Making cars and making health care: a critical review

Author
Winch, Sarah, Henderson, Amanda

Published
2009

Journal Title
Medical Journal of Australia

Copyright Statement
Copyright [year] Australasian Medical Publishing Company. This is the author-manuscript version of this paper. Reproduced in accordance with the copyright policy of the publisher. Please refer to the journal's website for access to the definitive, published version.

Downloaded from
http://hdl.handle.net/10072/30956

Link to published version
http://www.mja.com.au
To the Editor:

It is pleasing to see the acknowledgment by contributors of the fundamental premise that the fragmentation of health care may reduce the quality provided, which is a key argument of our paper. Our aim was to provide space for critical appraisal of ‘Lean’ and its application to healthcare, by questioning the assumed theoretical basis from which this approach is derived and inquiring about the evidence of the long-term benefits for patient outcomes. We seek to engender discussion and debate rather than provide a systematic review of existing literature. To this end, we think our aim has been achieved.

Returning to the central thesis of our paper, we argue that the notion of quality is rapidly being subsumed by quantity understood as patient throughput and the number of measurable errors. This is reflected in Ben Tovim’s focus on process rather than practice\(^{(1)}\). We believe that medicine is grounded in the human condition\(^{(2)}\) and thus ideas of quality must relate to patient experience including harms that are not readily measurable. We acknowledge that healthcare is becoming more and more complex and increasingly requires the exercise of practical wisdom that informs clinical reasoning.\(^{(3)}\) Individual differences between patients means that each situation has to be considered in its own context.
Recognition of this difference provides the opportunity for some of the richness and satisfaction inherent in medicine.

Finally, medicine and healthcare are far from immune to adopting and repeating the mistakes of other professions and “industries”. It has been suggested that the continued rationalisation of health care such as occurs with ‘lean’ approaches may contribute to the de-professionalization of medicine\(^{(4)}\) over time. In turn this may promote the “McDonaldization” of healthcare,\(^{(5)}\) whereby efficient turnaround becomes the primary goal. We suspect while meeting a need at one level will provide little long term satisfaction for the health care provider or the patient.

**References**


