally stable/not neurotic</td>
<td>Extroverted</td>
<td>Fair</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energetic/enthusiastic/enthusiastic towards music</td>
<td>Friendly/gregarious/People oriented</td>
<td>Flexible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happy/optimistic</td>
<td>Gentle</td>
<td>Exhibiting leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent/self-sufficient</td>
<td>Humble</td>
<td>Patient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neat</td>
<td>Humorous/sense of humour</td>
<td>Persistent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not compulsive</td>
<td>Interested in students</td>
<td>Realistic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restained/reserved</td>
<td>Relaxed</td>
<td>Strong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-control/self disciplined</td>
<td>Sober</td>
<td>Trusting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Pembroke and Craig (2002, p. 796)

In the Australian environment, the National Review of School Music Education Final Report (Pascoe et al., 2005) commented on a number of factors relevant to Pembroke and Craig’s (2002) qualities. Sites of effective practice were visited as part of the National Review process. In the 21 sites visited, a series of success factors were rated. These included: influence of students, parents, executive, teaching practices and resources. The most significant issue of the site visits in relation to this research project was the staff factor. In 21 sites visited, the following elements were observed to varying degrees: dedication, passion, enthusiasm, warmth/rapport, vision, musical expertise, continuity, collegiality, mutual respect, trust, mentoring, professional development, community music, specialist staff, musical excellence, organisational skills and teaching partnerships.

Pascoe et al. (2005, p. 69) also comment extensively on the role of teachers in music programs:

The most consistent factor contributing to the success of school music programmes was the commitment, dedication and enthusiasm of teachers... Typically, teachers at the centre of successful music programmes had a passion for music and highly developed musical
expertise, which spanned musical knowledge, performance skills and, to a lesser extent, understanding of compositional processes, technological competence and understanding of the techniques of sound production.

Table 2 Staff Factors Observed in Site Visits (n = 21)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Staff factors</th>
<th>Number of sites at which the factor was observed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dedication and commitment</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passion for music</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enthusiasm</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Engaging with] specialist staff</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational skills</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vision</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical expertise</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutual respect between staff and students</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collegiality</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuity</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust of students</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warmth/rapport</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentoring of new staff &amp; teaching students</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expectations of musical excellence</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision of professional development to others</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work in community music education programs</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching partnerships with the community</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Pascoe et al. (2005, p. 167)

This view is supported in interviews conducted by Ballantyne (2004, December) who stated: “The best music schools are the ones who have teachers who are skilful and competent musicians, first and foremost, and educators” (n.p.). Ballantyne and Packer (2004, pp. 304–307) concur with the need for communicative and management skills and creativity. With regard to creativity, they remark:

As many people conceive of creativity as being somewhat innate, it is also difficult to address within the pre-service program. Further research needs to be conducted to determine how best to respond to teachers’ desire for musical creativity to be addressed more effectively in the pre-service course.
Stowasser (1996) explored the notion of creative teachers further, initially drawing on the work of Hogg (1994, p. 16) who found that there were three major categories of music teachers:

1. The teacher of music as knowledge; perspective: to play and sing in order to learn about music
2. The teacher of music as accomplishment; perspective: to learn about music in order to sing or play well
3. The teacher of music as an empowering agent; perspective: knowledge and accomplishment in music are means towards the enrichment and personal growth of students.

The third category encompasses those who are most creative and integrated in their approach to music education. To achieve this type of teacher, Stowasser (1996) suggests an approach to teaching music that focuses on the use of intrinsic motivation rather than extrinsic assessment.

In order to embrace this type of motivation and to be enthusiastic and engaging, the teacher needs to exhibit confidence. This is what Pembroke and Craig (2002, p. 796) have classified as the internal qualities of being “confident/secure/strong ego/strength/tough minded.” Recent studies have referred to teacher confidence in music as being the most significant quality (Auh, 2004, 2006; Bresler, 1993; Gifford, 1993; Jeanneret, 1995; Mills, 1989; Russell-Bowie, 1993, 2002). As Gifford worked in the same institution as the current author, his findings are of particular interest to this project. Gifford (1993) recommended that personal experience with music, rather than extra time learning about it, was the key to a more successful music education for the training of teachers. He also found that teachers reported feeling less confident and enthusiastic about teaching music and expressed less positive attitudes towards being involved with music at the completion of their studies.

Motivation, Chapman (2006) claims, is only one aspect of a complex web of knowledge, skills and attributes required of the teacher. While Chapman is speaking specifically in relation to the teaching of singing, her findings have resonance in the more general field of teacher roles and attributes. Chapman (p. 169) defines six roles that a teacher performs:
• Mentor companion,
• Creative midwife,
• Spiritual champion,
• Lifelong learner,
• Knowledgeable teacher, and
• Truthful mentor.

Chapman (2006, p. 173) further describes in some detail what students expect of teachers, including:

• the capacity to recognise and develop potential,
• relevance of teaching,
• objectivity,
• facilitation and engagement in a mutual relationship, and
• grounding of knowledge in a scientific basis.

The literature in the field of teacher attributes and identity offers challenges for teacher education. The “teaching” or development of attributes, and subsequently identity, is relevant in the sense of what, when, and how the content of teacher education programs should be shaped.

**Content and delivery of music teacher education courses**

Teacher education courses have a significant role to play in ensuring beginning teachers are equipped with suitable skills, knowledge and attributes. While skills and knowledge can possibly be identified and taught, the extent to which attributes can be taught is a vexing issue. This issue has been discussed by a number of recent researchers, including Abdullin and Nikolaeva (2006, pp. 6, 7) who claim that music teacher education undergraduates should acquire the following:

• Design, manage and analyse the contents and process of music education
• Perform instrumental works expressively and competently
Professionally manage students’ listening, performing and composing activities

Analyse the process and results of music education.

Abdullin and Nikolaeva (2006) have facilitated this by producing texts, accompanied by DVD. The video component allows for a live method of music instruction demonstrating different systems and approaches to music education and includes 90 fragments of elements ranging from music listening, singing, playing and improvisation through to co-curricular music processes.

The National Review of School Music Education (Pascoe et al., p. 116) concluded that in relation to specific music teacher roles, specialist music teachers need multiple skill sets to do their job effectively. Skills referred to in the review report included:

- conducting and ensemble knowledge and skills and music technology skills… knowledge and experience in a range of instruments … management skills: financial management, instrument hire and management … skills in public relations, promotion and advocacy.

Due to the range of tasks required of specialist music teachers on appointment to Australian schools (tasks like teaching general and elective music, staging a musical, conducting a choir and/or band and teaching a variety of instruments), students were not very positive about their teacher preparation courses (Leong 1999). This resulted in an unrealistic expectation of teaching competency at graduation. Leong investigated teacher expectations prior to appointment, job descriptions of novice teachers, and professional activities in the first year, and offered suggestions for teacher preparation. He found that challenges to teachers included working in isolation, lack of expertise, and working long hours. In specific terms, Pascoe et al. (2005, p. 117) recommend that universities and others preparing music teachers seek to

Enhance or transform courses for specialist music teachers (including instrumental and vocal music teachers) to ensure that students develop and demonstrate contemporary approaches to knowledge, understanding and skills relevant to the needs of specific groups of students.

An investigation of the need for professional activities was undertaken by Chen and Leu (2006, July), concluding that teacher training institutes should provide practical, professional
and accessible music curricula or workshops to improve pre-service teachers’ music skills and teaching confidence. Ballantyne (2006) reflected that training should embrace continuity. The notion of continuity, according to Ballantyne, should develop from pre-service into in-service environments with discipline-specific induction and mentoring programs. To bring about continuity, Ballantyne also noted the need for practicum to be located throughout the course in order to facilitate the ongoing mentoring process.

Auh (2006, p. 40) reiterates this in further research into secondary teaching, claiming the need for the inclusion of teaching presentations and music pedagogy at both undergraduate and in-service levels. Rowe (2003, p. 1) suggests that what matters most for school education is “quality teachers and teaching, supported by strategic professional development.” Jorgensen (2003, p. 132) concurs:

The required extended opportunities in professional meetings for dialogue in seminars or discussion formats with other teachers… the need to be able to try out practical skills in master-class formats where they can receive feedback from others and hone skills in the company of others.

The literature pertaining to music teacher education courses appears to indicate that developing the identity of the music teacher is an ongoing responsibility, shared by students, schools, universities, and professional associations. The format and timing of delivery is variable depending on the context, but the essential content at the end of the pre-service phase could be more clearly defined and categorised in relation to attributes, knowledge and skills.

**Preliminary studies**

This project is part of an ongoing field of enquiry undertaken by the author. The research began with a pilot investigation in the field of singing teaching, where the findings indicated that there were a number of attributes, knowledge and skills that were considered most important for teachers to possess, including:

- Respect for the individual, with an emphasis on flexibility.
- Knowledge of appropriate repertoire,
- Aural, keyboard, language and organizational skills, and
• The ability to communicate effectively with enthusiasm, encouragement, good humour and patience. (Harrison, 2003c, p. 11)

In 2004, a further pilot study conducted by the author with 29 pre-service teachers and 12 experienced teachers found that there were a number of areas that pre-service and experienced teachers expected to be included in pre-service courses.

The data collection for the 2004 project was undertaken via email and through questionnaires. For the first phase of the study, 29 pre-service teachers were asked, through written responses to questionnaires, what they considered were important attributes of teachers. The significant parts of the survey were focused in the following manner:

1. The students were asked to reflect on their experience as teachers and students.
2. Based on these experiences of teaching and learning, they were asked to comment on what they believed were important attributes for music teachers to possess.
3. To focus their thoughts further, they were invited to consider such things as personality traits, musical competency, broad knowledge, specific musical knowledge and the balance of the teacher–performer.
4. Finally they were asked to respond to the question: “Which is more important: relational skills or musical ability?”

The survey was followed up with email discussion to clarify comments of subjects.

In the second phase of the 2004 study (Harrison, 2004), 12 teachers were surveyed in relation to their perceptions of the significant attributes a teacher should possess. Respondents were asked to classify these as personal, professional, musical, and other attributes. In summary, these could be categorised as content, pedagogical, practical, management and reflective skills, along with motivational and communicative attributes. In specific terms, the attributes, knowledge and skills were:

• Knowledge of content, pedagogy, repertoire and curriculum documents;
• Management skills incorporating organisation, behaviour management, time management and human resource management;
• Skills in managing technology;
• Possession of a range of teaching styles;
• Reflective skills for self evaluation and improvement;
• Practical music skills in a variety of genres and including sight-reading, singing, conducting, composition and arrangement;
• Capacity to motivate, inspire and encourage; and
• Connection with students as people.

Above all, this research noted the need for interpersonal skills: the ability to communicate in a variety of ways with the many stakeholders in the musical community (Harrison, 2004 December, p. 203). At that time, the author also suggested that

It is intended that the project continue to track the thoughts of these students as they enter the workforce as newly qualified teachers and to expand the study of experienced teachers into a wider pool. Furthermore, the data will be scrutinised more closely to discover deeper meaning and applications for teachers and teacher educators. Collaboration with domestic and international researchers will also further enhance this process. (Harrison, 2004, December p. 204)

Based on these findings (Harrison, 2003, 2004), four broad themes can be identified as significant in relation to teacher education and professional learning about music:

• The acquisition of musical knowledge and skills,
• The acquisition of pedagogical knowledge and skills,
• The acquisition or development of personal attributes, and
• Application of the above through professional practice.

In arriving at this point, a framework for the current project was formulated. To further inform the structure of the research, a cross-institutional pilot project was implemented. In this project, Harrison and Ballantyne (2005) found that a comparison of the perceptions of pre-service teachers with those of early-career teachers, as displayed in Table 3 below, provided some initial correlations. These findings indicate a high degree of similarity between the responses of the pre-service teachers and the early-career teachers. Due to differing methods of data collection (Harrison collected data through interviews, while Ballantyne’s
data was gained through questionnaires) the similar themes were not necessarily articulated in
the same terms: both groups considered providing opportunities to develop the applied skills
and knowledge to teach in the secondary music classroom to be significant in teacher
preparation courses. The early-career music teachers (perhaps due to their experience in the
classroom) felt that teacher education courses should enable music teachers to cope with the
extra responsibilities such as extra-curricular commitments expected in their workplace. This
resonates with other findings in the literature above (Auh, 2006).

Table 3 Comparison of Pre-service and Early-career Teachers’ Perceptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-service teachers’ categories</th>
<th>Early-career teachers’ categories</th>
<th>Early-career and pre-service teachers’ combined categories</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How to teach knowledge and skills; The ability to apply musical knowledge to practice</td>
<td>Knowing how to teach Music teaching techniques</td>
<td>Pedagogical content skills and knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of preparation and planning techniques</td>
<td>Planning lessons and work plans</td>
<td>Planning skills and knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practical knowledge of which techniques will work; the opportunity to practice these techniques</td>
<td>Practicum ‘hands-on’ experience</td>
<td>Putting knowledge and skills into a practical context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisation skills</td>
<td>Classroom and behaviour management</td>
<td>Management knowledge and skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ability to plan/organise performance and extra-curricular events</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity to develop appropriate resources</td>
<td>Music repertoire and resource development; Developing new and varied strategies, resources and repertoire for teaching</td>
<td>Music repertoire and resource development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop aural skills; broaden musical skills and knowledge</td>
<td>Aural perceptions skills; confidence in content knowledge/skills</td>
<td>Musical skills and knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding and representing the cultural and social location of music in Australian society</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment strategies</td>
<td>Capacity to adapt to the teaching environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Networking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Knowledge of learners and their characteristics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Skills on classroom instruments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Adapted from Harrison & Ballantyne (2005)
This perception of early-career teachers also has support in the literature: Conway’s (2002, p. 32) study of administrators and mentors suggested that pre-service teachers needed better preparation for the administrative part of the position. Comments included: “I wish there were some way for these new teachers to know more about budgets and dealing with parents”, and ‘He is a good teacher, but he really struggled with the administrative piece of the job.” Wheeley’s (2002, p. 37) study provides a list of 28 management tasks required of performing arts teachers. While these are too numerous to be listed here, the broader grouping of these tasks into planning, financial, physical, human resource and other management skills is worthy of note.

The themes emerging from the literature were identified as follows:

1. The time for change is ripe, with recent research of Ballantyne (2005, 2006), Auh (2006), Chapman (2006) and others, along with the National Review of School Music Education (Pascoe et.al. 2005) confirming the need for renaissance in music teacher education.

2. Music teacher role is different from other teachers’ roles. Teachers of music are required to perform distinctive functions. Therefore their identity construction is unique, combining musician, teacher and music teacher activities. The teaching of knowledge, skills and attributes of music teachers requires further research.

3. The construction of music teacher identity through teacher education is a specific field of enquiry. The implications for content and delivery of knowledge, skills and attributes in courses at pre-service and in-service phases need to be thoroughly investigated.

By way of summarizing this literature, Jorgensen (2003, p. 4) maintains that music teacher preparation requires a

broad education, academic challenge, extensive opportunities to practise the art of teaching guided by experienced mentors who exemplify the highest professionalism in their lives and work, high academic and musical expectations, and time to reflect on that practice.
The literature also provided suggestions for a methodological framework to be employed in the project. An exploration of data-gathering methods and analytical frameworks was implicit in the literature review, alongside the content described above. The method explained in Chapter 3 below also has its foundations in the literature.
CHAPTER THREE
PROJECT STRUCTURE

Preamble

This chapter seeks to identify the process through which the perceptions can be gathered from pre-service and experienced music teachers for the purpose of informing music teacher education practices.

To reiterate, the questions underpinning this volume are:

1. What knowledge, skills and attributes does a music teacher need to possess?
2. How do these qualities contribute to constructing music teacher identity?
3. How can the knowledge, skills and attributes required of music teachers be shaped into the essential components of teacher education in music?

In order to answer these questions, the methodology is framed around the perceptions and experiences of pre-service and in-service music teachers and how these perceptions can assist in the design of essential components of music teacher education courses.

A range of methods was employed to gather data for the project. Three forms of gathering evidence were employed:

- Surveys (phases 1, 2 and 3);
- Charting of life histories through “rivers” (phases 2 and 3); and
- Interviews (phase 4).

Rationale for methodology

The methodology is founded on qualitative facets of research (Hemingway & Gough, 2000, p. 167). In reflecting on earlier projects by the author in the field of music teachers’ identity (Harrison, 2004, 2005) quantitative styles alone were found to be inadequate in providing the
necessary complexity of data for analysis. In consultation with recent literature it was thought that a mixed method may provide a richer source of data and the use of qualitative styles were therefore investigated. 

In broad terms, the work of Merriam (1998, p. 5) gives a description of the essential components of qualitative research being

The goal of eliciting understanding and meaning, the researcher as the primary instrument of data collection and analysis, the use of fieldwork, and inductive orientation to analysis and findings that are richly descriptive.

Merriam’s description provides a framework for the style of study to be undertaken in relation in the general literature on qualitative methods. As this study concerns music education, more specific literature has been sourced. Flinders and Richardson (2002, p. 1167), in the New Handbook of Research on Music Teaching and Learning, review the general literature and describe music education research as

A hybrid of field… relying on disciplines such as education, psychology, sociology, anthropology, and even ethnomusicology for both methods of enquiry and organizing concepts, attempting to adapt and apply these methods to the study of music teaching and learning.

Flinders and Richardson’s (2002, p. 1160) definitions of qualitative research are also of interest in the approach to this project. They define qualitative research as

1. A systematic form of empirical enquiry that usually uses some type of fieldwork;
2. Fieldwork that is more than the mechanical record of their observations;
3. Studies that assume an interpretive focus;
4. A process that works with samples of voluntary participants.

Aspects of each of these definitions were employed in this project. Collins (2005, p. 29) concluded that music education is about making links and connections between what is understood and what is experienced on an emotional and musical intelligence level. These connections, Collins concludes, “are often more complex than they [the subject] are able to express.” The foundation of the research in a qualitative framework is also supported by the
philosophy of Dewey (1938) who referred to the conflict between scientists who aim to state meaning and artists who aim to express meaning. The emphasis on expression and its inherent difficulties in research terms were noted by Flinders and Richardson (2002, p. 1169) who claim that, within the next 10 years,

Qualitative studies will yield insights that have parallels with the insights gained from music experiences, for both can be powerful, emotion-laden and difficult to put into words.

As a result of the investigation of literature in qualitative research and music education research, a mixed methodology formed the basis of this project. The nature of the study, coupled with the challenges of investigating three separate cohorts (pre-service general teachers, pre-service specialist teachers, and experienced teachers), supports the decision to incorporate a variety of approaches to data gathering and analysis (Miles & Huberman, 1994).

Questionnaires in Phases 1 and 2 of the research were conducted in person, on paper, by an independent investigator. For Phase 3, the questionnaire was administered via e-mail. The researcher has employed the e-mail method of data collection on other studies (Harrison 2003, 2004) and found it suitable in this instance for a number of reasons: The asynchronous nature of e-mail communication allows the information to be readily obtained, with participants’ responses given at a convenient time, regardless of location. E-mail format allows the researcher to interact with the participant, ensuring clarification on issues arising from questions posed. Additional features of these type of interaction (as found by Im & Chee, 2003) include financial cost-saving, “as they do not require long-distance travel and the expenses of paper, pencils, photo-copying, and mailing fees.” Beck (2005 p. 412) noted that costs could be further minimised, as this form of data collection does not require transcription.

Despite the limitations of the self-reporting survey (Fortney et al., 1993), it was a practical way of gathering the desired data from a large, diverse sample. A similar approach was used in the preliminary studies described in chapter 2 above. The experience of the researcher in using similar data-gathering methods helped to minimise difficulties in the questioning strategy. The method in this instance is not used in isolation, but in conjunction with other methods including interviews, discussion and review of documents. The validity of the research is dependent on the interplay of each of these elements.
The second approach to data gathering incorporated a charting of life history. According to Connelly and Clandinin (1999, p. 95), the professional identity of teachers is a "story to live by," multifaceted, composed, sustained and changed in the course of a teacher’s life. Professional identities are born and grow into the histories of teachers. Starting point for some are early, for others, later…

Life history, the departure point for the field work with experienced teachers, has a strong foundation in the literature (Baker, 2005; Faraday & Plummer, 2003) and has the capacity to allow teachers to reflect openly about their own experiences.

Pre-service and experienced music teachers were therefore encouraged to map their experience as a series of episodes on a “river”. This technique has its basis in person construct psychology (Denicolo & Pope, 1990, 2001; Pope & Denicolo, 1993). Literature in Life-History, as described by Knowles (1993), also contributed to the use of rivers (or snakes) as means of data gathering. This process is designed to uncover “what teachers themselves find important in their practice and personal backgrounds” (Tickle, 2000, p. 7). In so doing, it aims to discover some of the truths about their identities through the telling of stories and identification of critical incidents within those narratives. Johnson (2004, p. 425) also supports such an approach: “teacher research relying on narrative enquiry should focus on more powerful ways of telling personal experience stories using a combination of verbal and visual language resources.”

The combination of verbal and visual language incorporated critical incident charting as employed by Tripp (1993) and Anderson (1997). The river technique was therefore used for participants to reflect on significant events in their lives. Pope and Denicolo (1993, p. 540) suggest that participants should be asked to “visualize their lives as a winding snake, in which each turn represents a personal experience of a critical incident that influenced the direction their career took.” In the current study, significant incidents in the candidates’ life histories were documented through written form or drawings along the length of the winding river on an A4 sheet of paper in the manner employed by Burnard (2003, April; 2004) and Baker (2005) in their investigations of music teacher identity. Specifically, the method employed by Burnard (2003, 2004) and Baker (2005) requested experienced music teachers to draw a river
and mark, at bends in the river, the most influential moments, people or events that, on reflection, influenced the course of their lives from that point. Participants were then asked to reflect, in interview, on the choice and location of these moments, people or events on the river. While Baker (2005) identified five career phases, categorised by age, this research has adhered to the view that there are three phases: pre-service, early-career and experienced (Ballantyne, 2004, December, 2005; Harrison, 2005). This is not to say that there are not other stages that contribute to the eventual construction of teacher identity, but these are not necessarily age-based. As recent Queensland-based research had been conducted into early-career teachers’ pedagogical content knowledge and skills (Ballantyne, 2004, December, 2005, 2006; Ballantyne & Packer, 2004), it was decided to investigate pre-service and experienced teachers in this study. Auh (2004, p. 18) claims that “pre-service students’ beliefs are important because they might affect the way they learn to teach” and that these beliefs are tacit and unexamined.

Interviews were selected for the final stage of the research. Frey and Oshi (1995, p. 1) define an interview as “a purposeful conversation in which one person asks prepared questions (interviewer) and another answers them (respondent)”. Given that the respondents had completed a structured questionnaire and a river, a semi-structured interview approach was selected. The purpose of the interviews was to pursue the contents of the questionnaire and the rivers in greater detail.

The support of the river model with interviews was advocated by Pope and Denicolo (1993, p. 542) who stated: “Further conversations may be needed beyond the snake… they only provide information and a basis for structural/content analysis.” Given the responses to questionnaire and river, the semi-structured interview was also informal. This style of interview was considered appropriate because, as Nichols (1991, p. 131) suggests, in “an informal interview, not structured by a standard list of questions, the interviewer can choose to deal with the topics of interest in any order, and to phrase their questions as they think best.” While structured interviews are easily more readily quantifiable and allow for more direct comparisons, semi-structured interviews can reveal a “richness of data” (Oatley, 1999, p. 1) and cause the data to be viewed through a completely different lens.
Recruitment of participants

For pre-service teachers, the researcher provided questionnaires to students enrolled in Education programs at a university in Queensland. The type of sampling employed here is *convenience sampling* (Bradburn and Sudman, 1988), as the participants were selected on the basis of ease of contact. Students ranged in age from 19 to approximately 50 years of age. Students in general programs and specialist music programs were surveyed. The group were invited to participate via anonymous questionnaire after assessment procedures had been completed for the semester. Recruitment was voluntary and participants were informed of the processes as explained in the complete informed consent package.

*Maximum variation sampling* was used to select the participants for the interviews as it enabled the identification of “common patterns across great variation” (Glesne, 1999, p. 29). Participants were selected to represent varied teaching experiences in primary, secondary, co-educational, single-sex, private and state settings. Experienced teachers were recruited through professional contacts. In this sense, elements of *purposive sampling* were also employed as the experienced teachers were selected on the basis of the expertise in the field of study. Appendix 3 provides the information distributed to these participants requesting their involvement.

Data Classification and Analysis

The purpose of the data analysis was to find similarities and differences between the themes emerging in relation to pre-service and experienced music teachers’ perceptions of the desirable attributes of effective music teachers; and to draw conclusions from their other responses. In the field of music education research, Bartel (2006, p.360) claims, “analysis is essentially a process of simplification, a process of creating order within the represented reality that allows for meaning making.” On completion of the data-gathering phase, the interview data were transcribed for “further comparative examination” (Bartel, p. 360), maintaining the integrity of the data and avoiding the tendency to “dissolve all complexity” (Shenk, 1997, p. 157). This was achieved by taking the following measures:

- Transcripts were forwarded to participants for verification of the accuracy of the content.
• The responses were collated and analysed to find similar themes and trends. Ways in which the responses differed radically from each other and the factors that may have contributed to those differences were also noted.

• The data were subjected to content analysis (Cavana, Delahaye, & Sekaran, 2001) to relate it to the literature and identify themes, concepts and meanings (Burns, 2000).

There is no intention in the research to hold the responses as “truth” rather as “accounts.” These accounts are a product of the time and place in which they are made and, if the same question was asked again at a different time in a different place, it is acknowledged that the answer could be different.

A number of strategies have been used to ensure the analysis is well argued and draws appropriate conclusions. The use of e-mail for the initial data collection meant that the subjects’ own words are used in the examples given in the discussion below. In addition to retention of the transcripts, supplementary data have been retained. Wherever feasible, detailed quotes have been included to illustrate the argument and to ensure responses are not quoted out of context. Using a technique employed by Plummer (1999) and Green (1997), more than one response (or quote) has been included in instances when different candidates have given similar responses to each issue. The meanings of these quotes are related to the existing literature as outlined in the preceding chapters. One of the reasons for providing such a detailed account of the literature is to make clear and valid connections between the current findings and research to date.

In analyzing aspects of critical incidents in written, verbal or visual form, an attempt was made to identify time chronologies for particular events, the identification and frequency of themes, significance, (how much time or space a particular topic occupies) and consequences. These aspects of analysis were employed as indicators of the importance of specific events to the person (Burnard 2003, April; P. Burnard, personal communication, February 8, 2006; Denzin, 1994; Pope & Denicolo, 1993).

Elements of critical incident technique were used to identify and categorize critical incidents following the guidelines espoused by Flanagan (1954). The critical incident technique (CIT) relies on the idea that critical incidents will be memorable, making their capture possible through interview, observation or self report. Critical reflections were used by Newman
(1993) as a way of getting teachers to tell their stories regarding valuable experiences in teaching. In applying CIT to aspects of teacher education, Alastuey, Justice, Weeks and Hardy (2005, p. 41) noted a range of identifiable features relevant to this research, including “an enjoyment of working with children” and “personal influences.”

By using a number of related data analysis strategies, richness in the connectedness of themes, concepts and meanings could be achieved.

**Structure of data collection**

The overall structure of data gathering took place in four phases. In both questionnaires and interviews, the questions were devised on the basis of the three questions underpinning the study. In phases one and two, the emphasis was on the first of these (What knowledge, skills and attributes does a music teacher need to possess?) In phases three and four, there was some reflection by respondents on the first question, but the main focus was on second and third questions (How do these qualities contribute to constructing music teacher identity and how can the knowledge, skills and attributes required of music teachers be shaped into the essential components of teacher education in music?). It should be noted that, given the semi-structured nature of interviews, the questions described in phase 3 (below) are indicative rather than verbatim examples. The questions for all phases were piloted in the previous studies by the author in the literature cited above.

**Phase 1**

Questionnaires were given to pre-service general teachers (n=149), asking

1. What did you want to find out about music teaching and learning?
2. What did you want to know about music itself?
3. In what ways do you believe music and/or other arts can enhance learning in other areas of education?
4. What qualities or attributes do you believe it is important for teachers to possess?
5. Do you have any other comment to make about the music aspect of your pre-service teacher education program?
Phase 2
Questionnaires were given to pre-service music teachers (n=15), asking
1. What do you want to find out about music teaching and learning?
2. What do you want to know about music itself?
3. What else do you think you need in your pre-service program?
4. How can aspects of delivery be developed in music education?
5. What qualities or attributes do you believe it is important for teachers to possess?
6. Do you have any other comment to make about your pre-service music teacher education program?
7. Can you describe any critical incidents that encouraged you to undertake a pre-service music program? *

* There was an opportunity for respondents to reflect on this in prose and/or placing critical incidents on a river.

Phase 3
Questionnaires were given to experienced music teachers (n=12), including the questions:
1. Outline your experience as a teacher.
2. Do you perceive yourself as a musician, teacher, music teacher or something else?
3. Describe your ideal teacher education course.
4. What is the role of continuous learning in teacher education?
5. What qualities or attributes do you believe it is important for teachers to possess?
6. Do you have any other comments relevant to this research project?
7. Can you describe any critical incidents that shaped your identity as a music teacher? *

* There was an opportunity for respondents to reflect on this in prose and/or placing critical incidents on a river.

Phase 4
Interviews were undertaken with experienced teachers (n=6) who teach in a variety of contexts (primary, middle school, secondary, government, private, single sex and co-educational) in order to gain greater depth of understanding into their responses. A video recording and a written transcription of each interview were produced. The raw data were analysed to identify which themes corresponded to the literature. The types of questions asked in the interviews were:
1. You have described your experiences as a teacher, what were your earliest memories of music in the home, at school and/or in the broader community?

2. You have self-identified as a (musician/teacher/music teacher). On what basis have you made this judgement?

3. Reflect on your pre-service course and the strengths and weaknesses you can see in it now. How you would have changed it to more adequately prepare you for the reality of teaching?

4. Consider the pre-service teachers you have had on practicum. What were their strengths and weaknesses? Were these related to their early experiences of music, their course, or some other factor?

5. How would you divide up the content of teacher education into pre-service and professional learning? What are the essential elements to include in the pre-service phase?

6. What advice do you have for beginning teachers?

In summary, the methods used were based in qualitative research methods, with the influence of recent music education research to inform the precise nature of data collection and analysis. A qualitative approach was used to analyse the frequency of themes. As music education research is hybrid in form (Flinders & Richardson, 2002, p. 1167), a complex combination of surveys, visual representations and interviews was employed encompassing elements of ethnography, life history and critical incident charting. The data were analysed to ascertain time chronologies for particular events, frequency and significance of themes and consequences. In this instance, consequences imply implications for music teacher education.

The first part of this book has provided a scaffold on which the fieldwork can be based. The context, relevant literature in teacher identity and music teacher identity, along with preliminary studies, informed the methodology. The next four chapters describe the findings in each of the four phases. Chapters 4 and 5 present the findings in relation to pre-service general and specialist music teachers respectively, while Chapters 6 and 7 outline the findings in relation to experienced teachers. Specifically, Chapter 6 explains the findings of the surveys of experienced teachers, while Chapter 7 provides the results of interviews with six experienced teachers. Chapters 8 and 9 draw conclusions from the data and present ideas for implementation of the findings.
In this chapter, responses related to the first research question were reported. This question asks: What knowledge, skills and attributes does a music teacher need to possess? The respondents in this phase of the study were general primary teachers, so the emphasis was on what content, skills and attributes they would require to teach music on their classrooms and what they would expect of the specialist music teachers. Respondents were also questioned as to the role of music in their classrooms, as this has an impact on the knowledge, skills and attributes required. The methodology employed in the study allowed for the inclusion of open-ended questions. Questions of this nature regularly provided rich data that would not be obtained from responses to other questions. In this instance, the open-ended question related to their course and answers gave some preliminary indications of aspects of the third research question: how can the knowledge, skills and attributes required of music teachers be shaped into the essential components of teacher education in music?

In Phase 1 of the study reported here, general pre-service primary teachers enrolled in a compulsory music course at a university in Queensland were asked to respond to a series of questions in relation to their course. Students were in the second semester of their second year of study. An academic who was not involved in their assessment processes administered the surveys. Out of a potential 181 students, 149 responded.

1. What did you want to find out about music teaching and learning?

In broad terms, these responses typically began with the words “how” and “what”. Emerging themes therefore included pedagogical skills, advocacy skills and suggestions focusing on the role of the general teacher in music education.

The “how to” responses could be more correctly described as pedagogical skills. These included, for example, how to explain key concepts using appropriate terminology, how to teach relevant outcomes and how to apply knowledge in a practical way. Some respondents referred specifically to music skills: how to use solfa and how to plan music lessons. Others
referred more directly to engaging and motivating students at all levels in the teaching of music and other key learning areas, along with using music in a “fun” way, without resorting to theoretical concepts.

Another theme in the “pedagogical” responses was strongly related to advocacy: how to make music an inclusive activity that is accessible for every child, particularly those with special needs. How to use music as a means of self-expression also featured in the responses.

The “what” responses generally described content-focused issues, along with teacher role and resource concerns. These ranged from the relevance of materials covered in lectures to curriculum documents and choice of repertoire. The responses are shown in Table 4 below.

Table 4 General Pre-service Teacher Responses on Music Teaching and Learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generic pedagogical themes</th>
<th>Advocacy and motivational themes</th>
<th>Role/Resource themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How you can use music to enhance a classroom [environment] #</td>
<td>How to motivate and encourage upper primary school levels</td>
<td>What is the role of the classroom teacher in music education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to teach relevant levels and outcomes</td>
<td>How to engage students without using boring theory</td>
<td>What I would be expected to teach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to integrate with other Key learning areas</td>
<td>How to adapt lessons to the age level of the students</td>
<td>What we learnt in lectures is what it is really like in school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to apply my knowledge in a practical way</td>
<td>How to teach in a fun way</td>
<td>What the primary school curriculum is about</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical pedagogical skill</td>
<td>How music can benefit children in the classroom</td>
<td>What repertoire to teach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to explain key concepts using appropriate terminology</td>
<td>How to create a love of music in children</td>
<td>What resources to use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to use sol-fa</td>
<td>How to make music accessible for every child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to plan music lessons</td>
<td>How to incorporate music for special needs students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to manage a choir, if there is no specialist</td>
<td>How to get students to express themselves</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>How to use music as an inclusive activity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>How to use music for therapeutic purposes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# As these responses were from general primary students, the notion that music could be used to create an atmosphere for specific types of learning was referred to by some respondents. For example, so used music to create an environment for relaxation after the lunch break
2. **What did you want to know about music itself?**

The responses to this question related to performance, music literacy and musical knowledge. Students wanted to know how to play the recorder more effectively, to sing in solfa and understand the process of composing and arranging. Some students also wanted to learn more repertoire for general classroom and specific music sessions. In relation to music literacy, students wanted to know more about the history, structure and function of solfa, as well as its practical application. General knowledge skills included musical history, structure and stylistic awareness.

3. **In what ways do you believe music and/or other arts can enhance learning in other areas of education?**

Students’ reflections on this question fell into three categories: the use of music/arts to develop generic skills development, the cross-disciplinary advantages of the arts, and their use as a management tool. In the opinion of this cohort, generic skills included creativity, confidence, discipline and concentration. The role of music/arts as a way of enhancing learning in the more traditional areas (Maths and English) was a feature of many replies. Music was also seen as a means of managing students in transition or to calm students after a more “energetic” activity. These skills were variously classified as generic skills, cross-disciplinary advantaged and the arts as a management tool, as described in Table 5.

Several pre-service teachers commented in a more open-ended fashion in relation to the capacity of music to enhance learning. One collected many of the thoughts expressed in Table 5 above as:

Tara: Music stimulates people and (depending on the teacher) allows students to be more creative, expressive and less inhibited. These spread across into confidence in group presentations and speaking in front of others and creativity in completing assignments etcetera
Table 5 General Pre-service Teacher Responses on how Arts Enhances Learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generic skill development</th>
<th>Cross-disciplinary advantages</th>
<th>Arts as a management tool</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Potential for engagement</td>
<td>Increases cognitive and conceptual schema</td>
<td>Calms and motivates students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outlet for creativity</td>
<td>As a means of developing core subject skills (e.g., maths)</td>
<td>As a transition between other activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relates real life skills</td>
<td>Increases body awareness</td>
<td>Gives students a break from other subjects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develops unique forms of expression</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crosses ability and age levels</td>
<td>Establishes alternate neural pathways</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As a confidence booster</td>
<td>As an aid to memorisation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group activities assist in social development</td>
<td>Cross-curricular advantages</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develops interpersonal skills</td>
<td>Develops motor skill</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaches discipline and concentration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The cross-disciplinary aspects of the arts were captured in this response:

Ursula: Arts can be related to any topic in the classroom and may be used to reinforce concepts, depending on the child’s learning style

The final comment in response to this question focuses on the capacity of the arts to act a leveler:

Chris: [It] provides a student with an opportunity to succeed, which motivates student at school, provides a different learning medium, catering for different learning styles. It appeals to all students – not just the most intelligent.

4. **What qualities or attributes do you believe it is important for teachers to possess?**

The qualities described here are classified into broad categories of generic, content, empathetic, communicative, social justice and self-awareness attributes. As there were no predetermined qualities from which students could select, the categories were established by the actual words used in the responses and in accordance with the literature discussed above.
General pre-service teachers placed heavy emphasis on generic attributes, followed by social justice and empathetic attributes. Content and management attributes were considered less significant. In specific terms, flexibility, open-mindedness, patience and a sense of humour consistently ranked among the highest responses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generic Attributes</th>
<th>Content and Management Attributes</th>
<th>Empathetic Attributes</th>
<th>Communicative Attributes</th>
<th>Social Justice Attributes</th>
<th>Self Awareness Attributes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Flexibility</td>
<td>Love of/Knowledge of content</td>
<td>Understanding</td>
<td>Ability to engage</td>
<td>Open mind</td>
<td>Willingness to learn new things/lifelong learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patience</td>
<td>Organization &amp; time management</td>
<td>Approachability</td>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>Love for helping children</td>
<td>Determination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of humour and fun</td>
<td>Performance skills</td>
<td>Compassionate</td>
<td>Ability to relate</td>
<td>Equity and Inclusivity</td>
<td>Self-reflection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enthusiasm</td>
<td></td>
<td>Respect</td>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>Desire to give students opportunities</td>
<td>Humility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passion</td>
<td></td>
<td>Friendliness</td>
<td>Encouraging</td>
<td>Acceptance</td>
<td>Wisdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creativity</td>
<td></td>
<td>Honest/Trust</td>
<td></td>
<td>Dedicatred</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence</td>
<td></td>
<td>Kindness</td>
<td>Child-centred practices</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive attitude</td>
<td></td>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td></td>
<td>Tolerance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Role model/ good person</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Do you have any other comment to make about the music aspect of your pre-service teacher education program?

Almost all students commented in a positive way about the structure, organization and management of the course. Other responses to this question fitted into two broad categories: the students who enjoyed the course and those who were critical of some of the content. Positive responses included references to “the best course this year” and “should be embedded throughout our entire program.”

Other comments concerned the placement of the course in the overall program, a lack of relevance for the recorder playing aspect of the course, and suggestions that the theoretical elements were too detailed for this, a non-specialist, cohort.
Again, some pre-service teachers commented in detail in response to this question. Positive reactions included:

David: It was amazing to have my eyes opened to the musical elements and terminology. Also interesting to see how music can be integrated into all the Key Learning Areas.

Evelyn: I loved the way my tutor taught music – fun, great communication skills. Both convenor and tutor have a great attitude/enthusiasm, which fired me up; reminded me how much I love music.

This comment reflected the feeling of a large proportion of the group, emphasising the nature of the course content and the reality that many schools in the state of Queensland (more than 80%) have music specialists:

Freda: I don’t think classroom teachers should have to teach music – incorporating music is different, but otherwise music teaching should be specialised.

This student eloquently put a widely held view forward, as a suggestion for improving the course content:

Gabby: No recorders – bring in instruments that students can use outside – keyboards, guitars. I don’t believe kids enjoy the recorder and think many have a negative perception before they even start. Make music cool.

Summary

The central focus of this chapter was to report responses related to the first research question: *what knowledge, skills and attributes does a music teacher need to possess?*

General pre-service teachers emphasized the importance of pedagogical skills, advocacy skills and the role of the general teacher in music education. Specifically in relation to music knowledge and skills, this cohort noted performance, music literacy and musical knowledge as being important components of their course. The value of music and other arts was seen in the use of music/arts to develop generic skills development, in the cross-disciplinary advantages of the arts and their use as a management tool. Desirable attributes identified by
this cohort included an emphasis on generic, social justice and empathetic attributes. Responses to aspects of the third research question (how can the knowledge, skills and attributes required of music teachers be shaped into the essential components of teacher education in music?) were also evident in participants’ reflections on their teacher education course. Students were generally positive about their course, with notable exceptions in the content relating to theory and recorder playing.
CHAPTER FIVE

PRE-SERVICE MUSIC TEACHERS

In this chapter, responses related to the first research question were also reported. This question asks: *What knowledge, skills and attributes does a music teacher need to possess?*

The respondents in this phase of the study were pre-service specialist teachers, so the emphasis was on what content, skills and attributes they believed would be required to teach music. The questions asked of this group directed them to identify pedagogical and musical skills, as well defining attributes required of music teachers. The second research question (*How do these qualities contribute to constructing music teacher identity*) was not a primary focus at this phase of the study. However, several participants gave some indication as to the construction of their identity in describing critical incidents that influenced their decision to undertake a pre-service music education program. The methodology employed in the study allowed for the inclusion of open-ended questions. In this instance, two open-ended questions related to the overall content of their pre-service program the response to which gave some indications of aspects of the third research question: *how can the knowledge, skills and attributes required of music teachers be shaped into the essential components of teacher education in music?*

In Phase 2, students enrolled in a Bachelor of Education pre-service music specialisation were asked to respond to a series of questions on a survey. The students (n=15) were taking a third year curriculum class and had completed two years of discipline subjects in music. An academic who was not involved in their assessment processes administered the surveys. They were asked:

1. What do you want to find out about music teaching and learning?
2. What do want to know about music itself?
3. What else do you think you need in your pre-service program?
4. What qualities or attributes do you believe it is important for teachers to possess?
5. Do you have any other comment to make about your pre-service music teacher education program?
6. Can you describe any critical incidents that encouraged you to undertake a pre-service music program? Respondents were asked to reflect on this by placing critical incidents on a “river.”

1. **What do you want to find out about music teaching and learning?**

As with the general pre-service teachers, these responses, with one exception, could also be categorized into “how” and “what” issues. The one exception was a response that simply said: “I want to find out about everything!” (Kate). There were themes of general pedagogical skills, music pedagogy skills and co-curricular-based skills evident in the responses.

The pedagogically focused (or “how to”) responses related to engagement, motivation and behaviour management. Of the music-specific responses, some, as with the general primary pre-service teachers, referred to using music in a “fun” way and finding the balance with students from diverse musical and cultural backgrounds.

The “what” responses tended to have a more broad focus than pure content, with mention of repertoire choice, musicianship skills and co-curricular management, as shown in Table 7 below.

### Table 7 Music Pre-service Teacher Responses on Music Teaching and Learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generic themes</th>
<th>Music-specific themes</th>
<th>Management themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How to engage students</td>
<td>How to balance students of varying musical abilities</td>
<td>What kind of rehearsal strategies and techniques maintain interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to make good relationships with students</td>
<td>How to include music from the outside world</td>
<td>What approaches to use in multi-media and technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to communicate effectively</td>
<td>How to include culturally diverse music</td>
<td>What organizational skills I’ll need</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to balance enjoyment with behaviour management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to challenge individual students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to apply different philosophies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to develop my own individual style of teaching</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A small number of students chose to give more extended responses to this question. One such response concentrated on the application of philosophy to practice:

Emily: I want to learn more about the different music philosophies and how to apply them not only in the school/classroom, but also in instrumental music lessons.

Another came with an open mind, but some insecurity in relation to his/her musical background and skills:

Harry: At this stage I consider myself a fairly blank canvas. I only have a few semesters of secondary music education at a very basic level. I want to find out what will engage music students; how to successfully connect and to foster a lifelong appreciation of music.

This response was echoed by other students who stated:

Colin: I still have a lot to learn about music and think that teaching other people is the best way to learn and solidify/clarify my own ideas.

Steven: I think reasonable amount of musical competency is important but as a teacher we need to know how to find resources and how to deal with teaching it; how to be flexible and organised.

2. What do want to know about music itself?

Responses to this question were very specifically focussed on music skills and their application in the school environment. As with the general pre-service teachers, there was an interest in connecting with the “third environment”: the place other than home or school in which music takes place. Skills included playing instruments, ensemble management (including conducting), vocal training and the integration of these skills with the real world. Again, a small number of students responded at greater length, generally giving comments that concerned music skills:
Nathan: I feel I have learned a lot of music theory stuff and music history stuff, which has been great, but as a musician I feel lacking in practical skills.

Jenny: I am interested in pursuing studies in better vocal technique – as well as brushing up on my once-well-used keyboard and aural skills.

Emily: I want to be able to refine my own technique, which is far from perfect, especially in the more practical areas of music: the things I want to improve are singing and solfa, and refining my technique and approach to guitar and piano playing.

Only one respondent was a little more blasé about the development of music skills:

Daryl: I just need to know enough music, so that I can “wing it!”

Another student had a more positive view:

Richard: I’d like to know how music could have a positive effect on human development. How it can unite people from all cultures.

3. **What else do you think you need in your pre-service program?**

Respondents were generally satisfied that their pre-service course had covered many of the aspects required for entry to the workforce. A range of specific and broader knowledge and skills were referred to in the responses, including confidence in applying knowledge, budgeting skills, advocacy, practical skills in music and pedagogy and how to find suitable resources. Comments relating to this question focussed on the practical application of generic and musical skills with some emphasis on co-curricular involvement:

Graham: If we really will be taking choirs and instrument groups I would like to know more about singing, conducting and just leading groups.

Jenny: Budgeting skills and ways in which to lobby for more funding for the music department.
Harry: …not just knowledge, but the nerve to stand up and teach it successfully – not just surviving the class. I also need to stop feeling incompetent when I compare myself to the others in my cohort.

4. **What qualities or attributes do you believe it is important for teachers to possess?**

As with Phase 1, the qualities described here are classified into broad categories of generic, content, empathetic, and social justice attributes. A notable omission was any mention of self-awareness attributes, such as those identified by the general pre-service teachers (humility, wisdom, etc.). Unlike the Phase 1 data, these responses were not given numerical values, as the size of the cohort was considerably smaller than the general pre-service cohort. Patience, sense of humour and flexibility again ranked highly, as shown in Table 8 below.

**Table 8 Qualities/attributes Considered Important by Pre-service Music Teachers**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generic Attributes</th>
<th>Content/Management Attributes</th>
<th>Empathetic Attributes</th>
<th>Communicative Attributes</th>
<th>Social Justice Attributes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Patience</td>
<td>Time management skills</td>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>Willingness to pass on knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of Humour</td>
<td>Musical skills</td>
<td>Integrity</td>
<td>Interpersonal skills</td>
<td>Respect for learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open-mindedness/</td>
<td>Love of subject matter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flexible</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enthusiasm</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passion</td>
<td>Knowledgeable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confident</td>
<td>Knowledge of /respect for all musical styles</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pre-service music specialists commented at some length regarding the qualities or attributes they believe they needed to possess, with communication featuring strongly in many responses:

Colin: A real love and enthusiasm for what we are teaching, patience and empathy and the ability to project a real purpose and relativity to what we are teaching. Teachers need good communication skills, but above all, good intuition into the needs of students.
Lionel: It is important for teachers to show students why they want to be there. I love music and I want to share that through teaching. This type of communication is just as important as being able to teach the content of the student.

Nathan: It’s important for music teachers to have a wide/extensive specific musical knowledge but more importantly, the teacher must be able to communicate this musical knowledge in a supportive environment that should be positive, fun and promote music making and active engagement in a non-threatening way.

Two students commented on the need for possession of generic skills:

Steven: A teacher should be a kind of jack-of-all-trades. Teachers will have to teach and facilitate more than just their particular subject knowledge and paint an overall picture that a student absorbs in their own way.

Nora: Music teachers (as with teachers in general) need to be strategic. They need a toolbox of teaching strategies of [sic] which they can draw on in varying contexts. With this, teachers can give their students a toolbox of learning strategies they can draw on in varying context and lifelong. Teacher must know their students as children/adolescents first, then as learners.

5. Do you have any other comment to make about your pre-service music teacher education program?

Having already responded to the question in relation to perceived needs in a pre-service program, responses to this question either reiterated the earlier remarks or offered the opportunity to provide more personal remarks such as “I’m packing it about prac” (Ingrid) and “I’m determined to make it!” (Harry).

Some pre-service music teachers responded in a more expansive manner, commenting on curriculum and competence issues:

Penny: The in-depth knowledge of the curriculum and the various ways to implement the attainable objectives and outcomes have helped me to grasp some idea as to how,
when and what knowledge needs to be known by me as a teacher and as a student. I have gained confidence in my teaching and knowledge of the subject. I think confidence is a key trait to have when teaching and learning.

These comments also reflect a positive response to the teacher training program:

Nathan: The lectures and workshops have gone a long way to improving and developing practical music and classroom skills, including planning. Things that are overlooked (i.e., personality, broad knowledge) have been covered – these are important.

Lionel: I found that the material we covered has been relevant and a great re-cap.

Respondents also reflected on the need for more practical skills in keyboard and conducting and further generic skills about how to interview well and coping with changes in syllabi. One comment pertained to the provision of a program that is double music: either primary and secondary music specialisation and/or classroom and instrumental specialisation:

Mary: It would be great if there was a program outside of doing a Bachelor of Music in which we could teach primary and secondary music without a different teaching area.

6. Can you describe any critical incidents that encouraged you to undertake a pre-service music program?

Critical incidents in the lives of pre-service teachers tended to focus on early childhood family experiences, school music teachers who were strong positive (and occasionally negative) role models, and studio music teachers who established a relationship with them and provided opportunities. In few cases, it was the experience of music in the third environment that brought about change in the music pathway. Many students (n=8/15) took advantage of the offer to present their critical incidences on a river. The comments below are drawn from the rivers (which can be seen in full in Appendix 1). The comments should be read in conjunction with the rivers to give a perspective on their position in relation to other events in the pre-service teachers’ lives.
While the presentation format for the critical incidents varied from the written form to the visual, the themes from the written form were also prevalent in the rivers. Early childhood experiences, for example, included comments on the home environment:

Colin: …Childhood experiences of singing with the family

Ingrid: …First musical memory – hearing Graceland in the tape player of Mum and Dad’s car

Kate: Pushed into instruments from parents… young boy, country town playing violin, not happy about it… continued and eventually appreciated my parents’ exposing me to instruments at a young age

Others remarked on the critical role school music played in their musical development:

Jenny: Not exposed to much music until grade 4 when I started learning guitar

Graham: I thank my school music program; we were given a wide music experience in choir, band and orchestra

Harry: Grade 4 testing for instrumental music program in a very small school

Comments on the role of music teachers, studio and classroom, featured strongly, and at critical points in pre-service teachers’ musical development:

Daryl: Started lessons with an amazing teacher: can only hope to be like her

Graham: Senior school music teacher’s personality made learning enjoyable; Instrumental teacher at uni gave inspiration, conductor gave me inspiration to be a musician – teaching, performing, and composing

Harry: Very bad music teacher…1st great band conductor, played great music, enjoyed ensemble
Ingrid: Two very good music teachers who were close friends and positive role models who instilled in me a love of music. Played guitar and played in school band

Emily: Private violin teacher – highly disorganized but very talented. Gave me lots of opportunities, even though I was not the strongest player

Some influential events were extra-musical, like travel (Graham) or the birth of children (Jenny). For almost all students, there was a decisive moment at which they decided to become music teachers, as exemplified in these remarks:

Kate: Decided I want to impart my passion for a wide range of music

Jenny: Starting helping at school with the choir. Music teacher suggested I get the paperwork for the knowledge I possessed

Colin: Came to the realization that I wanted to make my love of music into a teaching career

Summary
In response to the broader research question: what knowledge, skills and attributes does a music teacher need to possess, pre-service music teachers were interested in pedagogically focused areas of engagement, motivation and behaviour management. The “fun” element was emphasized in content, pedagogy and desirable attributes. Other desirable attributes included patience and flexibility. The absence of self-awareness attributes was observed. In response to the second research question (How do these qualities contribute to constructing music teacher identity), critical incidents focused on confidence, early experiences and the importance of role models.

The practical application of skills learned in the course in both classroom and co-curricular settings was noted by this cohort as an important inclusion in pre-service courses. These responses answered, to some extent, the third research question that relates to how can the knowledge, skills and attributes required of music teachers be shaped into the essential components of teacher education in music.