Griffith Business School

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

By

Tuan-Anh Le

April 2014
Community-based Tourism and Development in the Periphery/Semi-periphery Interface of Viet Nam

Tuan-Anh Le

B Tourism (Hons.), Vietnam National University (VNU)
B Intel. Relations, Institute for International Relations (IIR), Viet Nam
M Science (Cum Claude), Wageningen University (WUR), The Netherlands

Department of Tourism, Sport & Hotel Management
Griffith Business School
Griffith University

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

April 2014
ABSTRACT

Community-based tourism (CBT) is widely accepted as an effective facilitator of sustainable development that reduces exploitation and brings about benefits for local communities in the least developed and remote areas. However, whilst CBT can be a catalyst for local income and employment generation, its contribution to improving local development is often overestimated and inaccurately identified. This is in part because development and its measurement are mainly assessed by nonlocals who do not adequately take into account the opinions of residents. There is increasing concern that most of the impetus and funding for CBT, and its ongoing product viability, is attributable to Western “experts” and development agencies, and that far too little attention has been paid to local perspectives, empowerment, and knowledge. With regard to a CBT context, there is presently no study that adequately explores the local community’s perception of “development”; how CBT contributes to achieving that development; what factors facilitate or inhibit CBT to this effect; and how CBT can be improved so that it serves more effectively to promote development.

Additionally, most studies focus on destinations in the classic periphery and neglect the fact that many CBT projects are found in the dynamic interface between the periphery and the rapidly expanding semi-periphery regions that represent the frontier of contemporary economic development in emerging economies such as Viet Nam. Importantly, this interface functions as a gateway to large tourist numbers, indicating a potential relationship between CBT – traditionally considered a manifestation of alternative tourism – and mass tourism.

To address the attendant gaps in the literature and enhance the sustainability and potential of CBT, this research therefore has examined the extent to which CBT contributes to achieving development in the periphery/semi-periphery interface areas of Viet Nam from the perspectives of local residents. A qualitative research design is used to provide an in-depth, descriptive and interpretive analysis of local community perceptions. More specifically, constructivist grounded theory and case study approaches are applied to investigate perceptions of the performance of CBT in three communes in the hinterland of Sa Pa, a popular tourist destination town in north-
western Viet Nam. Primary data collection mainly involved interviews with 55 key informants living in Ta Van, Ban Ho and Ta Phin communes, as well as participant observation by the researcher. 

First, the results of the study show that development as perceived by residents is a complex and multi-dimensional construct, consisting of interrelated economic, socio-cultural, and environmental dimensions. However, the perceived development is not only primarily economic, but also displays environmental and socio-cultural dimensions specific to each community. Critically, it is apparent that residents perceive development as having concurrent characteristics of both core (e.g. higher income) and periphery (e.g. retention of traditional culture). Second, the interviews indicate that the role CBT has played in facilitating development is also complex and multi-dimensional, but ultimately positive. The attainment of development was strongly associated with the introduction of tourism, and in particular CBT that is perceived to generate better income and more jobs as well as increase the demand for a better environment. These benefits substantially outweigh the concurrent negative impacts. Additionally, the study identifies the role of the semi-periphery as an avenue for disseminating the benefits and costs of development (core) to adjacent peripheries. Third, the study identifies positive as well as negative factors that respectively facilitate or impede the local success of CBT. These factors implicitly or explicitly relate to the contrasting influences of core (through the semi-periphery) and periphery. Fourth, the study solicited perceived solutions from the residents who are arguably in the best position to make such suggestions because of their personal integration into the target destinations. Based on these outcomes, the study proposes a dialectically-informed model for community-based mass tourism (CBMT) suited to communities in the periphery/semi-periphery interface. This model provides tourism planners and managers with an effective grassroots-informed approach to achieve optimal local benefits from CBMT.

Keywords: Community-based tourism, grounded theory, periphery, semi-periphery, resident perceptions, Viet Nam
STATEMENT OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

This work has not previously been submitted for a degree or diploma in any university. To the best of my knowledge and belief, the thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the thesis itself.

Tuan-Anh Le

28 April 2014
In memory of my younger brother

Le Tuan Dung (1979 - 2010)

This dissertation is dedicated to

my beloved spouse Pilly & my son JoJo

my parents & my elder brother

for their empathy, support, love, and patience during my PhD journey
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis would not have come to fruition without the support of my supervisors. I am deeply grateful to my Principal Supervisor, Professor David Weaver who has been an excellent guru and an exceptional coach. He always makes time, surprises me with swift feedback, inspires my involvement in the world of academia, and motivates me when I am distracted. Acknowledgement and thanks must be made to my Associate Supervisor, Associate Professor Laura Lawton for her timely support, encouragement, and advice from the first day of my PhD journey.

I would like to thank the Australian Government for the scholarship that I received through the Endeavour Fellowship Award and Austraining International for their administrative support during my academic journey in Australia.

I acknowledge my gratitude to Dr. Jenny Bui for her initial ideas, valuable support and suggestions. If it were not her introducing me to the chance to do further study, I would not have experienced such a beautiful and peaceful Australia.

I am in debt to Dr. Georgette Leah Burns for her constructive comments; Associate Prof. Tran Duc Thanh (VNU) for strategic advice; Mr. Nguyen Tien Duc (AMDI) for great support; Adjunct Professor Steve Noakes (PAT) for encouragement; and Mr. Nguyen Duc Hoa Cuong (HANU) for technical assistance.

I would like to convey my thanks to local residents at Ta Van, Ban Ho, Ta Phin communes for providing insights into their perception, thoughts and voice that are essential to my study. Thanks also to staff of Sa Pa district, Mr. Ha Quang Minh (Sa Pa Tourism Information Centre), Mr. Le Van Viet (Sa Pa Tourism Section), Mr. Pham Tien Dung (Sa Pa Communist Secretariat) for assistance in provision of secondary data and contacts.

Many thanks to my beloved colleagues and friends at the department who have shared my up and down moods and helped me during the process of completing the study. Dr. Anna Kwek, Dr. Sarah Gardiner, Dr. Popi Sotiriadou, Dr. Ying Wang, Lynda Battig, Dr. Huong Do, Honey, Nan, Song Ee, your friendship and support have made my journey full of happiness and unforgettable.
PUBLICATIONS IN RELATION TO THIS THESIS

Refereed journal article, conference papers and book chapter

Book chapter


Journal article


Refereed conference papers


# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT........................................................................................................... v

STATEMENT OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP ....................................................... vii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .................................................................................... xi

PUBLICATION IN RELATION TO THIS THESIS .............................................. xiii

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS ................................................................. xix

LIST OF TABLES .................................................................................................... xxi

LIST OF FIGURES ................................................................................................. xxiii

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION .................................................................................. 1

1.1. Research Background .................................................................................. 1

1.2. Research Objectives .................................................................................... 4

1.3. Significance of the Study ........................................................................... 5

1.4. Structure of the Thesis ............................................................................... 5

CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW .................................................................... 9

2.1. Introduction .................................................................................................. 9

2.2. Development Theories ................................................................................. 9

2.2.1. Modernisation theory ........................................................................... 9

2.2.2. Marxism ................................................................................................ 10

2.2.3. Dependency theory ............................................................................. 11

2.2.4. World systems theory .......................................................................... 12

2.2.5. Emergent globalisation ........................................................................ 15

2.2.6. Measurement of development ............................................................. 17

2.3. Tourism and Development ......................................................................... 19

2.3.1. Tourism and development .................................................................... 19

2.3.2. Community – based tourism and development .................................... 29

2.4. Summary ..................................................................................................... 41

CHAPTER 3. VIET NAM CONTEXT ...................................................................... 43

3.1. Introduction .................................................................................................. 43

3.2. Development Theories and Viet Nam ......................................................... 43
3.2.1. The influence of development theories. ......................................................... 44
3.2.2. Measurement of development in Viet Nam.................................................. 46
3.2.3. Core and periphery as internal variations of development ......................... 48
3.3. Tourism and Development in Viet Nam ......................................................... 51
3.3.1. Tourism and development. ........................................................................ 51
3.3.2. Tourism development and planning. ............................................................ 54
3.3.3. Community-based tourism and development in Viet Nam. ....................... 57
3.4. Research Questions ....................................................................................... 60
3.4.1. Summary of the gaps in knowledge ............................................................. 60
3.4.2. Research questions .................................................................................... 61
3.5. Summary. ....................................................................................................... 63

CHAPTER 4. METHODOLOGY .............................................................................. 65
4.1. Introduction ................................................................................................... 65
4.2. Theoretical Paradigm .................................................................................... 65
4.3. The Role of Researcher ................................................................................ 68
4.4. Research Framework ................................................................................... 69
4.5. Research Strategy – A Combined Qualitative Approach............................. 71
   4.5.1. Grounded theory approach .................................................................... 72
   4.5.2. Case study approach ............................................................................ 74
4.6. Empirical Data Collection Strategy ............................................................... 75
   4.6.1. Sampling strategy .................................................................................. 76
   4.6.2. Methods of empirical material collection .............................................. 79
4.7. Empirical Material Interpretation .................................................................. 82
   4.7.1. The coding process ............................................................................... 82
   4.7.2. NVivo 10 as a supplement to codification and interpretation ................. 86
4.8. Validity and Reliability ................................................................................ 87
4.9. Ethical Considerations .................................................................................. 88
4.10. Summary.. .................................................................................................. 91

CHAPTER 5. CASE STUDY CONTEXT .................................................................. 93
5.1. Introduction ................................................................................................... 93
5.2. Sa Pa as a case study region ......................................................................... 93
   5.2.1. Overview of Sa Pa ............................................................................... 93
   5.2.2. Sa Pa and development ....................................................................... 102
5.2.3. Sa Pa development and tourism .......................................................... 105
5.3. The CBT Micro-Case Studies ................................................................. 112
  5.3.1. Ta Van................................................................. 113
  5.3.2. Ban Ho............................................................... 116
  5.3.3. Ta Phin............................................................... 120
5.4. Summary ......................................................................................... 123

CHAPTER 6. PERCEPTIONS OF DEVELOPMENT AND ROLE OF CBT .......... 125
  6.1. Introduction .................................................................................... 125
  6.2. Perceptions of Development ............................................................ 126
    6.2.1. Ta Van................................................................. 126
    6.2.2. Ban Ho............................................................... 129
    6.2.3. Ta Phin............................................................... 131
    6.2.4. Synthesis 1 - Development as perceived by the communities .......... 133
  6.3. Role of CBT in Facilitating Development ........................................ 134
    6.3.1. Ta Van................................................................. 134
    6.3.2. Ban Ho............................................................... 140
    6.3.3. Ta Phin............................................................... 143
    6.3.4. Synthesis 2 - Role of CBT in facilitating development ................ 145
  6.4. Summary ......................................................................................... 147

CHAPTER 7. FACTORS INFLUENCING CBT AND RECOMMENDATIONS .......... 149
  7.1. Introduction .................................................................................... 149
  7.2. Factors Influencing CBT .................................................................. 149
    7.2.1. Ta Van................................................................. 149
    7.2.2. Ban Ho ............................................................... 160
    7.2.3. Ta Phin ............................................................... 169
    7.2.4. Synthesis 3 – Factors influencing CBT. ...................................... 177
  7.3. Recommendations for CBT Development ....................................... 180
    7.3.1. Ta Van................................................................. 181
    7.3.2. Ban Ho............................................................... 185
    7.3.3. Ta Phin............................................................... 189
    7.3.4. Synthesis 4 – Recommendations for CBT................................. 192
  7.4. Summary ......................................................................................... 193
# ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADB</td>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APEC</td>
<td>Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASEAN</td>
<td>South East Asian Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBMT</td>
<td>Community–based Mass Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBT</td>
<td>Community–based Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIA</td>
<td>Central of Intelligence of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC</td>
<td>European Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNP</td>
<td>Gross National Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GSO</td>
<td>General Statistics Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDI</td>
<td>Human Development Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAHDI</td>
<td>Inequality–Adjusted Human Development Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INGO</td>
<td>International Non-governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IUCN</td>
<td>International Union for Conservation of Nature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDC</td>
<td>Least Developed Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDG</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PATA</td>
<td>Pacific Asia Travel Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNV</td>
<td>Netherlands Development Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TALC</td>
<td>Tourism Area Life Cycle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNWTO</td>
<td>United Nations World Tourism Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VDG</td>
<td>Viet Nam Development Goal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VNAT</td>
<td>Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WDI</td>
<td>World Development Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organisation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1. Core, Periphery and Semi-periphery........................................ 14
Table 2.2. Contrasting tourism contentions of advocacy and cautionary platform 23
Table 2.3. Unsustainable mass tourism and deliberate alternative tourism........ 26
Table 2.4. Four types of empowerment regarding CBT.................................. 36
Table 2.5. The compilation of characteristics of successful CBT.................... 37
Table 3.1. Overview of Viet Nam development indicators............................. 47
Table 4.1. Major paradigms used in tourism studies and research................. 67
Table 4.2. Types of case studies applicable to tourism.................................... 75
Table 5.1. Tourism development in Sa Pa (2003 –2012)................................. 107
Table 5.2. Visitor arrivals at CBT sites in Sa Pa............................................. 109
Table 6.1. Perception of development at the three case study communities........ 134
Table 6.2. Roles of CBT at three case study communities............................... 146
Table 7.1. Positive factors influencing the performance of CBT....................... 178
Table 7.2. Negative factors influencing the performance of CBT..................... 180
Table 7.3. Recommendations for CBT development at case study villages........ 192
Table 8.1. Local recommendations for optimal CBT development................... 205
### LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>International tourist arrivals [in million], 1995 – 2013</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Types of alternative tourism</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>CBT, alternative tourism, sustainable tourism and mass tourism</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>CBT position in Jafari’s four platforms</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Characteristics of successful CBT</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Approximation of the core, semi-periphery and peripheral areas</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>International and domestic tourists in Viet Nam, 1990 – 2013</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Research framework</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>The coding process</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Map of Sa Pa in Viet Nam and three CBT case study sites</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Sa Pa natural attractions</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Fauna and flora at Hoang Lien National Park</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Ethnic people in traditional costume, Sa Pa region</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Sa Pa market as a cultural centre</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>The influence of colonialism on Sa Pa</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Sa Pa development</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>Tourists visiting Sa Pa (2000-2013)</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>Stages of CBT sites on the destination life cycle</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10</td>
<td>Ta Van natural attractions</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.11</td>
<td>Tourists with Ta Van cultural attractions</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.12</td>
<td>Natural attractions in Ban Ho</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>Cultural attractions in Ban Ho</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.14</td>
<td>Construction of hydro-power stations in Ban Ho</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.15</td>
<td>Ta Phin natural attractions</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.16</td>
<td>Ta Phin cultural attractions</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Summary of interviewees’ profile</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Development perceived by community members in Ta Van</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Development perceived by community members in Ban Ho</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Development perceived by community members in Ta Phin</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Role of CBT in Ta Van</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

1.1. Research Background

Tourism is regarded as a particularly effective and viable tool for development through the stimulation of economic growth and the creation of employment opportunities in rural areas and emerging economies. This increasing regard is supported by an annual average growth of 7% in global overnight arrivals since 1950 (UN, 2010a). Recently, international tourism was positioned globally as one of the largest categories of international trade, ranking fourth after fuels, chemicals and automotive products (UN, 2010a, p. 92). The number of international stayover tourist arrivals has risen from approximately 25 million in 1950 to 1,087 million in 2013 (UNWTO, 2014). The revenues generated by tourist arrivals (not including airline ticket sales and domestic tourism) have increased on average by 11% a year during the period from 1950 to 2006, outstripping the growth rate of the world economy as a whole (UNWTO, 2007). In 2012, for the first time, over one billion international overnight arrivals were recorded (UNWTO, 2013b), generating US$1.3 trillion in export earnings (UNWTO, 2013a) or US$3.5 billion per day. It is anticipated that 1.8 billion arrivals can be expected by 2030 and that most of this growth will occur in the Asia-Pacific region (UNWTO, 2014).

Most tourism affiliates with large-scale or “mass tourism”, but sustained criticism of the latter since the 1970s has given rise to interest in the concept of “alternative tourism” (Weaver, 1998). As an ideal type, alternative tourism evokes small-scale, locally controlled, culturally authentic, and highly regulated tourism practices catering to small numbers of “allocentric”-type visitors (Weaver & Lawton, 2014). Community-based tourism (CBT) emerged during the early 1980s as a subset of alternative tourism and has been regarded by supporters as synonymous with sustainable tourism because of its emphasis on empowering and benefitting local residents (Beeton, 2006; Hatton, 1999; Leksakundilok, 2004; Murphy, 1985; Scheyvens, 1999; Weaver, 1998). Given the opportunities it seemingly creates for diversifying the local economy and providing equitable income and other economic
benefits, CBT has become widely adopted by development agencies as a preferred and allegedly highly effective tool for achieving economic and social development. This acceptance of CBT has occurred particularly in rural and underdeveloped areas of less developed countries (LDCs) where economic development options are constrained by geographical and other factors.

Although the current number of CBT initiatives is impressive (Zeppel, 2006), it appears that most have not lived up to their alleged potential to sustain rural communities (Salafsky et al., 2001). A paucity of tourism-related managerial and technical capacity and knowledge is one inhibiting factor that has been identified (Blackstock, 2005; Kontogeorgopoulos, 2005; Li, 2006), while Okazaki (2008) contends that local residents do not adequately understand the parameters of effective participation. The assumption has also been challenged that local residents all work together, harmoniously, equitably and with shared power, toward common objectives (Beeton, 2006; Weaver, 1998). Interacting and communicating with relevant outside stakeholders (e.g. investors, developers, planners and managers from the outside community) is critical to the success of any CBT. Currently however, this success is usually characterised by dependency on external development and funding agencies that may not share the goals or motivations in common with many or most community members (Butcher, 2007; Goodwin & Santilli, 2009; Weaver, 2010). In particular, there has been increasing concern that CBT is overly reliant on Western experts and development organisations who impose their own – often ideologically driven – assumptions about the nature of “development” and the optimal means for its achievement. Butcher (2007) described how non-governmental organisations (NGOs) often exercise dictatorial power over local communities so that the outcomes of the planned development conforms with what is wanted by the NGOs rather than with what is desired by the residents. It is therefore questionable whether any real community empowerment exists in CBT (Butcher, 2010), especially at the highest level of self-mobilisation where residents participate by taking initiative independently of external institutions (Pretty, 1995). Finally, it is suggested that the apparent lack of success of CBT may be due to the isolated nature of the locations, resulting in poor physical accessibility and very limited visitor numbers and, hence, a paucity of revenue earnings.
Despite the empowerment rhetoric of CBT (Scheyvens, 1999), far too little attention has been paid to local and non-Western perspectives and knowledge. There is presently no study that adequately explores how local communities actually perceive development; how CBT contributes to achieving that development; what factors facilitate or inhibit CBT to this effect; and how CBT can actually be improved so that it serves more effectively to promote development. The above-noted findings about the benefits and shortcomings of CBT are therefore constrained by their privileging of or confinement to the expert voice rather than to the voices of local residents who perhaps are best positioned and incentivised to make such assessments.

At the same time, these typically, and mostly Western-derived, CBT discussions have assumed a pure peripheral context dominated by relatively cohesive community structures and traditional livelihoods that are accessible only to small numbers of tourists. This conversation neglects the fact that many CBT projects are found in the dynamic interface between the periphery and the rapidly expanding semi-periphery area that represents the front line of contemporary development and offers a complex and transitional landscape of contrasting environmental, cultural, social, and economic impulses. Importantly, this interface can also function as a gateway to large tourist numbers, indicating a potential relationship between CBT – traditionally considered a manifestation of alternative tourism – and mass tourism. Does this interface represent a recipe for disaster, or a powerful basis for synergy? This question also has not yet been empirically investigated in the tourism literature from the perspective of local residents.

To address the attendant gaps in the literature and enhance the sustainability and potential of CBT, this research therefore sets out to investigate the extent to which CBT contributes to achieving “development” in the periphery/semi-periphery interface areas of Viet Nam from the perspectives of local residents. Qualitative research methods including grounded theory (Charmaz, 2005, 2006; Corbin & Strauss, 2008; Strauss & Corbin, 1990, 1998) and a case study approach (Stake, 2006; R. Yin, 2009; Yin, 2012) were applied to examine perceptions of the performance of CBT in three communes in the hinterland of Sa Pa, a popular tourist destination town in north-western Viet Nam. This country is relevant as a context for this study because of the government’s encouragement of CBT as a vehicle for
facilitating rural development in order to reduce pronounced internal core-periphery disparities that threaten the long-term viability of the state. The rapid diffusion of these developmental impulses means that an increasing number of CBT initiatives are best described as being at the interface of the periphery and core (by way of the semi-periphery), rather than in the periphery per se. In this research the residents of the interface case study communes are given the opportunity to voice their opinions on the concept of development, the role of CBT in facilitating development, the factors influencing CBT, and the recommendations for optimal development benefits from CBT.

1.2. Research Objectives

In order to investigate how local residents in CBT situations within the periphery/semi-periphery interface perceive the relationship between CBT and development, the following five objectives are identified:

Objective 1. To define “development” according to members of the relevant communities

Objective 2. To assess the role of CBT in the achievement of development as perceived by members of those communities

Objective 3. To identify factors that differentially influence the success of CBT from the residents’ perspective

Objective 4. To identify residents’ recommendations for achieving optimal development benefits from CBT

Objective 5. To identify the CBT patterns and their theoretical and practical implications for the periphery/semi-periphery interface of Viet Nam and similar environments elsewhere
1.3. Significance of the Study

The findings obtained from this research will make a significant contribution to both management and tourism knowledge as it relates specifically to the CBT literature. For the first time, a grounded theory approach is used to define development and its outcomes according to the local communities that are the most directly affected by CBT initiatives. In addition, the research will investigate how those perceptions differ from what is presented in the literature, and from one affected community to another. The above lines of inquiry, and especially Objective 1 and Objective 4, are consistent with the essence of the community-focused paradigm of CBT and break new ground in our understanding of this phenomenon and its mobilisation as an effective and sustainable vehicle for development.

Methodologically, this is also the first study that focuses on the assessment of the performance of CBT as a distinctive, dynamic and complex form of spatial organisation in the specific geographical context of the rapidly expanding transitional developmental zones between the semi-periphery and periphery.

Practically, the research provides a deeper and richer understanding of the CBT models experienced by local communities. Building on that research will contribute to the identification of optimum CBT model(s) suited to the periphery/semi-periphery interface areas of Viet Nam, and potentially, to other developing countries and regions in Asia and elsewhere where similar dynamics pertain. The optimal CBT model(s) will provide guidance and a formative foundation for CBT development for development agencies, enterprises, host communities, and local authorities involved in CBT initiatives.

1.4. Structure of the Thesis

The thesis consists of eight chapters. Chapter 1 outlines the broad direction of the thesis, providing an introduction to the research background, objectives and the significance of the research.
Chapter 2 reviews and evaluates the existing literature on the inter-related research topics of development, tourism, and CBT, with particular attention to their applicability to peripheral and semi-peripheral areas globally. The review encompasses two main sections. The first section reviews major development theories and the measurement of development, while the second section focuses on the relationship between tourism, CBT, and development, and residents’ attitudes toward CBT.

Chapter 3 moves from the generic context established in Chapter 2 to discuss the development theories more specifically, and to highlight the relationship between tourism, particularly CBT, and development in the peripheral/semi-peripheral interface areas within the context of Viet Nam. The chapter begins by reviewing the applicability of the development theories to the contemporary history of Viet Nam and then focuses on current development patterns as the basis for internal variations in development from a core/periphery perspective. Consequently, the relationship between tourism, and CBT and development is discussed with particular attention to the interface areas where the dynamics of development change are most salient. The final section of Chapter 3 identifies the gaps in the knowledge within the existing literature and presents the specific research questions that inform each of the five research objectives outlined above.

Chapter 4 explains the methodology adopted for this research. It starts with the justification of the adopted theoretical paradigm and then discusses the role of the researcher, the research framework, and the selection of research strategies including the research design, and the approaches used to address the research questions. The sampling procedure, and the collection and interpretation of empirical material are then described, and followed by a discussion of the application of the computer-aided NVivo 10 used to facilitate the administration and interpretation of empirical material. Finally, issues of data evaluation and authenticity, and ethics are considered.

Chapter 5 rationalises the selection of Sa Pa as a case study region along with its three CBT micro-case studies in Ta Van, Ban Ho, and Ta Phin communes. The chapter begins by describing the development of tourism in Sa Pa as the context for
the exploration of the semi-periphery/periphery interface areas where the case studies are located.

**Chapter 6** describes the themes that have emerged from the interpretation of the empirical data with regard to development as defined by the local community [Objective 1] at each CBT site and the role of CBT, as perceived by those communities, in achieving development [Objective 2].

**Chapter 7** presents the themes that have emerged from the investigation of the factors that influence CBT and development [Objective 3] and from the recommendations for the improvement of CBT recorded in the case studies [Objective 4].

**Chapter 8** discusses the general patterns of the study with reference to the pertinent literature, and in particular with respect to new conceptual frameworks and the development of an optimum CBT model for the peripheral/semi-peripheral interface areas within the context of Viet Nam [Objective 5]. That analysis is followed by a further discussion of the theoretical implications of the findings and the practical implications of the study. The final section of Chapter 8 acknowledges the applicable limitations, and considers subsequent research priorities.
CHAPTER 2
LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1. Introduction

The literature on the inter-related research topics of development, tourism and CBT is critically reviewed and evaluated in this chapter, with particular attention to their applicability to peripheral and semi-peripheral areas globally. Two main sections are encompassed in the review. Major development theories and the measurement of development are briefly introduced in the first section (2.2). The relationship between tourism, CBT and development, and residents’ attitudes toward CBT are focused on in the second section (2.3).

2.2. Development Theories

To broadly contextualise this analysis, social development trends since World War Two are outlined, beginning with the contrasting paradigms of capitalism-based modernisation theory and Marxism, progressing to dependency theory, and finally to post-dependency perspectives including world systems theory and emergent globalisation, and including sustainable development. These diverse perspectives reveal development as a highly contested concept in which the constructs of core and periphery assume diverse meanings and implications. Following the discussion of world systems theory, the concepts of core, periphery, and semi-periphery are reviewed in the context of each of the perspectives, and then elaborated with regard to the dynamics of globalisation. Each of these major development-related trends is outlined below in approximate historical sequence. The last part of the section examines how development is variably measured.

2.2.1. Modernisation theory.

Modernisation theory was influential in the late 1950s and early 1960s. Fundamentally, it is the theory that explains the evolution of national states (Tipps, 1973). Modernisation theory was initiated by an industrial revolution and is regarded as the process of transformation from a traditional, feudal society to a progressive
modern one. Rostow (1959) identified five sequential growth stages of this transformation, namely (1) traditional society, (2) preconditions for (transition to) ‘take-off’ i.e. the adoption of scientific methods of technology, (3) take-off, i.e. rapid capital accumulation and early industrialisation, (4) drive to maturity, i.e. high industrialisation in which the standard of living of the masses remain low, and (5) the age of high mass consumption. By the late 1960s, a sixth stage - “post-industrial” society - was forecast (Bell, 1973). These stages are linear and each stage is assumed to represent a higher level of economic and social development. According to proponents, the speed of movement from one stage to the next varies in terms of time, but eventually all societies will experience them (Chirot & Hall, 1982). The theory “rested on an optimistic version of economic growth models and on theories of stable change” (Preston, 1996, p.178). The theory has close affiliation with capitalist expansion to achieve economic growth, and with associated applications of technology and other innovations (Brugger & Hannan, 1983). Within modernisation theory, development implies that less developed countries gradually assume the qualities of the industrialised countries. The United States of America (USA) in particular presents an inspirational model of an imitative process that culminates in high material standards of living and an advanced, well-integrated economy (Hettne, 1995).

2.2.2. Marxism.

The Marxist theory of change, first articulated during the mid-19th century, has been considered “another theory of modernisation” insofar as it “stressed quality leaps which a society was forced to make because of the dialectics of internal contradictions, expressed through class struggle” (Hettne, 1995, p.50). Nevertheless, Marxism is different than those modernisation theories such as Rostow’s that focus on capitalism. Unlike classical modernisation theory, Marxism, from a social perspective, is highly critical of capitalism and stresses the importance of the “proletarian revolution”. This dialectical and materialist concept of history that defines development as the struggle between social classes in a context where productive capacity is the foundation of society is especially relevant to the process of development. Production and class relations evolve through struggles. In classical Marxism, progress occurs through the six stages of: (1) primitive communism, (2)
slavery, (3) feudalism, (4) capitalism, (5) socialism, and (6) communism. Communism is the ideal end state of this sequence of struggles. A fundamental difference between classic modernisation and Marxism, therefore, is the respective status of capitalism as a facilitator and inhibitor of the ideal developmental end state achieved in both cases through a series of materially transformational stages.

2.2.3. Dependency theory.

Dependency theory was conceptualised in the late 1940s by Prebisch (1949) and shares many tenets with Marxism. “The term ‘dependency’ originated with writings on Latin America”, indicating a distinctive geographic context that gives rise to the theory’s status as a “neo-Marxist” perspective (Smith, 1979, p.247). The theory, subsequently articulated and popularised by Frank (1967), Beckford (1971), Amin (1974) and others, outlined an interdependent relationship between development and “underdevelopment”, wherein the developed regions acquire and create “peripheries” that provide the resources and markets allowing the core to retain and expand its developed status. Accordingly, it is often stated that the core developed thanks to the underdevelopment of regions within Africa, the Americas, and Asia that previously had their own economic and cultural autonomy. In the case of Asia, for example, Britain’s economic strength in the 19th century was largely built on the export trade to India (Tomlinson, 1975) and “the imperial connection between Britain and India was of critical importance in contributing to British industrialisation and its emergence as a hegemonic power in the world over nearly two centuries” (Aditya, 2010, p. 81). Prior to British colonisation, India had about the same standards of living as Great Britain; by the early 1900s, Great Britain had perhaps 20 or 30 times the per capita wealth as India.

Structurally, the division of the world economy into industrial regions (or centres) and peripheral areas (for Great Britain, internal colonies such as Scotland and external colonies such as the British West Indies) supplying primary products and low-tech manufactures to centres in exchange for high-tech goods. This division accounts for the historically uneven spread of technological progress and the post-World War Two emergence of the so-called “Third World” (Prebisch, 1959; Preston, 1996). A critical point of difference with modernisation theory is that dependency
theorists regard underdevelopment as an unfavourable outcome of contact with the core countries (e.g. UK, Spain), whilst modernisation theorists regard it as a “pre-European” state that was ameliorated through such contact, as per the five stages described above.

2.2.4. World systems theory.

World systems theory, regarded widely as a variant of dependency theory, sees the world as a single interdependent economic totality (Wallerstein, 1974, 1984). This system is neither a closed local economy nor a world empire where a core extracts tribute from its peripheries, but the “world economy”, divided into tiers of states (core, semi-periphery, and periphery) and characterised by “a single economic division of labour, and thus a pattern of specialisation and exchange, with multiple cultures within it and no central authority” (Preston, 1996, p.219). Such characteristics situate world systems theory as a precursor to globalisation (see 2.2.4).

Core, periphery and semi-periphery

Major development paradigms of the later twentieth century have all been implicitly or explicitly informed by the core-periphery dichotomy that was one of the significant contributions of dependency and world systems theory. The terms “centre” and “periphery” were initially introduced by Prebisch (1949) in ‘The Economic Development of Latin America and its Principal Problems’. Prebisch contended that “the global system was not a uniform marketplace with producers and suppliers freely making mutual beneficial contracts but was in fact divided into powerful central economies and relatively weak peripheral economies” (Preston, 1996, p.181). Core and periphery differentials are distinguished through (a) economic indicators such as, Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per capital and the percentage employed in non-primary sectors, (b) exchange of goods and services between core and periphery and the nature of interaction, and (c) patterns of interaction (Galtung, 1971; Welthofer, 1989). Typically, cores exhibit higher levels of economic development, higher material standards of living, more highly skilled workers, higher levels of urbanisation and larger capital investments per worker. As such, they are at the centre of political power, cultural domination, and military
superiority (Wallerstein, 1974). Reflecting their dynamic and hierarchical character, “core/periphery” structures occur not only at the state level, but also internally, with each state having its own “core” and “periphery” differentiations (Galtung, 1971).

Modernisation discourses after 1950 assumed that cores were incubators of innovation and economic growth from which developmental impulses gradually “trickled down” to the periphery through contagious and hierarchical diffusion effects, leading eventually to a fully articulated space-economy. Dependency theory subsequently inversed this dynamic by contending that certain advantaged areas became cores by actively underdeveloping other areas and initiating and maintaining unequal terms of exchange. Accordingly, the periphery is created and reinforced by the perpetuation of those exchanges. Post-dependency paradigms such as sustainable development and globalisation are less ideologically posited but similarly invoke core and periphery as a fundamental characteristic of global and regional space economies.

Though Marxism did not literally mention the core and periphery concepts, the theory was used to explain the developmental transformation in peripheral areas of a colony, in which “industrialization produced enclave and hinterland relationships within the areas” with the so-called “spatial process of the division of labour’” (S. W. Williams, 1977, p. 276). Consequently, certain parts of the colony start to prosper while others suffer from this asymmetrical development.

In his dependency-inspired world systems theory, Wallerstein (1984) expanded the dualistic and arguably simplistic core-periphery concept to include the “semi-periphery” as a transitional space independent of state boundaries (Terlouw, 2001). This semi-periphery concept depolarises and mediates the relationship between the core and periphery. Semi-peripheries are partially industrialised, but with less sophisticated technology than the core. In dependency and world systems discourses, the semi-periphery is exploited by the core but exploits the periphery through “trickle-up” processes. However, in the modernisation perspective, semi-peripheries might be regarded as avenues for disseminating the benefits of development to adjacent peripheries through trickle-down processes. As such, those peripheries themselves eventually become part of the semi-periphery. This idea of an “avenue”
can be taken literally in situations where the semi-periphery occurs as a highway, river, or railway corridor that attracts adjacent development and expedites contact and flows of goods and people between core and periphery. In post-dependency discourses, the dynamic element is pervasive as globalisation impulses extend the semi-periphery into the periphery along all fronts. Based on the literature, the core, periphery and semi-periphery can be differentiated as per Table 2.1.

Table 2.1. Core, periphery and semi-periphery.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Core</th>
<th>Semi-periphery</th>
<th>Periphery</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economics</strong></td>
<td>High levels of vitality and a diverse economic base</td>
<td>Medium levels of vitality and an economic mix of activities with lax regulation and strong developmental pressures</td>
<td>Low levels of vitality and dependent on traditional industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Population</strong></td>
<td>Metropolitan in character. Rising population through in-migration with a relatively young age structure</td>
<td>Semi-urban and strong population pressures</td>
<td>More rural and remote – often with high scenic values. Population falling through out-migration, often with an ageing structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Technology/Communication</strong></td>
<td>Innovative, pioneering, and enjoys good information flow</td>
<td>Medium technology and information flow at average level</td>
<td>Reliant on limited and imported technologies and ideas, and suffers from poor information flows</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Power/Decision</strong></td>
<td>Focus of major political, economic and social decisions</td>
<td>Subordinate to the core, but has resources to resist or co-operate</td>
<td>Remote from decision making leading to a sense of alienation and lack of power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Infrastructure</strong></td>
<td>Good infrastructure and amenities</td>
<td>Basic infrastructure and amenities</td>
<td>Poor infrastructure and amenities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evolution</strong></td>
<td>Stable</td>
<td>Expanding</td>
<td>Contracting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Compiled from Botterill et al. (2000), Terlouw (2003) and Wanhill (1997)*

Given the unitary character of the global economy implied by world systems theory, it is possible to see core, periphery, and semi-periphery spaces as being largely
independent of state boundaries, so that each can transcend those boundaries or occur as a group within state boundaries (Terlouw, 2001). Accordingly, this trichotomy best describes an amorphous group of regions, as the present world-system is not only divided into many different states, but also into many different political and social economic zones (Terlouw, 2003). From another perspective, Friedmann (1995) attached the semi-periphery concept to the two level-hierarchy of world cities, in which he suggested 18 core and 21 semi-peripheral world cities.

2.2.5. Emergent globalisation.

Globalisation, the latest dominant iteration of the development debate, is “a complex set of distinct but related processes” (Shaw, 1997, p.498). Sometimes called emergent globalisation or post-dependency theory, it appeared in the 1970s in association with the restructuring of world capitalism toward global integration in a context of “time-space compression”. Weaver and Lawton (2010, p. 147) suggested “globalisation as the processes whereby the operation of business and the movement of capital is increasingly less impeded by national boundaries, and is reflected in a general trend toward industry consolidation, deregulation and privatisation”. According to Robinson (2001, p. 159), these processes have involved the worldwide decentralisation of production together with the centralisation of command and control of the global economy. Even more so than world systems theory, emergent globalisation considers the decreasing power of the nation-state entity as “core” and the increasing significance of transnational entities. Therefore, globalisation could be the catalyst for the integration and spreading of modernisation across borders to facilitate more efficient use of resources. Pieterse (1994) stated accordingly that emergent globalisation becomes an annex of modernisation theory. However, there is also an increasing concern that this integration fosters inequality and produces international winners and losers, resulting in the division of the world economy into a rich core and a poor periphery, in which the wealth of the core mostly comes at the expense of the periphery (Krugman, 1995). But Krugman also argued that “as the integration proceeds further, the advantages of the core are eroded and the resulting rise in periphery income may be partly at the expense of the core” (p. 876). When comparing the economic history before 1914 to the present situation, Bordo and Flandreau (2001, p. 66) pointed out that globalisation is “the presence of capital
controls” in which the developed countries drive the exchange rate regime for the periphery (LDC). Consequently, the more financial integration increases, the more financial vulnerability the lesser developed areas will continue to face when borrowing abroad. These discourses all demonstrate the extent to which globalisation can be affiliated in its structure or outcomes with either the basic modernisation or dependency model.

In line with globalisation, global awareness and intensification have produced the ideal type of “global citizen” who is aware of the increasingly negative environmental impact of human action on both the local (e.g. pollution and congestion) and global (e.g. global warming) scale (Haluza-DeLay, 2010). As a result, a growing awareness of the global links between environmental problems and socio-economic issues has emerged (Hopwood, Mellor, & O’Brien, 2005), requiring a long-term approach to economic growth and development (Joke & Tom, 2002). Consequently, sustainable development, or “meeting the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs” (World Commission on Environment and Development, 1987, p.43) emerged and came to prominence towards the end of the 1980s (Sharpley & Telfer, 2008). Sustainable development was the focus of Agenda 21 at the Earth Summit in Rio de Janeiro in 1992. Subsequently, Elkington (1994) and Slaper and Hall (2011) emphasised the “triple bottom line” of sustainable development that considers the need to balance economic, social and environmental dimensions. Sustainable development reflects the importance of environment as shown in Target 1 of Goal 7 of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs – see Section 2.3.5) The concept of sustainable development dominated Agenda 21 and was adopted by the world leaders at the Millennium Summit in 2000, amid calls for “integrating the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources”(UN, 2010b). A fundamental characteristic of globalisation is the intimation that non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and international government (UN) will be at least as instrumental as national governments in realising the developmental agenda.
2.2.6. Measurement of development.

Identification of appropriate development metrics is a major concern for all development theorists, since presumably a primary concern of all is to determine the extent to which a particular country, region, or group of people has achieved development. Since the 1950s, various indicators or metrics have been used to measure development, covering not only economic development but also socio-political, environmental, and human well-being or quality of life, as per the concept of the triple bottom line. These metrics are evolving. Working in tandem with the parent capitalist paradigm, early modernisation theory tended to equate development with productivity (man-hour work) and economic growth (measured by GDP, both absolute and per capita) (Rostow, 1959). Still within the modernisation template, McGranahan (1970) defined development as an economic process measured by increase in the per capita Gross National Product (GNP). Although this economic focus was expanded by Marxists to include political aspects as the decisive factor causing social-political changes such as class conflict (Galtung, 1971; UNDP, 1990) and social revolution (Boswell & Dixon, 1993), economic development remained dominant.

Seeing the world economy in core/periphery terms, dependency theorists measured development with economic attributes such as GDP per capita and percentage employed in non-primary sectors as well as goods and services exchanged between core and periphery. Relative economic self-sufficiency and the equitable distribution of wealth both spatially and among diverse segments of society (measured for example by the Gini coefficient) are critical parameters of development for these theorists (Galtung, 1971; Wellhofer, 1989). Myrdal (1974, p. 735) similarly argued that development is “the movement upward of the entire social system” and its indicators should reflect both economic and non-economic factors including all sorts of consumption, education and health, power distribution, and economic, social, and political stratification within society.

Going beyond GDP to such a broader definition of well-being, the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) (1990) proposed a composite Human Development Index (HDI) assessing inter-country development levels on the basis of the three
dimensions of human development, i.e. (a) living a long and healthy life (measured by life expectancy), (b) being educated (measured by adult literacy and gross enrolment in education), and (c) having a decent standard of living (measured by purchasing power parity and income) taking into account differential costs of living (McGillivray, 1991). More sophisticated yet is the Inequality–Adjusted Human Development Index (IAHDI) of Hicks (1997) that incorporates Gini coefficients measuring inequalities in annual income, educational attainment and longevity. The World Development Indicators (WDI) also provided a comprehensive selection of economic, social and environmental indicators, drawing from the efforts of the World Bank and its partner agencies. The list is a compilation of relevant, high quality and internationally comparable statistics about development and the quality of people’s lives around the world. The database contains more than 1,000 indicators for 216 economies, with many time series extending back to 1960. However, “these indicators rely heavily on the statistics produced by national authorities and agencies” (World Bank, 2012a).

The WDI 2012 focuses its attention on the world’s progress toward achieving the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The parent Millennium Declaration is a milestone in international cooperation inspiring development efforts to improve the living conditions of people around the world. The Declaration committed all 189 member states of the UN General Assembly in September, 2000 to a global partnership to reduce poverty while promoting gender equality, health, education, and environmental sustainability with time-bound and quantified targets to be achieved by 2015 (Permanyer, 2013). These targets have become known as the MDGs. There are eight development goals and each goal contains several targets. In an attempt to track countries and measure progress toward achieving the set targets, a comprehensive set of more than 60 indicators has formally been in effect since January 15, 2008 (see http://www.un.org/millenniumgoals for a complete list of goals, targets, and indicators). The MDGs are now widely regarded by the UN, World Bank, International Monetary Fund, and bilateral aid agencies as the authoritative criteria by which developmental progress can be measured in their dealings with less developed countries (Easterly, 2009). However, Easterly concluded that “the MDGs are poorly and arbitrarily designed to measure progress against poverty and deprivation, and that their design makes Africa look worse than
it really is, which makes attainment of the MDGs less likely in Africa than in other regions” (p. 26).

Reviewing the MDGs in 2013 (UN, 2013b), the UN Secretary General, Ban Ki-moon, acknowledged that the MDGs have mobilised action from governments, civil society, and other partners around the world, with significant result. The statistics show that enormous progress has been made towards achieving the MDGs. Millions of people’s lives have improved as countries have already met targets on reducing poverty, increasing access to safe water, improving the lives of slum dwellers and achieving gender parity in primary schools. Despite the fact that global economic slowdown challenges MDG achievement, global poverty continues to decline, more children than ever attend primary school, child deaths have dropped dramatically, and targeted investment in fighting malaria, AIDS, and tuberculosis have saved millions (UN, 2013a).

Although all development measurements reflect holistic quality of life aspirations ranging from improving poverty rates, promoting gender equality, and providing universal primary education to ensuring environmental sustainability, development and its measurement is mainly assessed by international organisations such as the UNDP, the World Bank, international non-governmental organisations and other outside experts who assume their own expertise and may not adequately take into account the opinions of local residents.

2.3. Tourism and Development

A literature review examining the inter-relationship between development, tourism, and CBT is provided in this section. The tourism development trend in line with development theories since 1950s is discussed in the first sub-section (2.3.1). CBT and development is reviewed in the remaining sub-section (2.3.2).

2.3.1. Tourism and development.

Since the mid-20th century, tourism has been widely considered as a viable means to stimulate development in a variety of destination contexts. In over 150 countries,
tourism is one of the five top export earners, and in 60 of those countries it is the number one “export” (UN, 2010a). With this dramatic growth in scale and scope during the past six decades, tourism now significantly contributes to the global economy. Since 1995, tourism has experienced an annual average increase of 4% (Figure 2.1). In 2012, though affected by the economic constraints of the global financial crisis (GFC), over one billion arrivals were recorded for the first time; overnight international arrivals exceeded 1,035 million and generated US$1.3 trillion in export earnings (UNWTO, 2013a) or $3.5 billion per day. In 2013, arrivals increased further to 1,087 million. As a result, international tourism accounts for approximately 10% of cumulative global GDP, 30% of the world’s exports of services and 6% of overall exports of goods and services. As a worldwide export category, tourism ranks fourth after fuels, chemicals, and food (UN, 2010a, p. 92), while ranking first in many developing countries (UNWTO, 2012). The World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) estimated that international arrivals will continue to experience an average annual growth of 4.1%, and will reach 1.4 billion by 2020, and 1.8 billion by 2030 (UNWTO, 2014). These figures, respectively, are approximately 2.6 and 3.4 times the volume recorded in 1995, and can be at least tripled if domestic tourism is included. Most of the impetus for this projected growth is provided by the Asia-Pacific region.

As the United Nations specialised agency for tourism, the UNWTO collaborates with relevant stakeholders to support the achievement of the MDGs by promoting the development of responsible, sustainable, and universally accessible tourism (UNWTO, 2010). Between 1970 and 2012, the share of international tourism accruing to the emerging economies (LDCs) has increased from 10 per cent to almost 50 per cent due to changes in consumer preferences in the major international tourist markets and the economic growth of the LDCs. They are also increasingly important as origin regions (Weaver & Lawton, 2010, p. 82). Taking advantage as one of the top income and employment generators, especially for the LDCs, tourism is considered a potential facilitator of development and is actively playing a significant role in realising MDG 1 – eradication of poverty, MDG 3 – gender equality, MDG 7 – environmental sustainability and MDG 8 - global partnerships for development (UNWTO, 2010).
Since the 1950s, the relationship between tourism and development has evolved in its complexity and controversy, with tourism not always perceived as an appropriate vehicle for facilitating economic or social development in peripheral areas. Sequentially dominant themes in this evolution are succinctly and uniquely described by Jafari (1990, 2003), who contends that tourism has evolved progressively since the end of World War Two through four distinct “platforms” or perspectives; namely advocacy, cautionary, adaptancy and knowledge–based. The platforms, which encompass different perspectives of tourism as a tool of economic, social, and environmental development, have been variously inspired and influenced by the development theories described above, and the cumulative influence of all these platforms continues to be felt in the present day.

2.3.1.1. Advocacy platform (1950s-1960s).

The demand for economic reconstruction and recovery after World War Two, together with the concurrent process of decolonisation, influenced socio-economic development throughout much of the world. Tourism growth was facilitated by the
emergence of the middle class in Western societies, their growing proclivity to travel for recreational purposes, and the increasingly convenient access to distant destinations (Weaver, 2006). Inspired by modernisation theory, the advocacy platform is characterised by strong support for tourism that is developed, especially under free market conditions, to serve as a catalytic or propulsive take-off activity. Tourism is still considered an extremely viable economic alternative for many communities and countries, a tool for economic development (Moscardo, 2009) and an ideal smokeless industry (Weaver, 2001a).

As an economic stimulant, tourism offered opportunities to regions such as Europe and Asia that were recovering from war-related devastation (Weaver & Lawton, 2010). The pro-tourism perspective argued that tourism positively contributes not only to economic development through the generation of revenue with multiplier effect and linkages to other sectors, but also to the culture and environment through promotion of cross-cultural understanding and provision of incentives for the conservation of cultural and natural attractions (Jafari, 1990; Weaver & Lawton, 2002, 2006, 2010). Accordingly, with high intensity or “mass” tourism, providing sufficient economies of scale, it was commonly regarded as the preferred model, having the greatest stimulus effect on development, especially for poverty – stricken regions where economic options are constrained (Weaver & Lawton, 2010). As a result, tourism has become a major contributor to national economies in many countries.

**2.3.1.2. Cautionary platform (1970s).**

In the late 1960s, it was realised particularly among certain academic groups and NGOs that tourism’s rapid expansion had high costs and generated undesirable consequences (Jafari, 1990). According to academics influenced by dependency theory, tourism was a means through which the developed core regions could continue to exploit and dominate the “underdeveloped” periphery following the demise of much of its commercial (i.e. plantation-based) agricultural sector (Weaver, 2006). Many small states began to develop economies over-dependent on tourism (Ayres, 2000), leading to descriptions of the latter as “a new kind of sugar” (Finney & Watson, 1975), a new form of slavery (Harrigan, 1974) and a “plantation model”
of tourism (Weaver, 1988). Another important construct of this era is the “pleasure periphery” (L. Turner & Ash, 1975), that alludes to the spatially and marginal regions (periphery) such as the Caribbean and South Pacific that were seen to be increasingly mobilised to provide these 3S tourism opportunities (pleasure) for the people of the core regions. To elaborate on the associated negative impacts, Mathieson and Wall (1982, 2006), Jafari (1990), and Weaver (2006) contrasted tourism contentions of the advocacy and cautionary platform and pointed out the economic, socio-cultural, and environmental costs that tourism will generate if not properly managed and regulated (Table 2.2).

Table 2.2. Contrasting tourism contention of the advocacy and cautionary platform

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advocacy platform</th>
<th>Cautionary platform</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Generates direct revenues</td>
<td>• Direct revenues eroded by seasonality and costs (marketing, administration, public infrastructure, incentives)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Generates indirect revenues (multiplier effect, linkages to other sectors)</td>
<td>• Leakages created by importation of goods and services and profit repatriation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Creates employment (labour intensive, unskilled)</td>
<td>• Employment is low-paying, seasonal, part-time, low benefit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Stimulates regional development</td>
<td>• Not necessarily best alternative (see problem)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Strong global performance</td>
<td>• Performance fluctuates at national and local level (global curve cannot be extrapolated to local level)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Promotes cross-cultural understanding</td>
<td>• Promotes cross-cultural conflict due to disparities, congestion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Provides incentive to preserve culture, natural environment</td>
<td>• Culture is commodified, crime is stimulated and environment is degraded by development and tourist activities, as well as induced effects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Weaver (2006, p. 5)
Direct revenue is often eroded economically by the skewing effects of seasonality and other costs, for example, marketing, administration, incentives, and infrastructure. There are also leakages created by importation of goods and services and profit repatriation, whilst tax revenues are often eroded through the need to make the above-mentioned investments. Employment is mostly low-paying, seasonal, and part-time, with minimal benefits. Socio-culturally, there is often cross-cultural conflict due to disparities and misunderstandings between hosts and guests (many of whom travel in their own cultural “bubble”), and tourism-related congestion (Mathieson & Wall, 1982, 2006). Also, culture can be excessively commodified to meet tourist preferences, crime is stimulated, and the environment is degraded by development and tourist activities, particularly in sensitive coastal and alpine areas. Fundamentally, unregulated tourism could undermine the foundation assets that support the growth of a tourist destination (Jafari, 1990; Weaver, 2006).

The negative effects of unregulated tourism growth have been summarised in the tourism area life cycle (TALC) model of Butler (1980), who postulated that destinations evolve through the five sequential stages of (1) exploration, (2) involvement, (3) development, (4) consolidation, and (5) stagnation, after which rejuvenation or decline may ensue depending on the actions that are taken or are not taken by planners and managers. According to Butler, a destination begins at the “exploration” stage when visitors come in small numbers to an area that is restricted by the lack of access and facilities. Gradually visitor numbers increase and reach “involvement” as local people respond to the attendant commercial opportunities, then development as growth accelerates and outside interests start to replace local investment. Continued development eventually progresses to “consolidation” as carrying capacities are reached and growth slows. Eventually, “stagnation” occurs to reflect social and environmental problems and then “decline” occurs if no remedial action is taken. There might be a shift to “rejuvenation” if there is a complete change in the attractions on which tourism is based, that is, by either adding man-made attractions or taking advantage of previously untapped natural resources. Butler’s model suggests that tourism carries the seeds of its own destruction unless carefully planned and managed, and therefore can be considered the culmination of the cautionary platform (Weaver & Lawton, 2006).
2.3.1.3. Adaptancy platform (1980s).

While the cautionary platform emphasised the costs of unregulated mass tourism, the complementary adaptancy platform proposed “alternative” forms of tourism alleged to be better adapted to less developed destinations than mass tourism. The underlying ideology is the same as that of the cautionary platform, though aimed at actually finding types of tourism that have fewer impacts than mass tourism (Jafari, 1990). Weaver (2006, p. 39) claimed that “Ecumenical church groups in both the developing and developed region played the lead role not only in pointing out the problems with Third World Tourism, but also in working toward “pro-poor” solutions that gradually crystallised under the rubric of alternative tourism”. In contrast to mass tourism, alternative tourism as a dichotomous ideal type is characterised by small scale development, local empowerment, strong inter-sectoral linkages, “authentic” experiences, diverse markets, low levels of seasonality, and low impacts. Table 2.3 profiles unsustainable mass tourism and deliberate alternative tourism as polarised ideal types differentiated by markets, attractions, accommodation, economic status, and regulation (Weaver, 2006).

By late 1980s, distinctive sub-sectors of alternative tourism emerged. Weaver (2006) categorised these sub-sectors based on their relative orientation toward attractions, accommodations or motivations (see Figure 2.2). Homestay (Dernoi, 1981) is, for example, accommodation-orientated while volunteer tourism (Coghlan, 2006; McGehee & Santos, 2005; McIntosh & Zahra, 2007; Mustonen, 2006; Raymond & Hall, 2008; Wearing, 2001) is motivation/market oriented. Rural tourism (Fleischer & Felsenstein, 2000; Fleischer & Pizam, 1997; Hjalager, 1996; MacDonald & Jolliffe, 2003; Oppermann, 1996; Sharpley, 2002; Wilson, Fesenmaier, Fesenmaier, & Van Es, 2001) is attraction oriented. Farm-based tourism (Evans & Ilbery, 1989; Frater, 1983; Gu & Wong, 2006; Ilbery, Bowler, Clark, Crockett, & Shaw, 1998; Pearce, 1990) combines both attraction and accommodation, whilst ecotourism (Boyd & Butler, 1996; Orams, 1995; Wall, 1997; Weaver, 1998, 2001b) orientates to both attractions and motivation/market.
Table 2.3. Unsustainable mass tourism and deliberate alternative tourism.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Unsustainable mass tourism</th>
<th>Deliberate alternative tourism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Markets</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Segment</td>
<td>Psychocentric to midcentric</td>
<td>Allocentric to midcentric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volume and mode</td>
<td>High; package tours</td>
<td>Low; FIT arrangements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of stay</td>
<td>Brief</td>
<td>Extended</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seasonality</td>
<td>Distinct high and low</td>
<td>No distinct seasonality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Origins</td>
<td>One or two dominant</td>
<td>No dominant markets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>markets</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Attractions</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Character</td>
<td>Generic, purpose built,</td>
<td>Idiosyncratic, pre-existing,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>‘contrived’</td>
<td>‘authentic’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis</td>
<td>Highly commercialised</td>
<td>Moderately commercialised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>Tourists only or primarily</td>
<td>Tourists and locals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Accommodation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size</td>
<td>Large scale</td>
<td>Small scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spatial pattern</td>
<td>Concentrated; obvious</td>
<td>Dispersed; no obvious tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>tourism districts</td>
<td>districts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Density</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture</td>
<td>Obtrusive international</td>
<td>Unobtrusive vernacular style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>style</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ownership</td>
<td>Non-local; corporate</td>
<td>Local; community or small</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic status</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourist receipts</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linkages</td>
<td>With non-local sectors</td>
<td>With local sectors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leakes</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiplier effect</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role of tourism</td>
<td>Dominant</td>
<td>Supplementary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Regulation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>Non-local corporate</td>
<td>Local community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideology</td>
<td>Free markets</td>
<td>Public intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis</td>
<td>Economic growth; profits</td>
<td>Community well-being</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timeframe</td>
<td>Short-term</td>
<td>Long-term</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Weaver (2006, p. 41)*
With regard to the dimensions of alternative tourism depicted in Table 2.3, CBT is most explicit in ‘accommodation’ through ownership (local community or small business), and ‘regulation’ through control (local community) and emphasis (community well-being). CBT is widely touted as a holistic solution for balancing the costs and benefits permeating all these manifestations, especially in disadvantaged areas (see Section 2.3.2), and therefore can be positioned in the centre of the diagram with roughly equal applicability to attraction (authentic culture, unspoiled nature), accommodation (homestay), and motivation (curiosity, interest in local culture). Moreover, it provides a broader context within which all the other types of listed alternative tourism can occur.

![Figure 2.2. Types of alternative tourism.](image)

*Source: Adapted from Weaver (2006, p. 40)*
2.3.1.4. Knowledge-based platform (1990s).

The knowledge-based platform adopted “a holistic view of tourism as an integrated and interdependent system in which large scale and small scale manifestations are both considered appropriate and potentially sustainable, depending on the circumstances of each particular destination” and therefore, “effective management decisions about this complex system are based not on emotion or ideology, but on sound knowledge obtained through application of the scientific method and informed by relevant models and theory” (Weaver & Lawton, 2010, p.12). Hence, alternative tourism or mass tourism is both perceived as potentially viable options depending on the individual circumstances of particular destinations. Science is in theory the basis for making decisions about the most appropriate mode of tourism development, rather than ideology that is strongly influenced by the relentless forces of globalisation.

The adaptancy and knowledge-based platforms are associated with sustainable development and sustainable tourism (Hardy, Beeton, & Pearson, 2002), where tourism development should be sustainably managed within the carrying capacity of a particular destination, in order to maximise positive economic, socio-cultural, and environmental impacts while at the same time reducing the negative impacts (Weaver & Lawton, 2010). A review of the literature has shown how globalisation can be appropriated by and interpreted within the precepts of both modernisation and dependency, and how those two platforms have similarly given rise to two essentially competing models of sustainable tourism. The adaptancy platform has equated sustainable development with alternative tourism and its CBT derivative, and the knowledge-based platform has equated it with a sustainable mass tourism model imbued with ethical impulses. Weaver (2014) has expanded this concept by advocating “enlightened mass tourism” as a synthesis of mass and alternative tourism that combines the best characteristics of each, and in particular economies of scale and innovative competitiveness for the former and ethical imperatives for the latter. Macbeth (2005) proposed two new platforms, namely a (fifth) sustainable development platform and a (sixth) value-full [ethical] platform that implicitly accommodate both the alternative and mass tourism models, but his suggestions are not yet widely acknowledged.
2.3.2. Community – based tourism and development.

As described above, alternative tourism emerged in association with the adaptancy platform of the 1980s as an allegedly more beneficial option having less severe effects on the destination and local population without diminishing the positive economic and socio-cultural effects (Butler, 1992). Figure 2.3 illustrates the assumed structural relationship between community-based tourism (CBT) and mass tourism, sustainable tourism and alternative tourism, wherein CBT is dominantly if not exclusively a form of alternative tourism (many of its precepts being in fundamental conflict with mass tourism) and belongs, at least aspirationally, to sustainable tourism.

![Figure 2.3. CBT, alternative tourism, sustainable tourism and mass tourism](Image)

*Figure 2.3. CBT, alternative tourism, sustainable tourism and mass tourism*

*Source: Adapted from D. B. Weaver (2008)*

Perceptions of tourism development, as seen, are influenced by development theories. As a form of alternative tourism, CBT emerged under the adaptancy platform, inspired by dependency theory and its salient focus on the empowerment of disadvantaged people. Figure 2.4 shows the position of CBT within Jafari’s four platforms. It is obvious that in conjunction with other forms of alternative tourism, CBT has been widely adopted as a catalyst for economic development in peripheral
areas, given the belief that it is highly adapted to the needs of local residents (Weaver & Lawton, 2010). This assumption is fundamental to the adaptancy platform, but also applies to the knowledge-based platform to the extent that the latter accommodates both alternative and mass tourism as potentially appropriate options for destinations. Notably, this affiliation with the knowledge-based platform leaves open the theoretical possibilities for “mass CBT”, as per Weaver (2014) enlightened mass tourism model.

Figure 2.4. CBT’s position in Jafari’s four platforms.


2.3.2.1. Defining community-based tourism.

There is a large volume of published studies describing and interrogating the concept of CBT. The book ‘Tourism: A community approach’ by Murphy (1985) is regarded as the pioneering work that emphasises the important role of community involvement in tourism development, especially within peripheral and less developed regions. This is predicated upon the assumption that local residents are the stakeholders who are most likely to be affected by local tourism activity and hence should have a privileged voice and role in any decisions surrounding such activities. According to
the Responsible Ecological Social Tours Project (1997) CBT is defined holistically
as tourism that takes environmental, social, and cultural sustainability into account.
However, it is managed and owned by the community, for the community, with the
purpose of enabling visitors to create their awareness and learn about the community
and their way of life. Harris, Vogel, and Bestle (2006) described CBT as a tourism
activity and form of development in which the host community is the primary
participant and the driver. This participation ranges from designing, planning, and
managing, to monitoring and evaluation. Fundamentally, CBT is a type of
sustainable tourism aiming to involve local residents in the operation and
management of small (that is, appropriate) scale tourism activities in order to
alleviate poverty and provide a source of alternative income for community members
that supplements existing sustainable livelihoods and replaces unsustainable ones
(SNV & TIM, 2007).

One might also venture the more ambitious goal not just of alleviating poverty but of
improving quality of life and resident wellbeing from physical as well as cultural,
spiritual and emotional perspectives. In a similar way, but more systematically,
Blackstock (2005) pointed out that CBT is a model in which the management and
operations of tourism-related business are placed under the control of local
community, aiming to (a) increase revenue for local communities, (b) retain revenues
in the local economy, (c) empower local communities, (d) preserve cultural identity,
(e) improve attitudes towards natural resource management and wildlife
conservation, and (f) develop sustainable tourism. These initiatives should also
encourage respect for local traditions and culture as well as for natural heritage.

Tourism Concern (2010) focused on the aspect of “community” and defined CBT as
a form of tourism that aims to include and benefit local communities, particularly
indigenous peoples and villagers in the peripheral areas in LDCs, and to give local
people a fair share of the benefits/profits, and a say in deciding how incoming
tourism is managed. Integrating all the above mentioned characteristics, Beeton
(2006) pointed out that CBT aims to create a more sustainable tourism industry,
 focusing on the host community in terms of planning and maintaining tourism
development, as well as to provide an equitable flow of benefits to all affected by
tourism through consensus-based decision-making and local control of development.
CBT relates to the concepts of “fair trade” tourism (Cleverdon & Kalisch, 2000; Goodwin & Roe, 2001; Mvula, 2001) and “pro-poor” tourism (Ashley, Roe, & Goodwin, 2001; Chok, Macbeth, & Warren, 2007; Hall, 2007; Harrison, 2008), in which CBT is a sub-set, since both can occur as mass tourism. According to Cleverdon and Kalisch (2000), there is historic inequality in global trading relationships on the basis of core–periphery dependency, therefore CBT can promote fair trade in which local villagers of small communities are provided an opportunity to join tourism business and make a modest living. While the literature suggests a variety of definitions, throughout this research the term CBT will primarily be used to refer to a form of alternative tourism in which the host community is empowered to play a decisive and formal role in planning, implementing, and managing tourism development, and in ensuring equal benefit-sharing within the community.

The underlying focal concept of “community” is based on a sense of shared common purpose, goal or interest that is either attached to a geographical area or is built on heritage and cultural values shared among community members (Joppe, 1996). “Community” implies a group of individuals with some kind of collective responsibility, and also the subsequent ability to make decisions by consensus or through representative bodies. They are usually local residents, often rural, poor, and economically marginalised (Responsible Travel, 2010). Those residents temporarily outside the area to access employment or other purposes may be included as community members, while some local residents may be excluded due to their alien cultural status or temporary residence. However the construct of community is defined, it is clear that a high level of community participation is regarded by most advocates as being critical to the successful implementation of CBT (Mountain Institute, 2000).

2.3.2.2. Magnitude and distribution of CBT.

The literature provides many examples of alleged CBT projects in regions as diverse as Asia (Harrison & Chipani, 2007; Hatton, 1999; Hiwasaki, 2006; Nyaupane, Morais, & Dowler, 2006; Timothy, 1999), the Americas (Hatton, 1999; Keogh, 1990; MacDonald & Jolliffe, 2003; Mitchell & Reid, 2001; Reed, 1997), Africa (Kibicho, 2008; Kiss, 2004; Manyara & Jones, 2007; Viljoen & Naicker, 2000) and Europe
(Prentice, 1993). Looking more broadly at tourism projects/initiatives implemented by International Non-governmental Organisations (INGOs), it is apparent that CBT is manifest mainly within the LDCs, and in peripheral locations within the MDCs, including northern Canada, outback Australia, and the Aboriginal lands of Taiwan. The Netherlands Development Organisation (SNV), for example, is currently managing pro-poor sustainable tourism projects with community participation in 23 countries in Asia, the Balkans, Africa, and Latin America (SNV, 2010a). Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ), the German equivalent, is currently implementing some 50 projects globally with a tourism component. Many of these projects aim to support and generate income for people living adjacent to nature reserves (GTZ, 2010). A comprehensive global inventory of CBT projects has never been compiled, but based on an assessment of the literature, it is likely that several thousand such initiatives have been or are currently being implemented, almost all of them in rural areas that are peripheral or relatively peripheral in relation to their host country, whether developed or developing. Many of these initiatives, for example, studies of Cochrane (2000); Hunter (2011); Lepp (2007); Nyaupane et al. (2006); H. L. Pham and Kayat (2011); Ruiz-Ballesteros (2011); Viljoen and Naicker (2000); Ying and Zhou (2007), are located in the periphery/semi-periphery interface that marks the inexorable diffusion of modernisation impulses in this contemporary era of globalisation. Whilst the probable number of tourists implicated in these initiatives is likely to represent only a miniscule proportion of all tourist activity, their involvement can have a major absolute and relative impact on sparsely populated peripheral destinations where even a modest revenue flow from tourism can vastly improve local living conditions.

2.3.2.3. Resident perceptions and attitudes toward CBT

The solicitation of resident attitudes is associated with attempts to take the cautionary perspective to identify local stakeholder perceptions of negative impact; as such it plays a significant role toward achieving and confirming the success of CBT. Jafari (2001) assumed that residents became increasingly disconnected with and alienated from tourism as the destination becomes overdeveloped. This perspective is in concert with the Irridex Model of Doxey (1975) that proposes a sequence of community reactions beginning with “euphoria” and progressing to “apathy” and
eventually to “antagonism”. Assumptions of community uniformity in the Irridex have now been largely discredited (Faulkner & Tideswell, 1997; Huimin & Ryan, 2012; Kuvan & Akan, 2005), with some studies supporting Sofield (2003)’s ‘adaptindex’ (Crawford & Frew, 2007; Datzira-Masip, Beeton, & Best, 2013). On the basis of a review of the empirical literature, Weaver and Lawton (2013) noted that community attitudes are rarely homogeneous. They suggested that an array of positive to negative attitudes pertain at all stages of tourism development, depending on the extent to which individuals perceive themselves to be the recipients of tourism-related benefits or costs. Weaver and Lawton further contend that sustainable tourism outcomes are more likely when residents are consulted about their attitudes and the information they provide is incorporated into tourism planning and management. Content residents, presumably, are willing to advocate for tourism and to be hospitable to tourists while discontent residents may sabotage service performance and take other hostile actions that dissatisfy visitors and negatively influence repeat visit intentions and word-of-mouth recommendations (Ap, 1992).

The dominant patterns emerging from residents’ perceptions in a review of the literature over more than 30 years of empirical research undertaken by Weaver and Lawton (2013), are mainly overall positive attitudes but parallel concern about negative impacts such as traffic congestion, crime, alcohol abuse, and littering. Social representation theory and social exchange theory have been widely embraced as appropriate frameworks to understand such ambivalence regarding residents’ perceptions of tourism impacts (Ap, 1990, 1992; Long, Perdue, & Allen, 1990; Pearce, Moscardo, & Ross, 1996). Social representation theory, introduced by Moscovici (1981), aims to identify socially shared representations of tourism and agreement among individuals established on this basis. The theory is used to describe and comprehend what people think in their daily experiences and how a wider social reality influences their perceptions. Within the context of tourism, local residents develop, contribute to and change social representation through their involvement in tourism activities (Pearce et al., 1996).

Social exchange theory, in contrast, is “the exchange of activity, tangible or intangible, and more or less rewarding or costly [that is, cost and benefit] between two persons” (Homans, 1961). Recognising exchange as the social characteristic that
defines the touring encounter between hosts and guests, Sutton (1967) notes that the encounter is typically asymmetrical and unbalanced. Mathieson and Wall (1982) also describe the tendency of tourist-host relationships to be unequal and unbalanced. Other scholars, however, contend that residents are able to and do assert their power with regard to tourists, engaging in a host of overt and covert strategies that extract advantages from the relationship (Cheong & Miller, 2000; Deery, Jago, & Fredline, 2012). According to Ap (1992), residents perceive tourism impacts to be positive when the exchange of resources between residents and tourism is high and balanced, or high for residents in an unbalanced relationship, e.g. in employment and income. When the exchange is low in either the balanced or unbalanced exchange relationship, the impacts are considered negative, e.g. pollution, crime.

2.3.2.4. Characteristics of successful CBT.

As with all forms of tourism, empowerment and power are important dimensions and mediators of CBT. Expressed ideally in the solicitation of resident attitudes, most CBT research in developing countries considers affirmations of community empowerment, relative to other stakeholders, to be a vital core element of successful CBT, both as an outcome and as a facilitator of outcomes (Nyaupane et al., 2006; Tosun, 2000). Whilst there are various types of community participation in the tourism development process (Jain & Triraganon, 2003; Tosun, 2000), the level and types of benefits that result may depend on the kind of participation that take place. Going beyond the basic concept of participation, Scheyven's (1999) framework of empowerment, focusing on its economic, psychological, social and political aspects, provides verifiable indicators of enablement that help measure the level of local control over the decision-making process and the equitable sharing of benefits emerging from CBT activities (Timothy, 1999). This framework provides core indicators for the analysis of successful CBT. Table 2.4 shows that economic empowerment focuses on long-term and equitably distributed benefits that are manifested in visible physical improvements, while psychological empowerment incorporates enhanced self-esteem and confidence as well as increased status of other traditionally low-status residents, including women and indigenous peoples. Social empowerment entails the maintenance or enhancement of community equilibrium and cohesion, while political empowerment involves representative, responsive and
effective local governing structures (Weaver, 2009). Sofield (2003) explores further the applicability of social and political empowerment to the context of indigenous communities. Reviewing “successful” CBT case studies in the Asia Pacific, Hatton (1999) identified as common themes: (a) The impetus and enthusiasm of the local communities for the development of CBT, (b) Leadership with good vision both within the community and as provided by supportive local and regional governments, (c) Attractive cultural heritage, (d) Accessible and attractive natural environment, and (e) Partnership between corporations, organisations and communities. Based on experiences in South America and Asia, Hauser (2008) noted four critical aspects of CBT. They are: (a) effective communication, (b) marketing and product development, (c) equitable income distribution, and (d) internal power and control relationship.

Table 2.4 Four types of empowerment regarding CBT.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Signs of empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic Empowerment</td>
<td>CBT brings lasting economic benefits to a local community. Cash earned is shared between many households in the community. There are visible signs of improvements from cash that is earned in local services and infrastructure such as improved water systems, house made of more permanent materials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological Empowerment</td>
<td>Self-esteem of many community members is enhances because of outside recognition of the uniqueness and value of their culture, their natural resources, and their traditional knowledge. Increasing confidence of community members leads them to seek out further education and training opportunities. Access to employment and cash leads to an increase in status of traditionally low-status residents, such as women and youth.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Empowerment</td>
<td>CBT maintains or enhances the local community’s equilibrium. Community cohesion is improved as individuals and families work together to build a successful CBT. Some funds raised are used for community development purposes like education and road improvement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Empowerment</td>
<td>The community’s political structure that fairly represents the needs and interests of all community groups provide a forum through which people can raise questions and concerns pertaining to CBT initiatives. Agencies initiating or implementing the CBT ventures seek out the opinions of community groups and individual community members, and provide opportunities for them to be represented on decision-making bodies e.g. CBT Management Board.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Adapted from Scheyvens (1999, p. 247)
Acknowledging the lack of empirical studies systematically investigating the factors that contribute to the successful implementation of community-based tourism, D. Weaver (2008) proposed ten common characteristics of successful ecotourism-focused CBT including: (a) clear definition of “community”, (b) strong and popularly supported leadership, (c) control over and access to wildlife-sustaining land, (d) broad based participation, (e) effective partnerships with relevant organisations, (f) skill and capacity acquisition, (g) creating and sustaining tourist demand, (h) maintaining quality, (i) reinvestment, and (j) operation maintained within its carrying capacity. Kontogeorgopoulos, Churyen, and Duangsaeng (2014) identified three success factors in CBT in Thailand, namely (a) fortunate geographical condition, (b) external support, and (c) local leadership. A summary of successful CBT characteristics is provided in Table 2.5.

**Table 2.5. The compilation of characteristics of successful CBT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Characteristics of Successful CBT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hatton (1999)</td>
<td>· The impetus of the local communities for the development of CBT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Leadership with good vision either by an individual or provided by local and regional governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Attractive cultural heritage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Natural environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Partnership between corporations and communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNV (2007a)</td>
<td>· A strong and cohesive community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Unique features linked to major tourism destinations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Influence of surrounding area on CBT development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Participation of the local community in planning and management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Capacity building of both communities and authorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Importance of hands-on technical assistance and financial support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Close collaboration with local authorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Market linkages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Management mechanism with strong leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Fair system of benefit sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Complete supply chain of tourism services and supplies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Constant monitoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hausler (2008)</td>
<td>· Effective communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Marketing and product development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Equitable income distribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Internal power and control relationship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Weaver (2008)</td>
<td>· Clear definition of “community”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Strong and popularly supported leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Control over and access to wildlife-sustaining land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Broad based participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Effective partnerships with relevant organisations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Characteristics of Successful CBT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Characteristics of Successful CBT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kontogeorgopoulos et al. (2014)</td>
<td>- Skill and capacity acquisition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Creating and sustaining tourist demand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Maintaining quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reinvestment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Operation maintained within its carrying capacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Fortunate geographical conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- External support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Individual leadership</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2.5 shows a comparison of the characteristics of successful CBTs and the four main cross-categories that emerge from these various analyses:

- **Carrying capacity**
  - Reinvestment

- **Quality monitoring**
  - A strong and cohesive community
  - Supported leadership
  - Broad based participation
  - Strong capacity
  - Equitable benefit sharing mechanism

- **Effective partnership**
  - Unique tourism resources
  - Proximity with surrounding sites
  - Diversified products
  - Good marketing

- **Community vibrancy**
  - with relevant organisations, i.e.,
    - Local authorities
    - Villages
    - Development agencies
    - National parks
    - Tourism enterprises

- **Market linkages**

**Figure 2.5. Characteristics of Successful CBT**

*Source: Compiled from Hatton (1999); Hausler (2008); SNV (2007a); and Weaver (2008)*

1. “**Community vibrancy**”, consisting of five sub-categories, i.e. a strong and cohesive community, strong and popularly supported leadership, broad based participation, strong capacity (communication, vocational skills, and finance), and Equitable benefit sharing mechanisms;
2. “Market linkages” consisting of four sub-categories, i.e. unique tourism resources, proximity with surrounding tourist sites, diversified products, and good marketing;

3. “Effective partnerships” with relevant organisations, i.e. local authorities, villages, development agencies, national parks and tourism enterprises; and

4. “Quality monitoring” consisting of carrying capacity and reinvestment.

2.3.2.5. Critique of CBT.

The knowledge-based platform, with its emphasis on objective scientific investigation and critique, has given rise to a body of literature that is increasingly critical of CBT and its alleged benefits for local communities. Hence, while the above definitions of CBT assume that participating local residents will benefit from this activity, researchers are questioning the feasibility of implementing its core element – widespread community participation (Okazaki, 2008). In the first instance and notwithstanding the semantics, a community is not a homogenous entity but rather one that is characterised by complex and shifting rivalries, cliques, hierarchies, power imbalances, and personality conflicts. Hence, consensus on pertinent issues such as the distribution of CBT responsibilities and benefits is likely to be rarely achieved. Second, it appears that community (“inside”) involvement alone is not sufficient to attain the desired developmental goals (Blackstock, 2005; Kontogeorgopoulos, 2005; Li, 2006), and that interaction and communication with relevant “outside” stakeholders (e.g. investors, developers, planners and managers from the outside community) is also critical to the success of any CBT (Belsky, 1999; Wearing & McDonald, 2002). Weaver (2014) further suggests that all alternative tourism is fundamentally dependent on mass tourism, and situates as an appendage of it, through the transportation systems that convey the vast majority of alternative tourists to their destinations. Simpson (2008) less ambitiously acknowledged the involvement of multi-stakeholders such as government, industry and NGOs in the planning, development and management of local tourism initiatives to ensure better outcomes for both host communities and the tourists. However, these multiple entities may not share the same short- medium- or long-term goals or ideas about how these can best be attained, and inter-stakeholder cooperation can be difficult to achieve and sustain.
Ironically, donor dependency is endemic to CBT (Goodwin & Santilli, 2009). More confounding is that whilst the technical and financial support of Development Agencies and NGOs is no doubt critical to the success of CBT, Weaver (1998) raised the ironic possibility that these experts may be ideologically driven to impose an alternative tourism model regardless of the preferences of local people, thereby calling into question the entire issue of local decision making autonomy. This point is articulated and elaborated by Butcher (2007), who analyses the activities of five key NGOs and discusses their exercise of dictatorial power over local communities so that their development conforms to what the NGOs want, not necessarily what the majority of community members want. As such, this structure of dependency and imposition appears to differ little from the colonialism-type dynamics so profoundly criticised by the dependency theorists themselves.

Butcher (2010) subsequently questioned whether there is any real “empowerment” of local people in community participation. It is noted that this empowerment not only relates to the seven levels of participation (Pretty, 1995), ranging from manipulative and passive participation where people participate by being told what has been decided or has been already happened, to self-mobilisation where people participate by taking initiatives independently of external institutions, but also to the distribution of power within a community (Beeton, 2006; Scheyvens, 1999). Participation needs to occur equitably at all levels and between all stakeholders (G. L. Burns, 2004, p.133). CBT, however, as suggested above, may serve to reinforce existing hierarchical social structures and internal inequities that existed prior to its introduction, so that the local elite and their enablers continue to be the primary beneficiaries and sources of decision-making power. The level of community participation and the empowerment of local communities in CBT, are consequently important issues requiring further analysis, especially from the local perspective.

Based on a review of 200 CBT projects across the Americas, Jonathan and Pam (2008, p. 1) pessimistically concluded that “the most likely outcome for a CBT initiative is collapse after funding dries up [completion of a project]”. The main causes of collapse were poor market access, insufficient skills capacity and poor governance, all reflections of limited economies of scale. Another survey of 150 CBT organisations by Responsible Travel.com and Conservation International
(2006) revealed that 25 (16.6%) had a non-functioning email address and only 27 (18%) actually qualified as CBT organisations. Both surveys showed that much accommodation has extremely low average occupancy rates of around 5%.

Although extensive research has been carried out on CBTs, all the previously mentioned successful factors and challenges suffer from the serious limitation that all come from either “experts” or development agencies. The literature appears to pay far too little attention to local and non-Western perspectives and knowledge at all stages of planning and management, suggesting the dominance of a condescending and patronising “top-down” approach. Most research in CBT, moreover, has only been carried out in either a buffer zone of protected areas (Nyaupane et al., 2006; H. L. Pham & Kayat, 2011; Viljoen & Naicker, 2000) or rural villages/areas (Cochrane, 2000; Hunter, 2011; Lepp, 2007; Ruiz-Ballesteros, 2011; Ying & Zhou, 2007) of LDCs. Several studies have examined the peripheral areas (Botterill et al., 2000; Keller, 1987; McKercher & Fu, 2006; Wanhill, 1997), but there is still insufficient research to look at the dynamic interface between the periphery and the rapidly expanding semi-periphery regions which represent the ‘front lines’ of contemporary economic development in most LDCs.

### 2.4 Summary

This chapter has provided an evaluation and justification of the study’s purpose through a review of the existing literature on development, tourism, CBT and their interactions in the transitional zones between the periphery and semi-periphery. First, the majority of literature indicates that development is differentially defined and influenced by the diverse and conflicting sequential development theories of modernisation, Marxism, dependency, world systems, globalisation, and sustainability. The measurement of development, concurrently, has roughly evolved from econometric scales such as productivity and GDP (Rostow, 1959); GNP (McGranahan, 1970); GDP per capital, percentage employed in non-primary sectors and goods values exchanged between core and periphery (Galtung, 1971; Wellhofer, 1989), to more sophisticated, diverse and complex constructs that incorporate both economic and non-economic factors (Myrdal, 1974), HDI (UNDP, 1990), IAHDI (Hicks, 1997). These constructs, including the globally accepted MDGs (UN, 2000),
reflect the ideas of quality of life, wellbeing and triple bottom line sustainability. It is noted that development and its measurement is mainly defined and assessed by international organisations such as the UNDP, World Bank, international non-governmental organisations or outside experts who do not appear to adequately or systematically take into account the opinions of local residents.

Second, the concepts of core and periphery that are implicated in all of the above theories are either mainly referred to at a state level (Galtung, 1971; Prebisch, 1949; Preston, 1996; Wallerstein, 1974; Wellhofer, 1989) or as the “pure” remote periphery of LDCs. The dynamic interface between the periphery and the rapidly expanding semi-periphery regions that represent the “front line” of contemporary economic development and globalisation in most emerging economies and an increasingly common venue for CBT initiatives, have been largely ignored. Third, the role of tourism as a facilitator of development has been presented through the differing perspectives of Jafari’s four platforms. CBT is situated as a product of the adaptancy platform and a type of alternative tourism that purports to avoid the negative costs associated with mass tourism, especially in peripheral areas. However, the literature consistently shows that the aspirations of CBT are undermined by a variety of limitations, including a lack of optimal resident participation. CBT initiatives tend to be overly dependent on the support of development/funding agencies. There is increasing concern that most of the impetus and funding for CBT, and its ongoing product viability, is attributable to Western ‘experts’ and development agencies, and that far too little attention has been paid to local and non-Western perspectives, empowerment and knowledge.

Having established this generic context, the more specific context of Viet Nam is considered in the next chapter, with respect to the attendant development theories, the relationship between tourism in particular, CBT and development, in the peripheral/semi-peripheral interface areas.
CHAPTER 3  
VIET NAM CONTEXT

3.1. Introduction

This chapter contains three sections. The influence of development theories on the contemporary history of Viet Nam is reviewed in the first section (3.2), and then the focus is placed on current development patterns from a core/periphery perspective as the basis for structuring and analysing internal variations in development. The relationship between tourism (particularly CBT) and development within Viet Nam is explored in the second Section (3.3), with particular attention to the peripheral/semi-peripheral interface areas where the dynamics of development change are most salient. Finally, research questions based on the previous two sections and on the identified gaps of knowledge within the existing literature are presented in Section 3.4.

3.2. Development Theories and Viet Nam

By way of a basic geographical context, Viet Nam is located in Southeast Asia with a total area of 331,690 square kilometres, ranking 66th in the world and 2nd in ASEAN (Central Intelligence Agency, 2014). Viet Nam shares borders with China to the north, Laos and Cambodia to the west, the Eastern Sea, (also called the South China Sea) to the east and the Gulf of Thailand to the south. As of July 2013, the total population was estimated at 92.5 million (rank 15th in the world and 2nd in ASEAN), with 69.8% within the labour force age of 15-64 years (ibid).

Mountains and hills cover two-thirds of the mainland, and the coast line (excluding islands) extends for 3,444 kilometres (Government of Viet Nam, 2014a). While there are 54 officially recognised ethnic groups, the dominant Kinh (Viet) group accounts for 85.7% of the population, and comprises the overwhelming majority within the relatively more prosperous coastal and lowland regions. In contrast, other ethnic groups, for instance, Tay, Hmong, Muong, Dao, Giay etc., constitute a majority in the peripheral highland and mountain portions of Viet Nam. The urban population
accounts for about 31% with an average annual growth rate of 3.03% achieved
between 2010 and 2015. This growth is mainly due to internal migration from the
countryside rather than natural increase. About one-third of the urban population is
accounted for by the two cities of Ho Chi Minh City (Sai Gon) in the South and Ha
Noi in the North. Together these two cities served as the respective capital cities of
South Viet Nam and North Viet Nam during the era of the American War (1965-
1975). The fertility rate for Vietnamese women is 1.87 children, ranking 143 in
comparison to other countries (Central Intelligence Agency, 2014; General Statistic
Office of Viet Nam, 2010; UNDP, 2010).

3.2.1. The influence of development theories.

The 20 centuries of Viet Nam’s recorded history consist approximately of 10
centuries under Chinese domination and another 10 centuries of Vietnamese
feudalism. During these centuries, Viet Nam’s economy was backward, self-
sufficient, and agriculture-based. From 1884 to 1945, Viet Nam was invaded and
became a semi-feudal colony of France. The development during this pre-war era of
French colonialism was partially influenced by modernisation as a result of the
penetration of Western capital (Government of Viet Nam, 2014b). However, French
policies were mainly focused on the exploitation of natural resources (coal, tin, zinc),
plantations (rice, rubber, coffee) and the convenience of cheap indigenous labour.
Manufacturing industries were not promoted. Goods production based on the
capitalist mode of production was just in its embryonic stage. Consequently, industry
in Vietnam under French colonisation was actually a small-scale extractive industry
representing a typical example of dependency theory at a country level in which
France functions as the core and Viet Nam as a periphery area.

Following World War Two, development in Viet Nam was profoundly influenced by
the development theories outlined in the previous chapter (modernisation theory,
dependency theory, Marxism theory), displaying a complex pattern. The north was
initially influenced by Marxism and the south by USA-supported capitalist
modernisation. This situation thereby gave rise to the current hybrid model described
below. These influences can be divided into three periods, (a) 1945 – 1975, (b) 1976
– 1986, and (c) 1987 to the present time. During the period 1945-1975 Viet Nam was
divided into two parts that followed different development policies. North Viet Nam (Democratic Republic of Viet Nam) was driven by Marxism while South Viet Nam (Republic of Viet Nam), followed an aspirational trajectory of modernisation with the support of the USA. From the perspective of world systems theory, Wallerstein (1976) categorised Viet Nam during this first era as a semi-peripheral state, indicating its intermediate status between core and periphery at the global level. After reunification in 1976, as with other socialist countries where Marxism played a dominant role in development, Viet Nam continued to pursue the Marxist ideology nationwide. Being part of the Soviet Union’s sphere of influence during the years of the Cold War, Viet Nam’s economic development model during 1976-1986 was oriented toward central planning and economic subsidies. This period ended with the introduction of the “Doi moi” (open door) policy in 1986.

This development policy, affected by dependency theory and its emphasis on the import substitution strategy and a decentralised economy, not only helped Viet Nam overcome the crisis that led to the collapse of the Eastern Block in late 1980s, but also contributed to the successful transition toward a seemingly oxymoronic “socialist”-oriented market economy (Irvin, 1995). This development has essentially functioned as a hybrid model that amalgamates the impulses of Marxism, capitalist modernisation, globalisation, sustainability, and dependency. Under the influence of post-Soviet globalisation, Viet Nam is increasingly integrating into regional and global systems and overcoming its traditional isolation. It obtained membership in the Association of South East Asian Nations (ASEAN) in 1995, the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) in 1998, and the World Trade Organisation (WTO) in 2007. All these memberships have served to hasten Viet Nam’s integration into the world economy, and have served as forums for Viet Nam’s active participation in regional integration initiatives, for example, the Mekong River Commission (MRC). This integration is progressing rapidly even though Viet Nam remains one of just five countries that continue to formally follow a socialist ideology (the others are China, Korea PDR, Laos and Cuba).
3.2.2. Measurement of development in Viet Nam.

Largely as a consequence of this post-war integration, Viet Nam’s conventional development metrics are rapidly improving. Viet Nam’s GDP (purchasing power parity) was estimated at US$325.9 billion in 2012, standing 38 in the world and yielding a per capita income of US$3,600 that stands 167th out of 229 in the world (Central Intelligence Agency, 2014). With the “Doi moi” policy, Viet Nam has experienced a period of rapid socio-economic development. Since 1990, the GDP has nearly tripled, based on an average annual growth rate of 7.5% up to 2008 (UNDP, 2010). Notably, the percentage of the population living below the national poverty line, that is, the percentage of the population that falls below US$1 per day based on the Viet Nam Living Standards Survey, has declined from around 75% in 1990 to 58% in 1993, and stands at 11.3% in 2012 (Central Intelligence Agency, 2014; Centre for International Economics, 2002, p. 2). Demographically, the General Statistic Office of Viet Nam (2010) reported that Viet Nam’s fertility rate has also continued to decrease over the last 10 years and is now below the replacement level. In 2010, Viet Nam entered the status of a middle income country, a step toward the official government goal of becoming a modernised and industrialised country by the year 2020 like its regional neighbours Malaysia and Thailand. According to the UNDP (2012) Viet Nam’s HDI (0.617) stands at 127 out of the 187 countries that are measured. However, Viet Nam HDI’s trend (1990 – 2010) is below the regional average in comparison with the countries of East Asia and the Pacific in particular, and with the world in general. More importantly, the increase in the inequality-adjusted HDI from 0.478 (2010) to 0.531 (2012) is a strong indicator that Viet Nam is becoming more unequal and the gap between the rich and the poor is being widened due to the increased influence of the market economy. Table 3.1 summarises some key development indicators of Viet Nam since 2008, with data for the indicated years provided as available.

Viet Nam’s perceptions as to what constitutes development are very much in tandem with the international perspective. In 2000, Viet Nam committed to the implementation of the Millennium Declaration and integrated the MDGs into the strategy for socio-economic development in the period 2001-2010 (Government of Viet Nam, 2001). In support of its achievement, the global MDG targets and
indicators have been recognised through the Comprehensive Poverty Reduction and Growth Strategy (Government of Viet Nam, 2002) that clearly defines the adopted Viet Nam Development Goals (VDGs). These take into account the specific development features of Viet Nam and include additional goals on reducing the vulnerability of Viet Nam’s economy, improving governance for poverty reduction; reducing ethnic inequality and ensuring pro-poor infrastructure (see Appendix 3.1).

Table 3.1. Overview of Viet Nam development indicators.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2012 global ranking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GDP (purchasing power parity - PPP) (US$ billion)</td>
<td>256.9</td>
<td>293.1</td>
<td>310.4</td>
<td>325.9</td>
<td></td>
<td>38/229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP per capita (PPP)</td>
<td>2.900</td>
<td>3.300</td>
<td>3.500</td>
<td>3.600</td>
<td></td>
<td>167/229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP (official exchange rate) (US$ billion)</td>
<td>123.6</td>
<td>138.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>57/193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty (% pop. living below national poverty line of $1 per day)</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td></td>
<td>11.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNI Atlas method (current US$ million)</td>
<td>78.439</td>
<td>88.537</td>
<td>101.089</td>
<td>111.125</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNI per capita (2005 PPP$)</td>
<td>2.740</td>
<td>2.850</td>
<td>2.757</td>
<td>2.859</td>
<td>2.970</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Development Index (HDI)</td>
<td>0.597</td>
<td>0.601</td>
<td>0.611</td>
<td>0.614</td>
<td>0.617</td>
<td>127/187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inequality– adjusted HDI</td>
<td>0.478</td>
<td>0.510</td>
<td>0.531</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>70/132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Inequality Index</td>
<td>0.305</td>
<td>0.299</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life expectancy at birth, total (years)</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>74.4</td>
<td>74.9</td>
<td>75.2</td>
<td>75.4</td>
<td>94/223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total fertility rate (children born/woman)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.93</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td></td>
<td>135/224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)</td>
<td>69</td>
<td></td>
<td>19.61</td>
<td></td>
<td>95/224</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literacy rate (% ages 15 and over can read and write)</td>
<td>92.5</td>
<td></td>
<td>93.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Compiled from Central Intelligence Agency (2012, 2014); General Statistic Office of Viet Nam (2010); UNDP (2012); World Bank (2012b)

The Government of Viet Nam (2012b) has set sustainable development as one of its top priorities and has demonstrated a strong rhetorical commitment to its attainment (Do, 2003; M. T. Nguyen, 2010). Viet Nam has made significant gains in relation to the MDGs, and is expected to achieve most of the targets set by the MDGs by 2015. The United Nation Economic and Social Committee for Asia-Pacific (ESCAP), ADB and UNDP (ESCAP, ADB, & UNDP, 2010), reported that Viet Nam had already
fulfilled 90 per cent of the MDGs by 2010, taking the lead in Southeast Asia, and outperforming many other countries (World Bank, 2010). Five of the eight main MDG targets set for 2015 have been attained, and another three are likely to be reached ahead of time (see Appendix 3.2). However, challenges exist. There are particular problems with regard to disparities between the Kinh majority and ethnic minority groups such as Hmong, Dao, Tay, Nung, etc. and the lack of drinking water and sanitation (UNDP, 2010; World Bank, 2010). It must also be recognised that the MDGs fundamentally represent an escape from the parameters of extreme poverty, and that their fulfilment is in no way indicative of a high Western-style standard of living for the majority of residents. There might also be geopolitical and political motivations for the Viet Nam government to pursue a higher level of development, such as reducing dissatisfaction in peripheral regions and facilitating government control through better spatial integration, but these are not explicitly expressed in relevant publically accessible government documents.

3.2.3. **Core and periphery as internal variations of development.**

With regard to the above discussion and all other development indicators, Viet Nam displays notable core-periphery differentiations, the amelioration of which is a basic motivation for the government’s development strategies. Although there is not yet any formal protocol for measuring the delineation between periphery and semi-periphery, the core-periphery and semi-peripheral areas/corridors in Viet Nam have been tentatively mapped in this thesis, based on differences in the GDP per capita, population and accessibility (measured by the presence of road transportation infrastructure) derived from General Statistic Office’s data for the years 2008 and 2009. These are the most recent years for which relatively reliable statistics are available. Note that the boundaries of the three zones as depicted in Figure 3.1 are approximations only, due to the scale of the map.

Out of 64 cities and provinces, Ha Noi, the capital city of 6.47 million people in the north, and Ho Chi Minh City, the largest city in the south with 7.16 million residents, are the two primary city-region cores. Both are characterised by high levels of economic vitality and good infrastructure. They also serve as major international points of entry. Together Ha Noi and Ho Chi Minh city occupy only 1.6% of the total
area of Viet Nam, but account for 16% of the population (34% of urban population) as well as over 30% of GDP, and have the highest number of road-carried passengers at 45% of the national total (General Statistic Office of Viet Nam, 2010). There are also several “semi-cores” that are characterised mainly by the population of the hub, in each case over 500,000 and rising rapidly through immigration and relatively high fertility rates due to a youthful population structure. Each semi-core functions as a second-tier urban hub within its respective region, i.e. Hai Phong and Ha Long cities in the North, Da Nang and Nha Trang cities in the Central regions, and Ba Ria-Vung Tau, Binh Duong and Can Tho in the South. These secondary hubs indicate the increased articulation of the national urban hierarchy and collectively account for approximately 7% of Viet Nam’s land area, 11.3% of the population (19% of the urban population) and 31% of GDP. Altogether the primary and secondary cores are estimated to represent just 9% of the land area but 27% of population (53% urban population) and 62% of GDP, thus clearly indicating their dominance of Viet Nam’s space-economy.

In contrast, the periphery mostly encompasses remote mountainous and borderland areas in the North, Central Highlands, and the South Mekong Delta, where infrastructure is poor and the economy is dependent on traditional industries (for example, handicrafts, and agriculture). These areas are estimated to account for 87% of the land area and 67.5% of population (19% of urban population), but just 28% of GDP. Ethnic minorities (Tay, Hmong, Dao, Giay etc.) comprise the majority of the periphery’s population. The semi-periphery includes the remaining 4% of land area, 5.5% of population (28% of urban population) and 10% of GDP. These mainly rural areas, largely alluvial plains and valleys or low hills, are characterised by a high level of sedentary agricultural activity and relatively good connectivity through local service centres and transportation networks. It is acknowledged that there are no previously published configurations of the Vietnamese semi-periphery in particular, and that the present demarcation is speculative, based on Wallerstein’s descriptions as they apply internally to the characteristics of Viet Nam. It is also important to note that just having core and periphery would be too simplistic and dichotomous, and that the semi-periphery effectively captures the middle ground representing the forward dynamism of the expansion of modernisation.
Figure 3.1. Approximation of the Core, semi-periphery and peripheral areas of Viet Nam.
3.3. Tourism and Development in Viet Nam

3.3.1. Tourism and development.

Viet Nam’s international tourism development was mainly focused on friendship and business travel among socialist countries prior to the introduction of the open door policy in the late 1980s, reflecting a highly constrained Marxist variant of the advocacy platform. Since the introduction of the open door policy, however, international tourism has been aggressively promoted by the central government as a tool for accelerating economic and social development. Vietnamese tourism has diversified its markets and activities, and, in tandem with other countries in the broader Asia-Pacific region, achieved remarkable double-digit average annual growth in international tourist arrivals of 17.3% from 1990-2013. Such a change is indicative of a shift to a more spontaneous market-driven version of the advocacy platform and is clearly shown by the fact that Viet Nam received only 250,000 inbound tourists in 1990, but more than 7.57 million in 2013 (Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism, 2013). This outcome has occurred two years ahead of the target of 6.5 million set in the tourism development strategy, despite the global economic downturn.

In 2012, international tourism generated more than US$7.6 billion in revenue (Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism, 2012), indicating that its encouragement is very much associated with ongoing government efforts to utilise tourism as a vehicle for economic development and a more equitable redistribution of wealth. The top five tourism generating countries constituted 52% (3,559,207) of total inbound tourists and included China, South Korea, Japan, USA, and Taiwan. China accounted for the largest market share, with 1.4 million visitors, followed by South Korea and Japan with 700,917 and 576,386 respectively. USA placed 4th with 443,826 visitors, followed by Taiwan with 409,385. Inbound tourists from 12 European countries together accounted for 11%, or 752,670 visitors. Meanwhile seven countries in Southeast Asia accounted for a 19.9% share of all arrivals (1,363,798 visitors).

Domestic tourism concurrently experienced a sharp annual average increase of 19.2%, from one million in 1990 to 35 million in 2013, reflecting the rapid growth of the middle class especially within core regions of Viet Nam (Figure 3.2). This is
consistent with Stage 2 of Burton (1995) tourism participation model, wherein a rapidly growing urban middle class desires and realises widespread participation in domestic tourism. Travel and tourism investment in 2011, implicating domestic as well as international tourism, was US$3.6 billion, accounting for 8.4% of total investment, generating 4.3 million jobs equal to 8.6% total employment, and contributing 5.8% of GDP (Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism, 2012; World Travel and Tourism Council, 2012).

![Bar chart showing the number of tourists in Vietnam, 1990-2013.](image)

**Figure 3.2. International and Domestic Tourists in Viet Nam, 1990 – 2013**


The challenges brought about by this large and rapidly developing tourism sector are evident in the increasing mass tourism development of major tourist destinations such as Ha Long Bay, Sa Pa (North West), Ha Noi, Central Viet Nam (Da Nang, Hue, Hoi An), Ho Chi Minh City and the Mekong River Delta (South Viet Nam) (Sturman & Le, 2013). In Ha Long Bay, for example, tourist excursion boats, one of the prime littoral tourist destinations of the country, increased from 200 to about 500 leading to increased environmental problems in the picturesque scenery of rock formations and island coves, including the overcrowding of caves, viewpoints, and anchoring places. The once hidden charm of this special environment is now subject
to modern resort and marina developments that have subsequently changed the character of the destination. Increasing numbers of short-term visitors put stress on the natural environment with unplanned and uncontrolled building activity and infrastructure development on the shore, as well as increased environmental management problems caused by marine tourism in the bay. The carrying capacity of the destination appears to be reached; however, even more new large-scale resort development is imminent (ibid, p.26).

Da Nang in Central Viet Nam, similarly, has seen a proliferation of hotel and resort construction along its coast in recent years. Large-scale investors have been attracted to take advantage of opportunities to develop golf courses and seaside resorts. Large tracts of previously public beach in Da Nang City have already been fenced off for private investment. It is unclear whether the area can sustain the planned influx of domestic and foreign tourists with their anticipated rates of water consumption and need for other resources (Sturman & Le, 2013). These examples of rushed and largely uncontrolled tourism development demonstrate the need for a sustainable approach to tourism development. Reflecting the worldwide tendency of leisure tourism to concentrate in just a few areas within any given destination (Weaver & Lawton, 2010), it may be noted that tourism is only incipient (Butler’s exploration and involvement stages) in most parts of Viet Nam, thereby indicating unfulfilled opportunities for development but concurrent opportunities to develop sustainably once some growth impetus is attained.

As discussed in Chapter 2, sustainable development and sustainable tourism are at least rhetorically well established as a global trend. The sustainable tourism approach not only provides positive experiences for visitors and communities while generating environmental and cultural awareness and respect but also helps to minimise the negative impacts of tourism by empowering local people, including ethnic minorities in order to maximise their income and employment from tourism services provision (UNWTO, 2010; Weaver, 2006; Weaver & Lawton, 2010). Such rhetoric is also well-entrenched in Viet Nam. The sustainable approach that has been introduced to Viet Nam by the initiatives of NGOs and other international organisations has been widely accepted as a response to the challenges the sector is facing. Notwithstanding
the experience of Ha Long and other intensively developed destinations, the
government of Viet Nam recognises the significance of sustainable tourism and
supports this approach in all manifestations of tourism - including CBT - through
appropriate policy-making, planning and implementation, in order to address
attendant environmental, ethical and social concerns.

3.3.2. Tourism development and planning.

As the Viet Nam tourism sector continues to expand in size and influence, improved
planning and management is required for maximising the value added to the socio-
economic development plan for the period 2011-2015 (Government of Viet Nam,
2011a) and the MDGs. This is not only relevant with respect to economic aspects,
but also triple bottom line environmental aspects, including climate change
considerations, and social aspects, in which tourism and poverty reduction initiatives
dovetail and are linked to national development objectives and the MDGs. Achieved
levels of growth indicate continued adherence to advocacy platform-type optimism
about the developmental possibilities of tourism in Viet Nam.

By way of further context, it is acknowledged that despite experiencing sharp growth
over the past 20 years, Viet Nam’s tourism sector is facing challenges that have
caused it to lag behind its main ASEAN competitors in terms of tourist arrivals,
average length of stay, average expenditure per visitor, rate of return visitors, and
tourism’s contribution to GDP. For example, Thailand and Malaysia received,
respectively, 22 million and 25 million international tourist arrivals in 2012. The
challenges include: (a) weak empowerment of local stakeholders including residents
in planning, development, and management of tourism at destinations; (b) lack of a
proper benefit-sharing mechanism allowing for an equitable economic, social and
environmental benefit-sharing among tourism stakeholders; and (c) lack of an
optimal model(s) for sustainable tourism development that generates growth and
employment, and contributes to poverty reduction and hunger eradication as well as
economic and social integration.

To overcome the challenges and develop tourism into a “spearhead economic
industry”, the government has formulated comprehensive strategies to support and
regulate internal tourism development, including a number of rhetorically progressive plans, policies, and programs for the sector. Most of these place the emphasis on the importance of stimulating economic activity, creating widespread social benefits, conserving natural and cultural resources, enabling human resource development, and raising tourism awareness. Apart from the Tourism Law (2005a) and the Resolution of the Political Bureau of Communist Party on the development of tourism as a spearhead for economic development, two key tourism policy documents that provide guidance for the development of tourism in Viet Nam are the Tourism Development Strategy (2011-2020), and the derivative Tourism Development Master Plan (2012-2020).

The strategy on Viet Nam’s tourism development until 2020, with vision to 2030, was approved in Decision 2473/QD-TTg dated December 30, 2011 (Government of Viet Nam, 2011b). The strategy expected: (a) to develop tourism into a key economic sector, accounting for an increasing proportion of GDP, and creating a driving force for socio-economic development; (b) to develop tourism in the direction of professionalism and modernism as a focal point emphasising, assuring quality and efficiency while affirming brand and competitiveness; (c) to develop simultaneously domestic and international tourism, paying attention to international inbound tourism and strengthening the management of outbound tourism; (d) to develop sustainable tourism tied to the preservation and promotion of cultural values of the nation, ensuring landscape preservation and environmental protection and maintaining security, national defence, social order and safety; and (e) to promote social engagement in and mobilise all domestic and foreign resources for investment in tourism development, making full use of the national potential and advantages in terms of natural factors, national culture and characteristic strong points of each and every region throughout the country, to strengthen the connections for tourism development (ibid).

The objectives are set that by 2020 tourism is expected to become a key national economic sector that is modern and professional with relatively uniform technical infrastructure; tourism products have high quality, diversity and prestige, and they are imbued with distinctive national identities and able to compete with other
countries in the region and the world. By 2030, Viet Nam is expected to become a nation with a fully developed tourism sector. In order to achieve the objectives, the average growth rate of the tourism industry for the period 2011-2020 is expected to be in the 11.5-12% range per annum. International visitor arrivals are projected to increase to 7-7.5 million by 2015 and 10-10.5 million by 2020. Also, the annual number of domestic tourists is projected to grow to 36 million and 48 million by 2015 and 2020 respectively. The vision for 2030 is 18 million international tourists and about 70 million domestic tourists. The target for annual tourism revenue is set at about USD 10 billion by 2015, increasing to USD 18-19 billion in 2020 (equal to 6.5-7% of the country’s GDP), and double that by 2030. It is expected that tourism will create 2.2 million jobs by 2015 and 3 million by 2020, including 870,000 employees working directly in tourism.

For the achievement of the above strategic objectives, the Tourism Development Master Plan by 2020 was approved on January 22, 2012 under Decision 201/QD-TTg to ratify an overall master scheme on tourism development by 2020 with a vision towards 2030 (Government of Viet Nam, 2012a). Under the decision, by 2020, tourism will become a spearhead economic sector with synchronous and modern material and technical facilities as well as high-quality and diversified tourism products that are able to compete with those provided by regional and international peers. The master plan anticipates the development of seven tourism regions, 46 national tourism areas, 41 national tourism sites, 12 tourism centres and other tourism areas that will generate a growth momentum for the industry. The industry will develop tourist markets, expand both domestic and international tourism markets; focus on tourism, convalescence and long-time tourism; develop tourism products; organise tourism space; and reinforce tourism activities. To fulfil the goals, there are preferential policies and mechanisms on investment capital mobilisation, promotional programs, scientific and technological applications, environmental protection and climate change response.

Under the foreign policy slogan “Viet Nam wants to be friend of all” reflecting the country’s integration into the globalisation process and concomitant desires not to antagonise powerful neighbours, Viet Nam has signed 42 bilateral tourism
cooperation agreements with potential origin countries, as well as a multilateral tourism agreement with ASEAN. Complementing its recent membership in the World Trade Organisation (WTO), Viet Nam is also an active member of international and regional tourism related organisations such as the UNWTO, PATA (Pacific Asia Travel Association), GMS (Greater Mekong Sub-region), APEC, and ASEM (Asia Europe Meeting). Relations with 1,000 tour operators in 60 countries and territories have been established to facilitate the arrival of international tourists (Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism, 2009).

3.3.3. Community-based tourism and development in Viet Nam.

3.3.3.1. Magnitude and distribution of CBT

The earliest CBT initiatives were launched in 1985. These developments involved peripheral locations, i.e. Mai Chau (Hoa Binh) in the North and Thoi Son island (Tien Giang) in the South, and were focused on Eastern European markets (SNV, 2007a) as per the Marxist advocacy approach alluded to earlier. However, all such projects also apparently reflected the pragmatism of a Vietnamese government fully aware that alternative tourism options were more appropriate for poorly integrated and ethnic minority-dominated mountainous peripheral regions requiring their own models of tourism development, at least in their early phases. In the early 1990s, with the subsequent open door policy and attention to the growing popularity of “sustainable development”, CBT was extended to additional peripheral locations, namely the area around the North West town of Sa Pa, the peripheral Central areas near Hoi An Ancient Town (Quang Nam) and Hue as well as other parts of the Southern Mekong Delta such as Chau Doc in An Giang (SNV, 2007a). These were opened to Western and domestic tourists, and aided by the concerted attention of international NGOs and development agencies.

Taking advantage of (a) 54 ethnic minorities rich in cultural heritage and living in attractive natural mountainous areas, (b) the emerging global markets of “responsible tourists” to Viet Nam as a new globalised destination, (c) income and employment opportunities, and (d) improved internal transport networks, CBT has subsequently received significant attention from development agencies/INGOs, local authorities, tourism enterprises, and local communities as an opportunity for economic
development and poverty reduction. The online review undertaken for the current study indicated there are about 35 CBT projects/initiatives in Viet Nam, involving 20 provinces (30% of all provinces). Most CBT initiatives are aided by international NGOs and development agencies (Stevens, 2010) including: The Netherlands Development Organisation (SNV), the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), Fauna and Flora International (FFI), the International Labour Organisation (ILO), Caritas (Switzerland), GTZ (Germany), Counterpart International (USA), IPADE (Spain), Agriterra (The Netherlands), and World Wildlife Fund (WWF). (see Appendix 3.3).

Geographically, one-third of these areas are located in boundary or “frontier” areas between periphery and semi-periphery and the remainder are in pure peripheral areas. Fifty-seven per cent (20/35) of all projects involve ethnic minority groups in northern Viet Nam. It is also noted that 90% of CBT projects established after 2003 were technically and financially supported by international development agencies as donors, namely, the Spanish Development Agency (AECI), Asian Development Bank (ADB), Japanese International Cooperation Agency (JICA), Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), European Commission (EC) etc. Exceptions include Mai Chau (Hoa Binh) and Thoi Son (Tien Giang). However, personal observation shows that some local initiatives appear to be labelled as CBT for marketing purposes only. It is difficult to justify if the success of these 35 projects is being closely monitored as no comprehensive monitoring and evaluation have been conducted to date. It is apparent, nonetheless, that CBT is still considered as an effective vehicle to facilitate development in the more marginal areas of Viet Nam, and more CBT initiatives that involve ethnic minority people living in the periphery/semi-periphery areas (Taylor, 2008) are being developed through, for example, FFI, WWF, ILO, Caritas, and EU.

Ethnic minority communities, in particular, have benefited from CBT-focused tourism development in peripheral Viet Nam through employment opportunities and infrastructure development (Leksakundilok, 2004). In 1995, T. L. Pham and Nguyen (2001) estimated that “mountain tourism”, a product segment dominated by CBT, would create 5,475 direct jobs. It is also noticed that incomes of households involved
in tourism and service business are 2-2.5 times higher than those who are occupied completely by agricultural work.

3.3.3.2. Characteristics of successful CBT in Viet Nam

By analysing the best practices from six Vietnamese CBT case studies marked (*) in (Appendix 3.3), SNV (2007a) identified 12 factors underlying the successful implementation of CBT in Viet Nam. These are: (a) a strong and cohesive community, (b) unique features linked to major tourism destinations, (c) the influence of surrounding area on CBT development, (d) participation of the local community in planning and management, (e) capacity building of both communities and authorities, (f) importance of hands-on technical assistance and financial support, (g) close collaboration with local authorities, (h) market linkages, (i) management mechanism with strong leadership, (j) fair system of benefit sharing, (k) complete supply chain of tourism services and supplies, and (l) constant monitoring. Effective cooperation with local authorities and other stakeholders is also deemed important (Oostveen & Nguyen, n.d.). This point is supported with the empirical evidence from the study conducted by Le, Bui, and Weaver (2012) regarding CBT in Kim Bong carpentry village near Hoi An, an ancient town in central Viet Nam. The study concluded that CBT could be successful if it succeeds in building an effective partnership between local expertise and supportive international stakeholders.

3.3.3.3. Critique of CBT

Despite the increasing number of CBT initiatives/projects, N. N. A. Tran (2008) identified some significant impediments for CBT development in Viet Nam: (a) limited knowledge of how to develop CBT, (b) limited number of good CBT products and CBT models, (c) strict policy of limited tourist access to border districts, and (d) lack of coordination of stakeholders. Another challenge with CBT development is the lack of local capacity and expertise. SNV (2010b) identified that many organisations committed to poverty reduction in rural areas have been unable to implement tourism development as they simply do not have the knowledge and experience necessary to train the rural poor in the development of products and services that would benefit them financially.
In addition, the reviews of 35 CBT initiatives/projects nationwide (see Appendix 3.3) demonstrates nine challenges hindering the implementation of CBTs. These are: (a) local awareness of CBT as a new concept), (b) passive participation of local residents, (c) the tendency for poor people to accrue fewer benefits, (d) lack of skilled people, (e) poor marketing and promotion, (f) management and benefit sharing, (g) lack of opportunities for local people to share what they are doing, (h) limited access/complicated procedure for foreign tourists in remote and border areas, and (i) lack of transportation vehicles. It is noted that most these Viet Nam-specific problems overlap with the more general CBT problems outlined earlier (see Section 2.3.2.5).

In short, our understanding of CBT in Viet Nam is constrained not only by the lack of concerted empirical research, but by the fact that proximity to the semi-periphery is increasingly implicated in CBT but has not yet been positioned or examined as a context distinct from the pure peripheral settings that dominate the literature. Moreover, the issue of constrained community empowerment that derives from the excessive influence of NGOs and development agencies (despite their rhetoric of community empowerment) is exacerbated by the tradition of central planning in Viet Nam and raises concerns that the practice privileges government as the primary source of knowledge and decision-making authority.

### 3.4. Research Questions

The preceding sections reviewed the literature with regard to the development theories and the relationship between tourism, community-based tourism (CBT) and development within the national context of Viet Nam. Consequently, major research gaps are identified and the research problem justified. The research purpose and research questions based on the review of gaps in the knowledge are introduced in this section.

#### 3.4.1. Summary of the gaps in knowledge.

The review of literature as discussed in Chapter 2 (international context) and Chapter 3 (Viet Nam context) has clearly identified the gaps in the knowledge. First, though
CBT is widely regarded as an effective facilitator for sustainable development that reduces exploitation and brings about income and employment for local communities in the least developed and remote areas, its contribution to improving local development is often overestimated and inaccurately identified. This is in part because development and its measurement are mainly assessed by non-locals who do not adequately take into account the opinions of residents who directly experience its direct and indirect effects. There is increasing concern that most of the impetus and funding for CBT, and its ongoing product viability, is attributable to Western experts and development agencies, and that far too little attention has been paid to local and non-Western perspectives, empowerment and knowledge. It may well be that these agencies and experts have a vested interest in demonstrating the “success” of such initiatives. The existing literature in CBT demonstrates a need for more research to explore the local community’s perceptions of ‘development’ and more importantly, to examine CBT’s role in attaining this development from local perspectives. Another consideration is that little is known about the differences in Viet Nam’s CBT sector from one initiative to another, so that relative indications of homogeneity or heterogeneity are unknown. Concurrently, while there has been an increase in the amount of research undertaken on CBT, most studies focus on the classic periphery and neglect the dynamic interface between the periphery and the rapidly expanding semi-periphery regions that represent the front line’ of contemporary economic development in emerging economies such as Viet Nam.

3.4.2. Research questions.

The purpose of this research is to investigate, from local perspectives, the extent to which CBT contributes to achieving “development” in the periphery and semi-periphery interface areas of Viet Nam. In order to address the purpose and achieve the five objectives that are stated in Chapter 1, the affiliated research questions as informed by the literature reviews are formulated and answered in the relevant chapter(s) in the thesis:
Objective 1. Define development according to members of the relevant communities.

- Question 1a. What do residents of the relevant communities mean by development? [Chapter 6]
- Question 1b. How do the perceived concept(s) of development vary within and between the communities? [Chapter 6]
- Question 1c. How is the perceived concept(s) of development different from the defined concepts of experts and/or other external power stakeholders? [Chapter 8]

Objective 2. Assess the role of CBT in the achievement of ‘development’ as perceived by members of those communities.

- Question 2a. How does CBT contribute to development according to the residents of the relevant communities? [Chapter 6]
- Question 2b. How do these perceptions vary between and within the communities? [Chapter 6]
- Question 2c. How is the perceived role(s) of CBT different from the perceptions derived from the literature? [Chapter 8]

Objective 3. Identify factors that differentially influence the success of CBT from the residents’ perspective.

- Question 3a. What are the factors that either facilitate or impede the local success of CBT, according to the residents of the relevant communities? [Chapter 7]
- Question 3b. How do these factors vary between and within the communities? [Chapter 7]
- Question 3c. How are these factors different from the identified factors in the literature? [Chapter 8]
Objective 4. Identify residents’ recommendations for achieving optimal development benefits from CBT.

- Question 4a. What recommendations do the residents of the relevant communities have for ensuring that CBT makes its maximum contribution to development? [Chapter 7]
- Question 4b. How do these recommendations vary between and within the communities? [Chapter 7]
- Question 4c. How are these recommendations different from the identified recommendations in the literature? [Chapter 8]

Objective 5. Identify the CBT pattern and their implications for the periphery/semi-periphery interface of Viet Nam and similar environments elsewhere [Chapter 8]

- Question 5a. What is the CBT pattern for the periphery/semi-periphery interface of Vietnam and similar environments elsewhere?
- Question 5b. What are the theoretical implications of the CBT pattern?
- Question 5c. What are the practical implications of the CBT pattern?

3.5. Summary

This chapter has reviewed the literature relevant to the current study within the context of Viet Nam, including the influence of development theories and the relationship between tourism, CBT and development. A summary of current gaps in the literature that informed the research questions of the five objectives has also been provided. The methodology adopted for addressing these objectives is described in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 4

METHODOLOGY

4.1. Introduction

The preceding chapters reviewed the literature with regard to different development theories, the relationship between tourism and development, community-based tourism (CBT) and residents’ attitudes toward CBT. Consequently, major research gaps were identified and the research questions formulated. In this chapter the justification of the underlying theoretical paradigm is presented (4.2), the role of the researcher is explained (4.3), the research framework is articulated (4.4), and the selection of an appropriate research strategy including the research design and approaches are discussed (4.5). The sampling procedure, empirical material collection and interpretation (4.6 and 4.7) are then described. The application of computer-aided NVivo 10 to facilitate the empirical material administration and interpretation is also discussed. Finally, the issues surrounding validity and reliability (4.8), and ethical considerations (4.9) are discussed.

4.2. Theoretical Paradigm

The purpose of this research is to explore the perceptions of residents as to the effectiveness of CBT as a way to achieve development in the semi-periphery/periphery interface areas of Viet Nam. Before entering into a discussion of the research strategies, the research methods, the research design, and the rationale for the adoption of the appropriate theoretical paradigm, it is essential that the underlying philosophy of the research is justified. A paradigm is defined as a way of examining social phenomena that relate to the development of knowledge, the nature of that knowledge, and the assumptions that underpin how we view or think about the world (King & Horrocks, 2010; Saunders, Lewis, & Thornhill, 2007, 2012). It may be similarly construed as a set of basic beliefs with distinct guiding principles that guide actions (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005; Guba, 1990). A paradigm describes an approach to research and provides a unifying framework for the understanding of knowledge, “truth”, values and the nature of being. As such, it provides a foundation
for research design and interpretation. A paradigm can be viewed from different perspectives that are based on either (a) ontology – i.e. the researcher’s view on the nature of social reality and its characteristics; (b) epistemology – i.e. the theory or science of the methods or grounds of knowledge, knowledge construction, the relationship between researcher and participants, subjects, objects, and the phenomenon being studied; (c) methodology – i.e. a set of guidelines for conducting a research process; or (d) axiology - judgements about values and ethics (Blaikie, 1993, 2007; Creswell, 2013a; Jennings, 2010, 2012; Veal, 2011).

Jennings (2012) identified the five major paradigms used in tourism studies and management research as positivism, post-positivism, critical theory, constructivism/interpretivism, and the participatory approach, each of which exhibits its own distinctive ontological, epistemological, methodological, and axiological characteristics (see Table 4.1). According to Jennings, there is no best way or only one way of doing research, nor is one way necessarily superior to another, as the choice of the most suitable research paradigm is based on the research purpose. She emphasises that it is not a case of “one paradigm fits all”.

This research uses an interpretive social science paradigm (Denzin & Lincoln, 2011) that emphasises meaningful social action, socially constructed meaning and value relativism (Neuman, 2006) to address the research purpose: the investigation of the perceptions of local residents on the role of CBT in achieving development. From an ontological perspective, the interpretive paradigm assumes that the world constitutes multiple realities, and requires an inductive approach to gather knowledge from the empirical world to explain phenomena. The generalisations are then used as a basis to build theory (Jennings, 2010). Epistemologically, the relationship between the researcher and participants, in this case, the researcher and local residents, is inter-subjective (emic). Methodologically, qualitative research is used as it emphasises the socially constructed nature of reality, the intimate relationship between the researcher and what is studied, and the situational constraints that shape inquiry. As interpretive research attempts to understand people’s beliefs and actions according to the way they attach to the norms, rules, and values that regulate their interactions, the focus of this research is not only on the participants’ views of the situation (Creswell, 2013a).
that tell us the reason for their beliefs, but also on the social practices that underlie them (Saunders et al., 2007, 2012).

Table 4.1. Major paradigms used in tourism studies and management research.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paradigms</th>
<th>Positivism</th>
<th>Post-Positivism</th>
<th>Critical Theory</th>
<th>Constructivism /Interpretivism</th>
<th>Participatory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ontology</strong></td>
<td>Universal truths and laws.</td>
<td>Fallible truths that are influenced by social and historical circumstances.</td>
<td>Realities are socially and historically framed and reflect power relations.</td>
<td>Realities and perspectives are multiple in nature.</td>
<td>Realities are constructed collectively via engagements between individuals and others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Epistemology</strong></td>
<td>Objective, etc.</td>
<td>Objective, etc whilst recognising potential biases inherent in researcher decision- making processes.</td>
<td>Subjective-objective (emic) unless post-positivist critical theory (objective).</td>
<td>Inter-subjective (emic)</td>
<td>Reflexive, situated and embodied. Critical subjectivity. Emic and etic. Hermeneutic.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Jennings (2012, p. 312)

This research explores the perceptions of local residents who are living in social environments that influence their thoughts. Therefore, the research problem drives the choice of the interpretive paradigm as the optimal philosophical basis for investigating the research questions. This paradigm is characterised additionally as inductive, emergent, and shaped by the experiences of the researcher in collecting and analysing the empirical data. Hence, the research questions are broad and are continually revised from the researcher’s experiences in the field so as to better reflect the types of questions needed to understand the research problems. In order to address the research questions in the current study, an understanding of local opinions about “development” was sought, and how CBT contributes to achieving
that development from an insider perspective. Gaining this insight was important because it subsequently enabled personal experiences that assisted the researcher to empathetically understand and equally value the views of local residents, including exceptions of the type that are often discounted in (post)positivism as insignificant outliers. Consequently, qualitative methods of participant observations and semi-structured interviews are used to collect the empirical data that are then interpreted using coding processes and content analysis supported by the NVivo computer program. This use of qualitative methods allows the researcher to develop an increasingly detailed knowledge of the topic being studied (Creswell, 2013a).

4.3. The Role of Researcher

Qualitative research is interpretative research in which the researcher is typically involved in a sustained and intensive experience with participants (Babbie, 2010). Qualitative research acknowledges the subjectivity of the researcher within the research process as, usually, the researcher brings to bear background experiences that complement and facilitate the interpretive process, thereby adding to the depth and diversity of interpretations (Jennings, 2012). The methodological framework of this exploratory study enables the researcher to engage in interpretive analysis while being at the centre of the investigation. As an interpretive researcher, it is important to acknowledge that the interpretation of findings is shaped by personal, historical, and cultural backgrounds, and that the intention is to make sense of what local residents reveal. With regard to the current study, the researcher values social changes and emancipation, and acknowledges that values, accordingly, are intrinsically embedded in, and an integral part of, the research process (Jennings, 2010).

The researcher’s initial experience of the participants and the setting of this current study occurred during a visit to Sa Pa in 1999, when working as a part-time tourist guide for Saigontourist Travel Service company. This visit involved a stay only in Sa Pa town. Further chances to visit Sa Pa occurred in 2002 during six months work as a tourism advisor on a sustainable tourism project funded by the IUCN and SNV (international non-governmental organisations). The town had experienced substantial changes since the previous stay: more tourists, shops, hotels and
restaurants. However, the CBT in villages around the Sa Pa town was still at the incipient stage of development. There was no official record of how many tourists visited and stayed overnight at the villages involved. Though researcher has not involved in the project in Sa Pa after 2002, reports indicated that the CBT was extensively developed at most villages/communities with the support of SNV and Bread for the World (also an international NGO) and Sa Pa became one of the successful examples of a CBT development in Viet Nam. A good impression of Sa Pa and the local residents as the setting and the participants for the current research was made.

To assess whether the Sa Pa area was appropriate for this study, contact with the local residents, including homestay owners, heads of communities, and members of CBT management boards at each proposed site was made in May 2010. Connection and trust were eventually established through introductions by each head of the village and longer stays at each community for doing interviews. It became clear that the previous knowledge about CBT development in Sa Pa was useful; however, this experience did not influence the interpretation of empirical data nor was the researcher dependent on the pre-determined themes that were neither actively looked at for evidence to support nor create favourable conclusions.

4.4. Research Framework

Research is a systematic process of investigation with the purpose of contributing to the body of knowledge that shapes and guides academic discipline and practice (Powers & Knapp, 1995). This exploratory research aims to understand the role of CBT for achieving “development” in the transitional zones between the periphery and semi-periphery areas of Viet Nam from the perspective of local residents affected by this activity. The research framework in Figure 4.1 graphically illustrates the process that was followed to achieve these objectives. This process consists of four phases as follows:

1. **Phase 1:** Desired/Actual Outcome, explores the concept of development according to members of the relevant communities [Chapter 6]. The results are
then compared against the construct of development as perceived by experts and/or other external power stakeholders [Chapter 8];

2. **Phase 2**: CBT as Vehicle for Development, assesses the extent to which the CBT is achieving development as perceived by local residents at the selected sites within the periphery/semi-periphery interface [Chapter 6]. This result is then compared against the role of CBT as perceived by experts and/or other external power stakeholders [Chapter 8].

3. **Phase 3**: Intervening Factors, identifies key factors that, according to the residents, differentially influence the success of CBT at these sites [Chapter 7]. These factors are then compared against the factors identified in the literature [Chapter 8].

4. **Phase 4**: Prescription, is based on the results from phase 1, 2, 3. This phase explores the local recommendations to achieve optimal benefit of CBT [Chapter 7]. Consequently, this phase recommends the model of CBT that is chosen pertains to the specific sites and to the development of an optimum CBT model for the semi-periphery and periphery interface of Viet Nam and elsewhere [Chapter 8].

![Figure 4.1. Research Framework.](image-url)
4.5. Research Strategy – A Combined Qualitative Approach

Quantitative and qualitative research are the main research approaches. Each is different in terms of its design and philological assumptions (Babbie, 2010, 2013; Creswell, 2007, 2013b). Quantitative research is related to the testing of hypotheses or theories, statistical calculation, and measurement expressed in numbers such as percentages, probability values, and variance ratios (Jennings, 2010; King & Horrocks, 2010; Veal, 2011). This approach is more appropriate for studying a large number of people where findings from a representative sample can be extrapolated to a larger population as it relies on the numerical evidence to draw conclusions (Veal, 2011). However, these findings are often too generic for specific contexts and individuals (Johnson & Onwuegbuzie, 2010). Bryman (2012) noted critically that quantitative research fails to distinguish people and social institutions from the “work of nature”, where self-reflection cannot be found and the analysis of relationships between variables creates a static view of social life that is independent of people’s lives. According to Neuman (2006), the quantitative approach is positivistic - that is, objective - and uses broader data to statistically analyse and measure concepts to test hypotheses, while the qualitative approach is subjective and uses in-depth informative empirical data to thematically gather and interpret feelings to generate a theory. The qualitative approach is not concerned with numbers, but typically with in-depth information primarily in the form of words conveyed orally or in writing from a limited number of cases (Veal, 2011). Holliday (2002) pointed out that there are qualitative areas in social life such as backgrounds, interests, and social perceptions that defy quantitative analysis. R. Burns (2000) emphasised the vitality of the thoughts, feelings and perceptions of the informants, since humans are conscious of their own behaviour. Therefore, qualitative research exemplifies a common belief that provides a deeper understanding of social phenomena than would be obtained from purely quantitative data (Silverman, 2013).

Qualitative methods have been used substantially in leisure and tourism studies in recent years, as they provide rich information and in-depth knowledge from multiple viewpoints related to the “how” and “why” of tourism-related phenomena and experiences (Jennings, 2012; Veal, 2011). This research is based on the assumption that the perceptions of local residents (insiders), and the contribution of CBT toward
achieving such development according to the relevant communities, is different from the perceptions of development outsiders, namely “experts”, and other external power stakeholders, e.g. local authorities, development agencies etc., derive from the literature. In other words, as the researcher, I want to empower individual residents to share their opinions and stories, and to have their voices heard regarding the relationship between development and CBT that directly affects their personal quality of life (Creswell, 2013a). Therefore, the qualitative research approach has been selected since the research problem is to explore the nature of personal experiences (Strauss & Corbin, 1990) and to seek experiential live community knowledge and study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or interpret, phenomena in terms of the meanings individuals ascribe to them (Creswell, 2013a; Denzin & Lincoln, 2005). Furthermore, the qualitative approach selected for this research is appropriate as questionnaire-type inquiries are not feasible for groups that are still in a transitional stage of development and maintaining oral traditions of conveying knowledge and feelings.

According to Creswell (2007), there are five main approaches in qualitative research, namely (1) narrative research, (2) phenomenology, (3) grounded theory, (4) ethnography, and (5) case study. Since the study looks for the optimum model of CBT from the perspective of local residents, the approach selected to use collect and interpret data in this study is the combination of grounded theory and case studies.

4.5.1. Grounded theory approach.

Grounded theory was developed in sociology by Glaser and Strauss (1967). It is a qualitative research design in which the inquirer generates a general explanation (a theory) of a process, action, or interaction shaped by the views of a number of participants (Corbin & Strauss, 2008; Strauss & Corbin, 1998). According to Strauss and Corbin (1990), grounded theory is qualitative research that uses a systematic set of procedures to develop an inductively-derived theory about phenomena. Neuman (2006) explained further that grounded theory is a type of inductive social theory that builds toward abstract theory, often by making comparisons between empirical observations. Grounded theory is considered one of the most widely-used approaches or frameworks for interpretation of empirical material in qualitative research.
(Bryman, 2012; Morse, 2009; Neuman, 2006). As a research approach, grounded theory focuses on the realities of people’s experiences (Bryant & Charmaz, 2007; Charmaz, 2006), and seeks to induce theory from empirical data through the ongoing interpretation of those materials (Junek, 2012; Junek & Killion, 2012). In other words, a theory is built from data or is grounded in the data and is developed during the data collection process, making qualitative research flexible and allowing data and theory to interact (Neuman, 2006, pp. 157-158).

Grounded theory has been widely used in tourism research, for example, by Castellanos-Verdugo, Caro-González, and Oviedo-García (2010), Connell and Lowe (1997), Hardy (2005), Jennings, Kensbock, Junek, Radel, and Kachel (2010), Kensbock and Jennings (2011), Lawton and Weaver (2009), and Weaver and Lawton (2008). Junek and Killion (2012) thoroughly reviewed the grounded theory research approach (1995-2011) in the different areas of tourism and identified the common characteristics as the comprehensive exploration of the lived experiences, in-depth explanations and understandings of the phenomena and experiences being studied, and the complexities and inter-relationship amongst tourism stakeholders, including local residents.

This approach is appropriate for the current study as there is neither an a priori theory to explain the resident’s perspective on tourism and development, nor existing development theories that adequately take into account the dynamic interface between the periphery and the rapidly expanding semi-periphery areas. The research seeks to develop an optimum CBT model grounded in the actions, interactions, and social processes of local residents at the selected sites and ultimately to help explain practices or provide a framework for research (Creswell, 2007). The constructivist grounded theory approach (Charmaz, 2005, 2006), where participants and researcher are co-creators of knowledge, is employed in this research. This approach is more flexible than the structured (post) positivism of Strauss and Corbin (1990, 1998) and Corbin and Strauss (2008). The approach places an emphasis on systematic procedures to guide the pursuit of the research questions as a series of logically relevant steps, and espouses rigorous methods for collecting and interpreting qualitative empirical material (Creswell, 2007). The interpretation of the empirical data under the grounded theory approach follows a coding process, namely open,
axial, and selective coding, through which empirical data are broken into categories and themes. The process is discussed in detail in Section 4.7.

4.5.2. Case study approach.

According to R. Yin (2009, p. 18), the case study is an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon in depth and within its real-life context, especially when the boundaries between the phenomenon and context are not clearly evident. It is a preferred method when: (a) “How” or “Why” questions are being posted; (b) the investigator has little control over events; and (c) the focus is on complex contemporary phenomena within a real-life social context. A case study is considered not only a method but also an approach to tourism research (Creswell, 2007, 2013a; Stake, 1995, 2006; Yin, 2003, 2012; R. K. Yin, 2009). Stake (2006, p. 8) stated that a case study is both a process of inquiry about the case and the product of that inquiry. The case study approach is used extensively in tourism research (Beeton, 2004, p.37; Kibicho, 2008; Xiao & Smith, 2006). Jennings (2010) compiled a list of the types of case studies applicable to tourism (see Table 4.2). She emphasised that the list is not mutually exclusive, so that, for example, a research project can be simultaneously multi-case, intrinsic, and instrumental.

The research employs an exploratory case study approach. As the analytic conclusions arising independently from more than a single case study are more valid, especially if each case offers contrasting results, a multi-case design was selected to supplement the grounded theory approach as the evidence is more holistically compelling and robust with a high possibility of replication (Stake, 1995, 2006; R. Yin, 2009). In the current study, the steps in case study design and empirical material collection are adopted from Jennings (2010, p. 186) (see Section 4.6).

The selection of case studies commenced with a fieldtrip to Viet Nam in May 2010. A single case study region (i.e. Sa Pa) and several case study communities were selected within the transitional zone between the semi-periphery and periphery areas around Sa Pa. Descriptions of these case studies and their suitability for addressing the attendant research objectives are provided in Chapter 5.
Table 4.2. Types of case studies applicable to tourism.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of case study</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Exploratory</strong></td>
<td>The study explores single or multiple cases of the tourism phenomenon to discover uniqueness or characteristics, since no pre-existing empirical data exist in the public arena. The ‘what’ is determined.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(R. Yin, 2009)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Explanatory</strong></td>
<td>The study seeks to determine ‘how and why’ a single case or multiple cases operate as they do.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(R. Yin, 2009)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Single</strong></td>
<td>Only one is studied holistically.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(R. Yin, 2009)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Multiple</strong></td>
<td>Several cases are studied holistically. The cases studied many be similar in nature or different in nature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(R. Yin, 2009)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intrinsic</strong></td>
<td>Cases are studied that hold particular interest for the researcher.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Stake, 2006)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instrumental</strong></td>
<td>Cases are studied in order to achieve secondary ends.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Stake, 2006)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Multi-case</strong></td>
<td>A number of cases are studied during the course of the one project – similar to Yin’s (2009) multiple case study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Stake, 2006)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: compiled by Jennings (2010, p. 186).

At each selected community, contact was made with the village head to discuss the research processes so they understood and supported the access to and collection of empirical data. The participant observation, documentation review, and interviewing were conducted to gather the empirical data from March – June 2011. NVivo 10 was used to support the coding process and the constant comparison for interpretation of the empirical data. The preliminary findings were corroborated with local residents for validation of each case in November 2012. The ethical consideration was applied before, during, and after the field work (see Section 4.9).

4.6. **Empirical Data Collection Strategy**

Qualitative research is characterised as inductive, emerging, and shaped by the researcher’s experience in collecting and interpreting empirical data (Creswell, 2007). Qualitative research “involves the studied use and collection of a variety of empirical data – case study, personal experience, life stories, interview” (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005, p. 4). Employing the grounded theory approach, the two stages of
empirical material collection and interpretation are inseparable as they proceed in tandem, allowing an openness and creativity for the research in foregrounding the emergent theory (Bryman, 2012; Junek & Killion, 2012, p. 326). According to Creswell (2007, p.19), the logic that the qualitative researcher follows is inductive, from the ground up, rather than handed down entirely from a theory, and sometimes the researcher accommodates change during the study to reflect better the types of questions needed to understand research problems. Accordingly, the strategy used to collect the empirical data is flexible and if necessary, open for possible adjustment, to accompany the emerging new issues and questions. This section describes: (a) the sampling strategy; and (b) the methods used to gather the desired empirical data.

4.6.1. Sampling strategy.

Generally, probability sampling is associated with quantitative research and purposive sampling (non-probability) is associated with qualitative research. The focus of qualitative research is not on the representativeness of a sample but on the collection of specific cases that help to clarify and deepen understanding (Neuman, 2006, p. 219). This process of sampling is essentially related to the selection of units of analysis with direct reference to the research questions to be asked (Bryman, 2012, p. 416).

4.6.1.1. Sampling of cases.

The classification of R. Yin (2009) was followed for sampling cases. Purposive sampling was employed as this research uses a multi-case design where the cases are selected with a specific purpose and the researcher selects the cases and subsequently samples the participants in each case. Creswell (2013b) suggested that a study should not include more than four case studies. Therefore, four case studies were planned for the purpose of this research as this number provided ample opportunity to identify themes from the cases as well as to conduct cross-case theme analysis.

The selection of case studies commenced with a fieldtrip to Viet Nam in May 2010 involving 13 potential sites to examine their relative suitability for the study: Khanh village (Cuc Phuong National Park); Mon, Rim, Thuong and Sat villages (Ngoc Son
– Ngo Luong Nature Reserve; Viet Hai (Cat Ba island); Ban Ho, Ta Van, Ta Phin and Cat Cat - Sin Chai (Sa Pa), Lac and Pom Coong (Mai Chau), and Giao Xuan (Giao Thuy National Park). After consultation and informal interviews with local tourism experts, local authorities, park managers, and local stakeholders, four adjacent case sites within the peripheral/semi-peripheral settings of Sa Pa were finally selected: Sin Chai, Ta Van, Ban Ho, and Ta Phin. Apart from the geographical location, these sites were purposively sampled on the basis of the differences in the combinations of culture and ethnicity of the residents and the stage of tourism development at each site. During a site visit, it was discovered Sin Chai hosted an unexpectedly limited number of tourists so it was decided to eliminate this village after some initial interviews. The main features of the three remaining sites and their suitability as case studies within the larger Sa Pa regional case study are described in the section on Case Studies in Chapter 5.

4.6.1.2. Sampling of participants.

The research questions give a clear indication of what unit of analysis should be sampled, that is, local adult residents of at least 18 years (legal age of adult in Viet Nam) living in the three selected sites. Bryman (2012, pp. 425-426) acknowledged that it is impossible to determine sample size at the outset and to know how many participants should be interviewed before theoretical saturation has been achieved. He stated that if saturation is the criterion for sample size, specifying a minimum or maximum sample number is pointless. Onwuegbuzie and Collins (2007 as cited in Bryman, 2012, p.425) noted that it is difficult to achieve theoretical saturation if the sample size is small, and at the same time, it is also difficult to undertake a deep case-oriented analysis if the sample size is large. Creswell (2013a, p. 157) accordingly recommended 20 to 30 individuals in order to develop a well saturated theory, and Charmaz (2006) suggested that the sample size could even be larger. McKenzie and Crouch (2006) argued that a sample of fewer than 20 increased the chance of getting close involvement with the participants in interview-based studies, thereby generating fine-grained data and features.

This research employs a mixed strategy of theoretical and “snowball” sampling. As the total adult population of each case study community at the time of selection
varied from 1,000 to 1,500 i.e. Ta Van (1,486), Ban Ho (1,062), and Ta Phin (1,198), and the number of annual stayover visitors to each village varied from 4,000 to 6,000 in Ban Ho and Ta Phin respectively, and up to 13,000 in Ta Van, a theoretical sample of 30 adult participants at each site was tentatively used as the starting point for gathering sufficient information. The criterion for judging when to stop the interviews is the assessment of theoretical saturation, that is, the yielding of no further themes after a sequence of later phase interviews (Glaser & Strauss, 1967, pp.61-62, 111-112; Strauss & Corbin, 1990, p.188). All respondents were adults aged 18 and over who had been living for at least three consecutive years in the selected sites. In order to ensure sample diversity, participants at each site were selected on the basis of gender, age range, ethnicity, and with roles in the community involved in providing tourism-related services, namely homestay, tour guiding, craft selling, and transportation, as well as others not involved in the provision of tourism services.

The snowball sampling technique was applied to identify the participants. In this process the researcher initially samples a small group of people relevant to the research questions, and these sampled participants propose other participants who have had experiences or fulfil the characteristics relevant to the research. These participants will then suggest others and so on (Bryman, 2012, p. 424). Snowball sampling was selected for this research as the researcher intended to live in the three sites, each for four weeks, and contacts were able to be made almost every day. By spending time talking to local residents, the researcher was given introductions to others and details for visiting that might be of benefit to the study. Using this sampling procedure and ensuring a continuous presence in each area enabled the researcher to interview a diversity of people, both those involved and those not involved in CBT. At each site, the initial participants were the owners of the homestay where the researcher stayed, who became the initial contacts from which to broaden the sample through the snowballing technique. On some occasions contacts were introduced while on others the names of potential contacts were supplied. In addition, time spent talking with people met when wandering about the villages also introduced additional relevant people. Eventually, empirical data were obtained through semi-structured interviews with a total of 55 participants with 16-22 residents at each of the three community case studies. This number proved sufficient in providing the theoretical saturation point. Appendix 6.1 summarises the
participant profiles with information on the sites, participants’ ID, gender, age, roles, ethnicity, and those involved/not involved in CBT.

### 4.6.2. Methods of empirical material collection.

In order to increase the quality of the empirical data the researcher: (a) maximised the use of multiple sources of evidence converging on the same facts or findings; (b) created a formal inventory of evidence from each case study site; and (c) maintained explicit links among the questions asked, the empirical data collected, and the conclusions drawn (R. Yin, 2009). The following sections describe the procedures used to collect the empirical data through document review and archival records, interviews, participant observations, and note taking.

#### 4.6.2.1. Documents and archival records.

The interpretive nature of the research involved the collection of empirical data from a variety of sources including the interviews, participant observations, and a document review of secondary materials. R. Yin (2009) recommended six forms of empirical material collection, i.e. documents, archival records, interviews, direct observation, participant observation, and physical artefacts. Creswell (2013a, p. 159) suggested four basic types of information: (a) observations ranging from non-participants to participants, (b) interviews ranging from closed-ended to open-ended, (c) documents and archive records ranging from private to public, and (d) audio visual materials including photographs, compact discs, and videotapes.

Where possible, for this research, the existing data sources were used: involving the search for information on relevant published materials such as library catalogues, electronic databases, Google Scholar, and unpublished work, taking into account the fact that information is not always accessible and open in Viet Nam, obtaining copies of relevant materials, reading and compiling a list of useful materials to form a list of references. For example, statistical sources were used, such as the national socio-economic data, strategies and plans (Vietnam Government portal, GSO, CIA Fact Book, World Bank. UNDP), and tourism statistics (UNWTO, VNAT, Sa Pa People’s Committee). The archive data was routinely collected, enabling the researcher to
explain the development, change, and evolution of both the regional and the three micro case studies (Marshall & Rossman, 2011).

4.6.2.2. Interviews.

In qualitative research, interviews are among the methods most frequently used for collecting data (King & Horrocks, 2010; Rubin & Rubin, 2012). According to Creswell (2013a, p. 162) interviews play a central role in the collection of empirical material in a grounded theory study, while other forms such as participant observation, reflection, and document analysis often play a secondary or complementary role. There are various types of interviews, ranging from structured to unstructured. Semi-structured interviews were used to gather empirical data for this study. The selection of the semi-structured option was not entirely pre-structured with respect to content, formulation, sequence and answers, but provided flexibility to attain a “true” understanding of what was happening and to make it possible for participants to express their opinions in their own words (Boeije, 2010). Prior to the fieldtrip the researcher prepared a prompt list of semi-structured questions that related to the research questions to guide the interaction, (see Appendix 4.2). These questions were open-ended, broad, and general, so that discussion and interactions with participants was possible if further clarification and additional detail were warranted (Jennings, 2010). In addition, the process enabled the researcher to gain an understanding of how the participants constructed meaning within the historical and cultural setting (Creswell, 2013a). The villagers were given the option of using either Vietnamese or their own ethnic languages as their preferred language for interview. However, all villagers were confident and competent in Vietnamese, so the issues relating to translation and with ensuring reliability were avoided.

Interviews were either recorded electronically or through written notes—depending on the signed consent of each participant— and then transcribed. In order to have a comparable, holistic and comprehensive insight into tourism development in general and more specifically, into CBT at each site, the researcher also had informal conversations with tourists and relevant stakeholders who were involved in tourism development in Sa Pa, i.e. NGOs, representatives of civil society organisations,
hoteliers, tour operators, travel agencies, tourism academics, and local authorities at both provincial and central levels.

Additionally, given the fact that the researcher identifies with Viet Nam’s dominant Kinh majority that is quite different from the ethnic minority groups of most of the villagers participating in the study, it was important to gain entrance to and then build and maintain trust with participants (Boeije, 2010) so that they were likely to share what they really thought. Apart from experience with the regional case study area through involvement in the sustainable tourism project in 2002, the researcher gained access to research sites by gaining the trust of the “gatekeepers”, namely the heads of the communities and homestay owners (Creswell, 2013b; King & Horrocks, 2010), who helped remove social and psychological barriers and facilitated connection to villagers at the case study sites.

4.6.2.3. Participant observation.

Participant observation requires researchers to spend long periods of time in the field as part of a community so that they can become immersed in the local culture (Bryman, 2012). Participant observation was employed in this study to supplement the semi-structured interviews, as the observations can enrich the researcher’s understanding of how the participants construct and describe their thoughts and feelings and can highlight behaviours or events that the participants being observed may not wish to discuss (Jennings, 2010, p. 180). Furthermore, observational information can help with describing the context, activities, people, and the meanings of what was observed from a local perspective (Silverman, 2013). Observing local residents and their behaviours as an outsider rather than as a participant, allows the researcher to absorb characteristics of the physical settings, social information, feelings, and attitudes through nonverbal communication such as gestures and facial expressions (Neuman, 2006).

4.6.2.4. Note taking/memos.

In addition to the semi-structured interviews and participant observation, information was recorded by taking notes during the fieldwork. Field notes collected during the
research contained sketches of the location of Sa Pa, the three selected sites. The notes were accompanied by photos of local residents and the physical environment, digital recordings, observation memos jotted down in the field, interview notes, and detailed notes written away from the field. These notes provided extensive descriptive detail that supported the researcher’s memory, (Neuman, 2006), the interviews, and participant observations, and amplified the clarity of the transcripts. Apart from the observational memos, my impressions, spontaneous ideas, assumptions, hypothesis, evaluations, and thoughts were written as personal memos that helped me to record, reflect and connect my thinking and doing (Boeije, 2010). Furthermore, the methodological memos that were the written elaborations of the researcher’s ideas as part of the development of the codes/themes during the codification and interpretation of empirical data with NVivo. Note taking/memos were considered appropriate as the intermediate step between the coding and the first draft. Memos were also kept to document the development process of patterns and theory that is discussed in Chapter 8.

4.7. Empirical Material Interpretation

The coding process used to analyse the empirical data and the use of Nvivo 10 to support the codification and interpretation are discussed in turn in this section.

4.7.1. The coding process.

Qualitative coding is an integral part of interpreting empirical material during which large quantities of empirical data are mechanically reduced into small and manageable units to facilitate analytical categorisation (Neuman, 2006, p. 460). The interpretation follows a process that progressively develops more detailed knowledge of the topic of investigation. This is achieved by organising primary empirical data into increasingly abstract units of information (Creswell, 2007). The coding process is designed to systematically reduce and analytically categorise the empirical data into relevant themes. Primarily through the interviews with local residents, categories and themes addressing the research questions with regard to development emerged and were labelled. The themes that emerged included: (Objective 1), the role of CBT toward achieving such desired development (Objective 2), the influencing factors
(Objective 3), and local recommendations (Objective 4). This process involved the researcher working back and forth between the themes and the empirical data until a comprehensive set of categories and themes was established.

The grounded theory approach was employed to interpret the empirical data and proceeded through the following three sequential stages: (1) Open coding; (2) Axial coding; and (3) Selective coding (Charmaz, 2006; Creswell, 2007; Neuman, 2006; Strauss & Corbin, 1990). The patterns/theories resulting from the coding process are discussed in Chapter 8. The coding process is illustrated in Figure 4.2.

![Diagram illustrating the coding process]

**Figure 4.2.** The coding process.

*Open coding* is the initial stage of interpretation during which the empirical data are broken down into discrete parts, closely examined, and then continually and systematically compared for similarities and differences (Strauss & Corbin, 1998).
At this first stage, open questions are asked about the phenomenon reflected in the empirical data. “Codes” then are labels tagged to a certain segment of the transcripts that describe particular information relevant to addressing the attendant research questions. In open coding, the codes are suggested during the researcher’s examination and questioning of the data (Babbie, 2010, p. 401).

During this process, a review of the relevant literature suggests ideas for important themes, particularly as the themes emerging from the interviews are from different sources: (a) explicit terms used in the questions asked; (b) concepts frequently mentioned by the interviewees; (c) concepts emerging from comparing different interviews; (d) related themes that consequently emerge from the themes identified; (e) cultural themes widely shared by different interviewees from their stories; and (f) themes indicating a change in participants’ perceptions, thoughts, events that were hinted at by the use of “time” related words (Strauss & Corbin, 1998).

After open coding, a list of themes is identified, for example, costumes, house architecture, cultural performance, support of local authorities, and management mechanisms. The constant comparison of newly collected data with created themes is conducted with previous data and existing themes (ibid). In this research, for some initial interviews at each site, the researcher commenced manual coding in the field right after the interview, transcribing the information in the evening. The coding undertaken earlier helped sharpen the researcher’s understanding of the collected information and guided the theoretical sampling as the interviews progressed (Bryman, 2012). Marginal notes on transcripts were gradually refined into codes using pencil and highlighter pens. This manual coding process became complex and difficult to manage as more interviews were conducted and more information was collected, so therefore, NVivo 10 was employed to manage transcripts and support the coding and interpretation process (see Section 4.7.2).

While open coding fractures the data and allows one to identify themes, their properties, and dimensional locations, axial coding is a set of procedures whereby common themes are sorted, then reorganised and grouped into categories. At this stage, the focus of the process is on the coded themes rather than on the empirical data (Neuman, 2006). The main purpose of axial coding is to identify the themes in
the research that are the dominant ones and those that are the less important ones (Boeije, 2010). In other words, axial coding reanalyses the results of open coding with the aim of identifying the important general themes (Babbie, 2010). The researcher begins with an organised list of open codes and starts grouping these codes into conceptual categories that reflect commonalities among codes (Harry, Sturges, & Klingner, 2005). Some themes that are not relevant to research questions are removed at this point. In this current research, axial coding was used to group common coded themes into groups that were then labelled into conceptual categories relating to the dimensions of sustainable development, for example, socio-cultural, economic, environmental and spatial. During this process, the themes that emerged from the collection of empirical material were also constantly compared with the emerging categories (Creswell, 2013b).

Selective coding is the process of selecting the core category, systematically relating it to other categories and themes, validating those relationships, and filling in categories that need further refinement and development. At this stage, the inter-relationships and connectedness among categories and major themes are established. These inter-relationships and connections are presented using a logical coding diagram in which the researcher identifies a central phenomenon; explores causal conditions; specifies strategies; identifies the context and intervening conditions; and delineates the consequences of this phenomenon. Alternatively, propositions or hypotheses may be specified that state predicted relationships. During this stage of the current study the relationships among categories and themes were re-examined and identified and then a story line that logically connects the categories was assembled. Furthermore, a cross-case theme analysis was conducted to compare commonalities and differences among the three case studies.

Finally, a model/pattern of responses and themes that elucidate the social, historical, and economic conditions influencing the central phenomenon in the periphery/semi-periphery interface was developed and visually portrayed. This model enabled the analyst to both distinguish and link levels of conditions and consequences as well as to yield new knowledge.
4.7.2. NVivo 10 as a supplement to codification and interpretation.

Qualitative data analysis software NVivo was selected to facilitate the codification and interpretation process of the empirical data. Unlike other data analysis software such as Leximancer that provides a form of automated analysis based on the properties of texts, NVivo requires the manual handling of data at various points, where the researcher codes empirical data and develops themes or categories (Jones & Diment, 2010). This characteristic of NVivo makes the process of data analysis suitable for the constructivist paradigm and allows the researcher to engage more meaningfully in the analysis (Bazeley, 2007; Bazeley & Jackson, 2013). This software package not only helps manage and organise empirical data but also enhances the interpretation process markedly and makes it easier for the researcher to experiment with different codes, test different hypotheses about relationships, and draw diagrams of emerging themes (Bazeley, 2013). In this research, NVivo 10 was used to support the organisation of the codification process of transcripts in Vietnamese.

The empirical data was used for the interpretation of the information gathered during interviews with the 55 participants living at the three target CBT sites. The total volume of transcripts was 192 formatted A4 pages. Interviews were recorded, transcribed and formatted in Microsoft Word. Before importing data into NVivo, paragraph styles (e.g. Heading 1 for interview questions, Heading 2 for participant answers) were applied to interview transcripts to differentiate between questions and answers. This early formatting was deemed necessary and was preferred to formatting the text after it was entered into NVivo.

A new standalone file was created by the researcher to import all interview transcripts into the Internals folder and grouped under a sub-folder named Interviews. As the interviews contain the same questions and are consistently structured in paragraph styles, auto-coding was employed to organise and to create a node for each question and organise data into nodes. As described earlier, in order to group the responses of each participant on the same questions, data was first auto-coded. Then, as detailed above, open coding was used to identify themes for the phenomenon under investigation. After that, using axial coding, common themes
were grouped and categorised into categories. Last, the *selective coding* was used to identify the relationships between the themes and categories identified from the interviews and the research literature. The themes were then visualised into a conceptual model. It is noted that NVivo is useful for organising and interpreting empirical data in a systematic manner that provides a clear structure of categories, themes, and related quotations. The use of NVivo also increased the consistency and clarity of coding, thereby reinforcing validity and reliability (Charmaz, 2006).

### 4.8. Validity and Reliability

Qualitative researchers are more concerned about issues of the richness, texture, and feeling of empirical data because their inductive approach emphasises the development of insights and generalisations from the assembled empirical data (Neuman, 2006). According to Bryman and Bell (2011, p. 395), validity refers to whether “you are observing, identifying, or measuring what you say you are”. Creswell (2013a) emphasised that validity, meaningfulness, and insights from the qualitative research result from the richness of the information gathered from the selected informants and the analytical capabilities of the researcher. Reliability, also known as trustworthiness, pertains to whether interview responses are consistent. It is also treated as a measure of generalisability, or the extent to which results can be replicated in similar settings, with similar people or samples.

Jennings (2010) argued that validity and reliability are crucial in qualitative research. She pointed out the importance of having rigorous processes for the collection and interpretation of empirical material and emphasised that research is worthless, becomes fiction, and loses its utility without rigour (Morse, Barrett, Mayan, Olson, & Spiers, 2002). Multiple measures were taken to ensure validity and reliability of the processes used in the field including analysis processes, and the researcher’s experiences and cultural immersion (Neuman, 2006) as previously described in the section on research strategies in Section 4.5. The plausibility of the information was cross-checked and the empirical data were verified using multiple sources of information. In particular three criteria recommended by Glaser (1978) for assessing the rigour in grounded theory studies were employed to ensure: (a) fit and relevance, referring to the assurance of the identified themes and categories related to the data.
and derived from the constant comparison and conceptualisation of the data; (b) workability, referring to the integration of the themes and categories into core categories that emerge; and (c) modifiability, referring to an insurance that all the identified themes and categories that are important to the theory are incorporated through the process of constant comparison and the fact that modifiable theory can be altered when new and relevant data is compared to existing data.

For this research, a respondent validation technique was employed to ensure the trustworthiness of the information (Bryman & Bell, 2011). Return visits were made to each selected case study site and the preliminary findings were validated with local residents in November 2012. During the visits, informal meetings with the interviewed participants were undertaken to see if the findings represented their views. Changes that had occurred since June 2011 were appended accordingly. Informants were also asked to read the transcribed descriptions of the interviews and were invited to comment on the short summary of findings as a way of obtaining their reflective feedback. It is noted that most participants agreed with the preliminary findings, though one participant disagreed with a theme, namely “the limited support from local authorities” and commented that “their effort should have been appreciated and emphasised”. In response, this different view was accepted by the researcher as such a different opinion reflects the participant’s dual role as a local resident and as a staff member of a local government authority.

4.9. Ethical Considerations

In tourism research, ethics are associated with protecting the anonymity and the confidentiality of information from the variety of stakeholders who are involved in or affected by the research process and outcomes, i.e. society, government, the scientific community, the research participants, sponsors or clients, and the researcher (Neuman, 2006). Therefore, it is essential for the researcher to be aware of the consequences of not only the methods used to collect empirical material and how findings are expressed and reported to relevant stakeholders (Jennings, 2010), but also the value–neutral processes of asking questions (Ryan, 2005). As a requirement of Griffith University, the research followed the strict ethical guidelines for conducting research as stipulated by the National Health and Medical Research
Council (2007) to protect the rights of the research participants (local residents). Ethical approval was completed prior to gathering the empirical data. In this research, the ethical issues were considered at both the planning and design phases. Any ethical issues that might emerge and how these issues would need to be addressed were anticipated by the researcher during the preparation of the research proposal (Creswell, 2013b) and in the application for ethical approval. This research was granted provisional Ethical Clearance for data collection by the Griffith University Human Research Ethics Committee (GU Protocol Number HSL/03/11/HREC) on 08 February 2011 prior to the conduct of the fieldwork (See Appendix 4.1). In addition the research proposal was approved by the Dean of Research, Griffith Business School on 07 June 2011 after a successful confirmation seminar of 23 February 2011. All specific comments made by independent assessor, Dr. Georgette Leah Burns and supervisors were incorporated where appropriate.

A consent package was prepared in accordance with the Griffith University Ethics Manual Guidelines consisting of: (a) an Information Sheet, (b) a Consent Form, and (c) proposed interview prompts. As the research was conducted in Vietnam, the translation of the consent package into Vietnamese was prepared, shown, and explained to all potential participants (interviewees) who were approached prior to the interview.

The researcher was requested by the Ethics Committee to share his reflections on the possibility that some potential participants may not be literate in Vietnamese and to consider what approach would be needed to facilitate informed consent from those participants. By way of explanation, the researcher reported that most residents could communicate in Vietnamese; however, in case potential participants may not be literate in Vietnamese, the researcher would seek assistance for interpretation from the local resident(s) who are capable of translating the key information of the consent form for the participants. It is noted that all participants could communicate effectively in Vietnamese during the research process.

The Information Sheet introduced participants to the research, i.e. the purpose, title, time, procedure, contact details of researchers and ethical conduct protocols (see Appendix 4.1). The sheet provided participants with accurate information that helped
guide their decision to participate. No coercive practice was used to influence the participants’ choice. Each participant was informed that their involvement was voluntary and if they felt uncomfortable, they could refuse to answer and were free to withdraw at any time, without comment.

The Consent Form clarified that participants had read and understood the consent package. Before each interview, the participant was requested to sign the consent form and was given a duplicate copy of their signed form. The participant was informed that the interview would be recorded and transcribed after signing the consent form. However, they were also assured that all the tapes would be destroyed after transcription and only research team members could access the research materials. In protecting the participants’ identity and to ensure their anonymity and confidentiality when reporting their perceptions in the thesis, a unique code ranging from 1 to 55 was created for each participant.

In response to the question of potential risk raised by the Ethics Committee, i.e. “Could the commentary from a community have negative consequences in terms of access to government support and the scheme?” The researcher was able to clarify the situation with the following explanation: It would not have negative effects, as the research focuses on improving the effectiveness of the existing CBT at each site, and contributing to the improvement of the quality of life of local communities, and that these ideas aligned with and were supported by the local authorities. Therefore, the commentary from the communities would be positive for local government. There was no risk involved during fieldwork at the three research sites because in the personal communications with the Deputy Head of Sa Pa District People’s Committee, it was confirmed that “…district authority supports the development of CBT at selected sites.”

Furthermore, to avoid any conflict of interest, participants were informed that their participation was voluntary and there would be no direct or immediate benefits provided. However as a token of appreciation each participant was given a small torch (flashlight) valued at about A$1, though only after the interview had ended so as to avoid bias in the collected empirical data. This gesture was a way for the researcher to express gratitude to the participants for their time and participation. The
contact details for the researcher and the research supervisors were provided in case
participants had any concerns with the ethical issues or questions. No contact was
made during the research process.

In retrospect, it is apparent that the measures taken to gain the trust and cooperation
of local residents were effective. Local residents, not surprisingly, were initially
hesitant in the presence of the “stranger-researcher” but more relaxed after a couple
of minutes. They were all hospitable and open to sharing their stories, including the
internal conflicts within the community, once they knew the purpose of the research.
In addition, there was no communication barrier because all the adult villagers speak
Vietnamese very well.

4.10. Summary

This chapter has described the appropriateness of the interpretive social science
theoretical paradigm and outlined the combined qualitative approach of grounded
theory and case studies used to address the research purpose and to answer the
research questions. The process of data collection and interpretation using a
document review, semi-structured interviews, participant observations, note taking,
and computer-based NVivo has been illustrated respectively. The validity and
reliability of the empirical data, and ethical considerations have been discussed in the
last sections. The case studies are described in greater detail in Chapter 5.
CHAPTER 5

CASE STUDY CONTEXT

Grow up to follow your father ploughing
And your brother hunting in the forest.
Grow up to follow your mother embroidering
And your sister batiking a new skirt.

Hmong song

5.1. Introduction

This chapter rationalises the selection of Sa Pa as a case study region along with its three CBT micro-case studies, namely Tan Van, Ban Ho and Ta Phin. The overview of Sa Pa development and tourism is introduced in the first section (5.2), and provides the context for the further exploration of the semi-periphery/periphery interface area where the case studies locate (Section 5.3). For each case study, the environmental, socio-economic, and cultural features of tourism and CBT development are described.

5.2. Sa Pa as a case study region

5.2.1. Overview of Sa Pa.

Sa Pa is located along the mountainous interface between the periphery and a semi-peripheral corridor in Lao Cai province, 380 km north-west of Ha Noi, the capital of Viet Nam (see Figure 5.1). The region is attractive for its climate, natural scenery, and a rich cultural heritage of ethnic minorities. The town serves as a gateway for Ha Noi and is accessible from there by overnight train or bus. To reach Sa Pa travelers can either take an overnight train or bus from Ha Noi to Lao Cai, and then a 45 minute bus ride of 38 km from Lao Cai railway station to Sa Pa town. It is convenient to have train and bus tickets purchased from any hotel or travel agent in Ha Noi.
Figure 5.1. Map of Sa Pa in Viet Nam and three CBT case study sites.

Topographically, at a height of 1,600m above sea level, Sa Pa is protected by the Hoang Lien Mountains that are the terminus of the Himalayan range and include the highest mountain in Indochina (Fansipan). The link to the Himalayas adds a complex layer of biodiversity to the Hoang Lien range. Steven Swan of Flora & Fauna International (FFI) in Ha Noi indicated:

You find the end of tropical flora and fauna, subtropical elements, and superimposed on that, the last trickle of Himalayan elements not found anywhere else in Indochina….and that seventy percent of the total plant species found in Viet Nam grow in the Hoang Lien range (Steven Swan).
Situated amongst the mountains, Sa Pa is cool, moderate, rainy in summer (May-September), and foggy and cold with occasional snowflakes in winter (November-February). The average temperature of the area is 15-18°C. Sa Pa has many scenic sites (Figure 5.2) such as Ham Rong Mountain, Silver Waterfall, rice terraces, Ta Phin Cave and particularly Hoang Lien National Park.

Figure 5.2. Sa Pa natural attractions.

Covering nearly 30,000 hectares, the park is home to over 2,000 species of plants, nine of which are found only in Viet Nam’s Hoang Lien Mountains (Figure 5.3). These include the endangered *Taiwania cryptomerioides* conifer, one of 28 conifer species found in Viet Nam. Resembling a Christmas tree, this rare conifer is found only in Taiwan, on the China-Myanmar border, and around the border of Lao Cai and Yen Bai provinces in Viet Nam. “These trees are like rhinos and tigers, left over from a bygone era”, says Mr. Swan, who estimates that only 100 of these beautiful trees remain in the wild in Hoang Lien. The most famous conifer is the *Fokienia*
*hodginsii* or *pomu* in Vietnamese, and currently listed as *near threatened* by IUCN. The *pomu* is coveted for making houses and furniture. Its fine-grained, pale wood is rich in aromatic oils that have a pleasant odour and preserve the wood.

![Image of *hodginsii* and *pomu*](image)

**Figure 5.3. Fauna and Flora at Hoang Lien National Park.**

The park’s fauna is equally rich with 16 animals listed as critically endangered in the World Conservation Union (IUCN) Red Book. To date, researchers have discovered 347 bird species, 199 butterfly species, 73 kinds of reptile, and 50 amphibian species. For example, out of a total global population of a few hundred Western Black Crested Gibbons, over 100 of these highly endangered species call the park home. The area is also a rendezvous point for climbers who wish to conquer the roof of the Indochina Peninsula, the Fansipan — Indochina’s highest mountain at 3,143m above sea level. Therefore, many of the tourists visiting Sa Pa also visit the park. In 2012, the park received 17,500 visitors including 2,108 climbers, of which 50% were international tourists (Hoang Lien National Park, 2013).
Administratively, Sa Pa consists of a town and 17 communes with the total area of 683.29 km² (Central Population and Housing Census Steering Committee, 2010). Each commune has several villages. Sa Pa region is home to 53,549 people from seven ethnic minority groups, of which only 17% (8,975) reside in Sa Pa town (the semi-periphery) while the remaining 83% (44,574) reside in mountainous or forested areas (periphery). Besides the Kinh ethnic people (17.9%), there are five main ethnic minority groups in Sa Pa, i.e. Hmong (51.65%), Dao (23.04%), Tay (4.74%), Giay (1.36%) Xa Pho (1.06%), and a small number of Chinese and other ethnic minorities (0.23%) (ibid).

It is thought that the first people to settle the foothills of Fansipan were the Dao. Through interviews with elderly Dao residents around Sa Pa in the late 1990s, French researcher Michaud (2001) deduced that the Dao had been in the area for nine generations, or since about 1820. Likewise, local Hmong lore contends that the Black Hmong arrived from China six generations ago, during the same period as the Dao. The oral tradition of both groups claims that drought and famine necessitated their move to Viet Nam’s Hoang Lien Mountains. The Kinh ethnic group moved to Sa Pa during the French colonial time (1890 -1954).

Most ethnic tribes reside in the surrounding villages in the peripheral areas where they wear traditional costumes and live a simple lifestyle and therefore are attractive to tourists. Most tourists leave Sa Pa with embroidered fabric or clothing bought from local Dao and Hmong women. The handmade clothing forms an important part of the cultural identities of these groups. The Hmong see their clothes as a link to their ancestors. One Hmong saying holds that: Only with hemp clothes will the spirits of the ancestors recognise their descendants. All Hmong women grow and process hemp that is planted in March and harvested in July. Whenever they have a free moment, Hmong women and girls wind hemp fibres around their fingers to form long strands. The hemp fibres are woven into cloth on hand-made wooden looms. Every year a woman will stitch a set of clothes for each member of her family: “I have a loom beside my house,” …“I weave, dye and embroider for my family but not enough to sell”. Mrs. Sung Thi Xi, 50 year old, of Sin Chai village.
Though today the Chinese export many colourful threads and fabrics to Sa Pa region, hemp is still used for the *shao khua*, the outer vest that is rubbed with beeswax to give it an iridescent shine and is considered to be the most important article of a man’s or a woman’s outfit. The collar, decorated with embroidery, stands upright to frame the wearer’s face. Women also wear *shao ti*, a long-sleeved, belted jacket underneath their shao khua. The sleeves are decorated with embroidery.

While Hmong women around Sa Pa weave their shao khua vests from hemp fibres, Dao women sew all of their family’s clothes from cotton bought in Sa Pa’s market: “It is compulsory for Hmong people to weave their own vests but Dao people never made the cloth”, says Mrs. Ly May Chan, 58. While all Hmong and Dao women are expert seamstresses, Mrs. Chan is more of an authority than most; she is the head of the Ta Phin Handicraft Association, a group with some 200 Hmong and Dao members. She explained that while the items made for sale are different than those kept for personal use, the production process is the same and that traditional Dao embroidery motifs often include pine trees, peach blossoms, tiger, bear and monkey paws, horses, birds, and the Thunder Spirit. Other ethnic groups such as Giay and Tay also have their own distinctively beautiful costumes (Figure 5.4).

![Figure 5.4. Ethnic people in traditional costume, Sa Pa region.](image-url)
Among other attractions is Sa Pa’s colourful market that predates the arrival of the French. Lao Cai province was an important commercial centre well before the establishment of a French military post in the 1890s. It is noted that Sa Pa’s market probably appeared some two centuries ago, soon after the arrival of Dao and Hmong settlers. In his 2001 book, *French Sa Pa: A Short History*, French researcher Jean Michaud explained the significance of the market to local people:

...For the Dao and the Hmong, the market is indeed a place of economic exchanges, but it is equally an important place for socialisation. Isolated life in hamlets, generally made up of relatives belonging to the same clan, forces the periodic holding of large social events allowing young boys and girls to meet eventual partners for amorous encounters, whether they are brief or for life... (Michaud, 2001, p. 47)
The market was first described in a pamphlet of Chapa’s Tourist Bureau to lure French tourists to Sa Pa in 1924. Soon after establishing a presence in Sa Pa in 1912, the French built a European-style marketplace consisting of a long row of open-fronted stalls set behind an area for open-air vendors. Horses were “parked” nearby. Today, while a few ponies graze in the park near the Post Office, most people reach the market by motorcycle. The old French marketplace, meanwhile, was demolished in 1995 to make way for the existing structures. In colonial times the market was held every six days. In the mid-1950s it was rescheduled for every Sunday so as to coincide with the day off for office workers. Nowadays, it is busiest on the weekends but runs daily (Figure 5.5).

While Sa Pa’s market appears festive, some residents and researchers complain that it has lost much of its cultural significance. A Sa Pa Kinh native composer of ethnic minority music, Mr. Le Trong Hung is overseeing a campaign to educate tourists about local minority cultures:

I want tourists to know about their clothes, songs, and the market that was a meeting place for the minority groups such as the Hmong, Dao, Tay, and Giay… People from the mountains went not only to buy and sell but also for fun, to meet old friends, and to window-shop, and the young people went to find a boyfriend or girlfriend, to show off their clothes and to admire each other. Therefore, people called it the love market. Hung added. (Hung, 65 year old, former director of Sa Pa Culture Centre and director of the Support Sustainable Tourism in Sa Pa District Project)

Mr. Hung emphasised that such misconceptions about the nature of Sa Pa’s Sunday market dates back to the mid-80s, when some journalists saw a group of Dao people performing traditional luu ba songs and got the wrong idea: “It is dark and they see people singing and dancing and assume it is something illicit and the rumour spreads,” Mr. Hung says. In fact, it is the “singing market” that is used to attract tourists not the “love market” curiosities. According to Mr. Hung, the Dao had a tradition of singing in the market. In the past, since people from outlying villages regularly travelled 45km by foot or on horseback to reach the market, they often spent the night in Sa Pa town, so as to be at the market when it opened at dawn. The Hmong always slept in someone’s house and the Dao people slept together in the market because they liked to sing together. Until the mid-1980s, Dao people would
gather in Sa Pa’s marketplace on Saturday nights to wait for the market to open at
dawn. There, they would light a fire and pass the time by singing. While love is a
popular topic, Dao songs also recount past glories or wonder about the future: Some
people met at the market and got married, says Mr. Hung. But others just became
friends for life (personal communication, 2012).

However, the market that was so popular in the late 1950s vanished by the early
1980s due to the war and conflict. Mr. Hung explained:

After the war in 1979 the economy went down. There was not much to sell so
less people went …and that The French, American, and Chinese wars caused
Sa Pa to mostly empty and people to lose some of their culture. Good singers
had to join the army. And people lacked time and money to keep their culture
(Hung).

In addition, because of this excessive attention as the “love market”, the minorities
have become shy, and the market seems to have lost part of its important social
function.

Economically, the Sa Pa economy is mainly dependent on subsistence farming. The
ethnic minority people of Sa Pa practised migratory, shifting cultivation for centuries
before immigrating to Viet Nam. Their traditional agricultural methods were to slash
and burn an area of forest to create fields in which dry rice or maize could be grown.
After several years of agriculture, the soil could no longer support crops, and the
village would migrate to a new site, abandoning their old fields and allowing the
forest to regenerate. Recently, the government has prohibited shifting cultivation and
has undertaken a program of sedentarisation. Agriculture is central to the economy of
almost every ethnic minority household in Sa Pa, but its productivity is limited by a
highly seasonal climate, a steep terrain, and high erosion. Only one crop of paddy
rice is grown each year, compared with two or even three crops in lowland regions of
Viet Nam. This practice is mostly due to a lack of water. Between October and April,
the paddy fields are dry and overgrown with weeds. On the lower mountain slopes,
maize, dry rice and cassava are grown. These crops are often cultivated on a rotation
system, so that fields in cultivation are interspaced with fallow areas of regenerating
scrub vegetation. As food production is often insufficient to provide for the
increasing population, and yields are diminishing due to reduced land capability and shortage of water, the local authorities have encouraged the cultivation of high-value cardamom and the development of tourism.

5.2.2. Sa Pa and development.

Sa Pa’s development has experienced substantial changes over a century since military and religious concerns drew the first French settlers to the area referred to as Chapa. Such development has undergone three stages: the French colonial time (1890 – 1954), the fleeing time (1954 – 1990), and the tourism era (1990 – present).

In the 1890s, French colonialists founded a military outpost on the site followed by the establishment of a military sanatorium and a Catholic mission. From a dependency perspective, this marks the incorporation of the region into the French colonial empire, and hence its “peripheralisation”. Modernisation theorists, however, would regard this as the first step in the integration of this pre-existing periphery into a modern space-economy. In 1912, the first hotel (Hotel de la Residence Provinciale) was established. While much of the town’s colonial architecture was destroyed in warfare against the French and the Chinese, some legacies of Sa Pa’s colonial past remain. Visitors can find some traces of French architecture, the French-built stone church, coffee, and crispy baguettes (Figure 5.6). The French regime also brought Kinh (lowland Vietnamese) settlers i.e. troops, government officials, labourers, and artisans, many of whom outstayed their colonial bosses and raised families in Sa Pa.

In May 1923, the construction of the train track between Ha Noi and Lao Cai was completed and regular night trains with carriages and soft beds operated and “took just six hours”. This indicates further integration of the periphery into the French-controlled colonial space-economy, with Sa Pa fulfilling various bridgehead-type functions. At the same time, the 38 km road from Lao Cai to Sa Pa became passable for cars that replaced the all-day journey on horseback. Consequently, Sa Pa developed into a popular summer resort for French colonialists and Vietnamese officials.
Figure 5.6. The influence of colonialism on Sa Pa.

In 1940, Chinese refugees displaced by World War Two arrived in Sa Pa. It was estimated that some 4,000 refugees were expected, while Sa Pa’s normal population at the time was just 1,200 people, or 2,000 in the summer. A bigger change came in the mid-1940s as Viet Nam struggled to end colonial rule. After declaring independence from France in 1945, the Viet Minh (League for the Independence of Viet Nam) went to war against the French. Almost 200 colonial buildings in or around Sa Pa were destroyed, either by the Viet Minh’s campaign to destroy French buildings like the army headquarters and hotels in the late 1940s, or by French air raids in the early 1950s. As a result, the vast majority of the Kinh population fled the
area. The war ended with the Geneva treaty signed in 1954 that rendered Sa Pa as part of North Viet Nam.

In the earlier period (1954 -1978) of the “fleeing time” stage, Sa Pa was peaceful despite the American/Viet Nam War (1956-1975). In the early 1960s, new inhabitants from the lowlands started to migrate to the region under the migration scheme to New Economic Zones including Sa Pa. However, the major upheaval occurred with the Chinese invasion in 1979. The Chinese troops occupied the town and destroyed almost every structure spared during the French conflict. Sa Pa’s Kinh residents fled again and the town entered a prolonged dormancy, while the local ethnic minority people remained in their villages. The border dispute between China and Viet Nam finally ended in 1990, creating favourable conditions for Sa Pa’s rebirth. The tourism era marked a turning point in 1993, the year foreign tourists “rediscovered” Sa Pa (Figure 5.7).
5.2.3. **Sa Pa development and tourism.**

Sa Pa was a tourist destination during the French colonial period but was destroyed and ignored because of the French war (1940 – 1954), the war with the USA (1956 - 1975), and the border conflict with China (1979-1990). The region was only revitalised in the early 1990s and has since experienced rapid tourism development. After the normalisation of relations between Viet Nam and China in late 1991, Sa Pa opened to international tourists and became a popular tourist destination. Tourism development has provided alternative sources of income for local people. Consequently, local residents have sold off their gardens to hotel developers, either using the money to buy land further from the town’s centre or to build multiple-storey houses or guesthouses on their smaller plots. The development of the physical infrastructure of Sa Pa town has been significant. Sa Pa’s main streets are lined with solid rows of souvenir shops, traveller cafes, and an increasing number of hotels and guest houses with newly resurfaced streets, spacious sidewalks, iron lampposts, and planted pine trees (DiGregorio, Pham, & Minako, 1996; Michaud & Turner, 2006). The influx of new workers was less visible but equally dramatic.

![Graph](image-url)

*Figure 5.8. Tourists Visiting Sa Pa (2000-2013)*
Since 1993, increasing numbers of visitors have been arriving into the area each year to enjoy Sa Pa’s beautiful scenery, pleasant climate and the diversity in the culture and customs of the ethnic minority groups (Villemain, Nguyen, Hainsworth, & Nguyen, 2004). Visitor arrivals to Sa Pa town have grown at an exponential rate (Figure 5.8). In the period from 1992 to 2013, the number of visitor arrivals has significantly increased from 17,000 to 721,991, approximately 80.5 times more than the population of Sa Pa town (8,975), and 13 times more than the total population of Sa Pa region (53,549 residents). In 2013, Sa Pa received 608,980 Vietnamese (84%) and 113,011 foreigners (15%) generating a total revenue of VND576 billion (or A$31 millions). It was expected that Sa Pa would receive 820,000 visitors with the estimated revenue of VND633 billion in 2014 (Sa Pa District People Committee, 2013c).

Tourism growth has created a demand for labour that local residents cannot meet, resulting in massive in-migration. Mr. Trung, for instance, runs the Auberge hotel with the help of four family members and 50 out-of-town staff. He claimed that Sa Pa’s population has grown from 3,000 when he arrived in 1963 (personal communication) to 53,549 now. In 2010, the Sa Pa region had 145 accommodations (one 4-star hotel, three 3- star hotels and 27 hotels of 1-2 stars and 1 resort) (Table 5.1). Altogether, there was a total number of 2,300 rooms and 4,600 beds and also 90 households operating homestay services (Sa Pa District People Committee, 2011). There were also 23 registered travel enterprises consisting of 15 inbound operators and 8 domestic operators with a total of 290 tourist guides. In addition there were 44 restaurants, 16 of which were restaurants of 480 seats located in hotels, 28 independent restaurants of 1,120 seats; and 75 transportation vehicles from 4 seats to 45 seats capable of transporting 1,200 people (ibid). Between 2003 and 2012, the number of accommodation places increased from 95 (1,028 rooms) to 151 (2,451 rooms); the direct labour force increased 4.6-fold from 532 to 2,447, and tourism revenue increased 36.7 times, contributing 57% to Sa Pa GDP (Sa Pa District People Committee, 2013b). Additionally, there was a two-fold increase in the average length of stay and in tourist expenditure (2003 -2012).
Table 5.1. Tourism development in Sa Pa (2003 -2012).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Tourism revenue * (VND billion)</td>
<td></td>
<td>57</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>325</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Contribution to GDP %</td>
<td></td>
<td>40</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Revenue from entrance fee (part of tourism revenue)</td>
<td>VND million</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>499</td>
<td>547</td>
<td>1,087</td>
<td>1,715</td>
<td>1,960</td>
<td>1,972</td>
<td>2,720</td>
<td>7,000</td>
<td>7,038</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Number of visitor arrivals (Visit)</td>
<td></td>
<td>120,578</td>
<td>170,000</td>
<td>200,024</td>
<td>259,079</td>
<td>305,907</td>
<td>282,716</td>
<td>405,000</td>
<td>450,268</td>
<td>520,818</td>
<td>610,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Domestic</td>
<td>Visit</td>
<td>87,450</td>
<td>130,000</td>
<td>136,700</td>
<td>193,724</td>
<td>206,868</td>
<td>182,000</td>
<td>295,000</td>
<td>319,665</td>
<td>370,908</td>
<td>485,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- International</td>
<td>Visit</td>
<td>33,128</td>
<td>40,000</td>
<td>63,324</td>
<td>65,355</td>
<td>99,039</td>
<td>100,716</td>
<td>110,000</td>
<td>130,603</td>
<td>150,810</td>
<td>125,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Average length of stay (Day)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Tourist expenditure (VND 1,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td>200</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>305</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Number of accommodation (Unit)</td>
<td></td>
<td>95</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Resort (part of 1-5 stars) Unit</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 1-5 stars</td>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- below 1 star</td>
<td>Unit</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Total of rooms (Room)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,028</td>
<td>1,356</td>
<td>1,934</td>
<td>1,957</td>
<td>2,012</td>
<td>2,065</td>
<td>2,128</td>
<td>2,300</td>
<td>2,415</td>
<td>2,451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Homestay (Unit)</td>
<td></td>
<td>58</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Direct labour (Person)</td>
<td></td>
<td>532</td>
<td>645</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>1,200</td>
<td>1,420</td>
<td>1,600</td>
<td>1,700</td>
<td>1,850</td>
<td>2,128</td>
<td>2,447</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Sa Pa District People Committee (2013b)
* Note: A$1 = VND18.500

The Sa Pa tourism market survey conducted by SNV (2011) pointed out that the main international markets for Sa Pa were Western Europe (i.e. Germany, France), North America (the US and Canada) and Australia, in particular, the young graduates or middle aged people, and the elderly, retired people. While the former preferred traveling independently without advanced reservation, the latter booked tour packages, especially those from North America or Australia, with a group size of 2-5 people per group. Both types of tour groups stayed one week to one month in Viet
Nam and spent less than US$50 a day. The domestic visitors of 30 years or above with high levels of education travelled from either Ha Noi (37%) or Ho Chi Minh city (18%). 56% of all visitors travelled with their friends, colleagues or families.

Travellers also use the town of Sa Pa as a gateway for accessing the nearby CBT villages that provide accommodation and exposure to ethnic minority cultures during a one- or two-day trek. Most international travellers (excluding Chinese visitors who only visit Sa Pa for a day’s travel) stay two to three days in higher category hotels in Sa Pa town, then hire a tour guide based in Sa Pa to have a one- or two-day trek and, finally, experience the daily life of the local ethnic groups by staying overnight at the villages or taking part in voluntary community development work, such as renovating a commune school or clinic, or teaching foreign languages and planting trees. Domestic travellers preferred staying at guest houses or hotels in town rather than in homestays, and to visit easily accessible attractions during the day, including walking around Sa Pa town.

5.2.3.1. CBT in Sa Pa.

There are increasing concerns from INGOs about the rapid change associated with tourism and the potential consequences for tourism and ethnic minority communities in Sa Pa. Therefore, in order to ensure that the tourism development is sustainable and beneficial to local communities rather than only to tourism enterprises or the relatively developed semi-peripheral town of Sa Pa, SNV together with IUCN launched a three-year project (2001-2003) entitled Support Sustainable Tourism in Sa Pa. Under this project, the CBT concept and its attached products of responsible trekking routes and homestays in minority communes were first introduced to the hinterland of Sa Pa (SNV, 2007a). Over time, CBT is becoming more popular. Table 5.2 shows the increasing visitor arrivals at CBT sites in Sa Pa in the period from 2010-2012. In 2012, the number of tourists visiting villages accounted for 37% out of the total number of Sa Pa visitors, in which day visitors numbered 206,650 (34%) and stayover tourists numbered 20,936 (3%).
Day visitors dominated all sites (91%) and have increased annually by 26% in 2011 and 11% in 2012 while the number of stayovers increased by 51% in 2011 but saw a decline of 13% in 2012 (Sa Pa District People Committee, 2013a). As a consequence, the supply of homestay accommodation increased. In the review of the economic development of Sa Pa tourism (2006-2010), the Lao Cai Provincial People Committee (2011) acknowledged CBT in six sites with 99 households providing homestay services i.e. Ta Phin (5), Lao Chai (1), Ta Van (48), Ban Ho (31), Thanh Phu (7), Sin Chai (3) and Nam Sai (4), and three CBT routes in operation, namely Route 1: Sa Pa – Lao Chai – Ta Van – Ban Ho – Thanh Phu – Sa Pa, Route 2: Sa Pa – Sin Chai – Sa Pa, and Route 3: Sa Pa – Ta Phin – Sa Pa. The acceleration of tourism has resulted in an increasing number of Hmong women working as trekking/tourist guides (S. Turner, 2011). The number of tour guides from ethnic minorities has increased from 48/132 to 121/210 tourist guides (Sa Pa District People Committee, 2006, 2013a).

Tourism appears to have benefited materially the local economy of the ethnic minority people. Income-generating activities in the area have diversified. Ethnic minority people now sell hand-produced goods and non-locally introduced products (e.g. soft drinks, beer) to tourists. The most widespread activity is the sale of traditional clothing by older Hmong and Dao women. Other introduced activities include employment on the increasing number of construction sites, acting as tour guides, providing homestay accommodation in villages, and performing traditional
songs and dances. Additionally, the livelihoods of some ethnic minority families have improved because of tourism. Families benefit from cross-cultural understanding; improved infrastructure such as roads; cheaper market goods; tourist dollars supporting handicraft industries, and employment opportunities for locals as guides and hospitality workers; and the extension of agricultural activities.

The Sa Pa value chain survey of SNV (2007b) recorded 1,153 ethnic minority households (5,765 people) each directly receiving about A$60 per month from their involvement in tourism activities. With the support of INGOs, the capacity of villagers was improved and CBT facilities were put in place. SNV, for instance, provided technical assistance to establish a CBT Management Board and operation mechanisms as well as training workshops in housekeeping service, cookery skills, tour guiding skills etc. while PATA funded a project that was managed by Ha Noi Open University and Capilano University (Canada) and focused on English conversation, product development, destination management and marketing in connection with local tour operators. With regard to the CBT facility, BftW financed the establishment of four CBT communal houses in Ban Ho, Ta Phin, Ta Van, and Sin Chai in 2008. IPADE/SNV funded the construction of a market place in Ta Phin in 2010. However, the rapidly developing Sa Pa mass tourism industry is causing undesirable impacts.

5.2.3.2. Tourism development and undesirable issues.

The growth of tourism has undoubtedly improved the standard of living for some Sa Pa residents, but has also led to substantial debate over its contribution to the ethnic tribes and environment. Nicholson’s (1997) study revealed that Sa Pa tourism brought little benefit to ethnic minority people due to the commercialisation of products such as embroidered dresses and indigo dyed-cotton decorated with intricately embroidered-panels. As a result, tourism created even more of a burden on minority women as they spent more time producing hand-made embroideries and clothes, while tourists wanted cheap mass-products on the market. Cultural values attached to embroidery were lost and the artistic quality of the craft deteriorated as market demand generated incentives for cheap souvenirs. Also, it has been noted that the quality of the hand-produced textiles is falling, possibly because tourists are more
interested in novelty than authenticity. In a study about the attitudes perceived by international and domestic tourists and the ethnic Kinh’s business towards tourism, T. M. H. Pham and Lam (1999) identified negative social impacts including street sellers, street children, commercialisation, and the disappearance of cultural activities as well as negative impacts on the environment, namely pollution (litter, water supply and waste) and visual damage from uncontrolled construction.

Though substantial tourist activities took place in peripheral areas and relied heavily on the attractions of the local villages of ethnic tribes, tourism profits were not equally shared with the villagers as most of the tourism profits went to tour operators in Sa Pa town (D. H. C. Nguyen & Oostveen, 2005). Socially, tourism development has transformed Sa Pa town into a place that even backpackers perceive in the following ways:

noisy, unsightly, and ultimately an infringement on nature and where modernity shocked them, the urban sprawl drove them away, and karaoke excesses and rampant prostitution were judged as sickening (Michaud & Turner, 2006, p. 799).

In the peripheral villages, the cultural identities of ethic tribes are being eroded and social problems such as child labour and prostitution were emerging (Vu & Makoto, 2010). Economically, the construction of hotels and homes in Sa Pa town and villages to accommodate mass tourism and new migrants, who were mostly Kinh people, inflated land prices. Consequently, the ethnic residents were driven out by the high cost of living, rising demand for municipal services, and higher taxes. It was evident that there were almost no tourist activities and facilities in natural areas excepting on the Fansipan route. Some natural trekking trails were left unattended and degraded, or destroyed completely (SNV, 2011).

Sturman and Le (2013) argue that the once idyllic mountain retreat of Sa Pa with its rural village character is severely under threat. Several trainloads with thousands of visitors arriving from Ha Noi are funnelled into the resort town every day. In order to accommodate the continuous stream of tourists, former village houses are increasingly displaced with high-rise hotel structures (up to 10 stories) in a largely
chaotic scramble for the best views of the mountain scenery. The waste system is operating over capacity. More importantly, the traditional lifestyle of ethnic minorities living in the area has become oriented towards hawking, and the commercialisation of traditional culture is evident. In addition, a series of hydro-power installations in the Sa Pa valley have severely harmed the mountain scenery and frustrated hiking tourists and homestay owners alike. The destination appears to have already passed its peak in the destination lifecycle and is at risk of future decline (ibid., p.26).

In short, tourism is playing a significant role in the development of Sa Pa district. Tourism benefits and undesirable issues are disseminated from the Sa Pa (semi-periphery) town to remote villages (periphery). Such dissemination indicates that, while there are agricultural and other primary sector links, the relationship is increasingly based on tourism, with Sa Pa serving as a gateway and service centre.

5.3. The CBT Micro-Case Studies

The Sa Pa region was selected as a regional focus because of its well-defined periphery/semi-periphery interface and its inclusion of CBT within a rapidly growing regional tourism sector. Three nearby communes - Ban Ho, Ta Van, and Ta Phin - were in turn selected as case studies for purposes of data collection. Here, in contrast with the modern and developed town of Sa Pa, where ethnic Kinh dominate the services-oriented economy, numerically dominant ethnic minority peoples such as Dao, Tay, Giay and Hmong are becoming increasingly engaged with tourism as a supplement to traditional livelihoods focused around farming, forestry and handicrafts. These three adjacent villages in the transitional zone between periphery and semi-periphery were selected because in each village there is: (a) a formal CBT management board in place but (b) a different dominant ethnic minority group, (c) a different distance from Sa Pa town, (d) a different population size, and (e) a different apparent stage of the destination life cycle (Figure 5.9). The description of each case study presented below broadly follows this sequence of destination development stages.
5.3.1. Ta Van.

Ta Van commune, with a total land area of 6,804 ha, is located in Muong Hoa valley, approximately 8 km south-east of Sa Pa town. The commune is accessible to cars and motorbikes, either by asphalted road along Muong Hoa stream or by walking trail via Lao Chai village from Sa Pa town. The commune is also the hub of the transportation network connecting the town to the southern communes of Sa Pa district, such as Ban Ho, Thanh Phu, Nam Cang, and Nam Sai. With an altitude of 1.200 – 1.500m, its annual temperature is 15-16°C. Ta Van is home to four ethnic groups: Hmong, Dao, Giay and Kinh. There are 689 households and 3,791 people (37.3% living below the poverty line), in which the Hmong group accounts for 65%, mainly residing in three remote villages (Den Thang, Xeo Mi Ti and Ta Van Hmong) while the Giay (25%) and the Kinh (2.4%) reside in Ta Van Giay village, and the Dao (4.6%) in Giang Ta Chai Dao village (Ta Van Commune People Committee, 2013).
Ta Van Giay village (hereafter called Ta Van) is by far the settlement most visited by tourists and was the site for data collection in this study. There are in total 38,000 members of the Giay minority living scattered across the Northern provinces of Lao Cai, Lai Chau, Ha Giang and Cao Bang. Originating in China, they arrived in Vietnam about 200 years ago. In the Sa Pa region, the Giay community of 947 residents is concentrated only in Ta Van. The Giay have been quick to grasp the tourist demands, learning together how to improve their houses, cooking skills, and English proficiency. The majority of houses in Ta Van are sturdy and spacious, with a bathroom and separate toilet to serve the increasing number of tourist arrivals (personal communication and personal observation).

The Ta Van area is one of the most popular tourist destinations with beautiful natural landscapes and attractions (Figure 5.10), including the ancient rock ground, waterfalls, the Muong Hoa stream, and impressive terraced fields that were voted as one of the seven most attractive terraced fields in the world by the readers of Travel and Leisure Magazine (Hoang, 2009). The village is also conveniently accessible and well connected to other attractive villages such as Su Pan, Hau Thao, Ban Ho, Lao Chai, and Cat Cat. Apart from beautiful scenery, Ta Van attracts tourists with its peaceful lifestyle, skilfully carved silver products, local customs, Giay ethnic food, and traditional stilt houses and land houses.

Figure 5.10. Ta Van natural attractions.

The Giay’s traditional land or stilt houses are made of wood and consist of three compartments: The middle is for the ancestor altar and the reception place, the right
for bedrooms, the left for kitchen space, and the second floor (once used for food storage) is the place for overnight tourist visits. On the top middle of the entrance door panels a red cloth is often hung, affixed to a piece of yellow paper with Chinese characters to dispel evil spirits. In addition to growing rice, the Giay produce agricultural tools, silver carvings and weaving. The skilful hands of women make brocade products, or beautiful jewellery carved with many exquisite and sophisticated textures. To further diversify the tourism activities, Ta Van village founded a cultural performance troupe to perform traditional dances and typical melodies such as bamboo bar dancing and love singing (Figure 5.11).

![Image](image1.jpg) ![Image](image2.jpg)

**Figure 5.11. Tourists with Ta Van cultural attractions.**

Most visitors regard Ta Van as an idyllic, rustic, and beautiful village, and the Giay as friendly, peaceful, and hospitable. They not only enjoy the village for its poetic landscapes, but like to explore the unique cultural identity of the ethnic Giay, and also to try some special local dishes, e.g. grilled fish, horse meat, roasted pork, and iridescent sticky rice. Most visitors indicated their high satisfaction about service quality, security, and the hospitable attitude of homestay owners, but the unclean
environment and unattended trails were of concern. Tour operators shared the same concerns (personal communication, 2013).

Because of its proximity to Sa Pa town, Ta Van is receiving an increasing number of visitors, reaching 136,800 in 2012, of which 88% are day-only visitors. Though the number of stayover visitors increased from 6,000 in 2007 to 16,200 in 2012, this number accounted for only 11.8% of the total number of visitors to Ta Van. Moreover, the average length of stay is only 1.1 nights. Most visitors are from Europe, and especially France, Germany, Spain and England. As the number of tourists continues to increase, the village may be ostensibly considered to be in the development stage of the Butler cycle.

As a result of the increasing tourist arrivals, the number of households registered as homestay service providers has grown substantially from only 3-4 households in 2001 to 28 in 2004, and 45 in 2013, accounting for 45% of the total homestay accommodation in Sa Pa region. The CBT management board started operation in 2008, when it registered 10,306 stayovers. The homestay revenue was more than VND500 million (AU$27,000) in 2008/2009. A community development fund was established with five staff who were supported with a monthly allowance of VND500,000 (AU$27) each. However, by 2011 the CBT management board was no longer in operation due to the poor capacity of new staff and the discontent of most homestay owners with the CBT management board (personal communication, 2011).

5.3.2. Ban Ho

Ban Ho commune (hereafter called Ban Ho), 24 km south-east of Sa Pa town, is located in a vast and flat valley circled by mountains and hills and accessible via uneven road or on foot. With an average altitude of 435 m above sea level, the mean temperature is warmer than Sa Pa town and between 18-25°C. The total area of 11,531 ha consists of 3% agricultural land, 83% forestry (9.570 ha), and 14% of rocks, mountains and streams (Figure 5.12). Out of 310 ha of agriculture land, 150 ha is used to produce rice and 155 ha for corn. In 2013 the area produced 688 tons of rice and 457 tons of corn. With regard to livestock, the commune has 672 buffalos, 68 cows, 1,653 pigs and 6,102 poultry (Ban Ho Commune People Committee, 2013).
Ban Ho has 510 households with 2,709 residents from four ethnic groups, namely Tay, Nung, Hmong, and Kinh, of which the Tay is the majority group. The Tay people of Sa Pa arrived in Viet Nam more than a century ago. They immigrated from present day Thailand, and share much of their culture with their Thai cousins. Therefore, the architectural arts of the Tay are easily distinguished from other ethnic minorities living in Sa Pa. Traditionally, Tay build their houses on stilts. The roofs of their houses are either two or four-sided and covered with thatch or palm leaves. The Tay people possess sophisticated rice farming techniques and live a sedentary lifestyle. Their villages are often very large with one hundred households or more.

Ban Ho’s economy is mainly based on agriculture. Before 1990, the agricultural production of Ban Ho was monocultural. People had difficult lives; the illiteracy rate was above 80% and there was a high rate of drug addiction and gambling. Poverty rates registered higher than 60%. The physical landscape creates difficulties for access and transportation; the cultivated land has shrunk particularly in agricultural production; inconsistent infrastructure is inconsistent; and difficult transportation has created unfavourable conditions for Ban Ho development. However, the economy
began improving with the introduction of tourism to Sa Pa in 1993. In 2010, the income per capita reached nine million per year and the poverty rate was 15.26% (65 households).

![Image](image1.png)

**Figure 5.13. Cultural attractions in Ban Ho.**

With regard to tourism development, Ban Ho received the first group of visitors in 1993, and became a popular tourist destination in 2009 when the construction of the hydro power station Su Pan 2 began. The development of CBT is attributable to the natural beauty of the Muong Hoa stream, a local water fall, and hot water streams as well as brocade products, traditional cultural performances, and the hospitable Tay people. With technical assistance from the IUCN/SNV (2008), the households upgraded their houses on stilts with essential convenient facilities to serve tourists. In addition, traditional weaving, *then* singing, and *tinh* traditional musical instruments have been restored to educate tourists about the Tay’s lifestyle and customs (Figure 5.13). Consequently, local lives have been improved, contributing to development and the alleviation of poverty.

Over 10,000 day visitors and 5,461 stayover tourists visited Ban Ho in 2008. However, this number declined 50% to 5,000 day visitors and 2,991 stayover in 2009.
due to environmental damage caused by the construction of two local hydro power stations (Figure 5.14). This construction induced the decline stage in the development of the area as the balance between economic development and tourism was not maintained. The situation has improved gradually since 2010 with the completion of one hydro power station (Su Pan 2). However, the construction of two more hydro-power stations, namely Nam Toong and Seo Chung Ho, is causing noise and mass wastage that continues to negatively affect households and tourists. Landslides have stopped stream flow, causing water to flood the fields of farmers and damage the crops. It was estimated for Su Pan II that approximately 30,000 m³ of soil and rock were poured down the banks for the dam and that 8,000 m³ went into the stream bed, filling the entire stream length of 200 m and affecting the waterfall (Ta, 2010).

Despite positive indicators that visitors are returning, observation shows that most are day-only excursionists, with over 17,000 of the latter visiting in 2012. Between the period of 2010 -2013, the number of day visitors increased from 6,541 (2010) to
10,231 (2011) and 17,200 (2012) while the stayover visitors remained stable with a slight flux from 2,530 (2010), to 3,380 (2011) and down again to 2,418 (2012). To date, there are 29 traditional wooden houses-on-stilts belonging to the Tay minority that offer tourists homestay services, soft drinks, and food. The local CBT management board started its operation in 2008. In the first year of its operation 2008/2009, the board registered about 5,000 stayover visitors, generating VND350 million in revenue. This revenue was used to pay an allowance of VND500,000 per person for five working staff, and to establish a community development fund (Sa Pa District People Committee, 2013a).

5.3.3. Ta Phin.

Ta Phin commune, 12 km north-east of Sa Pa town, is home to Red Dao and Hmong people. Sa Pa town is well connected with Ta Phin by an asphalted but bumpy road. The total land area is 2,178 ha, of which agricultural land accounts for 312.2 ha (14.4%) i.e. 178.2 ha for rice, 132 ha for corn, 9 ha for artichokes as medical herbs; and 55 ha of forestry land for cardamom (Ta Phin Commune People Committee, 2013). The main economy of Ta Phin is agriculture. In 2003, Ta Phin produced 766 tons of rice, 580 tons of corn, and 44 tons of cardamom. Livestock had 9,120 units, namely 494 buffalo, 133 cows, 1,500 pigs, 237 goats and 5,988 poultry (ibid). The commune has 566 households with 2,992 people (41.3% living below the poverty line), consisting of 1,604 Hmong (321 households), 1,269 Dao (201 households), 4 Day (1 household) and the remainder Kinh.

Ta Phin is not only known for its unspoiled natural beauty and a cave with attractive stalactites, but also for its French monastery ruins, hand-made brocade products, and particularly, for the traditional and unique cultural identity of the Red Dao people (Figure 5.15 and 5.16). The Dao are easily recognised by their distinctive traditional clothing that is still worn by almost all Dao women and by a large number of Dao men. The name “Red Dao” (hereafter called Dao) refers to the particular tribe of Dao who reside in Sa Pa, and derives from the bright red head-dresses characteristic of the female costume. The Dao travelled to Viet Nam from the southern provinces of China. Therefore, the roots of their architecture trace back to their Chinese origin. Dao houses follow a set exterior design and internal arrangement that observes the
rules of Chinese geomancy (Feng Shui). The houses contain a family altar positioned against a partition that runs the length of the living room. Like Chinese dwellings, Dao houses do not have chimneys - smoke escapes through small apertures in the ceiling.

![Image](image1.png)

![Image](image2.png)

**Figure 5.15. Ta Phin natural attractions.**

Dao artistic ability is most expressive in their clothing and handicrafts. Dao dress is the union of a variety of traditional decorative methods and techniques. These include the following: embroidery with coloured threads appliqué of different layers of coloured strips of cloth with the addition of coloured strands, red streamers and pompons; permanent silver accessories such as buttons, bells and clasps; and silver costume jewellery. The embroidered Dao symbols represent human beings, animals, birds, religious subjects, silver flowers, plants and trees, and various everyday subjects. The Dao are also silversmiths and create a rich array of silver ornaments with ornate filigree. Besides their decorative value, silver represents the economic standard of a family. Traditionally, silver was easily bought and sold and was acceptable tender in the places where the Dao migrated.
Sustainable tourism development was initially introduced to Ta Phin by the Support to Sustainable Tourism project of the IUCN/SNV. The project helped raise awareness about the impact of increasing tourist visitation to the Sa Pa region. The initiative was continued with a CBT-focused project implemented jointly by Hanoi Open University (Viet Nam), and Capilano College and North Island College (Canada) with financial support from CIDA (Canadian International Development Agency) for the period from 2005 to 2008, and with additional funding from the PATA Foundation for the period from 2010 to 2014. Ta Phin commune is the focus site of the project, in which local women and youth are helped to build their capacity in English conversation, product development and marketing, and site management as a way to assist rural and remote communities to reduce poverty, improve their quality of life, and help provide sustainable, authentic, cultural and nature-based experiences for visitors to their communities. Benefits are expected to be shared among several groups and individuals including residents of the villages, local government and private sector operators.
Ta Phin is becoming one of the main tourist attractions of the Sa Pa region. Between 2010 and 2012, the number of visitors increased from 36,856 (2010) to 39,317 (2011) and 47,800 (2012), in which the stayovers increased from 236 (2000) to 533 (2011) and 854 (2012). Five homestays offer accommodation and food services. Visitation trends suggest that the commune is situated in the development stage of the destination life cycle. The CBT management board has been established since 2010. The tourism revenue resulting from homestay was VND140 million (AU$75,686) in 2010/2011 and is used to support five staff. In addition to a community development fund, the Board set up an embroidery club and display centre to showcase and sell local products to visitors for extra income.

However, mass tourism has indirectly encouraged alternative materials to be used in the manufacturing of cloth items. Chemical dyes, usually not used in clothes that are worn by the ethnic minorities domestically, are used to color clothes sold to tourists. Aluminium jewelry, made in China to simulate traditional Dao silver pieces, are being imported for similar purposes. More seriously, many street vendors follow and “aggressively” force visitors to purchase their products for high prices (personal observation).

In short, it is apparent that the selected case studies combine elements of peripherality and modernity, in which the former is indicated especially by poor accessibility, ethnic minority dominance, the continued wearing of traditional costumes, high poverty rates, and resource exploitation (e.g. hydropower stations) to benefit the semi-periphery.

5.4. Summary

This chapter has described the main features of Sa Pa as a case study region and the three CBT micro case studies. The growth of Sa Pa town and the surrounding area has accelerated since 1993. Subsequently, Sa Pa town has played a critical role as the semi-peripheral hub at the terminus of a transportation corridor that disseminates tourism to other villages in the transitional zone between the town (semi-periphery) and communes and villages (peripheral areas). This development represents the modernisation process where more hotels, restaurants, and shops are being built and
more migrants arrive. It is acknowledged that CBT contributes toward the
development of villages where the income sourced from agriculture is gradually
replaced by income from the provision of tourism-related services i.e.
accommodation, beverage consumption, transportation, souvenirs etc. However, the
rapid development of tourism in both Sa Pa town and the villages in the transitional
zones is creating unexpected impacts, namely cultural modification and
commercialisation, street children and vendors, inflation, construction of hydro
power stations, pollution, and uncontrolled construction. Having described the
regional and local context of Sa Pa, the findings with regard to the “development”
defined by the local community at each of the CBT sites and the role of CBT as
perceived by those communities, in achieving development will now be presented.
CHAPTER 6
PERCEPTIONS OF DEVELOPMENT AND THE FACILITATING ROLE OF CBT

6.1. Introduction

This chapter presents the results from the semi-structured interviews of 55 participants living in the three Sa Pa region case study communities of Ta Van, Ban Ho and Ta Phin with regard to their perceptions of development [Objective 1], and the role of community - based tourism in its facilitation [Objective 2]. First, the profile of interviewees is presented to provide a context for the findings. Then in Section 6.2 the perceptions that emerged in response to the Research Question 1a: In your own personal opinion what is ‘development’? are examined. Emergent themes are first described and illustrated with relevant quotes from each site (Sections 6.2.1 – 6.2.3). Subsequently, these emergent themes are compared to identify similarities and differences among the communities [Research Question 1b] (Section 6.2.4). The findings from the Research Question 2a: How CBT contributes to the defined ‘development’ through the lens of local residents are investigated in Section 6.3. Emergent themes are categorised into positive and negative categories for each community, and again illustrated with relevant quotes (Sections 6.3.1 to 6.3.3). Finally, the themes are compared to identify the commonalities and differences among communities [Research Question 2b].

Profile of Interviewees

Of the 55 local residents interviewed, 29 were male (53%) and 26 female (47%). Twenty-two people are based in Ta Van, 16 in Ban Ho, 17 in Ta Phin (Figure 6.1). The average age of male and female interviewees was 36 and 42 years respectively. Men were a majority in the interview because they are often the heads of the families. They have more interaction with visitors and are the focal points of contact with tour operators and hotels in Sa Pa town and Ha Noi. With regard to ethnicity, 17 are Giay, 15 are Tay, 15 are Red Dao, six are Kinh, and two are Hmong (see Appendix 6.1).
6.2. Perceptions of Development

The perceptions of local residents at each case study are organised in three main categories resulting from axial coding, namely economic, socio-cultural and environmental. Each category consists of themes (derived from open coding) and is illustrated with supporting quotations. The inter-relationships among categories and themes are illustrated with a diagram. The size of the circles on the diagram (economic, socio-cultural and environmental) indicates the frequency of references indicated by residents to the relevant categories and themes. The bold font equates to the most frequently mentioned themes, and the italics illustrate the least frequently mentioned themes as shown in Figures 6.2, 6.3 and 6.4.

6.2.1. Ta Van.

For the majority of the 22 residents who were interviewed, the concept of development was synonymous with “income growth”. This was expressed variably as “high income”, “better income”, “good income”, “sufficient income” or “economic growth”:

![Graph showing summary of interviewees' profile](image-url)
Development is higher income. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)

Often, this high income came immediately to mind, but was then qualified by linkages to a better standard of living or quality of life:

Development is high income and better living. (Informant 3, male, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

For many residents who responded, development simultaneously entailed specific socio-cultural enhancements such as “wellbeing”, “accessible education for children”, and “better housing”:

As for me, development means better wellbeing, higher income, and children have access to good education in the town [Sa Pa]. (Informant 2, male, Giay, 63, homestay owner)

My children have more educational opportunity to develop themselves and be educated. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)

In addition, some participants considered development involved more opportunities to converse and interact with tourists, that is, to engage in a “cultural exchange” regardless of the language barrier:

I think development is equal to more conversation and connection with others [tourists], good income, and a joyful and happy life. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)

Development is when visitors come and stay over…more income and people to talk. I like listening to their talks during dinner…. I can say some greetings only [but] I understand their gestures [laughing]. My wife is better. Visitors like chitchatting with her to learn about our lifestyle and customs. (Informant 9, male, Giay, 35, labourer)
A small number of those interviewed looked at development mainly from the environmental perspective. These participants perceived development as “protected forests” and “maintained greenery”. This perception stemmed both from local values as well as the tourists’ perceived appreciation of greenery and unspoiled scenery:

Development means to me that the forest is protected and the environment is well maintained. (Informant 8, male, Giay, 52, homestay owner)

Development is the evergreen rice fields and forests that attract tourists to come.
(Informant 12, female, Giay, 45, villager)

The connection between development and environment was further expanded and linked with the awareness of the necessity to work with government and to have better housing and hygiene to accommodate the needs of tourists:

Development is achieved when people and the local authority work together to develop the economy. The forest is protected; pasture and plants are green, as those attract tourists, and houses are hygienically clean. (Informant 1, male, Hmong, 56, commune leader/Head of CBT management board)

Figure 6.2. Development perceived by community members in Ta Van.
In summary, there are three inter-related aspects to the way development was perceived by the Ta Van community. The interconnections are illustrated in Figure 6.2. It is apparent that most perceived development mainly from an economic perspective represented by income growth, but also from a socio-cultural perspective variably comprising well-being, education, connectivity, and better housing, and a tangential environmental aspect consisting of the maintenance of green areas. Preservation of traditional culture, however, was not cited by the sampled Ta Van villagers as part of development.

With regard to theme interconnections, two-thirds of the residents linked the economic theme with the socio-cultural theme, while half connected it with the environmental theme. Only two residents cited the economic aspect alone. The association between the economic and socio-cultural themes was positive, with more income growth from the increase in the number of tourists generating more connectivity, communication, and cultural exchange between tourists and residents. Only one individual cited all three aspects.

6.2.2. Ban Ho.

The most striking pattern to emerge from the interviews with the 16 residents of Ban Ho was discovered in the responses about “environmental” issues, followed by “economic” and “socio-cultural”. The majority of participants expressed the view that development was equal to “environmental recovery” consisting of “reforestation”, “crystal waterfalls”, “clean stream”, “hot spring water” and a peaceful environment “without explosions and landslides”:

Development is green, clean and a beautiful environment where villagers and tourists can enjoy the sound of a waterfall, running stream, singing birds and the fragrance of rice fields. (Informant 25, female, Tay, 72, villager)

For me, development is simply having enough food and living in a tranquil environment. I often went to waterfall for swimming and catching fish. I used to be proud of our landscape but not now: noisy, dusty and no longer green scenery. (Informant 27, male, Tay, 65, villager)
Others linked the environment theme with traditional culture:

Development is the recovery of a clean and green environment, and good maintenance of traditional customs and life style. (Informant 26, male, Tay, 39, Deputy head of CBT Board)

Like Ta Van, the idea of development is also substantially linked to “income growth” generated from the sale of local products and services, in particular, roasted suckling pig, ducks, cultural performances, and agricultural working tools, to mostly domestic day visitors and some international tourists [who stay at least one night in Ban Ho]:

Development is income. I see this year as less developed than last year; I harvested three tonnes of rice but this year only two tonnes. Luckily, it is sufficient as my children had sideline jobs. (Informant 24, male, Tay, 48, homestay owner)

Some participants expressed the belief that development also had a socio-cultural dimension consisting of “better education”, “community solidarity” and “cultural performance” in association with the embroidery and weaving demonstrations carried out within an intermingled economic context:

Development means more income and better education. (Informant 30, male, Tay, 59, restaurant and homestay owner)

….development is when villagers live in harmony and help each other like....a strong sense of solidarity [community] …. (Informant 29, female, Tay, 49, homestay owner)

Development comes with an open market where we can perform frequent cultural shows and demonstrate embroidery and weaving skills. (Informant 28, female, Tay, 26, dancer)

The relationship between the three aspects of development in Ban Ho is illustrated in Figure 6.3. It is apparent that most residents perceived development mainly from an environmental perspective that was interpreted as environmental recovery, but also from an economic perspective represented by the increase in income, and a socio-cultural dimension consisting of cultural performances and craft skills
demonstrations. Only one Ban Ho resident equated development with environmental factors alone and one resident placed it just with economic growth.

![Diagram of Development Perceived by Community Members in Ban Ho](image)

**Figure 6.3. Development perceived by community members in Ban Ho.**

It is noted from the findings and personal observations that there was a strong tendency in Ban Ho to associate development with all three themes: environmental, economic and socio-cultural. However, the majority of residents who were interviewed felt that the environment was especially important. As in Ta Van, there was positive association between economic and socio-cultural aspects, with more income associated with more cultural performances.

### 6.2.3. Ta Phin.

The economic aspect, represented by “income growth”, was the theme most frequently solicited from 17 residents of Ta Phin, followed by “cultural enrichment” and “environmental hygiene”. As in Ta Van, economics came first when residents were asked what development meant to them:
For me, development is higher productivity and more income. (Informant 41, female, Dao, 27, seller)

Development is having more income to buy fertiliser and pesticide and sufficient food to live. (Informant 49, male, Dao, 30, villager)

Approximately half of those interviewed commented that “cultural enrichment”, comprising ‘interaction with tourists’ and ‘development of traditional craft skills’, was an important aspect of development:

Development happens when there is more appropriate interaction with tourists and traditional craft skills are developed to produce more diverse products. (Informant 51, female, Dao, 36, villager)

Several residents indicated that “hygiene” was an important aspect of development, with dimensions of ‘cleanliness’, ‘tidiness’ and ‘odourless’ being important for houses that were being used as homestays to accommodate tourists:

Development is having a clean, tidy and odour-free house to serve tourists (Informant 48, female, Dao, 42, villager)

The interdependence of the three aspects of development perceived by residents in Ta Phin is summarised in Figure 6.4. Most interviewees perceived development mainly from an economic aspect represented by income growth, but also from a socio-cultural perspective comprising interaction with tourists and the development of traditional craft skills, and from an environmental aspect with the focus on hygiene. Like Ta Van and Ban Ho, there were positive associations between the economic, socio-cultural and environmental themes as more income was equated with improvements in hygiene and the enhancement of traditional skills. Of 17 residents who were interviewed, just over half indicated more than one aspect of development. Only one individual recognised all three aspects, whilst two residents cited only the socio-cultural aspect.
6.2.4. Synthesis 1 - Development as perceived by the communities.

A comparison of findings at the three case studies revealed some similarities (see Table 6.1). First, the majority of residents perceived development as a complex and multi-dimensional construct. Constituent components were (a) economic, (b) socio-cultural, and (c) environmental, of which almost two-thirds of residents affiliated development with two or more of these aspects. Second, income growth was the main dimension of development for both Ta Van and Ta Phin. Thirdly, interaction or connectivity with tourists was an important part of the socio-cultural aspect at both villages.

There are, however, differences among the villages. Environmentally, Ta Van and Ban Ho residents tended to link development with the outdoor environment (scenery and landscapes) while in Ta Phin the indoor environment was represented by hygiene and was considered more important.
Table 6.1. Perception of development at the three case study communities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Themes regarding the perception of development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tan Van</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>• Income growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-cultural</td>
<td>• Wellbeing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Connectivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Better housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td>• Maintained green area</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: The font style indicates the frequency of reference by local residents. The bold font equates to the most frequency, and the italic illustrates the least frequency.*

6.3. **Role of CBT in Facilitating Development**

Community-based tourism has played an increasingly important role toward achieving the development desired when participants were asked: *How does CBT contribute to your defined ‘development’ for your village.* There are both positive and negative aspects according to the villagers sampled. The patterns emerging from open coding were grouped into three main categories using axial coding, i.e. economic, socio-cultural and environmental. The open-coded themes and supporting quotations in each case study are presented in Sections 6.3.1 – 6.3.3. The inter-relationship among categories and themes are illustrated with a diagram. The size of the oval illustrates the frequency of these themes mentioned by residents. The bold font equates to the most frequently mentioned themes, and the italic illustrates the least frequently mentioned themes as shown in Figures 6.5, 6.6 and 6.7.

6.3.1. **Ta Van.**

6.3.1.1. **Positive role of CBT.**

Several villagers equated development with tourist arrivals, although this was immediately qualified by noting the development-related benefits that are perceived to result from the latter:
Development is more tourists, higher income and a more civilised society [community]. (Informant 14, female, Giay, 31, villager)

It was noted that CBT made significant positive changes toward the community and involved the residents:

Tourist arrivals positively contributed to the development of our community. It generated extra income and employment for my family. In the past, we had one homestay, now we have three homestays. My children operate homestay and motorbike services. Not only is there extra income but my family is also happy as we could afford for our son to study at a university in Ha Noi capital city, to renovate our toilet, and to purchase new furniture. (Informant 2, male, Giay, 63, homestay owner)

Economically, CBT generated “better income” for both direct and indirect service providers and the community more generally. Multiplier effects occurred as a portion of this income was reinvested into renovating houses and facilities, whilst contributions were also made to a community fund ensuring that benefits were equitably shared among the members of the community:

The introduction of CBT increased my family’s income 2.5 times. Homestay service prices increased from VND15,000 to VND40,000 per night. I used to contribute 15% of my homestay revenue for community fund. (Informant 16, female, Giay, 35, homestay owner)

Such “better income” encouraged local residents to invest in tourism:

As residents saw that CBT brought about two to three times higher profit than agriculture, there were more households providing homestay services. From only 4 households, to date, there are 42 households registered for provision of food and beverage, and homestay services. (Informant 1, male, Hmong, 56, commune leader)

CBT also created “more jobs”:

I was happy when more tourists were visiting our village as I have more jobs and could earn my good living from servicing tourists’ transportation between Sa Pa and Ta Van. (Informant 22, male, Giay, 41, driver)
There were also references to a gradual shift from the agriculture-based economy into a tourism-based economy:

In comparison with 2010, more tourists returned to stay at my home since the beginning of this year. I saw many households resuming their investment in homestay. Some households even hired workers to do agriculture work so that they could have time to serve tourists. (Informant 18, female, Giay, 30, shop, owner)

Further interrogation revealed socio-cultural enhancement and connectivity associated with tourist arrivals. In terms of wellbeing, to accommodate tourists who often require an appropriate levels of comfort, i.e. safety, hospitality and hygiene, local residents invested to improve the quality of products and services. Homestay owners built separate toilets and bathrooms with hot water and amenities, bought utensils for cooking, imported beer and soft drinks, and provided soft mattresses. The investment benefited not only tourists as consumers but also the homestay owners themselves. Moreover, the revenue generated from homestay servicing and product selling made education accessible for children eager to follow on to the higher secondary school education offered in Sa Pa town:

Part of tourism income was used to pay tuition fee for my two children to study in Sa Pa town and the remaining was for reinvestment in housing, utensils and home appliances to better serve tourists. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)

Approximately one-half of those interviewed stated that they learned and knew more about other countries through interactions with tourists. It was either in the form of a gift, a postcard, or even only a greeting in a foreign language:

I think tourism opens my eyes. I always feel happy when receiving a new postcard. Though I do not understand what is written on the back of the card, by looking I could guess where it comes from and sometimes I ask a tourist guide to help me. You could see my drawer is full of postcards from all over the world. They are tourists who stayed with my family and treated me as a friend. (Informant 19, male, Giay, 46, homestay owner)
Local residents who admitted the fact that there were language barriers felt happy using body language to communicate, though sometimes tourist guides could assist as translators:

I cannot speak foreign languages ….but I understand what tourists want through their gesture. Also, tourist guides help me understand tourists. (Informant 12, male, Giay, 45, homestay owner)

CBT also plays a significant role environmentally. Tourism has made the village road cleaner, has improved the public areas and trekking paths, and it has especially stimulated advocacy for environmental protection in response to tourists’ demands for a better environment

I saw a big change since tourists arrived, with villagers paying more attention to the cleanliness of the village road and public areas. Households operating homestay services were aware of keeping their houses tidier, surroundings cleaner, and no littering. (Informant 3, male, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

6.3.1.2. Negative role of CBT.

Some economically and socio-culturally negative impacts of CBT on the Ta Van community were also recognised. A majority of respondents felt that CBT created a situation of “price competition” among the households providing homestay services. To attract more tourists, some households offered low prices for tour operators and incentives for tourist guides. Such “unfair competition” resulted in “conflict” and frustration among community members:

I felt treated unfairly as there were some homestays which charged low prices and offered souvenirs and incentives for tourist guides. (Informant 8, male, Giay, 52, homestay owner)

Another emergent theme was “non-transparent fund management”. The contribution of 15% of the accommodation price for each tourist-night created a substantial community development fund. However, some believed that this fund was not being used appropriately. Two-thirds of the homestay owners who were interviewed
expressed their concern about “non-transparent transparency in usage and management of the community fund”. There was “no financial report” of where the money was spent and “how decisions were made”. Eventually, some owners decided not to contribute any more:

I asked myself why I had to contribute to the community fund while I did not know where my money was to be spent. Personally, I felt disrespected [cheated]. I raised questions about transparent financial reports but it seemed that the CBT board ignored it. (Informant 13, male, Giay, 48, homestay owner)

I no longer had trust in the CBT management board because of the fact that there was no transparent management and usage of community fund. (Informant 10, male, Giay, 34, homestay owner)

Another pattern that emerged was “inflation”. Though there was an increase in the price of food and beverage, only a few residents commented on this:

It was true that tourism brought in the inflation however I did not think it was serious as most of food and beverage for tourists were transported from Sa Pa. (Informant 7, male, Giay, 35, labourer)

As a consequence of tourism development outside investors saw business opportunities and invested in land privately owned by local residents, resulting in “increases in land prices” and causing pressure on local residents who could not afford to buy land for their children:

Buying land here, I do not think we could afford it. Land price was speculated. Agricultural land was used to build homestays, shops and restaurants. (Informant 7, female, Giay, 59, labourer)

Along with “land speculation”, approximately one-half of those interviewed indicated that there was an increasing trend for more non-residents to invest in homestay businesses and restaurants in Ta Van. These investors either rented or bought a house to do so. As they had better relations with tour operators, good
financing, and service skills, most tourists used the services of these non-residents. Such competition affected the on-going business of local residents:

My partner and I are not originally from here and used to work in Sa Pa town. We saw good opportunities in Ta Van as there were many tourists. Therefore, we rented this house (VND2.5 million a month) to do homestay services, selling food, beverage and souvenir. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)

Another emerging theme was “community conflict”, wherein some residents expressed the belief that the solidarity of the community was threatened by CBT:

When more households are involved in homestay business, there was severe competition. As a result, neighbours saw one another as competitors not relatives any more, especially at low season. Our community solidarity was being broken as money drove people away. (Informant 5, female, Giay, 43, homestay owner)

Figure 6.5. Role of CBT in Ta Van.
The results obtained from the preliminary analysis of the perceived positive and negative roles that CBT plays in achieving development in Ta Van are summarised in brief, in Figure 6.5. It is apparent that the overall response to the role of CBT as a development facilitator in Ta Van is positive. Though there are negative impacts from CBT including economic (i.e. price competition, non-transparent fund management, land speculation and inflation) and socio-cultural (i.e. non-resident competitor, conflict), most commented that CBT positively contributes to achieving development through better income, tourism-related jobs, social connectivity to tourists and demand for a better environment.

6.3.2. Ban Ho.

6.3.2.1. Positive role of CBT.

Like the responses from the residents in Ta Van, the majority of interviewees in Ban Ho indicated that CBT played an important positive role in achieving development. Economically, CBT was strongly associated with “better income” and “extra jobs” for local residents. This increased income and additional jobs were mainly from domestic day-visitors who spend mainly on food (mainly lunch), hot spring visits, and souvenir purchases:

CBT brought about more income as more tourists arrived I could sell more pigs, chickens and ducks. At high season, a couple of years ago, my restaurant consumed at least 20 kg of chicken daily. (Informant 36, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

Tourism revenue was also linked to socio-cultural aspects such as displays of local culture, with over half of the residents commenting that CBT helped strengthen “community solidarity”:

I joined a cultural performance group. We only performed in the evening when tourists required it. It was a good source of extra pocket money and full of fun. I am proud to introduce tourists to our traditional dance and songs. (Informant 35, female, Tay, 27, villager)
Our village is like a family. We live and help each other to serve tourists better. We are willing to share our tourists with others when one homestay received more than a group. (Informant 26, male, Tay, 39, Deputy head of CBT management board)

Additionally, craft skills were restored. Most of the homestay owners were aware of tourist demand and had a loom in their home to demonstrate weaving skills to tourists:

I knew how to weave and embroider when I was a child but like other women, I rarely used a loom. It was time-consuming and old style. However, now every homestay has a loom and women practise whenever there were tourists who are interested in seeing how to thread yarn in a loom and weave it into a scarf. (Informant 32, female, Tay, 24, villager)

In response to the role of CBT with regard to environment, the overall response was very positive. There was a strong association between CBT and the “demand for better environment”.

Owing to CBT, not only was the cleanliness of village improved but also tourist attractions and its surroundings, i.e. waterfall, trekking routes, rattan bridge, village road. (Informant 34, female, Tay, 38, primary school teacher)

6.3.2.2. Negative role of CBT.

In contrast to the economic benefits, some residents felt that CBT increased prices:

When Ban Ho became a hot tourist attraction, prices increased like a crazy horse; I felt pickpocketed when going shopping. If I could buy one kilogram of meat with only 40,000 dong three years ago now it was only enough for 200 grams. (Informant 31, male, Tay, 46, homestay owner)

Further analysis revealed that the village was very “dependent on tourism”. All resources were used to invest in the development of tourism-related products and services. As a result, when there was a drastic decline in tourist arrivals because of the deteriorating landscape and scenery caused by the construction of the hydropower station, most residents were affected:
My family borrowed money from a bank to invest in a big homestay and restaurants but there were mostly no tourists recently due to environmental pollution, we were really in a difficult situation and did not know how to pay off the loan. (Informant 36, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

Such investment was associated with “over development” where the supply of homestay and restaurants was much higher than demand.

There are too many homestays and not enough tourists. Tourism is still hurting a year after the new start of Nam Tong hydropower station. My homestay has not received any tourists since the end of last year, a complete 99 percent fall in the number of visitor arriving as compared with a year earlier. (Informant 24, male, Tay, 48, homestay owner)

With regard to socio-cultural effects, half of interviewees raised their concern about “street selling children” causing frustration for both tourists and homestay owners. One owner said in an angry voice:

I could not stand street sellers. Instead of selling, they aggressively forced tourists to buy their products at high price while tourists hardly refused because these street sellers had accompanied them a long distance of six to eight kilometres. (Informant 38, female, Tay, 35, homestay owner)

---

**Figure 6.6. Role of CBT in Ban Ho.**
The roles attributed to CBT in development in Ban Ho are illustrated in Figure 6.6. The results, as with those displayed in Ta Van data, indicate that CBT is regarded overall as a positive facilitator for development in the village. Though there are some negative economic impacts from CBT (i.e. inflation and dependence on tourism) and some socio-cultural concerns (i.e. over-development and street selling children), the majority indicated that CBT positively contributes to achieving development through better income, tourism related jobs, community solidarity, restoration of craft and demand for a better environment.

6.3.3. Ta Phin.

6.3.3.1. Positive role of CBT.

Again, the overall response to the role of CBT was positive. Almost two-thirds of interviewed Ta Phin residents said that CBT had made great economic changes to Ta Phin that were represented by “better income” and “more jobs”:

In Ta Phin, every household made embroidery. Tourists often bought at a high price that gave us better income and more jobs. (Informant 45, male, Dao, 70, villager)

My family had more jobs since we were trained to do CBT. We earned more from the sale of embroidery, traditional medical herbs, homestay service as well as food and beverages that was much higher than agriculture. (Informant 46, female, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

Not only did CBT contribute to achieving economic development, but the tourist arrivals also enhanced socio-cultural development through “development of craft”, “the construction of new markets” and “improvement of hospitality skills”:

Women in Ta Phin were very talented at embroidery. In the past, we embroidered for our own use but when tourists arrived we saw more potential. Therefore, we set up the Craft Development Centre to preserve our traditional skills and make extra income for members. (Informant 44, female, Dao, 42, homestay owner/Head of Craft Development Centre)

CBT gave me and others a lot of benefit. We all were trained in hospitality skills to serve tourists better. Those skills are housekeeping, cooking and conversational English. (Informant 47, female, Dao, 46, homestay owner)
Environmentally, most homestay owners were trained in and aware of the importance of “hygiene in homestay service”:

Ta Phin is safe, we are hospitable. Tourists like our dress [smile] but we need to improve and maintain the hygiene at homestay and surroundings. (Informant 50, male, Dao, 47, homestay owner)

6.3.3.2. Negative role of CBT.

Together with the benefits obtained from CBT, some residents mentioned the negative impacts of “inflation” (albeit not necessarily owing only to tourism) and “competition in selling products”:

I see the price of food and food stuff increasing daily but possibly not because of CBT alone! It is difficult for households that do not have farming land, gardening and husbandry. (Informant 53, male, Dao, 45, homestay owner)

However, the most significant finding associated with negative impact is “street selling”. In particular, 16 out of 17 interviewees expressed their concern about the “behaviour of street selling adults”:

I feel ashamed with the behaviour of street sellers, what is called, ‘aggressive’, ‘pushing’ and ‘insisting’ which created a bad image of Ta Phin. We are working with stakeholders to find a proper solution. (Informant 52, male, Dao, 43, head of commune)

I think tourists do not want to visit my village any more as there are too many street selling adults forcing them to purchase souvenirs. (Informant 55, female, Dao, 28, homestay)

…not many visitors … I have not sold any products … I am told by a Hmong tourist guide that tourists feel uncomfortable when visiting Ta Phin as they are ‘accompanied’ by ‘insisting’ street sellers. (Informant 54, male, Dao, 58, shop owner)

A market place was constructed to help residents promote their embroideries, but some residents indicated that the location of the market was not appropriate. Therefore, no one was using this facility:
I do not understand why market place was changed to current (new) place. It is a bit far from village centre and not always visited by tourists. Therefore, none of us are interested in selling our products there. (Informant 40, female, Dao, 33, seller)

The roles that CBT plays in Ta Phin are shown in Figure 6.7. From this information, we can see that CBT plays a significantly positive role. Two-thirds of interviewed residents commented that CBT contributes toward achieving development through better income, more tourism related jobs, development of crafts, construction of a market, improvement in hospitality skills, and hygiene in homestays though there are some negative impacts believed to stem from the involvement in CBT. These impacts are economic (e.g. inflation and competition in selling), and socio-cultural (e.g. street selling adults and the location of the market aspects).

![Figure 6.7. Role of CBT in Ta Phin.](image)

6.3.4. **Synthesis 2 - Role of CBT in facilitating development.**

The role of CBT in the communities is summarised in Table 6.2. The results obtained from the three case studies show some similarities. With regard to positive impacts, the majority of respondents perceived the economic role of CBT in generating better
income and more jobs and in increasing the demand for a better environment to be highly beneficial to their way of life. Socio-culturally, residents considered that CBT promoted the restoration and development of traditional crafts at both Ban Ho and Ta Phin. Approximately one-half of all participants cited both economic and socio-cultural aspects. In regard to the negative role played by CBT, inflation was perceived as a problem at all three villages, though other contributing factors were conceded by some villagers. Interestingly, there were no comments about negative environmental impacts from CBT.

Table 6.2. Roles of CBT at three case study communities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Themes regarding the developmental role of CBT</th>
<th>Ta Van</th>
<th>Ban Ho</th>
<th>Ta Phin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>• Better income</td>
<td>• Better income</td>
<td>• Better income</td>
<td>• Better income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• More jobs related to tourism</td>
<td>• More jobs related to tourism</td>
<td>• More jobs related to tourism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-cultural</td>
<td>• Connectivity with tourists</td>
<td>• Community solidarity</td>
<td>• Development of craft</td>
<td>• Construction of a market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Restoration of craft</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Hospitality skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td>• Demand for better environment</td>
<td>• Demand for better environment</td>
<td>• Hygiene in home stay</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>• Price competition</td>
<td>• Inflation</td>
<td>• Inflation</td>
<td>• Inflation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Non transparent fund management</td>
<td>• Dependence on tourism</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Competition in selling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Land speculation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Inflation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-cultural</td>
<td>• Non-resident competitor</td>
<td>• Over development</td>
<td>• Street selling adult</td>
<td>• Location of market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Community conflicts</td>
<td>• Street selling children</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The font style indicates the frequency of reference by local residents. The bold font equates to the most frequency, and the italic illustrates the least frequency.

There were several notable differences among the villages. From the positive perspective, the role of CBT perceived in Ban Ho village was economically more associated with the increase in domestic visitors as opposed to international tourists for Ta Van and Ta Phin. Environmentally, Ta Van and Ban Ho residents indicated the role of CBT in association with the outdoor environment (public areas, scenery,
and landscapes), while Ta Phin residents attached their perceptions to indoor environments (hygiene in homestays and the surroundings). Though street selling was perceived as having a negative outcome at both Ban Ho and Ta Phin, there was a significant difference behind the perceptions; Ta Phin residents were more concerned that both children and adults were involved in aggressive selling.

6.4. Summary

The purpose of this chapter was to examine: (a) what is development [Objective 1] and (b) the role that CBT plays in achieving that defined development [Objective 2] from the perspectives of local residents and according to each case study community and their variations. With regard to development, the most obvious finding to emerge is the perception that it is a complex and multi-dimensional construct consisting of inter-related economic, socio-cultural, and environmental dimensions, with almost two-thirds of residents sampled affiliating development with two or more of these aspects.

With regard to (b) the role of CBT in the achievement of desirable development, a significant finding is that CBT plays a complex and multi-dimensional role in facilitating the achievement of development. These were apparent in the comments clearly identifying (a) economic aspects, (b) socio-cultural aspects, and (c) environmental aspects, of which over half of respondents affiliated CBT with both economic and socio-cultural aspects. A second major finding is that the perception of development strongly associates with the introduction of tourism, and in particular with CBT in instances where income was generated from the increase in the number of tourists; well-being was enhanced through connectivity with tourists; education was made more accessible; traditional craft skills were revived; and a green environment was facilitated. Thirdly, a majority of respondents perceived the role of CBT in generating a better income and more jobs and in increasing the demand for a better environment outweighed the negative impacts. In particular, although there are negative economic impacts that are believed to be a result of involvement in CBT (i.e. price competition, non-transparent fund management, land speculation, inflation, dependence on tourism, and competition on selling) and socio-cultural concerns (i.e. non-resident competitors, community conflict, street selling), CBT positively
contributed overall to achieving development through better income, more tourism related jobs, social connectivity to tourists, the restoration and development of craft skills, and demand for a better environment. None of the residents cited any negative environmental impacts from CBT. It was also shown that the economic role of CBT perceived in Ban Ho was more associated with the increase in domestic visitors while international tourists dominated comments from residents in Ta Van and Ta Phin. Finally, street selling was of great concern to local residents in Ban Ho and Ta Phin, but not Ta Van. Attention is focused on factors that influence the CBT development [Objective 3] and on suggestions to improve the CBT in the case studies [Objective 4] in the chapter that follows.
CHAPTER 7
FACTORS INFLUENCING CBT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1. Introduction

Chapter 6 presented the results associated with the first two objectives of this thesis, that is, the perception of local residents with regard to development and the role of CBT in its facilitation. This chapter explores the following: (a) the factors that influence the success of CBT as perceived by local residents in the three case study communities [Objective 3] and (b) suggestions subsequently elicited from those residents for improving CBT within their home communities [Objective 4].

7.2. Factors Influencing CBT

First, the analysis from the responses to [Research Question 3a] “What are the key factors that influence the success of CBT at your village?” is organised into positive and negative factors for each community. Under each factor, the emergent themes are axially coded into the six main categories of “socio-cultural”, “economic”, “environmental”, “infrastructural”, “organisational and political”, and “spatial”. The underlying themes and sub-themes are illustrated with relevant quotes (Sections 7.2.1 – 7.2.3). Finally, in answer to Research Question 3b, these themes are compared for identification of similarities, differences, and interrelationships among the communities (Section 7.2.4).

7.2.1. Ta Van.

7.2.1.1. Positive factors.

Figure 7.1 shows the sub-themes, themes and categories obtained from the analysis of the information obtained from the community members of Ta Van. The bold font emphasises the themes and sub-themes most frequently cited by local residents while the italics demarcate the least frequently cited. The up-arrows on the diagram are used to represent perceived improvements while the down-arrows indicate perceived deterioration where perceptions of change over time were mentioned.
Figure 7.1. Positive factors influencing CBT as perceived by community members in Ta Van.
7.2.1.1. Socio-cultural.

The majority of residents indicated that the key factors contributing to the success of CBT at Ta Van are “socio-cultural”, comprising “traditional culture”, “hospitality and friendliness” and “clean and neat lifestyle”. The “traditional culture” theme is represented by the sub-themes of “traditional costumes”, “house architecture”, “cultural performance” and “local food and beverages”:

I think the Giay’s traditional costume and house architecture are two main reasons attracting tourists to our village. Giay women are very proud of their beautiful costumes and wear them daily. Additionally, our unique architecture of two-story design, clay terrace and many windows create cool, spacious and comfortable ambiance. (Informant 20, female, Giay, 49, homestay owner/Head of women’s union)

I do not renovate my house as most tourists tell me that they like its old architecture and advise me to preserve it. Our families have lived in this wooden house over three generations. It looked old, a bit dark but still good. My house is the oldest one in the village at nearly 80 years old. (Informant 2, male, Giay, 63, homestay owner)

Success of CBT in Ta Van is owing to the attractive features of traditional costume and architecture of the Giay people. Most tourists enjoy the cultural performance, local food and especially rice wine, so-called magic water, which is homemade and served as a compliment during dinner. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)

The diversity of ethnic groups (the Dao, Hmong, and Giay) with their respective costumes, architectures and traditional handicrafts make Ta Van village attractive. Food specialities, festivals at the beginning of the lunar year and people’s hospitality provide comfort and enjoyment to tourists. (Informant 1, male, Hmong, 56, commune leader)

Additionally, one-half of the residents said that the competitive advantage of Ta Van is its “hospitable” characteristics, and the “clean and neat” lifestyle of the Giay ethnic people:

Our Giay ethnic people are very friendly, hospitable, and hard working. We mostly live in traditional wood houses with clay floor. Women often wear traditional costumes in daily life and during work. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)
Giay ethnic culture attracts tourists because the community maintains traditional architecture; women dress in traditional costume and participate in cultural performance. The Giay people in particular are hospitable and have a clean and neat lifestyle, which is well suited to serving tourists. (Informant 3, male, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.2.1.1.2. Economic.

A small number of residents indicated that “self-investment” of ethnic Giay homestay owners and “external support”, including financial support and facilitation of non-governmental organisations, are economic factors positively influencing CBT in Ta Van:

Being hard working, diligent, and knowing how to do business, Giay people obtained bank loans to invest and develop homestay services. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)

The increase in accommodation prices and the low interest rate of bank loans has created favourable conditions for Giay residents to invest and renovate their houses into homestay to serve tourists. Most Giay people finance themselves to do business. (Informant 1, male, Hmong, 56, commune leader)

7.2.1.1.3. Environmental.

From the environmental perspective, two-thirds of residents commented that CBT was successful in part because the village has “beautiful and unspoiled scenery” consisting of complementary natural and cultural features such as forests, streams, cool temperatures, and terraces:

Beautiful landscapes, rice terraces, crystal streams, natural forests, green mountains and cool temperatures make Ta Van a typical rural area and attractive to tourists. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)

Ta Van village has primitive scenery, a nearby stream, and is close to bamboo forest, waterfalls and rice terraces. So beautiful it is like a poem, the village attracts tourists to visit all year around. Many tourists like swimming in the crystal stream and staying overnight at the village. (Informant 10, male, Kinh, 48, homestay owner)
7.2.1.1.4. Infrastructural.

Another emergent theme identified as influencing CBT in Ta Van is infrastructure. Approximately half of those interviewed indicated that “good road conditions” and “interesting walking and trekking routes” positively contributed to CBT performance:

Transportation to the village is very convenient either by a walk through Lao Chai village or on main road, or taking a car or motorbike. Each means of transportation gives you a different experience. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)

Ta Van has good infrastructure to serve tourists i.e. electricity grid, asphalted road, and a new cement bridge that enables cars and coaches to cross the stream to the gate of the village. Recently, the village has had its freshwater pipe system constructed and installed. (Informant 15, female, Kinh, 41, shop owner)

7.2.1.1.5. Organisational and political.

The emergent themes influencing CBT in Ta Van from an organisational and political perspective were the “management board” and “technical assistance”:

In Ta Van, in the early stage, the success of CBT was partly because of the CBT management board, which provided support and managed tourism activities. (Informant 3, male, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

CBT in Ta Van could not be successful without the substantial support of the CBT management board, local authorities and international organisations. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)

Apart from the support of local authorities, Ta Van received substantial support from international organisations with regard to hospitality skills training, advisory services and the development of interpretation and signage, and study tours. Such technical assistance helped local residents to undertake tourism business more professionally. (Informant 1, male, Hmong, 56, commune leader)
7.2.1.1.6. Spatial.

The “spatial factor”, consisting of “proximity” to Sa Pa and “its location on the main tourist route” significantly contributed to the success of CBT in Ta Van:

Ta Van is accessible to all tourist sites. It is located within walking distance of only 6 km from Sa Pa. Travellers could either visit the village or return within a Giay or stay overnight at the village. Additionally, Ta Van is right on the most popular trekking route, that is, Sa Pa – Lao Chai village – Ta Van village – Sa Pa. (Informant 17, male, Giay, 58, homestay owner)

The proximity from Ta Van to Sa Pa is an advantage to attract visitors. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)

Ta Van has an ideal location, which is close to Sa Pa town, surrounded by many tourist attractions i.e. sacred stones, silver waterfall, and villages of Hmong and Dao ethnic groups, and on the main tourist road to the South of the district. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)

Some residents noted that declining tourist arrivals in Ban Ho resulted in more tourists for Ta Van:

Ta Van is more fortunate than Ban Ho as the village is yet to be selected for hydropower development. Thanks to its location, Ta Van is regarded as ideal alternative for Ban Ho. (Informant 3, male, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.2.1.2. Negative factors.

Residents noted various negative factors that they considered hindered the performance of the CBT in Ta Van village (Figure 7.2).

7.2.1.2.1. Socio-cultural.

“Cultural modification” and “aggressive vendors” were major socio-cultural concerns. The majority of informants felt that increasing “cultural modification” was threatening the sustainable development of CBT. The “cultural modification” theme
is represented by the following sub-themes, namely, “fusion food and beverage”, “modified house architecture”, and “privatised culture performance”:

![Diagram showing categories, themes, and sub-themes]

**Figure 7.2.** Negative factors influencing CBT as perceived by community members in Ta Van.
Tourists are told that their meals are traditionally prepared [authentic] but in fact it is fusion food, if not saying, Kinh’s recipe. Either homestay owners or tourist guide cook mostly the same recipe everyday based on the ingredients provided by tour companies. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/head of village)

You can see that the old typical Giay’s house architecture is disappearing and being replaced by a modified style. All new houses have too high ceilings and are more spacious. Even a house-on-stilts of another ethnic group (Muong) was brought in and reassembled as a homestay right in the middle of the village. I believe that if you ask, tourists are confused and cannot identify which one is a traditional Giay’s house. (Informant 2, male, Giay, 63, homestay owner)

Ta Van had a communal cultural performance team, which was privatised and belongs to a private enterprise. The advantage is that performers have monthly-secured payment regardless of the number of shows they perform but the disadvantage is that the community depends on a private enterprise (now) although all performers have been trained by the community. Additionally, what is called Giay’s traditional performance is being modified to be tourist-oriented entertainment shows. Tourists can request any song or dance and performers will try to meet their demand. (Informant 20, female, Giay, 49, homestay owner, Head of women’s union)

In addition to cultural modification, the villagers believed that aggressive “street selling children” were hindering the progress of the CBT:

Street children’s selling is a substantial problem for Ta Van. Tourists are often accompanied by a group of children selling souvenirs. At first, tourists enjoy this as they have someone to talk with and a free tourist guide. Finally they admit that it is a problem as most children quit school, follow tourists, and invite with insistence [price is higher than shop]. Sometimes, vendors quarrel [dispute] in front of tourists because tourists are buying from one but not others. In Ta Van, it is Hmong children only [not Giay’s children]. These vendors are ready to call their customers [tourists] bad names, if they refuse to purchase from them. (Informant 1, male, Hmong, 56, commune leader)

Street selling children create bad images about the village. Tourists staying at my house often complain to me that they feel guilty of not buying from street selling children but then are frustrated when they realise if they do buy that the products are of high price and low quality. I feel sad as most of these children earn their livings at the age that they should study and play at school. They might have no better future than ours. (Informant 3, male, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)
7.2.1.2.2. **Economic.**

Economically, “price competition”, “land speculation”, “inflation” and “leakage” were emergent themes hindering CBT performance:

From our record, many homestays do not register their stay-over visitors [they do not contribute 15%]. It is claimed that these homestays also offer tour operators and hotels a lower price of homestay service. Such low prices are making competition worse and leading to internal conflict among homestays, loss of community fund and poor quality of service. (Informant 1, male, Hmong, 56, commune leader)

There are more non-residents renting houses to run homestay business in Ta Van. These people even invest in property business, pushing land prices higher. Most villagers do not support such rental business [competitors] and investment. Some homestay owners even oppose it. As a result, this has caused conflicts in the village and consequently the loss of community solidarity. (Informant 2, male, Giay, 63, homestay owner)

Inflation was considered as having a negative impact on villagers as well as on tourists:

The recent increases of food and foodstuff price have negative impacts on CBT, for example, the price of 1kg file pork meat increases from VND20,000 (2008) to 5 times higher at VND100,000 (2011). (Informant 21, female, Giay, 54, villager)

Some villagers cited the “leakage” effect:

I am sad that tourists do not use any locally made food and beverages. All raw materials except rice, such as meat, vegetables, flour, potato, fruit ... are prepared and packaged by hotels and tour operators. Soft drinks and beer are imported as well. (Informant 14, male, Giay, 31, villager)

There is no traditional handicraft locally made by Giay’s ethnic people. All souvenirs are imported from other villages and China. I wonder if any tourists can recall their memories of where they have visited or mistaken our village with Hmong or Dao ones. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)
7.2.1.2.3.  *Environmental.*

A small number of those interviewed expressed their concerns about a “degraded environment”:

The environment of Ta Van is degrading. The village has no waste treatment and drainage system. Walking around, you can see plastic bags discarded [by children] in creek, in bushes and on village roads causing bad image, water pollution and favourable conditions for the development of flies and mosquitos. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.2.1.2.4.  *Infrastructural.*

Several informants indicated that “an unattended walking and trekking road” is a common “Infrastructural” problem:

Since the CBT management board is inactive, walking and trekking roads are unattended. When it rains, trekking routes are like a swamp and very slippery; when it is sunny, the roads are dusty whenever a motorbike passes through. You could see the rubbish, nylon, cattle waste on roads all damaging the beautiful image of Ta Van. (Informant 3, male, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.2.1.2.5.  *Organisational and political.*

It is interesting to note that the overall response to the “organisational and political” turned out to be negative. “Passive support of local authorities”, “low community trust”, and “poor management board” were emergent themes:

Local authorities are not interested in CBT any longer [as it was at the beginning]. Head of commune does not pay sufficient attention to implement the CBT plan that was mentioned in the communist party resolutions at both district and commune levels. Head of CBT management board is hesitant to organise regular meetings. Villagers do not hold him in high esteem as his speeches are often generic [vague], not specific and no action plan to follow up. (Informant [details suppressed])

Community trust and solidarity are being broken. Homestay owners are divided in factions criticising and competing to maximise their own personal benefit. Being the head of village, I am working to build up the trust among villagers. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)
In the past, the CBT management board was considered to be a positive factor by the majority of villagers as it had facilitated the development of the CBT in the village at the early stages. However, it is now struggling to gain trust from homestay owners. The main reasons perceived are “lack of expertise”, “inadequate monitoring and evaluation”, and “poor leadership”:

The old management board is managed poorly and is not appropriate. We need a proper model, which unites homestay owners for better CBT development. It is a model that all homestay owners are involved in management of Community fund. The board regulation must be specific and clear. (Informant 11, male, Giay, 36, homestay owner)

Management board lacks expertise and a good leader who is interested in CBT. It is necessary to have a monitoring and evaluation system with strict regulations in place to manage and regulate CBT at the village (Informant 20, female, Giay, 49, homestay owner/Head of women’s union)

7.2.1.2.6. Spatial.

When the villagers were asked about the spatial aspect of Ta Van one individual commented that “proximity” to Sa Pa was a negative factor as such closeness limited the length of time the tourists stay:

As the village is too close to Sa Pa [8km], many tourists want to stay overnight in Sa Pa town. Those same-day visitors [excursionists] only visit the village and return to Sa Pa within a day. They often do not spend much at the village. Therefore, there is not much benefit to villagers. (Informant 12, male, Giay, 45, villager)

In summary, the most striking observations to emerge from data comparison are traditional culture, unspoiled scenery, good infrastructure, a management board in place, and proximity to Sa Pa, and as well as the main tourist routes, they are seen as positive factors facilitating the development of CBT at Ta Van. However, a trend of decreasing effectiveness is perceived in relation to external support, road conditions, and the role of management board over time. In contrast, cultural modification, street children vendors, price competition, a poor management board, and lack of community trust, are the main negative factors hindering the performance of CBT. From the Figures, we can see that some factors are becoming worse from the
villagers’ perspective, including house architecture, land speculation, unattended tracking routes as well as a lack of monitoring and evaluation.

It is interesting to note that the proximity to Sa Pa is regarded both as a positive factor and as a negative one. The proximity of the village is attractive to excursionists, but not to tourists, who are capable of staying longer and spending more, because they can return to Sa Pa within the same day and spend most of their money there. Apart from being a tourist attraction, Ta Van plays a role as a hub and connecting point for tourists prior to trekking to other remote villages. Therefore, it was considered as an ideal alternative to replace Ban Ho.

7.2.2. Ban Ho

7.2.2.1. Positive factors.

The positive factors facilitating CBT development at Ban Ho are synthesised in Figure 7.3.

7.2.2.1.1. Socio-cultural.

During the interviews most villagers indicated that “rich traditional culture” is the main factor pulling tourists to visit and stay at Ban Ho. This factor consists of “unique architecture”, “cultural performance”, and “local specialities”:

For our Tay people, the traditional house-on-stilt architecture is a unique feature attracting travellers. Our houses are often made of wood and bamboo. Such design makes the houses cool, ventilated and beautiful so that most travellers like to take photos of it. (Informant 36, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

Tay people love singing and performing. When tourism developed a couple of years ago, there were four cultural performance groups in the village [information and culture, old people, community and Mr. Son’s group]. Currently there are only two groups left. Tourists enjoy our interesting performance and often give us tips after the show. (Informant 28, female, Tay, 26, villager, member of dancer)
Not only do tourists enjoy house architecture and the interesting performances by the Tay minority people, but Ban Ho is also well known and attractive to both international and domestic tourists because of its traditional culinary specialities:

Visitors like our traditional specialities such as five-colour sticky rice … coloured using natural ingredients [no chemical], grilled fish…fresh stream fish, baby bamboo shoot fermented with chilli and medical herb, boiled duck,
and roasted suckling pig…. Not only having lunch in the village, domestic visitors often order extra to bring back. (Informant 30, male, Tay, 59, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.2.2.1.2. Economic.

As tourism generates better income than agriculture, villagers in Ban Ho actively borrow money from banks and relatives to “invest in homestays and restaurants”:

My family invested all what we had in this homestay and restaurant. Business was very good [for two years] …and we earned much more income than agriculture. We were farmers. Each year we got 2 tonnes of rice, which was equal to VND15-16 million. Meanwhile for each tourist who stayed overnight, we earned at least VND100 thousand [mostly from beverage and accommodation]. If each month we received 10 tourists, then tourism would produce income equal to agriculture. …but normally we got 30 tourists each month. (Informant 24, male, Tay, 48, homestay owner)

Our Tay people mainly live on agriculture and animal farming. As return on investment was high, in particular in restaurants serving domestic tourists who visit the village and return within a day, my family [like many households] opened a restaurant. We received many Kinh tourists every day [twice as many as international tourists]. They came all year round in both summer and winter and their average spending is high. (Informant 36, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

The village also received considerable “external support”, for example, a CBT common house, a trekking route, from local and international non-governmental organisations:

Thanks to the support from district and international organisations, tourism facilities and infrastructure were improved. A trekking route to waterfall was developed and a CBT common house was built… (Informant 26, male, Tay, 39, Deputy head of CBT management board)

7.2.2.1.3. Environmental.

According to residents, Ban Ho is worth the somewhat difficult journey to get there as the village rewards visitors with the magnificent views of an unspoiled village with many natural and cultural attractions in the Muong Hoa valley. The majority of
villagers agreed that Ban Ho’s beautiful scenery was the crucial factor attracting tourists:

I love my rural village. Its scenery is like a wonderful natural painting. Situated in the breathtaking Muong Hoa valley where the Lavie stream and Muong Hoa stream are nestled, tourists can enjoy the stunning view of the whole village with mountain ranges, waterfalls, streams, wooden houses perched on the sites of rolling hills, and rice paddy fields from the main road before walking downhill. (Informant 25, female, Tay, 72, villager)

As waterfall and stream’s water is fresh and cool, most tourists like relaxing and swimming after a long day of walking. There are also hot springs that all domestic tourists like in the wintertime. Some tourists admitted at the time we have dinner with grilled fish and cold beer that the picturesque scenery of Ban Ho is one of many unforgettable memories of their trip and they would definitely recommend their friends to come. (Informant 23, male, Tay, 45, Head of village)

7.2.2.1.4. Infrastructural.

It is apparent that “infrastructure” to Ban Ho is not as good as that to Ta Van, but villagers regarded it as a competitive advantage to be able to attract trekking tours and travellers who love adventure, as well as the free and independent travellers:

Our village can be accessible by motorbikes, cars, trekking. Most domestic tourists reach the village by car or motorbike while international travellers enjoy biking and trekking as they could contemplate the pristine and peaceful countryside. (Informant 26, male, Tay, 39, Deputy head of CBT management board)

Ban Ho is a popular destination for trekkers who often walked down south through forests, streams, rice paddy fields from Ta Van village. Trekking trails are a bit sloppy and slippery in the rainy season but tourists enjoyed trekking very much (Informant 36, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.2.2.1.5. Organisational and political.

Respondents regarded Ban Ho as a successful model of CBT thanks to its “strong CBT management board”, “community commitment”, and “technical assistance” from international organisations:
The CBT management board was in good operation. The board not only managed tourism related activities such as registration of stay-overs, safety and security well... but also improved tourism products such as trekking routes to waterfall, trails to other villages, and cultural performance shows… (Informant 23, male, Tay, 45, Head of village)

Some villagers indicated that “community commitment” is a positive factor contributing to the success of CBT:

Our community is committed toward CBT development. We do not support the non-residents to invest or rent our houses for homestay business. We have regular meetings to discuss tourism development in the village. (Informant 33, male, Tay, 29, homestay owner)

The majority of villagers pointed out the importance of technical assistance from international non-governmental organisations and local authorities:

Ban Ho received a lot of technical assistance. Not only the financial support for the construction of the CBT communal house and the improvement of trekking trails, but also capacity building workshops on various tourism and hospitality related skills such as customer service, housekeeping, cooking, and tour guiding, as well as soft skills like communication and English. Core members of the board also participated in study tours to learn about best practices in Thailand and other places in Viet Nam. (Informant 26, male, Tay, 39, deputy head of CBT Board)

7.2.2.1.6. Spatial.

Located about 25 km from Sa Pa, Ban Ho is considered not only an ideal destination for both international and domestic tourists to visit either by car or on foot but also a hub/connecting point for tourists who want to explore further the southern part of Sa Pa:

Ban Ho has good proximity for international tourists to stay at least one night after a long day trek. Meanwhile for domestic tourists, visiting village around, swimming at waterfall or in streams [hot spring in winter], enjoying magnificent view, and having delicious lunch within a day is a great experience. (Informant 31, male, Tay, 46, homestay owner)

Ban Ho is not an end destination but a transit route. The trails and roads from Ban Ho also lead to the colourful Red Dao village of Nam Tong, Xa Pho village of Thanh Phu, and other ethnic communities in the south of the
district [Sa Pa], where trekkers can enjoy primitive forests, deep valleys, high mountains and opportunities to discover the daily typical rural lifestyles of ethnic people. (Informant 23, male, Tay, 45, Head of village)

7.2.2.2. **Negative factors.**

Though regarded as a good model of CBT development, residents perceived also that Ban Ho is facing several problems that could jeopardise this success. Further analysis revealed that the construction of two hydro power stations at the village area was the root problem. The following emergent themes were negative factors perceived by villagers (Figure 7.4).

7.2.2.2.1. **Socio-cultural.**

Together with economic development and the construction of the hydro power stations, villagers indicated that “temporary immigration of labour” and the “introduction of incompatible services” were modifying the traditional culture and having bad influences on the young and on tourism:

The temporary immigration of the labourers who come to work in hydro power stations breaks the tranquillity for our rural village. Together with their arrival, many unexpected services such as massage, karaoke, and prostitution were introduced to the village and badly influence the lifestyle of youngsters and tourism. The loudness of karaoke shops, which operate until midnight, causes homestay owners and tourists discomfort though as stipulated, all entertainment activities have to close by 10 pm. (Informant 23, male, Tay, 45, Head of village)

Additionally, “street selling children” is also a negative factor influencing the CBT in Ban Ho. Villagers and tourists both complained about this problem:

……...[there is no] open market where local people can sell and tourists can buy... ...group of children follow tourists and force them to buy though they might have bought the same products already. ...... tourists have a right to refuse but they hardly do.... it is impossible to escape from aggressive street selling children. (Informant 30, male, Tay, 59, restaurant and homestay owner)
7.2.2.2. Economic.

Like other villages, tourism development caused “inflation”, but the villagers accepted the increase in price as an inevitable effect of development:

Prices are increasing daily. I could buy a kilogram of pork for VND20,000 two years ago but now you cannot buy that with even VND70,000. The increasing prices happened in all commodities and we have to live with it. In response, we increase the price of tourism services [homestay, beverage].
Fortunately, hotels, travel agencies, and tourists understand and are willing to support us. (Informant 24, male, Tay, 48, homestay owner)

With huge investments made in homestays and restaurants so as to meet the increasing demand of tourist arrivals, the village was becoming “dependent on tourism”. Consequently, villagers were disappointed and severely affected when tourists stopped visiting:

…Business started getting worse since 2009 when the power station was in full construction. Visitors largely shunned our village. Almost all tours were cancelled. My homestay was empty for almost six months. I do not have figures for the economic loss due to the drop in visitors but it was painful to see tourists visiting other villages instead. (Informant 20, male, Tay, 59, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.2.2.2.3. Environmental.

The “degraded environment” was the main negative factor hindering CBT development at Ban Ho. All interviewed villagers stated that the deteriorated environment resulted from the construction of two hydro power stations causing noise pollution, landslides, eroded slopes, sedimentation of streams and the closing of the hot springs:

[sound]….Tourists run out of my homestay when there were explosions…. They quickly packed up their luggage and requested to return to Sa Pa though someone was taking a shower and dinner was prepared and ready to serve. I guess that they are too cautious…. (Informant 37, male, Hmong, 28, homestay owner)

With the construction of the power station, landslides happen more frequently. They are very dangerous and could cause a loss of life. Therefore, I always remind tourist guides [to tell tourists] that they should remain inside and not walk too close to the mountain after rain. Just last year (2010), the Su Pan power station was severely damaged by landslides after a heavy rain. (Informant 36, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

Tourists trekking to Ban Ho used to indulge in the crystal stream and enjoy the artworks of emerging stones from the water along Lavie stream that resemble different figures [depending on the imagination] or see water
flowers created by the splashing water running into the boulders. The stream now is full of sediment. (Informant 32, female, Tay, 24, villager)

Tourists wondered why the slopes were bare. I did not tell them the truth, instead, I explained to them that we were prepared to plant crops. If they had known that it was because of the construction of the power station, they would not be happy…. (Informant 31, male, Tay, 46, homestay owner)

Many natural attraction of the tranquil village – such as Ca Nhay and Lavie waterfalls where tourist can enjoy the sweet sound of running water or see brooks gently running down bamboo cylinders that locals use to channel the water into their terraced paddy fields – are only past memories. (Informant 35, female, Tay, 27, villager)

7.2.2.4. **Infrastructural.**

With tourist numbers decreasing, tourism infrastructure is not maintained properly:

The construction of power stations devastated not only our environment but also the infrastructure. Every day, many heavily loaded trucks run repeatedly generating noise and dust in the dry season while the road was getting muddy and slippery in the rainy season. (Informant 28, female, Tay, 26, dancer)

No one pays attention to trekking routes. The trails from village to waterfall were dangerous to walk through, as it was too bushy and not maintained regularly. (Informant 36, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.2.2.5. **Organisational and political.**

With the change of the CBT management board leader in mid-2010 and the fall in the number of visitors visiting Ban Ho, the CBT management board became inactive:

I do not see any activities of the CBT management board since the end of last year (2010). Such a non-active board makes our tourism worse [?], especially when we are in need of a representative to help get our village tourism back on its feet. I expect that tourism to my homestay would return to normal hopefully next year, as signs of a recovery already appeared in early 2011. It is getting better but has not at all reached the prior level. As the Su Pan power station is completed, we all actually hope that in 2012 the situation would be, maybe not fully, but gradually, recovered again. (Informant 36, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)
7.2.2.2.6. *Spatial.*

Due to the negative impact of the construction of the hydro power stations that were devastating the environment at Ban Ho, many tour operators and hotels stopped organising tours to the village. Previously Ban Ho was perceived by customers and tour operators as a must-see destination because of its environment but has now become a mostly tourist-empty village:

Five years ago, our village was one of the most attractive villages for tours to Sa Pa. The number of tourists had declined drastically by 30% each year since the introduction of power stations in 2007 and 2010. Now, with one power station completed [2011] and the environment recovering, tourists started to return in small numbers but it might take us about two years to have the number of visitors to village returning to pre-2009 levels … Ban Ho has now become a transit route/a by-passing instead of a destination as it was. Our village image is still quite damaged. (Informant 26, male, Tay, 39, Deputy head of CBT Board)

In summary, the main positive factors contributing to the development of CBT at Ban Ho are its rich traditional culture, beautiful scenery, accessible infrastructure, operational management board, and proximity to Sa Pa. However, over time a trend of decline has developed in relation to external support, condition of trekking routes, and the role of the management board. In contrast, the respondents considered cultural modification, street children vendors, and degraded environment are the main negative factors hindering the performance of CBT. Factors perceived as showing a trend of deterioration include cultural modification, street children vendors, unattended trekking routes, and the leadership capabilities of the CBT management board. The latter two factors are indirectly associated with the hydro stations. According to some respondents however, there are indications that Ban Ho’s environment is slowly recovering and that tourists have been returning following the completion of the first hydropower station [Su Pan] in late 2011.

7.2.3. **Ta Phin**

7.2.3.1. *Positive factors.*

The overall response to positive factors influencing the performance of CBT in Ta Phin, is illustrated in the Figure 7.5.
7.2.3.1.1. *Socio-cultural*

Ta Phin village is a place where both Red Dao (75%) and Black Hmong (25%) live together. The majority of those who were interviewed indicated that the “traditional culture” of the Red Dao, consisting of “ethnic costume”, “embroidery”, “herb bathing”, and “hospitality”, is the main factor attracting tourists to Ta Phin:

Dao women and I look [different and] attractive in our embroidered costume. In my village, all women wear traditional costume all day [both at home and at work]. Every tourist likes to take photo with us in our colourful dress. (Informant 48, female, Dao, 42, villager)

I am very proud of our beautiful ethnic costume, mainly made from the indigo-dyed hemp fabric, and then sewed with different colour threads (yellow, red and green) to use as collars, belts, sleeves. It is interesting that you could “guess” my age and embroidery skills when looking at my costume. (Informant 53, male, Dao, 45, homestay owner)

Further analysis shows that Dao women are very skilful at making embroidery that is attractive to tourists:

We all learn how to sew and embroider from our mothers. Most of the young girls start their embroidery when they are about ten years old (or even younger). At first, they start with simple patterns and then they move on to ones that are more complicated, which often represent symbolic figures of farming, animals, and children. Traditionally, girls have to make their own clothes to wear when they get married. (Informant 43, female, Dao, 37, homestay owner/Head of women’s union)

Another emergent theme is “herb bathing”:

Our Dao people are well known for herbal baths. They are a unique product and a must-try experience for any visitors to Ta Phin. Herb bathing used to be a popular natural medicine to make our mind and body relaxed after a hard day’s work. Visitors enjoy herb bathing and feel refreshed after a long day trek. (Informant 47, male, Dao, 46, homestay owner)

Some villagers emphasised that Red Dao people are very hospitable to visitors:

We have a common saying that “When you come to a Dao’s house you do not have to worry about being hungry” which means whoever you are and wherever you are from, when you visit a Dao’s family you are welcomed and
if at our meal time, you are invited to join as a family member. (Informant 42, male, Dao, 41, homestay owner)

### 7.2.3.1.2. Economic.

Most villagers, particularly homestay owners, indicated that the financial support from local authorities and international non-governmental organisations helped facilitate CBT in Ta Phin:

---

**Figure 7.5. Positive factors influencing CBT as perceived by community members in Ta Phin.**

---

#
It was fortunate that my house had been selected to be a homestay provider. I am a farmer... my family lives on annual crops of rice and corn. We raise pigs and chicken... and do not have money to do homestay. However, with the financial support from local authorities and international organisations, I renovated my house, upgraded toilet facilities, purchased some utensils and was trained how to serve tourists who passed through my village and wanted to stay in my house. (Informant 47, male, Dao, 46, homestay owner)

7.2.3.1.3. Environmental.

Most villagers are proud that Ta Phin has “beautiful scenery” that is attractive to tourists, including “primitive forests”, “hilly mountain”, “cave”, and “rice paddy fields”:

Beside cultural attractions such as a monastery and traditional houses, embroideries ..., I think Ta Phin is attractive to tourists because of its beautiful landscape and splendid scenery of rice paddy fields, ranges of mountains and hills, well-protected forests and plenty of shady trees along the road to the village. (Informant 46, female, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.2.3.1.4. Infrastructural.

“Good road conditions” and “trekking routes” connecting Ta Phin to and from Sa Pa town bring tourists to the village:

My village is accessible to tourists thanks to its 12 km asphalted road connecting the centre of the village to and from the main road as well as Sa Pa town. Tourists could visit the village all year round without worrying about road conditions. It just takes about 20 minutes [by motorbike or car] to reach the village from Sa Pa town. (Informant 51, male, Dao, 36, villager)

For some tourists who prefer adventure, walking through rice fields and ethnic villages is an interesting experience:

I see that most tourists who stay at my homestay often take a walk down from Sa Pa. They enjoy trekking through high hills, vast valley, villages and rice terrace for to experience the daily life of ethnic minority people along the trail. (Informant 40, female, Dao, 33, homestay owner)
7.2.3.1.5. Organisational and political.

Most villagers interviewed, particularly homestay owners, expressed positive support for “local authorities” and for the “technical assistance” they received from tour operators and international organisations:

I joined some training classes offered by the district people committee on various topics from the enhancement of tourism awareness to the improvement of embroidery skills… helping me to better serve tourists to the village. (Informant 39, male, Dao, 26, farmer)

There is also support from international projects on capacity building of tourism and hospitality occupational skills as well as the development of the CBT for Dao ethnic people:

I participated in the CBT project [funded by CIDA and PATA] since 2007 and learnt new skills about doing homestay business …such as homestay management and development, conversational English, housekeeping… The acquired knowledge is very useful for me to serve tourists properly, which results in more visitors and extra income. (Informant 43, female, Dao, 37, homestay owner and Head of women’s union)

One individual stated that tour operators help the village to develop CBT through donations and promotion:

It is very good for us that some tour operators not only bring tourists but also help promoting and raising fund for Ta Phin community through tourist donations. (Informant 46, female, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay own owner)

7.2.3.1.6. Spatial

Almost two-thirds of informants said that “proximity to Sa Pa” and “being a connection point” contributed to the success of CBT in Ta Phin:

As the centre of the village is only 12 km from Sa Pa town and main route is in good condition, Ta Phin is convenient for tourists to access either by motorbike, car or just a walk. (Informant 4, female, Dao, 52, homestay owner)
The proximity is also convenient for trekkers:

It takes trekkers approximately four hours up and down hills through rice fields, bamboo ranges and some minority villages to my house [hamlet 1]. As I live on the hillside of 5 km from the centre of the village, the trek route is of about 14 km from Sa Pa without passing the centre of the village. (Informant 47, female, Dao, 46, homestay owner)

Ta Phin is also a connection point [stop over] to and from Sa Pa to other villages. Some tourists prefer to stay at my homestay [guesthouse?] in the centre of the village, as it is convenient for them either on the way back to Sa Pa or en route down east of Sa Pa.(Informant 49, female, Dao, 27, villager)

The single most striking observation to emerge from the interviews with the Ta Phin villagers (also talks with tourists) was the decrease of tourist arrivals in Ban Ho that helped Ta Phin to become a popular destination:

I think Ta Phin is becoming popular partly due to the sharp decrease of tourist arrivals in Ban Ho. Taking that advantage, Ta Phin is changing itself to be an attractive destination in the tour programs of the travel companies. (Informant 51, male, Dao, 36, villager)

7.2.3.2. Negative factors.

There are some negative factors seen as preventing the performance of CBT at Ta Phin. The results obtained from the analysis are presented in Figure 38.

7.2.3.2.1. Socio-cultural.

“Cultural modification” in house design and “aggressive vendors” are two emergent themes:

I see the blossoming of some newly designed houses-on-stilt in the centre of the village. It is definitely not the traditional Dao’s one [or even Hmong’s one] but a copy of Muong or Thai ethnic groups. Such changes may confuse tourists about Dao’s house architecture. (Informant 53, male, Dao, 45, homestay owner)

I feel shameful to see dozens of Dao’s children and adults [women] aggressively approaching and following tourists to offer and persuade them to buy embroidery e.g. bags, wallets, clothes and other merchandises. This
created a bad impression for the first time visitor who might be frightened by the insistent following and selling. Be careful, as some vendors are not friendly at all, if you do not intend to purchase any things, you either do not ask or say you have bought already. (Informant 48, female, Dao, 42, villager)

I notice daily with my own eyes that tourists are often “bullied” and forced to purchase embroideries by street vendors. In particular, some women are very aggressive and even spit at tourists if they do not buy any things from them. Even if a tourist offers to give a tip instead of purchasing, she is shocked and frightened when vendors refuse and say curses to her in English. (Informant 45, male, Dao, 70, villager)

![Diagram showing categories and themes of negative factors affecting CBT in Ta Phin.](image)

Figure 7.6. Negative Factors influencing CBT as perceived by community member in Ta Phin
7.2.3.2.2. Economic.

It is apparent from interviews [mostly with homestay owners] that “competition selling products” and “inflation” are critical to CBT:

Though there is no rule, I dare not offer tourists who are accompanied by street vendors to purchase any of my embroideries when they come by my house as street vendors are not happy and will blame me for “taking away their food”. I do not want to have trouble with these vendors, as they are not friendly. (Informant 42, male, Dao, 36, villager)

I think the increase in price is a bit difficult for villagers who are not involved in tourism. However, there is no substantial impact on tourists as raw materials [food] are prepared by tour operators/hotels and brought along with tourists from Sa Pa. (Informant 53, male, Dao, 45, homestay owner)

7.2.3.2.3. Environmental.

It is surprising that villagers take good care of their forests but neglect the “public and surrounding environment”:

Ta Phin is getting dirtier as it seems that no one cares about the public and surrounding environment. Other homestay owners and I always try to keep our houses and surroundings clean and tidy but we cannot cover public areas completely. It should be the task of the commune. (Informant 50, male, Dao, 47, homestay owner)

7.2.3.2.4. Infrastructural.

Some villagers noticed that the “trekking route” was unattended by villagers:

I know some trekkers walk down to village but.... not sure which trail [route] they take. I do not think that I have to do something to improve the trail as.... it is a public walking route. (Informant 46, female, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.2.3.2.5. Organisational and political.

Many Ta Phin residents regarded the “lack of leadership” and “lack of community solidarity” as major hindrances to CBT:
Though we in Ta Phin receive technical assistance and financial support, I think we lack leadership that represents us to manage and promote CBT. We have discussed the idea of a CBT management board and mechanism on paper since 2008, but no action has happened since then. It seems that we might need a cooperative, which will help us develop CBT. (Informant 47, female, Dao, 46, homestay owner)

I am afraid of villagers in hamlet 4 of the Ta Phin village. They seem unhappy when my house receives tourists to stay over instead of their houses though their houses are not qualified to be a homestay. (Informant 40, female, Dao, 33, homestay owner)

7.2.3.2.6. Spatial.

Some villagers explained the slow increase of stay-over visitors due to its proximity to Sa Pa:

Due to short distance from Sa Pa to Ta Phin, most visitors just plan to visit our village for a while and then go back to Sa Pa within the morning or afternoon. Only a few visitors stayed at the village. However, this small number is getting smaller because of aggressive vendors disappointing visitors. (Informant 42, male, Dao, 41, homestay owner)

In summary, it is apparent from the findings that the main positive factors contributing to the performance of CBT at Ta Phin are its traditional culture, beautiful scenery, external support (finance and technical assistance), accessible infrastructure, and proximity to Sa Pa. However, there is a trend of decline in relation to the condition of the unattended trekking route. In contrast, cultural modification, aggressive vendors, and lack of leadership are the main negative factors hindering the performance of CBT. Factors perceived to be deteriorating include cultural modification, aggressive vendors, and the lack of leadership and its management mechanism.

7.2.4. Synthesis 3 – Factors influencing CBT.

The synthesis of factors influencing the performance of Community-based Tourism at the three case study villages, as perceived by interviewed residents, is presented in Tables 7.1 and 7.2. The bold font equates to the themes most frequently referenced by local residents, and the italics illustrate the least frequently referenced. The
underlined texts represent positive changes while the grey-shaded texts indicate perceived negative changes.

Table 7.1. Positive factors influencing the performance of CBT at the case study villages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Factors</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Ta Van</th>
<th>Ban Ho</th>
<th>Ta Phin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Socio-cultural</td>
<td>Traditional culture</td>
<td>· Costume</td>
<td>· House architecture</td>
<td>· Costume</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Cultural performance</td>
<td>· Cultural performance</td>
<td>· Embroidery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Hospitality and friendliness</td>
<td>· Specialities</td>
<td>· Hospitality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>Self-investment</td>
<td>· External support</td>
<td></td>
<td>· External support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td>Beautiful and unspoiled scenery</td>
<td>· Rice terrace</td>
<td>· Stream</td>
<td>· Beautiful scenery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Stream</td>
<td>· Forest</td>
<td>· Rice field</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Forest</td>
<td>· Waterfalls</td>
<td>· Forest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Mountain</td>
<td>· Mountain</td>
<td>· Mountain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Hot spring</td>
<td>· Cave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Good road conditions</td>
<td>· Interesting walking and trekking routes</td>
<td>· Good road conditions</td>
<td>· Good road conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Trekking routes</td>
<td>· Trekking routes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisational &amp; Political</td>
<td>Management board</td>
<td>· Support of local authorities</td>
<td>· Support of local authorities</td>
<td>· Support of local authorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Management mechanism</td>
<td>· External support</td>
<td>· Community commitment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Technical assistance</td>
<td>· Technical assistance</td>
<td>· Technical assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Capacity building</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Instruction/sign board</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spatial</td>
<td>Proximity to Sa Pa</td>
<td>· Location on the main tourist routes</td>
<td>· Domestic visitors</td>
<td>· Proximity to Sa Pa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Hub and connecting point</td>
<td>· International tourists</td>
<td>· Decrease in arrival in Ban Ho</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>· Decrease in tourist arrival in Ban Ho</td>
<td></td>
<td>· Interconnect point</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is apparent from the findings that there are a number of similarities among the villages. All villages share positive commonalities such as rich traditional culture, effective external support, beautiful scenery, good infrastructure such as good road conditions with interesting trekking routes, and a proximity to Sa Pa. With regard to
negative factors, all villages are facing some common challenges including cultural modification, unattended trekking routes, lack of leadership on the management of CBT, and the limited length of stay for tourists and an increasing number of same-day visitors as opposed to stay-over tourists.

There are, however, a number of significant differences among the villages. From the positive perspective, “traditional costume” is the main socio-cultural sub-theme representing “traditional culture” in both Ta Van and Ta Phin while “house architecture” is the main manifestation in Ban Ho. Economically, Ta Phin is different from other villages in term of self-investment. Environmentally, each village has its own strengths. Ta Van has a splendid rice terrace; Ban Ho is known for its waterfalls and hot springs while Ta Phin is famous for a cave. This indicates differential attributes for a “sense of place”. With regard to organisational and political aspects, both Ta Van and Ban Ho have a CBT management board that plays an important role in managing and promoting tourism, whilst Ta Phin does not. Only Ta Phin is receiving technical assistance from an international organisation. It is interesting to note that Ban Ho’s villagers expect to attract mainly domestic tourists while international tourists dominate the number of visitors to Ta Van and Ban Ho.

From a negative perspective, Ta Phin’s villagers perceived “aggressive vendors”, including both children and adults, as the main socio-cultural hindrance, while residents in Ta Van and Ban Ho referred only to “street selling children”, but did not refer to it as a critical theme. Economically, “price competition” and “land speculation” are the main themes for Ta Van whilst “over-dependence on tourism” pertained to Ban Ho, and “competition in selling products” between street vendors and homestay owners was relevant to Ta Phin. Environmentally, the environmental degradation that was expressed as a major concern by respondents in Ban Ho was of less concern in the other two villages.
Table 7.2. Negative factors influencing the performance of CBT at the case study communities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Ta Van</th>
<th>Ban Ho</th>
<th>Ta Phin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Socio-cultural</td>
<td>• Cultural modification</td>
<td>• Cultural modification</td>
<td>• Cultural modification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Fusion food</td>
<td>o Migration of labour</td>
<td>o Non-traditional house</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Modified architecture</td>
<td>o Emergence of unexpected service</td>
<td>• Aggressive vendors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Privatised performance</td>
<td>o Aggressive vendors</td>
<td>o Street selling children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Aggressive vendors</td>
<td>o Street selling children</td>
<td>• Street selling adult</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Street children selling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>• Price competition</td>
<td>• Inflation</td>
<td>• Inflation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Land speculation</td>
<td>• Over dependence on tourism</td>
<td>• Competition in selling products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Inflation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Leakage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td>• Degraded environment</td>
<td>• Degraded environment</td>
<td>• Neglected environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Explosion</td>
<td>o Explosion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Landslide</td>
<td>o Landslide</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Eroded slopes</td>
<td>o Eroded slopes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Sedimentation of streams</td>
<td>o Sedimentation of streams</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Closed hot spring</td>
<td>o Closed hot spring</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructural</td>
<td>• Unattended walking and trekking routes</td>
<td>• Unattended walking and trekking routes</td>
<td>• Unattended trekking routes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Poor village road conditions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisational &amp; Political</td>
<td>• Poor management board</td>
<td>• Non-active management board</td>
<td>• Lack of leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Lack of expertise</td>
<td>o No leadership</td>
<td>• Community solidarity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o No monitoring and evaluation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Leadership</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Community trust</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Passive support of local authorities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spatial</td>
<td>• Proximity to Sa Pa</td>
<td>• By passing only</td>
<td>• More same-day visitors vs. tourists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Limited length of stay</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7.3. Recommendations for CBT Development

The factors that contributed both positively and negatively to CBT were examined above in Section 7.2. The suggestions subsequently elicited from these residents for improving CBT within their home villages are described in this section. The analysis from the responses to Research Question 4a: “What are your suggestions for improving the benefit of CBT to the development of your village?” is first organised by location. Emergent themes are then divided into six main categories: “socio-cultural”, “economic”, “environmental”, “Infrastructural”, “product development”, and “organisational and political”. These categories are similar to those employed in
the previous chapter, except for the omission of the “spatial” theme and the addition of a “product development” theme. The underlying themes for each category (Sections 7.3.1 – 7.3.3) are illustrated with relevant quotes. These themes are compared to highlight similarities, differences, and interrelationship among the communities in order to address Research Question 4b.

7.3.1. Ta Van.

The results of the recommendations obtained from Ta Van are summarised in Figure 7.7, in which the larger font emphasises the themes most frequently cited by local villagers, while the smaller font denotes the least frequency.

7.3.1.1. Socio-cultural.

Preservation of traditional culture against the trend of increasing commodification was of great concern to some senior local villagers:

I think the community should have a meeting to seriously discuss the preservation of our traditional culture against the increasing commercialisation happening in our village and work together to revitalise and promote our authentic Giay identity. It is also important to educate our children about village history, and our cultural features such as house style, and costume before it is too late....... [turning to other issues] sooner or later, if we do nothing, the village will be another Sa Pa town where everyone can move in and live there. I do think we should find a way to protect ourselves from the negative influences of what non-residents bring in [new house, music, costume etc.] while adopting their good practices. (Informant 2, male, Giay, 63, homestay owner)

I always tell my children stories about our history, where we are from and what makes us different from others like Hmong, Dao, and Kinh. I want my kids to be proud of their ancestors and ethnic values though I send my children to school to learn the Vietnamese language. (Informant 20, female, Giay, 49, homestay owner, head of women’s union)

Organising joint sport activities between guests (tourists) and hosts (villagers) to promote cultural exchange and mutual understandings is an interesting initiative:

I see many young tourist [student] groups stay long days in the village. They like working as farmers and playing sport. We can organise joint activities between our youngsters and them like playing football, badminton... that will
bring people together. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)

### Categories

**Preservation of traditional culture**
- A community site to play sport with tourists

**Increase in price of products and services**
- Arrangement of food for tourists
- Benefit sharing from entrance ticket
- Tourist distribution mechanism

**Environment**
- Forest protection
- Clean village road

**Recommendation**
- A market site for ethnic people
- Restriction of hydropower station
- A lighting system along village road

**Infrastructural**
- Day ethnic ‘s souvenir
- Periodical cultural shows
- Leaflet about Day ethnic people

**Product development**
- Restructure of management board
- Management of Community fund

**Organisational & Political**

---

**Figure 7.7. Recommendations for improving the benefits of CBT at Ta Van.**

### 7.3.1.2. Economic.

Some villagers recommended that local income could be improved by increasing service prices, self-arrangement of food, benefit sharing of entrance tickets, and the distribution of tourists to homestays:

I see the opportunity to improve our earning [income] through the increase of service prices, particularly food, beverage and accommodation. Current accommodation prices are too low, being equal to a bowl of chicken noodles of VND40,000 in [Sa Pa] town. My homestay sometimes has no benefit from tourist stay and cost is more than benefit when receiving small groups of two persons. Taking into account inflation and the increase of new entrance ticket
to villages, it is reasonable to increase our price of homestay up to VND70,000 and beverage up to VND30,000 from the current VND20,000. (Informant 3, male, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

To increase income, homestays should prepare local food for tourists instead of the current provision of raw materials [food] by hotels and tour operators in Sa Pa. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)

I think the village should be entitled to the share of revenue from the entrance tickets charging visitors to tourist attractions and villages. .. [other recommendation] to ensure the experience quality of tourists and equal benefit sharing among homestays in the village, there should be a system of allocating [distributing] tourists to homestays. There might be max. 3-5 tourists allocated to a homestay instead of the current sometime 20-50 tourists for one homestay... not only is it over the capacity of a single homestay to serve and accommodate so many, but there will also be frustration, for example, because of long queuing for bathroom and toilet. (Informant 3, male, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.3.1.3. Environmental.

Villagers recognised the need to protect the physical environment as a way to attract tourists:

Tourists come to our village because of its paddy fields, beautiful landscape and green forest. Therefore, protection of forest and scenery is of crucial importance... (Informant 1, male, Hmong, 56, commune leader)

Each villager should not only keep their own houses and front terrace clean but also the public areas and village lanes. We should have village cleaning once a week. (Informant 2, male, Giay, 63, homestay owner)

7.3.1.4. Infrastructural.

Suggestions were given for improving the infrastructure by erecting a market site for selling souvenirs, saying “no” to hydro power stations, and installing a lighting system:

Developing a market site for ethnic people to sell souvenir is of top priority as this will help reduce the street vendors...but our difficulty is in shortage of land...... [other issue] currently, there are already five hydro power stations in our surrounding villages [in Sa Pa], which are destroying the neighbouring
cultures and environment. I do not want to see any station close to our tourist attractions in Ta Van as tourists will not visit us then. (Informant 1, male, Hmong, 56, commune leader)

I think there should be a lighting system along walking lanes. It is then safe for both tourists and villagers to walk around the village in the evening. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.3.1.5. Product development.

Product development received considerable attention from villagers. Linked to the issue of socio-cultural preservation (see socio-culture theme), most suggestions focused on raising awareness and promoting Giay ethnic culture to visitors, as for example, through the development of typical Giay souvenirs, organisation of regular cultural shows, sport activities, or the production of a simple leaflet about the history of the village and its Giay people:

I see room to develop Giay ethnic souvenirs so that visitors remember our village. We can start with either a simple postcard, handmade scarf or wooden bracelets [not too heavy souvenir]. Most products now are from Hmong, Dao or Kinh people. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)

There should be periodical cultural shows for both visitors and tourists [that is, both walk-ins and tour groups]. Ticket prices will include a soft drink. All revenue will be for performers. We can start first with one or two regular shows per week. (Informant 3, male, Kinh, 38, restaurant and homestay owner)

A good way to teach visitors about the village is to make small leaflets about village history and culture. It could be one colour and some homestays could sponsor it in return for their advertisement. (Informant 4, female, Kinh, 21, shop, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.3.1.6. Organisational and political.

The majority of villagers interviewed regarded the reform of the CBT management board and improved management of community funding as ways to improve the benefits of CBT for the development of the village. With regard to reform, the emergent sub-themes consist of restructuring the management board, more
transparent regulations and operational mechanisms, and capacity building for management board members:

To regain trust, I think, the CBT management board should be restructured with new members who are committed and directly elected by homestay owners and tourism-related businesses [the community]....... and the board should review and work out a transparent regulation and operation mechanism. (Informant 6, male, Giay, 37, homestay owner/Head of village)

The board [village] should explore opportunities to receive technical support from external organisations in capacity building and marketing. Both board members and homestay owners should learn best practices of managing a CBT site through study tours [visits] and capacity building workshops. (Informant 2, male, Giay, 63, homestay owner)

Homestay owners recommended a greater involvement in the management and monitoring of the community fund:

Homestay owners and tourism-related businesses must be involved in the management and the usage of the community fund. A brief monthly report system could be an option. (Informant 2, male, Giay, 63, homestay owner)

In summary, the recommendations that emerged from the data collected during the interviews with the Giay ethnic people mostly came from a small group of either senior villagers working for a local authority (i.e. local elite) or young active entrepreneurs. The most frequently solicited themes are preservation of traditional culture, increased prices of local products and services, protection of the environment, construction of a market site, the development of Giay ethnic souvenirs, and the restructuring of the management board.

7.3.2. Ban Ho.

Figure 7.8 summarises the recommendations of villagers at Ban Ho.

7.3.2.1. Socio-cultural.

A major emergent theme in the comments from villagers was the revitalisation of craft skills among Ban Ho community members to preserve traditional culture and to increase income:
There is high demand for good quality embroidery. We might have a stamp to certify that a product has been made locally, not in China or elsewhere. Then we could sell with high price. ... [other recommendation] As to preserve unique Tay culture and to avoid benefits leaving the village [leakage] as well as cultural modification, I would suggest a written agreement [or some other commitment] that non-residents are not allowed to invest or to rent homestays to do business at Ban Ho. (Informant 20, male, Tay, 59, restaurant and homestay owner)

![Diagram](image_url)  
**Figure 7.8. Recommendations for improving the benefits of CBT at Ban Ho.**

### 7.3.2.2. Economic.

There were suggestions to improve income through increasing prices of services:

I support the increase of service prices in Ta Van. VND70,000/night [homestay] is reasonable, as the current price is too low. The changes of price should be agreed upon and applied by all homestay owners. The CBT management board would send a notice to tour operators and hotels to inform them about such changes. Additionally, a list of service and product prices must be publicly posted in front of each homestay. (Informant 26, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

### 7.3.2.3. Environmental.

The majority of villagers strongly recommended that the restoration of the natural environment be an important priority for all stakeholders, as it was a root problem:
The district authority together with tourism companies and local residents should work together to replant trees to have the bare slopes and area along the village road green. This requires strong commitment of local residents to protect not only planted trees but also the remaining green area. (Informant 20, male, Tay, 59, restaurant and homestay owner)

I wish that the village landscape could be restored to its original, mountain reforested, streams dredged, hot springs watered. ….then tourists will return and stay with us. (Informant 20, female, Tay, 39, hot spring owner)

If we cannot have the environment restored, tourists will visit other villages. We need immediate action not just talk and promise. (Informant 16, male, Tay, 62, villager)

There was also a suggestion to mitigate the negative impacts of the construction of Nam Tong hydropower station:

The first hydropower station [Su Pan] has just been completed. The second one is under construction and scheduled to be completed in two years….. We should mitigate the negative impacts of the construction [environmental destruction] by planting more trees, getting sand out of streams…. It is expected slopes, and crystal waterfall and streams will be fully recovered. (Informant 23, male, Tay, 45, head of village)

Local authority, hydro-power company and community should work out a plan to afforest the surrounding areas, reduce noise and landslide otherwise no one want to visit our village anymore. (Informant 28, male, Tay, 42, homestay owner)

7.3.2.4. Infrastructural.

Some villagers advocated a market site to sell souvenirs and demonstrate craft skills:

I recommend developing a market site to sell souvenir and demonstrate traditional craft skills for tourists. There is a plan and land allocated. I am informed that a new market will be built at the current primary school place as school will be re-allocated to a quiet place for this project since 2007 but no action has been taken so far. (Informant 23, male, Tay, 45, head of village)

In the context of regarding linguistic skills as a form of social infrastructure, some homestay owners mentioned that English training classes (in evening) were essential to communicate more effectively with tourists:
Tourists were surprised when I spoke English .... I accompanied them to a remote village [Sin Chai]. I considered myself to be another tourist guide though I could use only some simple words. If there is a class, homestay owners and I will re-arrange our work to attend. (Informant 26, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.3.2.5. Product development.

Ban Ho villagers frequently recommended the organisation of regular cultural shows, the development of tailor-made products and souvenirs for tourists:

I think the village is too quiet and boring if there is no cultural performance. Regular cultural show is not only for tourists but also local residents. (Informant 26, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

Recently my homestay received two groups of tourists. One stayed for a week and the other for three days. They both were interested in working in the rice field like farmers. They helped us cut and reap. The longer-staying group wanted to learn about the process of distilling local wine from selected rice, whilst the shorter-stay group requested me to show them the strawberry/cotton trees and how to dye cloth in indigo. (Informant 24, male, Tay, 48, homestay owner)

I see many independent tourists who drive themselves [motorbike] to Ban Ho. They do not know where to go and visit. Therefore, I think of the development of a simple sketch [map] with attractions labelled, a black and white leaflet with hand written description about our village and its Tay culture, and of organising a tour of 60 minutes to guide them around village. Some tourism and hotel companies in Sa Pa could support the design and printing costs. (Informant 26, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

For domestic tourists, I might make and collect the buffalo wooden bells, bows and arrows, bamboo, rattan products [e.g. chairs, batons], a CD of Tay traditional music…. as these are all souvenirs of high demand. (Informant 20, male, Tay, 59, restaurant and homestay owner)

7.3.2.6. Organisational and political.

Some recommendations focused on the restructuring of the CBT management board and the selection of a qualified and committed leader:

I personally support the improved operation of the CBT management board. I think homestay owners and tourists feel secure when there is a management
board responsible for CBT in place. The board can play the role as a focal point to connect village with tourists and international organisations. (Informant 26, female, Tay, 45, restaurant and homestay owner)

The current management board is inactive mainly because of the lack of good leadership. There should be a meeting to select a competent and committed leader prior to restructuring the board. (Informant 16, male, Tay, 39, deputy head of CBT Board)

In summary, the major themes emerging from the data are the revitalisation of craft skills, increased service prices, restoration of the natural environment, development of a market site, development of tailor-made products to meet the increasing and diverse demand of tourists, and a qualified leader for the CBT management board.

7.3.3. Ta Phin.

The recommendations for the development of the CBT at Ta Phin are illustrated in Figure 7.9.

7.3.3.1. Socio-cultural.

The majority of villagers recommended strict regulations for street sellers:

Street sellers are destroying the image of our hospitable village [Ta Phin]. I do not think “insisting” approach is the best way to sell products. Initially, some visitors might feel dismayed and overwhelmed to be surrounded by many local sellers when they just get out of their bus but ….what are left are annoyance, disappointment, and possible unpleasant memories of being harassed and followed. Regulations should be applied as strictly as the time when Ta Phin has festivals to keep visitors away from being unexpectedly disturbed…..why not punishment... (Informant 54, male, Kinh, 58, villager)

Why there were no aggressive street sellers during festive days? It was because the local authority warned that they would fine and arrest the sellers if they followed and forced tourists to buy. Unfortunately, it was only a short time...I think there should be a fine notice and hot telephone line which tourists could report inappropriate behaviours. (Informant 15, female, Dao, 49, shopper)

Another suggestion was to provide more information for tour operators and tourists:
...Provision of village information with “do” and “do not” advice for tourists might help reduce cultural shock. Tour operators will inform tourists about what they might receive, how they should behave, “do” and “do not” prior to visiting village…. for example, “do not” buy products from street sellers but at village market, where street vendors are supported by local authority to promote and sell their products. (Informant 53, male, Dao, 45, homestay owner)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Socio-cultural</td>
<td>Strict regulations for street sellers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>More information for tour operators and tourists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>Equal opportunities in selling products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation</td>
<td>Improvement of inter-village road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>Information center and village showroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product development</td>
<td>A management team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisational &amp; Political</td>
<td>Support from international organisations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 7.9. Recommendations for improving the benefits of CBT at Ta Phin.

7.3.3.2. Economic.

Villagers indicated they expected to have an equal economic opportunity when selling embroidery:

I would suggest that each street seller will be given a ticket. They will take their turns to accompany tourists during their visits around the village. After a short walk, tourists might be interested in buying some products. (Informant 47, female, Dao, 46, homestay owner)

7.3.3.3. Infrastructural.

Some villagers recommended an investment to upgrade inter-village roads to other attractions and villages:
Ta Phin has an ideal location connecting Sa Pa to other attractions and villages. There will be more tourists if the connecting roads are upgraded so that at least bicycles and motorbikes could roll on. (Informant 42, male, Dao, 41, homestay owner)

7.3.3.4. Product development.

Development of an information centre and a craft showroom received substantial attention from interviewed villagers:

Our village should have an information centre and a craft showroom to introduce visitors to village history and Dao ethnic culture as well as to showcase and promote the craft skills and embroidery......We are working with PATA [Pacific Asia Travel Association] to look for a funding agency to help us develop an information and cultural centre to educate local residents and visitors about Dao people, culture and attractions. (Informant 43, female, Dao, 37, homestay owner/Head of women’s union)

7.3.3.5. Organisational and political.

The establishment of a management team to seek financial and technical support from international organisations is the main recommendation:

In order to develop successful Community based tourism at Ta Phin, we might need to have a management team to unite hamlets for tourism development … the team as village representative to work with local authorities to attract more support from international organisations. (Informant 43, female, Dao, 37, homestay owner/Head of women’s union)

I expect international organisations to help improve my house to be a homestay and to bring in more tourists to Ta Phin. (Informant 48, female, Dao, 42, villager)

In summary, the major recommendation themes elicited from the villagers interviewed are strict regulations for street sellers, provision of more information for tour operators and tourists, development of an information centre and a craft showroom, and the establishment of a management team representing the community to attract further support from international organisations. There were no recommendations involving environmental improvement or trekking routes.
7.3.4. Synthesis 4 – Recommendations for CBT.

Table 7.3 presents the synthesis of recommendations for the development of Community-based Tourism at the three case studies. The bold font indicates the most frequency of reference by local residents.

Table 7.3. Recommendations for CBT development at case study villages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Themes regarding recommendations for CBT development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ta Van</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ban Ho</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ta Phin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-cultural</td>
<td>• Preservation of traditional culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• A community site to play sport with tourists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Revitalisation of craft skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Restriction of non-residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Strict regulations for street sellers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Information for tour operators and tourists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
<td>• Increase in prices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Increase in prices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Equal opportunities in selling products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Increase in prices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Benefit sharing from ticket</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Tourist distribution mechanism to homestay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Restoration of natural environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Mitigation of negative impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• of the construction of hydropower station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental</td>
<td>• Forest protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Clean village road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• A market site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• English training class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Improvement of inter-village roads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructural</td>
<td>• Develop a market site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Prevent new power stations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• A light system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• A market site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• English training class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product development</td>
<td>• Tailor made products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Regular cultural shows</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• An information centre and village showroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisational &amp; Political</td>
<td>• Restructure of management board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Management of community fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Restructure of management board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Selection of a competent leader</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• A management team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Support from international organisations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is apparent from the findings that all three villages share some similar recommendations, namely preservation and promotion of traditional culture, the increase in prices of services, environmental protection, development of a market site, product development (e.g. cultural shows, local souvenirs), and the restructure of the management board with more competent leaders.

There are, however, some differences among the villages with regard to the level of importance and the list of negative factors identified. Firstly, Ta Van villagers prioritised the increase in prices and their arrangement of food for tourists (economic
aspect), whilst the restoration of the natural environment (environmental aspect) and strict regulations for street sellers (socio-cultural aspect) were crucial for Ban Ho and Ta Phin respectively. Secondly, environmental protection and the development of a market site were important suggestions for both Ta Van and Ban Ho villagers, but neither suggestion was mentioned by the people of Ta Phin. Thirdly, though all villages referred to the management board as a representative body, expectations were different. For example, Ta Phin villagers hoped to establish a management board, whilst Ta Van villagers were more urgent about the need for a restructure, and Ban Ho people focused more on the selection of an effective leader.

7.4. Summary

This chapter has described the factors that influence the performance of CBT from the perspectives of the villagers at Ta Van, Ban Ho and Ta Phin as per Research Objective 3. These factors can be divided into socio-cultural, economic, environmental, infrastructural, organisational and political, and spatial categories. The major finding shows that the majority of villagers perceived traditional cultures, beautiful scenery, good infrastructure (road and trekking routes), and proximity to Sa Pa as the main positive factors, while cultural modification, unattended trekking routes, lack of leadership, and the limited length of stay for visitors are the major negative factors. Certain positive and negative factors are perceived to be fluctuating and changing over time. Differences are apparent among the villages. Firstly, “house architecture” is perceived as an important socio-cultural factor in Ban Ho, while “traditional costume” is a principal factor in other villages. Secondly, respondents considered that there was an effective CBT management board in Ta Van and Ban Ho, but that no official organisation existed in Ta Phin. Thirdly, Ban Ho preferred to receive domestic tourists while Ta Van and Ta Phin villages aimed to attract international tourists. Fourthly, both children and adults were identified as aggressive vendors in Ta Phin while this situation was referenced only to children, but not as a critical theme, in the other two villages. Finally, environmental degradation was an important theme in Ban Ho but of less concern in the other villages.

With regard to the suggestions from local residents for improving the benefit of CBT to the “development”, as per Objective 5, the recommendations are diverse and
grouped into socio-cultural, economic, environmental, infrastructural, product development, and organisational and political categories. The major finding shows that the recommendations mainly came from a small number of villagers who are either senior or business-minded villagers (elite), directly involved in tourism business at the attendant villages. Though there are some very important similarities, the proposed recommendations are specifically relevant to addressing the identified negative factors at each village. Chapter 8 will discuss the findings and implications of the Chapter 6 and 7 results in relation to the relevant literature and research questions.
CHAPTER 8
DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

8.1. Introduction

The general patterns of the study are discussed in this chapter with reference to the pertinent literature, and in particular the development of an optimum CBT model for the peripheral/semi-peripheral interface areas within the context of Viet Nam and similar settings. The chapter consists of two sections. The results of the study with respect to the literature are discussed in the first section (8.2); in particular, Objectives 1 to 4 and the attendant Research Questions 1c to 4c (Sub-sections 8.2.1 to 8.2.5) are addressed. This discussion is followed by a discussion of differences based on ethnic groups, gender, age, and involvement in tourism (Sub-section 8.2.6). Finally, the CBT patterns for periphery/semi-periphery interface areas within the context of Viet Nam [Objective 5] are discussed. The theoretical contributions (8.3.1) and practical implications (8.3.2) are identified in the concluding section (8.3) of the study. Finally, an acknowledgement of the applicable limitations of the study (8.3.3) and subsequent research priorities (8.3.4) is provided.

8.2. Discussion of the Study Results

The main findings from this research that includes the sampled residents’ perspectives compared with the findings in the existing literature are discussed in this section. The discussion is focused on the first four research objectives and the attendant research questions, namely, (1) the perception of development; (2) the role of CBT; (3) the factors influencing the performance of CBT, and (4) the recommendations that derive from these perceptions. This procedure is followed by the discussion of the relevant socio-demographic variables that differentiate the sample responses. Based on these findings, a CBT model for periphery/semi-periphery interface areas is proposed [Objective 5], and its implications for development are considered.
8.2.1. Perceptions of development [Objective 1].

A major innovation of this study is the solicitation of information from residents as to how development should be defined. In prior research, this definition is either assumed, or accepted only from the perspective of experts from academia, government, or NGOs who may bring into play their own vested interests. This situation exists despite the commonly held assertion that local residents are the stakeholder group most affected by the consequences of various development-related initiatives, and accordingly deserve to have a privileged position in the decision-making process. The results of this study indicate that development as perceived by residents is a complex and multi-dimensional construct, consisting of interrelated economic, socio-cultural and environmental aspects. Almost two-thirds of those sampled associated development with two or more of these aspects (see Figure 8.1).

![Diagram](image)

**Figure 8.1. Combined perception of development [not to scale].**

Although it is notable that the economic component was still the most important for the residents within this multi-dimensional framework, this finding corroborates the ideas of Elkington (1994) and Slaper and Hall (2011) with regard to a triple bottom line of sustainable development that goes beyond the conventional econometric indicators only, to also include environmental and social dimensions. Furthermore, this outcome is broadly consistent with previous research which has equated development with not only economic growth as the representation of modernisation
(McGranahan, 1970; Rostow, 1959) but also non-economic factors related to tangible as well as intangible wellbeing and quality of life (Myrdal, 1974; UNDP, 1990). The residents’ perceptions clearly indicate the important role of socio-cultural aspects in development such as community solidarity, social interaction, connectivity, and cultural viability. Notably, the latter are not explicitly included in the MDGs of the United Nations or in the definition of development proffered by international organisations such as the UNDP that considers only the more basic elements of material human development aspects, or of the World Bank that mainly refers to economic growth, albeit increasingly within the “green” context of environmental stewardship.

The findings also support the idea that while development as defined by international organisations is generic and applicable to all people, the local perceptions of development were not homogeneous and were strongly associated with immediate social and environmental concerns relevant to the specific circumstances and needs of each community, and specific groups within these communities. Economic aspects – and particularly income growth – were perceived as the core element of development and the means for achieving socio-cultural expectations (e.g. education, better housing, and the environment) in Ta Van and Ta Phin. In contrast, Ban Ho residents who were sampled primarily perceived development in close association with environmental recovery, as the community was suffering from the deleterious effects of landslides, erosion, explosions and other negative impacts associated with the construction of hydro-power stations. An environmental dimension was also evident in Ta Phin but this was conceived entirely in terms of the desirability of good hygiene.

The “weight” of each dimension also varies. For instance, residents in Ta Van and Ta Phin cited opportunities for interacting with the outside world as an important socio-cultural parameter of development, while for residents of Ban Ho and Ta Phin, retention of traditional craft skills was cited as a secondary indicator of development. These differences relate in part to proximity to the semi-periphery and especially to the town of Sa Pa; Ta Van is closest (8km), then Ta Phin (12km) and finally Ban Ho (25 km). Residents of the nearby villages (Ta Van and Ta Phin) who are more exposed to outsiders such as tourists value interaction with the latter. This evidence
is consistent with those of other studies (Besculides, Lee, & McCormick, 2002; Faulkner & Tideswell, 1997; Klein, Osleeb, & Viola, 2004; Mason & Cheyne, 2000; Weaver, 2000), and suggests that although the existing development measurements reflect holistic quality of life aspirations, they are adapted to the needs of particular locations and local experiences. In the context of the semi-periphery/periphery interface, it can be assumed that as communities develop more interaction with modernity (brought in by tourism), and consequently become economically more well off, the residents appreciate interaction with the outside world but concurrently have increasing motivation to retain or regain a clean environment and to protect traditional culture, and have both the willingness and financial ability to contribute to this outcome. One implication is that elements of “tradition” typically associated with the periphery, such as traditional culture, strong community bonds, and a clean environment, are well accepted as part of a holistic development equation; clearly, residents want material prosperity and at the same time, value the retention of traditional social, cultural, and environmental qualities.

8.2.2. Role of CBT in facilitating development [Objective 2].

The results of the study showed that according to the residents sampled, the role CBT has played in facilitating development is also complex and multi-dimensional, but ultimately positive. This complexity was apparent and distinct in economic, socio-cultural and environmental aspects (see Figure 8.2). The attainment of development was strongly associated with the introduction of tourism, in particular CBT, where income was generated from the increase in the number of tourist arrivals; well-being was enhanced through connectivity with tourists; education was made more accessible; traditional craft skills were revived; and a greener environment was facilitated. It is of note that the top section of Figure 8.2 (above CBT) indicates the space that lends credence to the advocacy platform from the tourism perspective, while the lower part supports the cautionary platform. It is apparent that the relative weightings lend greater support to the advocacy platform. This outcome corroborates the findings of a great deal of the previous work in this field that tourism is a viable tool for development (Jafari, 1990; Mathieson & Wall, 1982; Moscardo, 2009; Weaver & Lawton, 2014) wherein the benefits appear ultimately to outweigh the associated costs. This finding supports and legitimises contemporary efforts by
various agencies and NGOs to advocate tourism, and CBT in particular, as a stable long-term facilitator of development in less developed countries and regions, including those at the periphery/semi-periphery interface.

This idea of an implicit cost-benefit analysis is evident in the responses. In all three villages, a majority of participants perceived that in generating greater income and more jobs, and increasing the demand for a better environment, the role of the CBT outweighed its role as a generator of negative impacts. In particular, although there are recognised negative economic impacts from CBT (e.g. price competition, non-transparent fund management, land speculation, inflation, dependence on tourism, and competition on selling) and socio-cultural concerns (e.g. non-resident competitors, community conflict, street selling), CBT overall was seen to positively contribute to achieving development through better income, more tourism-related jobs, social connectivity to tourists, restoration and development of craft skills, and
demand for a better environment. The strongly positive support for tourism that was subsequently expressed corroborates the social exchange dynamics that are recognised in the literature to underlie resident perceptions of tourism in a wide variety of destinations (Andereck, Valentine, Knopf, & Vogt, 2005; Andriotsis, 2005; Ap, 1992; Choi & Murray, 2010; Jurowski, Uysal, & Williams, 1997; Perdue, Long, & Allen, 1987; Pfister & Wang, 2008; H. L. Pham & Kayat, 2011; Weaver & Lawton, 2013).

Surprisingly, none of the residents cited any negative environmental impact from CBT. This omission is interesting given that much of the research on the effects of tourism, and especially that undertaken in similar trekking regions, emphasises the direct and indirect generation of litter and other wastes as a major negative impact and source of resident annoyance (Kontogeorgopoulos, 2005; Nyaupane et al., 2006). This lack of concern may be explained by the short trekking distances (max. 25 km) and by the dual use of the trekking routes as village walks so that they are not isolated as in Annapurna and other trekking regions of Nepal and northern Thailand. As such, they are regularly maintained and taken care of by local villagers. In addition, it may be that the number of tourists using these trekking routes is still within their carrying capacity, though no relevant statistics are available. However, this author has observed the deteriorating quality of certain unattended trekking routes, and foresees that environmental impacts will be a problem if no effective intervention is taken.

The findings show differences between the villages about the economic role of CBT. In Ban Ho the role was more associated with the increase in domestic tourists while international tourists dominated in Ta Van and Ta Phin. This variation indicates that domestic markets are becoming more important as Vietnamese tourists become more prosperous and amenable to travel (Bui & Jolliffe, 2011), contrary to the stereotype of wealthy international visitors as the typical CBT customer. Finally, street selling was of great concern to local residents in Ban Ho and Ta Phin, but not to those in Ta Van (see Section 8.2.5). That street selling is not perceived as a problem for the residents of Ta Van may be explained by the perception that there are plenty of tourists available to meet the needs of all vendors, and hence minimal competition for business.
8.2.3. Factors influencing CBT [Objective 3].

Positive as well as negative factors that respectively facilitate or impede the success of CBT locally were revealed by the residents of the relevant communities. To facilitate analysis, the identified factors are grouped into socio-cultural, economic, environmental, infrastructural, organisational and political, and spatial categories (see Figure 8.3). Factors implicitly or explicitly related to the contrasting influences of core (through the semi-periphery) and periphery per se were invoked, with the majority of villagers perceiving traditional cultures (i.e. an ideal type characteristic of the periphery), beautiful scenery (periphery), good infrastructure i.e. road and trekking routes (core), and proximity to Sa Pa (core) as the main positive factors. Cultural modification (core), unattended trekking routes (periphery), lack of leadership (core, i.e. erosion of traditional hierarchies), and the limited length of stay of visitors (core, i.e. focus on excursionists because of proximity to Sa Pa) are the major negative factors.

Certain positive and negative factors are perceived to be fluctuating and changing over time. The positive changes mainly relate to traditional culture as more local villagers feel proud to wear their impressive traditional costumes when welcoming tourists (see Section 7.2.3.1), while embroidery skills have been revitalised due to the high demand from tourists. Meanwhile, the evolving negative changes include the modified architecture, the construction of non-traditional houses, land speculation, aggressive street selling adults, and the lack of leadership due to the erosion of traditional control structures by modernity and tourism/CBT development.

The factors that influence the success of CBT also vary between and within the communities (see Section 8.2.5). From a positive perspective, traditional costumes are identified as the main socio-cultural sub-theme, representing traditional culture as an asset in both Ta Van and Ta Phin, while house architecture is the main manifestation in Ban Ho.
Economically, Ta Phin is different from other villages in terms of its strong culture of self-investment. Environmentally, each village has its own strengths. Ta Van has a splendid rice terrace, Ban Ho is known for its waterfalls and hot springs, while Ta Phin is famous for its interesting and accessible caves. These variations reveal different attributes for “sense of place”. Both Ta Van and Ban Ho had a CBT management board that played an important role in managing and promoting tourism with the use of organisational and political facilitators, while Ta Phin did not. It is interesting to note, however, that Ta Phin commune is currently formulating a management board to manage the operation of CBT. It is critical to note that external agencies have been involved in all three communes (though currently only in Ta Phin), but that no mention was made by residents that they are causing any problems such as the ones that Butcher (2007) noted, regarding the dependency of CBT communities on outside organisations or the imposition of favoured ideological agendas. It is interesting to note that Ban Ho’s villagers expect to benefit from mainly domestic tourists while international tourists are cited by residents of Ta Van and Ban Ho.
From a negative perspective, Ta Phin’s villagers perceived aggressive vendors, including both children and adults, as the main socio-cultural hindrance, while residents in Ta Van and Ban Ho referred only to street selling children, who were not seen as a comparably critical issue. This situation is similar to one that occurred in the Mexican CBT destination of San Juan Chamula (Chiapas state), where “sellers aggressively approached tourists, covering them in textiles to promote sales” (van den Berghe, 1992, p. 245). Economically, price competition and land speculation are the main themes in Ta Van whilst over-dependence on tourism pertained to Ban Ho (during 2007-2009), and competition in selling products between street vendors and homestay owners was relevant to Ta Phin. The physical degradation of the environment noted by Ban Ho residents was of less concern in the other two villages where there has been no construction projects of similar magnitude and effect.

Some of the above findings highlighted in bold text (Figure 8.3) are consistent with Hatton (1999); Hausler (2008); SNV (2007a), and (D. Weaver, 2008) who found reinvestment in unique tourism resources (This current study refers to traditional culture and beautiful and unspoiled scenery), strong capacity (The current study refers to technical assistance) community commitment, support of local authorities, and proximity, as the characteristics of a successful CBT (see Section 2.3.2.4 and Section 3.3.3.2). However, the findings expand the facilitating factors further to include socio-cultural aspects (e.g. hospitality and friendliness, and a clean and neat life style); economic aspects (e.g. external support); infrastructure (e.g. good road conditions and interesting trekking routes); organisational and political aspects (e.g. CBT management board); and spatial aspects (e.g. a hub and connecting point). In contrast to earlier findings, no evidence of support for market linkages and good marketing were detected. A possible explanation for this may be that markets are readily available due to the proximity to Sa Pa town, whereas most of the literature pertains to remote CBT locations deep in the periphery areas where such links are vital for attracting visitors.

This study produced results that are generally in agreement with a growing body of literature that acknowledges a negative side of CBT (see Section 2.3.2.5 and Section 3.3.2.3). However, the list of negative factors identified varies among the case studies. One emerging negative factor that particularly related to this study is
aggressive vendors who undermine the expectation of friendly local people and can foster a negative destination image (see Section 8.3.2).

**8.2.4. Recommendations for achieving optimal development [Objective 4].**

Another innovative aspect of this research is the solicitation of perceived solutions or prescriptions from the residents who are arguably in the best position to make such suggestions because of their personal integration into the target destinations. In this study, the recommendations are diverse and categorised into six categories, namely socio-cultural, economic, environmental, infrastructural, product development, and organisational and political (Table 8.1). Not surprisingly, most of the recommendations arise directly from two previous questions, the role of tourism in facilitating local development, and the factors facilitating or inhibiting tourism development. The major finding shows that the recommendations came mainly from a small number of villagers who are either senior or business-minded (members of the local elite), and directly involved in tourism businesses in their villages. It is understood that they have more information about improving their village because of their positions of power, but it is also customary for other villagers to defer to their leaders, who thus have the social sanction and confidence to make recommendations. Interestingly, although all residents are implicitly supportive of higher tourist numbers, this support is not directly reflected in the recommendations. However, it is clearly implied and stated in other comments.

Though there are some very important similarities, namely preservation and promotion of traditional culture, the increase in prices of services, environmental protection, development of a market site, and product development (e.g. cultural shows, local souvenirs), and the restructure of the management board with a competent leader, the proposed recommendations are specifically relevant for addressing the identified negative factors at each village. First, Ta Van villagers prioritised an increase in prices and their arrangement of food for tourists (economic aspect), while the restoration of natural environment (environmental aspect), and strict regulations for street sellers (socio-cultural aspect) were crucial for Ban Ho and Ta Phin. Second, environmental protection and the development of a market site were important to both Ta Van and Ban Ho but not Ta Phin. Finally, all villagers
referred to the management board as a representative body, and expectations were idiosyncratic, with Ta Phin residents hoping to establish a management board, Ta Van residents citing the urgent need of a restructuring, and Ban Ho residents more focused on the selection of an effective leader.

Table 8.1. Local recommendations for optimal CBT development.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Socio-cultural</strong></td>
<td>· Preservation of traditional culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Revitalisation of craft skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Restriction of non-residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· A community site to play sport with tourists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Strict regulations for street sellers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Information for tour operators and tourists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic</strong></td>
<td>· Increase in prices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Arrange foods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Benefit sharing from ticket</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Tourist distribution mechanism to homestay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Equal opportunities in selling products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Environmental</strong></td>
<td>· Forest protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Clean village road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Restoration of natural environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Mitigation of negative impacts of the construction of hydropower station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Infrastructure</strong></td>
<td>· Develop a market site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Prevent new power stations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· A light system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· English training class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Improvement of inter-village roads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Product development</strong></td>
<td>· Giay’s ethnic souvenir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Periodical cultural shows</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Brochure and leaflet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Tailor made products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Regular cultural shows</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· An information centre and village showroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organisational &amp; Political</strong></td>
<td>· Restructure of management board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Management of community fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Selection of a competent leader</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>· Support from international organisations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is of note that most recommendations for CBT development in the literature come from experts and often do not take into account the “voices” of local residents (Butcher, 2007, 2010). Therefore, the grassroots approach adopted to examine the
local recommendations provides an improved and more resident-responsive empirical framework for understanding the residents who are affected and their associated needs and preferences.

8.2.5. Socio-demographic perspective.

Differences among the three villages have been identified, but it is equally germane to consider variations in perception based on broader socio-demographic factors that cut across the case study communes. The findings from the study accordingly corroborate the previous findings on tourism (Andriotis, 2005; J. Williams & Lawson, 2001) and community-based tourism (Nunkoo & Ramkissoon, 2011; H. L. Pham & Kayat, 2011) that socio-demographic characteristics of local residents influence their perceptions. Specifically, differences were discerned with respect to ethnicity, gender, age, and involvement in tourism, but not education levels, marital status, place of birth, or length of residency. The lack of discernment about education may be due to the fact that there were only three residents interviewed (two in Ta Van and one in Ban Ho), who have a diploma while all the rest lacked formal education qualifications.

8.2.5.1. Ethnicity.

There are differences in perception of development (see Section 8.2.1) and the CBT’s role (see Section 8.2.2) based on ethnicity. Traditional craft skills are considered to be an important tourism asset for the ethnic Dao residents of Ta Phin. This consideration derives from the skills that Dao people have in weaving embroidery and brocade. All Dao females must learn how to weave when they are children and they have to weave their own clothes, blankets linen, and pillows before getting married. Consequently, it is of note that only Dao women (Ta Phin) and Hmong women sell souvenirs on the street while Giay (Ta Van) or Tay people (Ban Ho) do not do so, explaining that they feel ashamed to sell products made by anyone other than themselves. Additionally, the traditional Dao culture of nature preservation has kept their forest protected. The Dao consider the forest to be a crucial and holy place providing medicinal herbs and foods. They believe that each tree or stream has a spirit. Therefore, the proximate natural environment is well preserved. The strong culture of the Dao is also represented by their wearing of
traditional dress at all times while the Giay [Ta Van] and the Tay (Ban Ho) only wear costumes during festivals or when tourists visit their house. From observation, it may be that residents in Ta Van and Ban Ho might have been at least partially acculturated into the dominant Kinh lifestyle in terms of their attitude to costumes.

These differences can be better contextualised by situating each village within the stages of Weaver’s (2009) model of indigenous tourism. With the diffusion of transportation networks into peripheral areas and the mass exposure of the dominant society (both domestic and international) to versions of indigenous culture (p. 49), the case studies of the CBT development at Ta Phin and Ta Van indicate the incipient stage 4 of indigenous empowerment (in situ exhibitionism and exploitation). Here, traditional cultural performances, displays of loom and embroidery products, and the indigenous villagers themselves in traditional costumes, occur at venues within areas where the indigenous people reside. It is noted in corroboration that some homestays in these communes were managed and operated by non-indigenous residents. Meanwhile the ethnic people at Ban Ho are at Stage 5 (in situ quasi-empowerment) as the villagers have the potential for greater empowerment to control tourism within indigenous areas, already restricting homestay operations by non-indigenous residents.

8.2.5.2. Gender.

The males and females interviewed were equally inclined to perceive tourism as a development opportunity, but it seems that women are more likely to perceive personal economic and socio-cultural benefits. Women were observed as taking on more of the workload to serve the increasing demands of tourists, including cooking, cleaning, and weaving. However, the time flexibility resulting in a less hardworking environment in comparison to farming) and most importantly, the considerable monetary compensation, collectively serve to empower their role in the family and community, and stimulate a positive attitude toward tourism. The usual role of men as breadwinners with women being responsible for housework, child care, and some farming is changing as females earn more from tourism and play crucial roles in serving tourists:
[I am] busier but happier when tourists stay in my house [smiling]. Tourism helps revitalise the traditional culture of embroidery weaving. Now, I can sell brocades, have more money to buy what I like, and do not have to get up early to do farming as usual. I wish more tourists visit us and stay longer. (Informant 43, female, Dao, 37, homestay owner and Head of women union)

This outcome echoes the findings of Buzinde, Kalavar, and Melubo (2014); Scheyvens (2002); UN (2011) who noted the increasing empowerment of women through tourism, and tourism’s role in providing a wide range of income-generating opportunities for women, particularly in developing regions. This observation substantiates findings from L. Tran and Walter (2014) on ecotourism, gender, and development in northern Viet Nam that similarly revealed a more equitable division of labour, increased income and self-confidence, community involvement, and new leadership roles for women through increased engagement with tourism.

8.2.5.3. Age.

The findings of this study are consistent with H. L. Pham and Kayat (2011) who contended that the younger the residents, the more positive their perceptions of tourism. It is likely that the young are more knowledgeable about tourism and markets due to their greater exposure to the outside world through the Internet and the opportunities they have to travel to places outside their village. Through such exposure, they actively explore and establish contacts with tourist guides, hotels, and tour operators in Sa Pa and Ha Noi while older residents often seem to passively wait for tourists to arrive and, being more rigid in their thinking, appear less able to adapt to the changes when tourist arrivals decline. Interestingly, the older residents are more committed to environmental values while the younger ones consider economic values as the primary core of development. It may be explained from the perspective of their place-specific engagement (Panelli & Tipa, 2007) with nature or the harmonious relationships they value between humans and nature (Menchu, 2007). It is also noted that in comparison to their elders, the younger people are more tolerant and adaptable to modernity (changes). Notably, some younger respondents considered cultural modification as a positive indicator of development.
8.2.5.4. **Involvement in tourism.**

Involvement in tourism is strongly associated with supportive attitudes toward CBT, with social exchange theory contending that individuals so invested are more likely to perceive tourism positively overall. It is therefore not unexpected that the residents who were more engaged with tourism and tourists are more positively inclined toward tourism and expressed more positive attitudes. Homestay owners, for example, are more supportive than farmers:

Since tourist arrived, our quality of life has changed remarkably. My house is upgraded [to accommodate tourists]; a better source of income, three times higher than agriculture; village roads are cemented, more shops are opened etc. (Informant 2, male, Giay, 63, homestay owner)

CBT management boards intended to facilitate involvement, however, did not function well in either Ban Ho or Ta Van. The reason is partially due to poor leadership skills. However, further exploration reveals that the heads of the boards were officially appointed by the local authorities after ‘consultation’ with its local members. This position is often held by the head of commune. Therefore, from the perspective of power relations, it is evident that decisions are made from a top-down perspective rather than the participatory bottom-up approach advocated by CBT. Consequently, local residents are not empowered to raise their voices while the ‘selected’ heads of the boards do not always have the wisdom and capability to manage CBT effectively. This external expression of power supports the statement of Sofield (2003) that “empowerment of indigenous communities cannot be ‘taken’ by the communities concerned drawing only upon their own traditional resources but will require support and sanction by the state, if it is to avoid being short-lived” (p.114). In principle, this indicates an acceptable (and unavoidable) paradox of CBT development in countries with a central planning system like Viet Nam where, unlike social representation theory, decisions do not reflect a socially collective consensus based on power negotiations among stakeholders. In practice, this problem could be largely resolved if appointments were merit-based.
8.2.6. CBT patterns for periphery/semi-periphery interface [Objective 5].

The three case studies are all located in the interface area between Viet Nam’s northern periphery and the semi-periphery, and hence it is not surprising that the dynamics of core and periphery are implicated in all four of the research questions examined thus far. Critically, this relationship is not a simple one-way street as assumed in modern development discourses that see the influences of modernity diffuse inexorably and rapidly from the core to the periphery, with the interface gradually shifting as the semi-periphery expands into the core. More specifically, from a tourism perspective, it is mass tourism that is assumed to displace the alternative tourism-related CBT as the periphery recedes, as per the tourism area life cycle dynamics described by Butler (1980) (Figure 8.4).

![Diagram of CBT patterns for periphery/semi-periphery interface]

**Figure 8.4. Conventional diffusion perspective.**

The only area of dispute has been whether this diffusion is fundamentally positive, as argued by the modernisation theorists, or negative, as posited by the dependency theorists who see the periphery as an outcome of this “underdevelopment” process (see Chapter 2). The results of this research, in contrast, imply reciprocity where positive as well as negative influences flow back and forth between core and periphery, and the interface becomes more static.

8.2.6.1. Community-based mass tourism.

Where convention perceives a one-way expansion of the core into the periphery via the semi-periphery, this research suggests there is a “push-back” effect from the periphery that modifies the mass tourism that might otherwise overwhelm the latter,
mostly in negative ways. Proximity to the gateway town of Sa Pa dictates that nearby villages are more likely to become mass tourism-dominated “hyper-destinations” that display exaggerated tourist-to-resident ratios (Weaver, 2005a). Distance-decay relationships are especially evident in the 51:1 ratio exhibited by Ta Van, the commune closest to Sa Pa. An associated and equally expected dynamic is that the great majority of visitors in each case consist of day-only excursionists, as in the rural-urban fringes of advanced economies that have hitherto dominated the hyper-destination literature (Getz, 1994; Weaver & Lawton, 2001). In contrast, the CBT literature is strongly invested in the primacy of overnight accommodation as a critical source of revenue and a dominant type of tourism-related infrastructure, catering to a relatively small number of visitors who tend to stay for at least several days (Beeton, 2006; Hatton, 1999; Kontogeorgopulos, 2005), as per the ideal of alternative tourism (Butler, 1992; Dernoi, 1981; Weaver, 1995, 2005b).

Proximity to a major semi-peripheral gateway therefore seemingly distorts and subverts such assumptions, and leads to speculation that the type of tourism encountered in this interface is better described as community-based mass tourism (CBMT), based on the assumption that community-based tourism and mass tourism can synergistically co-exist in such settings. Critically, it is apparent that residents perceive development as having concurrent characteristics of both core and periphery. Thus, residents associate development with a higher income, better and more modern roads and houses, education, and other attributes clearly associated with the core. Such positive impacts are associated with tourism, and larger tourist numbers therefore are desired. Concurrently, however, villagers want to retain the traditional culture, community cohesion, and a pristine environment; qualities that are readily associated with the ideal periphery. It is further apparent that residents implicitly or explicitly negotiate the relationship between core and periphery to try to obtain the best outcomes from each. For example, they see tourism as a vehicle for retaining and restoring interest in traditional crafts and clothing (vestiges of the periphery), with mass tourism (an innovation of the core) providing the impetus to generate sufficient demand for and income from such products.

Such negotiations indicate implicit resolution-based dialectical processes (Weaver, 2014) where the periphery can for analytical purposes be positioned as the pre-
existing “thesis” and the core (through the semi-periphery) as the “antithesis” that acts as a counterpoint to this thesis and constructively challenges the latter. The interface, ideally, becomes a relatively stable “synthesis” where the best aspects of core and periphery are retained and the worst aspects discarded or avoided (Figure 8.5).

![Diagram showing the relationship between periphery, interface, and semi-periphery with CBT, CBMT, and mass tourism labeled within]

Figure 8.5. Community-based mass tourism perspective.

Residents, it is argued here, pursue such dynamics unselfconsciously, but they might be more explicitly incorporated into strategic tourism planning by relevant managers and planners. Weaver (2014) argued that mass tourism, because of its size and widespread acceptance by tourism stakeholders, always dominates such syntheses and makes a valuable contribution through its economies of scale and innovation-spawning competitiveness, but that the ethically-informed input of alternative tourism is critical for avoiding the negative effects described by Butler (1980) in his destination life cycle model. The end result, or successful synthesis, is what Weaver (2014) described as “enlightened mass tourism”. It is ventured here that CBMT, as revealed in emergent form in this Vietnamese context, is a variation of this concept. A similar dialectical balancing is evident in Kim Yujeong Literary Village in rural South Korea, where tourists outnumber locals by a factor approaching 1,500 to one over the course of a year, yet residents are strongly supportive of the tourism industry and appear well adjusted to the sector and empowered accordingly (Lee & Weaver, 2014).
The enlightened mass tourism synthesis embodied by CBMT, however, is not inevitable or a foregone conclusion, given the dangers posed by the detrimental effects that both core and periphery currently and potentially can bring into the equation. The marketing of traditional crafts and clothing to mass tourists, for example, can lead to commodification effects that undermine their “authenticity” (Aicken & Ryan, 2005; Mosedale, 2006; Ryan & Aicken, 2005). The town of Sa Pa, to give another example, is an increasingly important facet of the village space-economy through its positive role as an accessible source of retail goods and services. Concurrently, it is the primary conduit for the tourists who provide a growing proportion of the income that represents tangible development to these residents. Sa Pa, however, also provides a large amount of high quality and reasonably priced accommodation, thereby limiting the opportunities for villagers to earn additional income by supplying these same services. Residents, and especially those involved directly in tourism, appear to recognise both the costs and benefits of such dynamics, and implicitly or explicitly negotiate these as per social exchange theory (Ap, 1992; Pfister & Wang, 2008; Weaver & Lawton, 2013).

The apparent tensions between tradition and modernity revealed in this periphery/semi-periphery interface certainly also exist in pure periphery contexts, but seem to be exaggerated and exacerbated by proximity to regional urban gateways and transportation corridors. In theory, the resultant creation of hyper-destinations within a short period of time should be generating an array of economic, socio-cultural, and environmental problems in tandem with the positioning of these three villages in stages of the destination life cycle that indicate the breeching of local carrying capacities (Butler, 1980). Yet, contrary to expectations, and like Kim Yujeong Literary Village in Korea, these villagers appear to be very happy with their local tourism activity and welcome interaction with tourists. However, this does not render them oblivious to or unconcerned about the attendant problems that vary according to the unique circumstances of each village.

Without subverting their own voices, it is ventured by the author that CBMT is viable because villagers make sophisticated if implicit assessments of costs and benefits from tourism, and have determined in the main that the latter outweigh the former and have the potential to do so even as visitor numbers accelerate.
Optimisation and adjustment characterise these assessments, as for example in the
desire to increase income and education while concurrently preserving traditional
culture and protecting the natural environment. In so doing, tradition and modernity
are regarded not as irreconcilable, but as complementary if seemingly contradictory
impulses that together can contribute to enhanced quality of life. This position
corroborates Turner (2011) who emphasises the resilience, confidence and
adaptability of indigenous people. Such apparent contradictions are also typical of
the resolution-based dialectical approach (Weaver, 2014). In Viet Nam and
elsewhere, being on the periphery/semi-periphery interface may therefore be seen as
more an opportunity than a threat with regard to the potential of enlightened mass
tourism to improve the quality of life for residents in a sustainable way through
CBMT.

8.2.6.2. Toward enabling the CBMT model.
The purpose of this study was to investigate the relationship between the CBT and
development from the community’s point of view. By analysing the local residents’
perceptions toward development and the factors that influence the extent to which
CBT contributes to achieving development at three communities, the study suggests
an optimum CBMT model for the periphery and semi-periphery interface areas that
can accommodate the idiosyncratic circumstances found in each relevant community.
Creswell (2013b) indicated that a model (theory) is an explanation of something or
an understanding that is a drawing together, of theoretical categories that are arrayed
to show how the model work (Strauss & Corbin, 1998; Wacker, 1998).

Following from the above discussion, it is now possible to consider how a
dialectically-informed framework for CBMT can be constructed for application to a
broader array of destinations in the periphery/semi-periphery interface. Figure 8.6
presents the CBMT model as a diagram. This model provides tourism planners and
managers with an effective grassroots-informed approach to achieve optimal local
benefits from CBMT. In essence, it contends that diverse benefits (economic, social,
environmental, etc.) derive from an affiliation with both the core (by way of the
semi-periphery) and the periphery, as listed. These respectively provide orientations
toward mass tourism and alternative tourism that can be constructively combined to
create a more effective synergy. Initially, the model suggests the need for measures to retain (i.e. not erode) these benefits, as per the equilibrium or “status quo” model of sustainability (Weaver, 2006). Once that stability has been achieved, then strategies can be implemented to reinforce these strengths, as per the “enhancement” model of sustainability that seeks to improve on the status quo. Core and periphery, however, also entail negative effects associated with their respective internal contradictions (Weaver, 2014). The concurrent strategy is to stabilise these weaknesses (as per status quo sustainability) so that they are not made any worse, and then to gradually work to reduce and eventually eliminate the problem. The end result is a CBT variant of enlightened mass tourism, or CBMT, that continues to maximise the associated benefits while minimising the associated costs.
Figure 8.6. Community-based mass tourism model.
8.3. Conclusion

This research provides an empirical interpretation, from the perspective of local residents, of the relationship between development and tourism, in particular CBT, in the periphery/semi-periphery interface areas of Viet Nam. The study makes significant contributions to existing development theories, management, tourism, and CBT knowledge. The theoretical contributions and practical implications of the study as well as the associated limitations and directions for future research are presented in this section.

8.3.1. Theoretical contributions.

The tourism literature is replete with empirical and speculative investigations on the relationships between tourism and development, especially in economically emergent regions. This thesis follows suit in terms of the broad topic area, but contributes innovatively to the literature in advancing the current understanding of development theories with respect to the object, scope, context and outcome of enquiry, as discussed below. First, the study focuses on assessment of CBT’s performance from the perspective of local communities. Second, the study corroborates the usefulness of social representation theory and social exchange theory in explaining local residents’ perceptions of CBT. Third, the study positions the specific geographical context of the periphery/semi-periphery interface as a distinctive and increasingly relevant form of spatial organisation. Fourth, the study proposes a dialectically-informed framework of CBMT that amalgamates the best characteristics of core (through mass tourism) and periphery (through alternative tourism).

First, the study interpreted the concept of development, in relation to the performance of CBT from a local perspective. Unlike other studies that either focused on the residents’ attitudes toward tourism, or tourism impacts on local residents (Andereck et al., 2005; Diedrich & García-Buades, 2009; H. L. Pham & Kayat, 2011; Sharpley, 2014; Tosun, 2002; Weaver & Lawton, 2001; J. Williams & Lawson, 2001), this study explored the local perception of development (that is, the desired overall outcome), then investigated how CBT was perceived to contribute to achieving such development. Consequently, the understanding of the relationship has been enhanced
by the inclusion of the residents’ voice; a voice moreover that they were very confident and eager to share with the researcher. These voices situate development as a complex aspiration dominated by economic considerations but also as vital concurrent sociocultural and environmental dimensions. The findings of the study also indicate that there are variations in the way that local residents define what development is, as well as the factors facilitating or hindering CBT. Such variation depends on the specific economic, socio-cultural, and environmental circumstances, and the proximity of each community. There is no homogenous value for all as every community is different and such differences, indicating the intensive localisation of resident perception, should be taken into account in any future CBT research.

Second, the study upholds the usefulness of social exchange theory in explaining local residents’ perceptions of CBT. In all three case studies, the residents perceived CBT positively, as the exchange of resources between residents and CBT is high, and positive impacts outweigh the negative impacts. The findings of the residents’ perceptions regarding development and the role of CBT indicated that they recognise both the costs and benefits of CBT, but “negotiate” to mitigate the costs and maximise the benefits. They are strongly positive toward tourism and support its expansion even though these villages, with their “vulnerable” indigenous populations and a growing influx of visitors, should be experiencing rampant negative impacts and resident disgruntlement, according to the supporters of the cautionary platform. Therefore, even in such “fragile” settings, the case for the pro-mass tourism advocacy platform is compelling, because residents are confident about their ability to realise benefits and avoid or manage related costs.

Third, the study positions the specific geographical context of periphery/semi-periphery interface as a distinctive and relevant form of spatial organisation. The findings emphasise that the primary flow or dynamic within the interface is not the one-way dissemination of modernity from the semi-periphery to periphery areas as argued by the modernisation and dependency theorists, but also includes the “push back” effect from the periphery in interaction with the semi-periphery, as demonstrated by the determination to maintain ethnic traditions and a wholesome clean environment. Thus, social exchange theory is manifested in the selective amalgamation of positive characteristics from both periphery and core (through the
semi-periphery). As areas of pure periphery continue to diminish and recede
worldwide, this type of interface could well become the normative spatial context for
investigating CBT destinations in future. One implication is the likely preponderance
of day-only excursionists over the traditionally assumed overnight visitors.

Fourth, the study, for the first time, has proposed a dialectically-informed framework
for CBMT that is developed based on empirical evidence that alternative tourism (the
traditional context of CBT) and mass tourism not only can co-exist but can
amalgamate, potentially creating a synergy that amplifies the best characteristics of
each. This synthesis of innovative community-based mass tourism (CBMT) provides
a useful and innovative framework for explaining and analysing the emerging
phenomenon of tourism development in the periphery/semi-periphery interface areas
and contributes to further understanding of enlightened mass tourism as a
contemporary tourism megatrend of sustainable tourism.

8.3.2. Practical implications.

The study provides a deeper and richer understanding of the relationship between
CBT and development experienced by local communities from the grassroots
approach. Building on that, the study identifies optimum CBT patterns that provide
guidance and a formative foundation for CBT development useful to the
development agencies, enterprises, host communities, and local authorities involved
with CBT initiatives in the periphery/semi-periphery interface areas.

First, the empowerment of local residents is crucial for the sustainable development
of any CBT initiative. The residents are not only the most affected beneficiary but
also a key stakeholder in ensuring the success of CBT. The universal cooperation of
the interviewed residents indicates that these stakeholders are enthusiastic about
sharing their perceptions if appropriate relationships and trust are cultivated over
time between the researcher and the researched. Additionally, the study showed some
demographic variation among communities thereby providing a basis to emphasise
local participation. The voice of elites who play a dual role as a knowledgeable
resident within a community and an officer working in local authorities should be
considered, but it must also be augmented by the voice of “ordinary” residents who also deserve to be empowered.

Second, the importance of spatial context cannot be underestimated. The dynamic characteristics of periphery/semi-periphery interface areas, where tradition meets modernity in complex, dynamic and diverse ways, should be acknowledged when implementing any tourism/CBT activities. The findings of the study propose that there is potential to accommodate modernity in order to maximise tourist experiences and generate income while preserving the traditional culture and pristine environment — the primary resources to attract tourists.

Third, the proposed CBMT pattern contributes substantially to the existing and future CBT initiatives in the periphery/semi-periphery interface areas in Viet Nam and other similar geographical areas. The facilitating and impeding factors were found to be essential variables that development agencies, the tourism industry, and local authorities should consider. Furthermore, by understanding the mechanics of the interface and the influencing factors, the newly developed concept of CBMT as a variation of the enlightened mass tourism can be accepted as a new form of sustainable tourism more relevant to the dynamics of contemporary tourism systems.

Finally, the lessons learned from the application of the grassroots approach are essential for tourism planners, managers, and policy makers in a country like Viet Nam where central planning and authoritarian leadership still prevail. The dual (dialectical) approach of the recommended grassroots and traditional top-down approaches could be negotiated to ensure sustainable development outcomes optimal for both the local residents and the good of the country as a whole.

8.3.3. Limitations.

There were a number of limitations to this study that need to be considered in terms of the study sample, the data collection sites, the study design, and the issue of trust. Firstly, with a small sample size of 55, caution must be applied, as it might be argued that the findings are not transferable to other sites, especially given the differences between the villages. Reliability therefore cannot be assured, even though there is
confidence that theoretical saturation was achieved in the results. Second, the current study has only examined Sa Pa as a regional case study and three micro case studies that might not represent the broader diversity of the periphery/semi-periphery interface. Additionally, the discarding of the Sin Chai village case study (due to limited tourist numbers) served to reduce the voice of the Hmong people who account for 52% of Sa Pa population. Third, it would have been more comprehensive to adopt a mixed-method approach wherein the findings of the qualitative interviews could be used to develop a measurement scale for a questionnaire survey. Finally, it is acknowledged that some residents might have conditioned or qualified their responses due to language and ethnicity barriers, given that the researcher is a member of the Kinh majority whereas the villagers are all members of ethnic minority groups.

8.3.4. Future research.

This study is the first to attempt to investigate the relationship between the CBT and development from the community point of view and the factors that influence the extent to which CBT contributes to achieving development in the periphery/semi-periphery interface areas of Viet Nam. As a result, the study suggests an optimum CBT model for the periphery and semi-periphery interface area. In future investigations, the research methods and framework developed in this study can be expanded and applied in other similar geographical periphery/semi-periphery interface areas. Secondly, it is suggested that further development of a measurement scale and the use of quantitative methods with a larger sample size is necessary to test the model. Finally, it would be constructive to compare perceptions of other relevant stakeholders including regional representatives of the public and private sectors as well as international and local NGOs, informal groups, and the international and domestic tourists without whom no form of tourism can exist.

8.4. Summary

This chapter has discussed the main findings of the research and contextualised these in relation the existing literature with regard to (1) the perception of development; (2) the role of CBT in facilitating development; (3) the factors influencing CBT as a
facilitator, and (4) local recommendations. Additionally, the socio-demographic perspectives have been considered. From such discussions, a CBMT framework for the periphery/semi-periphery interface area has been developed. The concluding section has discussed the theoretical and practical implications, the limitations of the study, and suggestions for future research.
REFERENCES


Centre for International Economics. (2002). Viet Nam poverty analysis prepared for Australian agencies for international development (pp. 118). Canberra, Australia: Centre for International Economics.


231


Nyaupane, G., Morais, D., & Dowler, L. (2006). The role of community involvement and number/type of visitors on tourism impacts: A controlled comparison of


SNV. (2011). Sa Pa tourism market survey for development of tourism products and services.

SNV, & TIM. (2007). *A toolkit for monitoring and managing community-based tourism.* SNV Asia Pro-Poor Sustainable Tourism Network, and SNV Viet
Nam, and School of Travel Industry Management (TIM), University of Hawaii.


UN. (2013a). Beyond the millennium development goals: The post-2015 sustainable development agenda (pp. 2). New York: the UN Department of Public Information.

UN. (2013b). Greater access to trade, medicines and technologies helps more countries close gaps to reach anti-poverty goals (pp. 3). New York: the UN Department of Public Information, the UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs and the UN Development Programme.


## APPENDIX 3.1

### MDGS AND VIETNAM DEVELOPMENT GOALS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)</th>
<th>Viet Nam Development Goals (VDGs)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universalise education and improve education quality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promote gender equality and empower women</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce birth rate, child mortality and child malnutrition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve maternal health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce HIV/AIDS infection and eradication other major diseases</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensure environmental sustainability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a global partnership for development</td>
<td>Ensure pro-poor infrastructure development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job creation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop culture and information to improve spiritual life of people; preserve culture of ethnic minority groups</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce vulnerability and develop social safety nets to support the poor and the disadvantaged</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promote further public administration reform and legal information provision for the poor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Government of Viet Nam (2005b)*

250
### APPENDIX 3.2

**VIET NAM PROGRESS TOWARD MDGS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MDGs</th>
<th>Progress</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 1. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target 1</td>
<td>Halve between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people living in poverty</td>
<td>Poverty reduced by more two thirds between 1993 and 2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target 2</td>
<td>Halve between 1990 and 2015, the proportion who suffer from hunger</td>
<td>Proportion reduced by more than two thirds between 1993 and 2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 2. Achieve universal primary education</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target 3</td>
<td>By 2012 boys and girls to complete a full course of primary schooling</td>
<td>Grade 5 completion rate (gross) is 104% for boys and 98% for girls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 3. Promote gender equality</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target 4</td>
<td>Eliminate gender gaps in primary and secondary education no later than 2015</td>
<td>Gender equality at all school levels, except for ethnic minorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 4. Reduce child mortality</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target 5</td>
<td>Reduce by two thirds between 1990 and 2015, the under-five mortality rate</td>
<td>Reduced 65% between 1990 and 2005 (down from 53% to 19% per 1000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 5. Improve maternal health</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target 6</td>
<td>Reduce maternal mortality by three quarters, between 1990 and 2015</td>
<td>Fell by two thirds, from 250 per 100,000 births in 1990 to 85 in 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 6. Combat HIV/AIDS and other diseases</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target 7</td>
<td>By 2015 have halted and begun to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS</td>
<td>Infection rate went up from 0.34% in 2001 to 0.44 in 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target 8</td>
<td>By 2015 halted and reverse the incidence of malaria and other diseases</td>
<td>Malaria cases severely reduced; with only 35 malaria-related deaths in 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 7. Ensure environmental sustainability</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target 9</td>
<td>Embrace sustainability and reverse the loss of environmental resources</td>
<td>Forest cover up but loss in closed-canopy forest and biodiversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target 10</td>
<td>Halve, by 2015 the share of people without drinking water and sanitation</td>
<td>Rapid progress on drinking water, much slower on hygienic sanitation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: World Bank 2013*
**APPENDIX 3.3**

**CBT INITIATIVES/PROJECTS IN VIETNAM (1985-2013)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>CBT villages</th>
<th>Commune, District</th>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Started</th>
<th>Ethnic groups involved</th>
<th>Agencies involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Tha</td>
<td>Phuong Do, Ha Giang Town</td>
<td>Ha Giang</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Local authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Lang Giang, Giang Thuong, Phin Ho, Nam Hong</td>
<td>Thong Nguyen, Hoang Su Phi</td>
<td>Ha Giang</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Local authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Lung Cam</td>
<td>Sung La, Dong Van</td>
<td>Ha Giang</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Lo Lo</td>
<td>Local authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Doi, Tan Lap</td>
<td>Moc Chau</td>
<td>Son La</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Thai</td>
<td>Handspand Adventure Travel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Cat Cat – Sin Chai</td>
<td>Sa Pa</td>
<td>Lao Cai</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>Hmong</td>
<td>IUCN/SNV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Ta Van</td>
<td>Sa Pa</td>
<td>Lao Cai</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>SNV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Ta Phin</td>
<td>Sa Pa</td>
<td>Lao Cai</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>CIDA, PATA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Ban Ho</td>
<td>Ban Ho, Sa Pa</td>
<td>Lao Cai</td>
<td>1990s</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>SNV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Trung Do</td>
<td>Bao Nhi, Bac Ha</td>
<td>Lao Cai</td>
<td></td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Local authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Villages</td>
<td>Nam Det and Nam Khanh, Bac Ha</td>
<td>Lao Cai</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Local authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Deu III</td>
<td>Nghia An, Nghia Lo</td>
<td>Yen Bai</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Thai</td>
<td>Local authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Pac Ngoi and Bo Lu (Ba Be NP)</td>
<td>Cho Ra</td>
<td>Bac Can</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Tay, Dao</td>
<td>Local authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Buot, Phu Mau 1 &amp; 2,</td>
<td>Chieng Yen</td>
<td>Son La</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Thai/ Muong</td>
<td>SNV/IPADE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Quynh Son</td>
<td>Quynh Son, Bac Son</td>
<td>Lang Son</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Muong</td>
<td>Local authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Ban Lac *</td>
<td>Mai Chau</td>
<td>Hoa Binh</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Thai</td>
<td>Self-regulated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Pom Coong</td>
<td>Mai Chau</td>
<td>Hoa Binh</td>
<td></td>
<td>Muong</td>
<td>Self-regulated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Giang Mo</td>
<td>Cao Phong</td>
<td>Hoa Binh</td>
<td></td>
<td>Muong</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>Mon, Mu, Ri, Thuong and Sat(Ngoc Son – Ngo Luong NR)</td>
<td>Tan Lac and Lac Son</td>
<td>Hoa Binh</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Muong</td>
<td>FPSC/AECI and FFI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Khanh (Cuc Phuong NP)</td>
<td>Cuc Phuong National Park</td>
<td>Hoa Binh</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Muong</td>
<td>FFI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Viet Hai</td>
<td>Viet Hai, Cat Ba</td>
<td>Hai Phong</td>
<td></td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>FFI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Giao Xuan (Xuan Thuy NP)</td>
<td>Giao Xuan, Xuan Thuy</td>
<td>Nam Dinh</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>MCD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>CBT villages</td>
<td>Commune, District</td>
<td>Province</td>
<td>Started</td>
<td>Ethnic groups involved</td>
<td>Agencies involved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Nam Phu (Tien Hai NR)</td>
<td>Nam Phu, Tien Hai</td>
<td>Thai Binh</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>MCD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Hon and Hin (Pu Luong NR)</td>
<td>Pu Luong, Cam Thuoc and Quan Hoa</td>
<td>Thanh Hoa</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Thai</td>
<td>FFI</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Central Viet Nam**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>CBT villages</th>
<th>Commune, District</th>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Started</th>
<th>Ethnic groups involved</th>
<th>Agencies involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Yen Thanh</td>
<td>Luc Da, Con Cuong</td>
<td>Nghe An</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Thai</td>
<td>Local authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Ngu My Thanh</td>
<td>Quang Loi, Quang Dien</td>
<td>Hue</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>UNWTO, IUCN Netherlands and CSRD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>Chay Lap</td>
<td>Phuc Trach, Bo Trach</td>
<td>Quang Binh</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>Counterpart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>Doi *</td>
<td>Thuong Lo, Nam Dong</td>
<td>Hue</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Catu</td>
<td>SNV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>Bhoong and Droong</td>
<td>Dong Giang</td>
<td>Quang Nam</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>Catu</td>
<td>Luxembourg/ILO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>My Son</td>
<td>Duy Xuyen</td>
<td>Quang Nam</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>Catu</td>
<td>Luxembourg/ILO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>Kim Bong *</td>
<td>Cam Kim, Hoi An</td>
<td>Quang Nam</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>ITC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Southern Viet Nam**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>CBT villages</th>
<th>Commune, District</th>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Started</th>
<th>Ethnic groups involved</th>
<th>Agencies involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Xuan Tu (Trao Reef Marine Reserve)</td>
<td>Van Hung, Van Ninh</td>
<td>Khanh Hoa</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>MCD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.</td>
<td>Phum Soai</td>
<td>Chau Phong, Tan Chau</td>
<td>An Giang</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Cham</td>
<td>ADB/SNV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>My Hoa Hung *</td>
<td>My Hoa Hung, Long Xuyen Town</td>
<td>An Giang</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>ADB/SNV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td>Thoi Son *</td>
<td>Thoi Son Islet</td>
<td>Tien Giang</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>Self-regulated</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Sources: Compiled from VNAT and INGOs i.e. ADB, AECI, FFI, ILO, MCD, SNV, ILO, and VNAT*

*Implementing CBT initiatives and projects in Viet Nam*
APPENDIX 4.1

PARTICIPANT INFORMATION SHEET AND CONSENT FORM

Ethical Clearance approved by Griffith University

(GU Ref. number: HSL/03/11/HREC dated 08 November 2011)
Tuan-Anh Le (Andrew)  Prof David Weaver  Associate Prof Laura Lawton
(Investigator)  (Chief Investigator)  (Senior Investigator)
Griffith University  Griffith University  Griffith University
Ph: (07) 555 27653  Ph: (07) 5552 9290  Ph: (07) 5552 8709
Email:  Email:  Email:
andrew.le@griffithuni.edu.au  d.weaver@griffith.edu.au  laura.lawton@griffith.edu.au

Project title: Community-based Tourism and Development between the Periphery Semi-periphery Interface of Viet Nam

Dear resident,

We would like to invite you to participate in a semi-structured interview lasting approximately 45 minutes. This interview will be conducted by researchers from Griffith University, Australia as a part of a PhD research project on the effectiveness of Community-based Tourism (CBT), from a residents' perspective, for achieving development in the transitional areas between the periphery and semi-periphery of Sa Pa. Questions will be posed about your perception on what is “development” and how CBT contributes to achieve that development.

Your interview will be recorded and transcribed after you sign the consent form of participation. All the tapes will be destroyed after transcription. Only research team members can access the research materials. They will not be disclosed to third parties without your consent, except to meet government, legal or other regulatory authority requirements. However, your anonymity and confidentiality will at all times be safeguarded. For further information, consult the University’s Privacy Plan at http://www.griffith.edu.au/about-griffith/plans-publications/griffith-university-privacy-plan or telephone 3735 5585.

The result achieved from this research will assist the local authorities to develop an optimal model of CBT(s) which contributes to maximising tourism benefits to your community.
There are no risks to you from participating in this research. This is an anonymous study and interviewees will not be identifiable from the data collected or the report. No identifiable personal information will be collected in the interview. Your participation in this research is voluntary. You can withdraw at any time without any comment or penalty.

If you have any further questions in relation to this research, please feel free to contact the researchers using the contact details provided above. If you are interested to receive a copy of the results of the research, please indicate this on the questionnaire and leave your email address for a brief summary report.

This research is conducted in accordance with the National Statement on Ethical Conduct in Human Research. If you have any concerns or complaints about the ethical conduct of the project, please contact the Manager, Research Ethics, Office for Research, Griffith University on 3735 5585 or research-ethics@griffith.edu.au.

Please read the attached consent form. Your signature on the consent form will signify your willingness to participate in this research. Thank you very much for your valuable time and support!

Tuan-Anh Le (Andrew)
PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM

Tuan-Anh Le (Andrew)       Prof David Weaver       Associate Prof Laura Lawton
(Investigator)             (Chief Investigator)     (Senior Investigator)
Griffith University        Griffith University        Griffith University
Ph: (07) 555 27653        Ph: (07) 5552 9290        Ph: (07) 5552 8709
Email:                     Email:                     Email:
aple@griffithuni.edu.au  d.weaver@griffith.edu.au  laura.lawton@griffith.edu.au

Project title: Community-based Tourism and Development between the Periphery/Semi-periphery Interface of Viet Nam

By signing below, I confirm that I have read and understood the information package and in particular:

- I understand that my involvement in this research will include an in-depth, semi-structured interview lasting around 45 minutes;
- I understand the risks involved (if any), and that I am free to withdraw at any time, without comment or penalty;
- I understand that there will be no direct or immediate benefits to me from participating in this research;
- I understand that my participation is voluntary, and that my responses are completely anonymous – no identifying information is required;
- I understand that if I have any additional questions I can ask Tuan Anh using the contact details provided on the information sheet, which I have retained;
- I understand that I can contact the Manager, Research Ethics at Griffith University Human Research Ethics Committee on 3735 5585 (or research-ethics@griffith.edu.au) if I have any concerns about the ethical conduct of project; and
- I agree to participate in the project.

Name       : ____________________

Signature  : ____________________ Date : ____________________
## APPENDIX 4.2

### SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW PROMPTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTERVIEW PROMPTS</th>
<th>REFLECTION/THEMES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Location:</strong></td>
<td>Time/Date:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Name:</strong></td>
<td>Gender:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age:</strong></td>
<td>Ethic group:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Role/Occupation:</strong></td>
<td>Involvement in tourism:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education:</strong></td>
<td>Phone:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROMPTS</th>
<th>REFLECTION/THEMES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. In your own personal opinion, what is ‘development’?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. How can “development”, as you personally define it, be measured?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Please describe the Community – based Tourism that occurs in your village.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. How does this CBT contribute to your defined ‘development’ of your village?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. What are the key factors that influence the success of CBT at your village?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. What are the impediments for CBT to achieve your defined “development”?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. What are your suggestions for improving the benefit of CBT to the “development” of your village?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Observation**

---

---

---

---

---
APPENDIX 6.1

INTERVIEWED PARTICIPANT PROFILE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewee</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Ethnic</th>
<th>Role in community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ta Van Case Study (22 participants, 11 males and 11 females)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 1</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Hmong</td>
<td>Commune leader, Head of CBT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 2</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 3</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>Restaurant and homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 4</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>Shop, restaurant and homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Farmer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 6</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Homestay owner, Head of village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 7</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Labourer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 8</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 9</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Farmer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 10</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 11</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 12</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 13</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 14</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 15</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>Shop owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 16</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 17</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 18</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Shop owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 19</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 20</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Homestay owner, Head of women’s union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 21</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 22</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>Giay</td>
<td>Driver</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ban Ho Case Study (16 participants, 9 males and 7 females)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 23</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Head of village</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 24</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 25</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 26</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Deputy head of CBT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 27</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 28</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Dancer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 29</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 30</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Restaurant and homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 31</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 32</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 33</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 34</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Primary school teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviewee</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Ethnic</td>
<td>Role in community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 35</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 36</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Restaurant and homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 37</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>Hmong</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 38</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Tay</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Ta Phin Case Study (17 participants, 9 males and 8 females)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewee</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Ethnic</th>
<th>Role in community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Informant 39</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Farmer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 40</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Seller</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 41</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Seller</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 42</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 43</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Homestay owner, Head of women’s union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 44</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Head of Craft Centre Development Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 45</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 46</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Restaurant, homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 47</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 48</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 49</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 50</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 51</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Villager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 52</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Head of commune</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 53</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 54</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>Kinh</td>
<td>Shop owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 55</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>Dao</td>
<td>Homestay owner</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>