

Actions to Foster Expansion of Quality Work-Based Learning

Programmes for Young People in the South Mediterranean Region

Policy Guidelines



Actions to Foster Expansion of Quality Work-Based Learning

Programmes for Young People in the South Mediterranean Region

**Policy Guidelines**

---

## UNESCO - a global leader in education

Education is UNESCO's top priority because it is a basic human right and the foundation for peace and sustainable development. UNESCO is the United Nations' specialized agency for education, providing global and regional leadership to drive progress, strengthening the resilience and capacity of national systems to serve all learners and responding to contemporary global challenges through transformative learning, with special focus on gender equality and Africa across all actions.



## The Global Education 2030 Agenda

UNESCO, as the United Nations' specialized agency for education, is entrusted to lead and coordinate the Education 2030 Agenda, which is part of a global movement to eradicate poverty through 17 Sustainable Development Goals by 2030. Education, essential to achieve all of these goals, has its own dedicated Goal 4, which aims to "ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all". The Education 2030 Framework for Action provides guidance for the implementation of this ambitious goal and commitments.



---

Published in 2021 by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization  
Regional Bureau for Education in the Arab States - Beirut  
Sports City Avenue, Bir Hassan, P. O Box 11-5244

© UNESCO 2021



This publication is available in Open Access under the Attribution-ShareAlike 3.0 IGO (CC-BY-SA 3.0 IGO) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0/igo/>). By using the content of this publication, the users accept to be bound by the terms of use of the UNESCO Open Access Repository (<http://www.unesco.org/open-access/terms-use-ccbysa-en>).

The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNESCO concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The ideas and opinions expressed in this publication are those of the authors; they are not necessarily those of UNESCO and do not commit the Organization.

Cover Photo: Eugenio Marongiu/Shutterstock.com; and illustration elements: ©UNESCO/Marie Bastille

Author: Stephen Billett, Griffith University, Australia

Designed by UNESCO Beirut

Printed in Lebanon

# Acknowledgements

These practical guidelines have been produced to inform policymakers, employers and practitioners in the Arab region, about how to design and manage actions to foster expansion of quality and effective work-based learning systems to increase youth employment.

The guidelines have been developed under the Youth Employment in the Mediterranean project (YEM) which is a three-year regional initiative launched by UNESCO and implemented in collaboration with eight Member States in the period of 2018 to 2020.

The project is funded by the European Union and aims to improve skills anticipation systems and promote technical and vocational education and training (TVET) to strengthen youth employment and encourage entrepreneurship in the Mediterranean region.

# Table of Contents

Acknowledgment	3
Introduction: Why work-based learning provisions matter?	7
Method	8
Findings: Progressing WBL Arrangements	8
Policy Recommendations	10
Policy Recommendation 1: Enact legal and institutional frameworks	10
Policy Recommendation 2: Enact localised frameworks and enablers	14
Policy Recommendation 3: Enhance the standing and status of TVET and the occupations it serves	16
Policy Recommendation 4: Develop the capacity of workplaces to provide effective learning experiences	17
Policy Recommendation 5: Recognise, embrace, and enhance the traditional model of apprenticeship	19
Policy Recommendation 6: Align TVET provisions with employment opportunities	20
Policy Recommendation 7: Build and sustain social partnerships at national, regional and local levels	21
Policy Recommendation 8: Promote localised engagement between TVET institutions and workplaces	22
Policy Recommendation 9: Implement strategies to improve TVET workforce capacity	24
Policy Recommendation 10: Support and engage with informed accounts from research and evaluation	25
WBL experiences: Actors, roles, and actions	26
References	28

# Introduction

## Why work-based learning provisions matter?

Across the globe, there is a growing interest in young people engaging in work-based learning (WBL) provisions as part of their initial occupational preparation. This interest arises, in part, from a concern that students living vocational and higher education courses are often ill-equipped to move into the world of work, because their preparation does not involve the world of work experiences, nor the particular occupations which they are being prepared to practice. However, another reason is that there is a growing realisation importance and specific contributions arise for the learning of occupational practices from having extensive experiences in workplaces and engaging in activities associated with the occupations for which they are being prepared.

The UNESCO 2015 Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) encourages Member states that they should consider establishing or strengthening governance models for TVET institutions involving relevant local stakeholders and cooperating, when relevant, with business associations in supporting WBL. In its various forms, WBL includes in-service training, attachments, apprenticeships and internships, should be promoted. The quality of work-based learning should be enhanced and, when relevant, be complemented by institution-based or other forms of learning.

TVET, as part of lifelong learning, can take place at secondary, post-secondary and tertiary levels and includes work-based learning and continuing training and professional development leading to qualifications. TVET also includes a wide range of skills development opportunities attuned to national and local contexts. Learning to learn, the development of literacy and numeracy skills, transversal skills and citizenship skills are integral components of TVET. Given the growing consideration of WBL and TVET in other settings including community-based, distance and online, Member States need to more systematically support and acknowledge the emerging roles and learning needs of trainers, tutors and other facilitators, by considering the development or strengthening of policies and frameworks concerning their status, recruitment and professional development. TVET staff should have decent working conditions and adequate remuneration, as well as career and professional development opportunities.

TVET's landscape is changing fast, as new programs (for example, at post-secondary level) and new roles (for example, TVET is supporting the transition to green economies) are emerging. Changes in TVET are the result of political and structural changes in the overall education and training system. They are also the result of external social, political and economic factors, notably youth unemployment, demographic developments and labour market trends driven by technological and work processes and organisation changes, as well as the recent turmoil in the Arab region topped by the Syrian crisis.

In this context, WBL is often seen as a powerful driver for expanding and improving the relevance of TVET. However, realising the potential of WBL requires policymakers and social partners to engage in partnerships and close cooperation. Since 2015, UNESCO has also worked together with the Inter-Agency Working Group on Work-Based Learning's members<sup>1</sup> on a common and wide understanding of WBL schemes:

***Work-based learning refers to all forms of learning that takes place in a real work environment. It provides individuals with the skills needed to successfully obtain and keep jobs and progress in their professional development.***

***Apprenticeships, internships/traineeships and on-the-job training are the most common types of WBL. These types usually – but not always – combine elements of learning in the workplace with classroom-based learning.***

Indeed, understanding the dynamics of WBL and ensuring that those are reflected in the design of TVET schemes is essential to ensure that enterprises, including in informal sector and rural areas, receive the incentives and can provide high-quality WBL and that trainees perceive it as an attractive learning opportunity.

After more than 10 years of the publication of the report on 'Work-Based Learning Programmes for Young People in the Mediterranean Region', ETF and UNESCO find it timely to

<sup>1</sup> The Working Group currently consists of UNESCO, ILO, World Bank, OECD, ETF, CEDEFOP, European Commission, Asiatic Development Bank.

update this important report in light of the new vision for education, the new UNESCO TVET strategy.

This report aims to inform policymakers and practitioners in the Arab region and other countries and agencies supporting the development of TVET about what steps might be taken by the government, social partnerships, TVET training institutions, private and public sector workplaces, and to organise, implement, manage, and evaluate effective WBL programs targeting young people. The report is mainly informed by country reports from Algeria, Egypt (El-ASHmawi, 2017), Jordan (Rawashdeh, 2017), Lebanon (Ghneim, 2017), Palestine (Jweiles, 2017), Morocco (Sennou, 2017), Oman (Al-Mujaini, 2017), Tunisia (Chelbi, 2017) and Algeria (Bedou 2018). These have been augmented by the contributions by representatives of six of these countries in the technical workshop held in Rabat, Morocco in October, 2019.

TVET is defined by UNESCO as “those aspects of the educational process involving, in addition to general education, the study of technologies and related sciences and the acquisition of practical skills, attitudes, understanding and knowledge relating to occupation in various sectors of economic life”. The specific objectives of the project informing this report are to provide current information and to compare issues and processes to make progress on WBL arrangements for young people addressing the following themes:

- The nature and extent of work-based learning;
- Policies, legislation, and regulation;
- Employer and employee organisations’ participation;
- Level and type of qualifications/certifications;
- Acquisition of transferable and foundation skills;
- Work-based learning in new sectors of the economy (green, digital, etc.);
- Work-based learning as a vector for access to technical, vocational education and training (TVET) for disadvantaged groups and gender equality;
- Resources to support work-based learning programs and to improve their quality;
- Funding work-based learning; and
- Evidence, data and research on the performance of WBL on employment, productivity, growth and sustainable development.

Most of these themes have been addressed through the country reports, but those associated with detailed learning outcomes (i.e., transferable foundational skills, skills for new economies) are less well represented.

## Method

The report comprises the findings from a review of documents from four sources. Firstly, the eight country reports were prepared by experts familiar with their political, economic, social, and cultural context and with detailed knowledge of their TVET system. Five studies were organised by UNESCO (i.e., Egypt, Jordan, Lebanon, Oman, and Palestine) and three by the European Training Foundation (ETF) (i.e., Algeria, Morocco, and Tunisia). Both sets of reports used common framing, although varied in their presentation. Secondly, documents provided by UNESCO were reviewed, including earlier studies such as the ETF 2009 report on WBL arrangements in Mediterranean countries. Thirdly, the Torino Process reports of Egypt, Jordan, Palestine, and Lebanon’s TVET systems provided quite current accounts of activities in these countries. Fourthly, documents informing about demographic, economic, and institutional information were accessed from sources such as World Development indicators and UNESCO Institute for Statistics.

As elaborated in the full report (UNESCO, 2018), the synthesis of these documents aims to provide a set of general findings and guidelines about how to advance the provision of WBL experiences for young people in the Arab region. These findings are derived from the specific country studies, through a process of drawing out general findings, but acknowledging the diverse circumstances from which they are drawn and different levels and kinds of applicability to each of these countries. The recommendations and guidelines are aimed to inform action, but in ways acknowledging the different ways they are likely to be pertinent to and applicable in each country.

The potential is that the findings and guidelines here might also inform what might and should occur across these countries, and what might be applicable to many others, particularly those with analogous levels and trajectories of development.

## Findings: Progressing WBL Arrangements

In overview, a range of factors were found to influence and shape the provision of WBL experiences, how they are organised, made accessible and to whom, and on what bases and these stand as top-level findings that are drawn from the country studies in particular. These factors are sixfold:

- the kinds and qualities of legal and institutional governance (i.e. government mandates, laws and regulations etc.);
- social partnerships (i.e., the engagement of employers, unions, and professional bodies, locally, regionally and nationally);

- kinds and scale of workplaces; (i.e. the predominance of small-to-medium and micro-businesses that comprises workplaces in these countries)
- funding arrangements (e.g. sharing of costs and access to reimbursements);
- the kind and nature of the TVET provisions (i.e., relevance of curriculum, quality of educators, links with industry, attractiveness of qualifications, alignment with enterprise needs); and
- societal sentiments shaping how young people, their parents, and employers come to value and participate in TVET.

Findings associated with these six factors are used to structure this policy recommendations and guidelines document from those findings. Individually, these factors influence the provisions and participation in WBL within TVET programs in these countries, yet, by degree they are interdependent. For instance, lower than desirable levels of economic activity can lead to restricted employment and workplace learning opportunities. These circumstances emphasise the importance of close alignment amongst provisions of TVET, work-based experiences and the needs of local workplaces. Similarly, the small and micro-businesses that dominate the economy of these countries will require particular kinds of localised support, from TVET institutions that are dependent on them to provide their students with work experiences. Also, unless young people want to engage in TVET and then the occupations for which they have been trained, these goals will not be achieved. Instead, large numbers of students are using TVET to articulate to higher education, despite, in some cases (e.g. Egypt), this leading to lower levels of employment. Therefore, how young people and their parents view TVET, the occupations it serves, and also workplace learning experiences are important. Furthermore, the valuing of these experiences by employees will likely shape the degree by which they commit to them.



# Policy Recommendations

The policy recommendations arising from the synthesis and analysis of the reports and associated documents provided here are of a general kind, rather than being country-specific. The aim here is to inform about how young people's workplace learning experiences can be best promoted and made accessible so that lessons can be learnt from, but applied across, these countries. These 10 policy recommendations below are drawn from the country studies presented here, other data, and instances of best practice drawn from other sources, (e.g. Business Europe, 2018; International Labour Organisation, 2015; Asian Development Bank, 2018). These recommendations are as follows:

## Policy Recommendation 1: Enact legal and institutional frameworks

It is necessary to establish, enact, develop further, and sustain legal and institutional frameworks under which TVET, including that associated with partners and specifically with WBL arrangements, can effectively be implemented and progressed. This includes mandating the duration of these experiences, roles and responsibilities of various actors and shared funding mechanisms to support WBL.

### Measure 1.1 Enacting legal and institutional frameworks

Establishing, enacting, developing further, and sustaining legal and institutional frameworks under which TVET, including those associated with partners and WBL arrangements need to be effectively be implemented and progressed.

**Legal frameworks** are those addressing qualifications, certification, advice by industry/professional bodies; conditions of employment; work-related activities; remuneration/expenses for students/apprentices; duration of indenture; incentives for employers and support provided by local training organisations.

**Institutional frameworks** are arrangements for consultation, development, and maintenance of social partnerships, locally and nationally; protocols for engagement between training institutions and workplaces; arrangements for developing workplace capacity to support.

## Rationale

Appropriate laws and administrative frameworks providing governance arrangements at national, regional and local levels are required to optimise WBL experiences and secure their benefits (e.g. Algeria, Morocco & Tunisia). These frameworks also demonstrate government leadership and can provide mechanisms to engage social partners, workplaces, students, and their parents. They also can be used to establish and support working relations for vocational training institutions to engage with the community to provide an effective TVET system that includes accessible and productive WBL arrangements locally. This extends to the kinds of legal arrangements used in **Germany** that underpin these partnerships (ILO 2013), and those adopted in Kentucky in **America** (Kentucky 2015).

Important also here is who is granted leadership in this governance. When national responsibilities reside within a ministry for schooling and/or higher education, there is a risk that the focus on TVET and work-based experiences will be downplayed or even ignored. Noteworthy is that those countries with well-developed TVET system also have dedicated ministries (e.g. Algeria, Morocco). Algeria even has statements about apprenticeships represented in its Constitution. So, national leadership can exercise a strong commitment to developing an effective TVET system incorporating WBL experiences and establish arrangements to realise those commitments.

Effective governance will include an openness to and mechanism for engaging with a range of social partners, such as employer and employee representatives and at national, regional and local levels. This was consistently supported across all country studies. Where such social partnerships are absent or not functioning properly, a key role for government is to initiate and sustain them at these three levels. This is because decision-making about TVET and its enactment, particularly with enterprise-based commitments required to support WBL arrangements occur at the local level (e.g. Palestine). A commonly referred to model is the German bipartite chamber of commerce that represent both employers and employees, particularly at the local level (Deissinger & Hellwig, 2005). These kinds of organisations can mediate amongst competing interests of employers and employees, of TVET training institutions and workplaces, and also represent a voice that can be independent of partite politics, and address localised concerns. These kinds of institutional arrangements

represent mature TVET systems evident in countries with enduring TVET systems (Billett, 2013).

Securing coordination across government departments with responsibilities for TVET, and with WBL elements is recommended in a number of studies (i.e. Egypt, Palestine, Lebanon), because WBL arrangements require input and administration across a range of government jurisdictions/portfolios (e.g. education, labour, regional development). Likely, the most effective coordination is when a ministry with responsibilities for TVET is responsible for it (Algeria). So, more than having dedicated ministries for TVET, they also need authority to coordinate activities to promote TVET and WBL experiences.

In all, from this analysis of the country studies and other sources, the kinds of legal and institutional framing required to support WBL arrangements comprise and extends to:

- a national qualification framework articulating from schooling and into higher education;
- accreditation and quality assurance systems to ensure quality experiences for young people in TVET institutions and workplaces;
- involving social partners, educators and workplaces in processes identifying what constitutes the intents (i.e., aims, goals, and objectives), for TVET programs and the kinds of content and experiences to secure those intents, and their adapted at the regional and local levels, whilst maintaining national coherence;
- recognition of prior learning processes to support those young people learning in 'traditional apprenticeship' models that sit outside of accredited TVET programs, including the certification of what is learnt;
- professional development of teachers in TVET institutions, to maintain and develop further both their occupational and educational capacities;
- nationally recognised train-the-trainer provisions for those who supervise students/apprentices in workplaces;
- shared funding arrangements that distributes the cost of young people's WBL across government, community, workplaces and young people, with local means of decision-making and access to those funds; and
- provision of labour laws that make reference to pay and conditions associated with training, and rewards for enhanced skill acquisition.

## Measure 1.2 Establishing and enacting shared funding mechanisms

Establishing and enacting shared funding arrangements is essential to support engagement in and long-term commitment to workplace-based TVET arrangements.

### Rationale

Associated with these legislative and administrative frameworks are shared funding mechanisms. These would be required for TVET, including supporting WBL arrangements as well as apprenticeships, and are required for both school-based training structures and for what occurs in workplaces in terms of the kind and quality of experiences. This kind of action necessitates allocating budgets within public TVET providers based on performance and impact in terms of processes (i.e., the kind of experiences that are provided) and outcomes (i.e., measures of skill development and employability). It also seems likely that the best outcomes will arise from arrangements that grant more financial and management autonomy for schools and centres. As noted elsewhere, a responsive TVET system, and particularly one that is premised on WBL experiences, needs to be able to respond at the local level, adapt its provisions, and modify arrangements, albeit within a consistent national framework, to achieve effective engagements with local enterprises and strong outcomes for students/apprentices. Part of the local arrangements could be the development of workplace capacity to provide effective experience for students/apprentices and for there to be local selection processes for workplaces supporting these learners. The source of this funding could well derive from cost sharing, including a national training fund (i.e., training levy) of some kind that could comprise either direct funding or enterprises being able to defer making contributions on the basis of their commitment to and engagement in supporting TVET provisions, including workplace learning experiences. Even so, institutional frameworks can also accommodate financial and non-financial incentives for employers to support WBL. There are instances and examples from other countries about how such a scheme might progress, and the framing of the legislative and administrative arrangements might be informed by international and regional best practices.

## Measure 1.3 Engagement with partners

Workplace-based learning arrangements with young people are inevitably founded on engagement with a range of partners, and in particular, the enterprises in which young people will engage in WBL.

## Rationale

Given the centrality of engaging with enterprises, both public and private, having regular reviews about how those enterprises can come to effectively engage with, support, and mutually benefit from their participation in WBL programs for young people is warranted. What has been suggested in some of the country studies, even those in which these programs exist, is that the engagement with workplaces needs to be improved, and that can perhaps best come from understanding their needs and encouraging their participation. The range of purposes for such an engagement by TVET institutions extends to (a) understanding their needs, (b) finding out about what kinds of incentives or support are most likely to be effective, (c) identifying how their interests can best be articulated and engaged with both nationally and at the local level, and (d) determining the optimum kind of interactions with local training institutions. All of this does not necessarily involve burdensome administrative infrastructure. Indeed, it may be better without it. However, local processes of engagement that are empowered from the centre and responsive to feedback from localities across countries may well be an effective way of engaging local businesses, enhancing their participation with the TVET system, and being responsive to their needs as they assist young people to develop occupational skills. These arrangements extend to the kinds of conditions under which students can engage in workplaces and the implications for their work and employment in programs such as apprenticeship. Guidelines about these issues have been addressed by governments in **America** (Kentucky 2015) and agencies such as the International Labour Organisation for arrangements in **Jordan** (ILO 2015).

### Measure 1.4: Effective governance

Inevitably, arrangements associated with WBL require coordination across government departments associated with education and labour, and their enactment at the local level. Consequently, ensuring effective governance occurs across departments, both centrally and locally is essential for the effective provision for young people's WBL.

## Rationale

Improving coordination across government departments with responsibilities for TVET, and particular those with WBL elements has been suggested across a number of studies. As has been noted, the provision of TVET, in particular where it extends to workplace learning experiences, often requires input and administration across a range of government ministries. Typically, these ministries can be those with responsibilities for school education, TVET or higher education, the labour market and, in particular, industry

engagement. However, it is important in all cases that there is a high level of coordination across these departments rather than one dominating. It is probably reasonable to suggest that the interests of TVET and associated workplace learning experiences are likely to be most effectively coordinated when a ministry with that particular interest has leverage on the others. So, it may be insufficient just to have a ministry specialising in TVET. Instead, there is a need for coordinating powers across other ministries so that these interests can be advanced in ways that promote TVET and WBL experiences.

### Measure 1.5: Strategic planning

Given the complexity of institutional arrangements and the need to act over time to secure long-term goals, it is necessary to have effective strategic planning to realise these outcomes.

## Rationale

All of this action would also require a significant and long-term operational plan, with clear annual goals but also with goals extending out to a decade or more. Some of these requirements, such as the professional development of teachers, can be ongoing, but having staff with extensive industrial and workplace experience will not be able to be achieved within the short term. Also, building effective administrative arrangements that are operable at the national and local level will not be achieved in the short term, but will require extensive consultation, engagement, and development over time. Forward planning to incrementally increase the numbers of students engaged in dual type entry-level training arrangements is proposed to promote the broad use of workplace learning arrangements. Part of that plan is to find ways to include and coordinate donor countries' contributions and efforts to achieve the kinds of goals that these countries want, rather than maintaining an emphasis on what is seen as effective in, and an expression of, donor countries' preferred models.

### *Country experience and promising practices*

The country reports from **Algeria, Morocco** and **Tunisia** indicate that those countries have quite well developed processes of TVET governance that, in some instances, accommodate regional needs and requirements and in ways that are positioned to provide support for initiatives such as WBL. One example of the extent of such institutional arrangements is that in Algeria there is an annex to the Constitution that declares that young people have a right to apprenticeship. Whilst these arrangements not free from criticism and not always optimum in an operation, it is noteworthy that concerns about the low standing of TVET were not as marked as in the other countries. Moreover,

**Algeria** has arrangements which permit high levels of female participation in apprenticeships, which is quite distinct from other countries.

Many countries with advanced industrial economies have multiple agencies associated with TVET and both legal and institutional frameworks which support their provision. Countries such as **Germany**, the **Netherlands**, **Australia**, **Switzerland** and **Austria** all have mature governance arrangements in place to support TVET and initiatives such as WBL. Whilst differing in actual form, what is common across these arrangements is the involvement of external partners, particularly in the form of industry and professional groups. At their best, in countries like Germany, these partners play an important and extensive role, that is often quite independent on government, such as the Chambers of Commerce.

## Promoting gender inclusivity

It is noteworthy here that these mechanisms can be used to assist the greater inclusion of young women in WBL programs. A **national qualification system** provides a mechanism whereby achievement in education is the basis for personal progression, regardless of the individual's gender or ethnicity.

**Accreditation arrangements** can ensure that equity of access to participation in programs is an element of program and institutional accreditation. **Engaging with social partners** to assist WBL provisions be available to young women as well as young men, and that responsibilities associated with duty of care to young women are understood and can be exercised. The ability for young women to have **existing competence recognized**, particularly for that which has been acquired outside of educational programs can be particularly helpful for those who have been denied or had difficulty accessing educational programs and certification. **Professional development of TVET staff** can extend to assisting them with offering and implementing gender inclusive experiences for students and to transform gendered societal views of the kinds of work in which young men and women are expected to participate. Similarly, **train-the-trainer programs** for workplace staff can emphasize the importance of gender inclusivity and the enactment of strategies to secure successful WBL experiences by young women.

**Government can use funding leverage** to encourage and support workplaces provide WBL experiences for young women, thereby directly supporting achieving equity goals. The same governments can introduce **laws** that attempt to limit discrimination and encourage equity and access to opportunities in education institutions and workplaces.

## Further Reading

- Billett, S. (2013). Towards a mature provision of vocational education. *International Journal of Training Research*, 11( 2), 184-194.
- Billett, S. (2013). Towards a mature provision of vocational education. *International Journal of Training Research*, 11( 2), 184-194.
- CEDEFOP. (2009). The German Vocational Education and Training system. Retrieved from Thessalonki, Greece:
- CEDEFOP. (2002). Towards a history of vocational education and training (VET) in Europe in a comparative perspective, Florence.
- Deissinger, T. (1997). The German Dual System – A Model for Europe? *Education and Training*, 39(8), 297-302.
- Deissinger, T. (1996). Germany's Vocational Training Act: its function as an instrument of quality control within a tradition-based vocational training system. *Oxford Review of Education*, 22(3), 317-336.
- Deissinger, T., & Hellwig, S. (2005). Apprenticeships in Germany: modernising the Dual System. *Education and Training* 47(4/5), 312-324.
- International Labour Organisation. (2013). Legal and policy frameworks in Germany for apprenticeships. Retrieved from Geneva:
- International Labour Organisation. (2015a). Policy brief: Main findings from a pilot on upgrading informal apprenticeships in Jordan: a bottom-up approach Retrieved from Beirut: [www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---arabstates/---ro-beirut/documents/publication/wcms\\_364567.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---arabstates/---ro-beirut/documents/publication/wcms_364567.pdf)
- Kentucky Department of Education. (2015). Work-based Learning Manua. In Kentucky Department of Education (Ed.).

## Policy Recommendation 2: Enact localised frameworks and enablers

Either in the absence of, or to further augment these national legal and institutional frameworks supporting WBL experiences for young people, it will be necessary to act regionally and locally to secure participation by both enterprises and young people and provide effective TVET. These can include sharing of costs, kinds and duration of workplace experiences and how they can be supported.

### Measure 2.1: Enact localised frameworks and enablers

To enact national legal and institutional frameworks supporting WBL for young people, or in their absence, the promotion and organisation of local arrangements can assist participation by enterprises and young people and providing effective TVET. Development and maintenance of arrangements at the local level, including social partnership extending to those between employers and training institutions; engagements and negotiations between the two mediated by industry/occupational groups; reciprocal support between training organisations and workplaces to develop effective staff; ability to respond at the local level to enterprise and learner needs; tailoring of national institutional arrangements to meet local needs. Moreover, opportunities for developing further the skills of TVET teachers and workplace supervisors and mentors are likely to be realised through such interactions.

### Rationale

As has been advanced frequently across this report, the country studies and also other sources indicate the importance of social partnerships for effective TVET provisions, in particular, those that include WBL experiences. As well as being necessary elements for engaging with workplaces so as to provide experiences for young people, these partnerships are helpful for developing further the kinds of programs being offered, the educational intents of those programs, the relevance of content, and their applicability to the needs of enterprises who might employ graduates from TVET programs. It has been noted repeatedly how the central purposes of TVET with WBL experiences are associated with addressing youth unemployment, meeting the skill profile needs of enterprises, addressing national economic development, and overcoming social inequity through effective educational provisions. It is unlikely that any of these will be achieved without effective relations with social partners. Moreover, an indicator of the maturity of TVET systems is the extent and quality of such social partnerships that need to occur at both national and local levels. It follows then that many of the recommendations

associated with social partnerships are about strengthening them, both in terms of those partnerships themselves and also in terms of what and how they can contribute to the provision of workplace learning experiences for young people.

### Measure 2.2: Strengthening the engagement and role of social partners

Strengthening the engagement of social partners is likely to be premised upon the (a) kinds of roles that they are allocated and their skills to undertake those roles effectively, and (b) means by which these partnerships will be formed and sustained.

### Rationale

It is suggested that institutionalising employer engagement can be assisted through enhanced information sharing by government, including labour market information, the implementation and outcomes of apprenticeship systems, and building the capacities of social partnerships. That capacity-building can include and arise from greater engagement in the planning for and evaluation of WBL schemes such as apprenticeships and alternance programs. For instance, it is suggested that employer associations might be actively involved in the piloting of initiatives and the accreditation and certification of these kinds of programs, much in the way that this occurs within countries such as Germany through their chambers of commerce. It is suggested that these roles might extend to the governance of training institutions at a local/regional level to increase the alignment between TVET offerings and the needs and requirements of local enterprises. Such arrangements are likely to transcend both public and private enterprises to engage the broadest range of workplaces.

A key role for the social partnerships is addressing and seeking to overcome a shared problem of low retention in programs and in the targeted occupation after graduation. Both sponsors of TVET and enterprises have a shared concern that the effort directed towards preparing young people for specific occupations will be squandered unless there is a sustainable level of retention of young people during the courses and in those occupations after their completion. If the current level of attrition continues, it will undermine efforts not only of the TVET programs, but also of enterprises' commitment to them.

Realising these partnership arrangements is likely to require reciprocity in the form of shared commitment and engagement, and demonstrable benefits for all parties including, of course, young people. The nature and form of sustainable social partnerships are likely to be associated

with meeting specific needs. As a consequence, the form and delineation of these partnerships will be important. For instance, it is likely that national partnerships will need to be formed around particular occupational groupings or industry sectors. It is these partners who will be able to advise about national curricula, mandatory content, and the mix of experiences required for those occupations or industries. At the local level, there may be replication of those national bodies (i.e., industry sector or occupational based). Alternatively, they might be shaped to achieve different kinds of purposes, such as local development, and addressing issues such as entrenched employment in rural areas, for instance. So, the actual shape and form of these social partnerships is likely influenced by imperatives that attract partners and sustain their interest in participating in them. An element of that process will be the degree by which resources are distributed within and across these partnerships, their composition, and the degree by which their contributions are recognised and enacted.

The evidence from elsewhere suggests that social partnerships are likely to be at their most enduring when there are clear imperatives to participate, and accepted and acknowledged roles by government, and when these partnerships are able to achieve goals that warrant continuing participation.

### **Country experience and promising practices**

Partnerships at the national and local level that support TVET and initiatives such as WBL are hallmarks of effective and mature TVET systems. Sometimes, the local arrangements are the product of states, regions or local government that functions within a framework of national government, but are well placed to respond to localised needs. Noteworthy here are models such as the Chambers of Commerce in Germany that represent the interests of organised labour and also employees at national and local levels. These local partnerships can comprise advisory processes such as those in the state of Victoria in Australia (i.e. Local Learning and Employment Networks) and those that are actively engaged with local employers and TVET institutions such as those in Germany (Chambers of Commerce), orders in Scandinavia that together represent the interests of workers is.

The presence of national institutional frameworks seems important for their establishment, engagement and continuity. The tripartite arrangements adopted in many Scandinavian countries (i.e. government, unions and employers) are replicated in Germany and countries such as Australia, albeit in different forms. In some instances, tensions in competing interests and might overwhelm the purpose of these institutions. However, it seems that where there is recognisable, imperatives and each of the partners is able to contribute to discussions and outcomes this may

well support the effective enactment of such arrangements. However, it is likely that government policy, broadly writ, it is necessary to build and sustain effective partnerships. The European Training Foundation (ETF) handbook provides suggestions for how these partnerships might work.

The evidence suggests that localised social partnerships, such as is required for WBL initiatives, need effort and commitment in their formation, development and continuity (Billett & Seddon, 2004). This includes social partners being willing to moderate some of their interests to achieve collective outcomes: i.e., to realise the goals of the community and young people within it. Indeed, in one such partnerships it was noted that partners relinquishing some of their interests were central to the demonstration of shared concerns and commitments, whilst retaining distinct perspectives.

### **Further Reading**

- Billett, S., Ovens, C., Clemans, A., & Seddon, T. (2007). Collaborative working and contested practices: Forming, developing and sustaining social partnerships in education. *Journal of Education Policy*, 22(6), 637-656.
- Billett, S., & Seddon, T. (2004). Building community through social partnerships around vocational education and training. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 56(1), 51- 67.
- European Training Foundation. (2014). *WORK-BASED LEARNING: A HANDBOOK FOR POLICY MAKERS AND SOCIAL PARTNERS IN ETF PARTNER COUNTRIES*. Retrieved from Turin:
- Local Learning and Employment Networks. <https://www.education.vic.gov.au/about/programs/Pages/llens.aspx>
- Kentucky Department of Education. (2015). *Work-based Learning Manua*. In Kentucky Department of Education (Ed.).
- Seddon, T., & Billett, S. (2004). *Social Partnerships in Vocational Education: Building Community Capacity*. Retrieved from Adelaide.
- Seddon, T., Billett, S., & Clemans, A. (2004). Politics of social partnerships: A framework for theorising. *Journal of Education Policy*, 19(2), 123-142.

### Policy Recommendation 3: Enhance the standing and status of TVET and the occupations it serves

Action is required by government, training institutions, and social partners and communities to enhance the status and standing of TVET and the occupations it serves. This includes promoting the view that learning experiences in workplaces are legitimate, worthwhile, and an essential element of post-school education for specific occupations.

#### Measure 3.1 - Enhancing the standing and status of TVET and the occupations it serves

Government, training institutions and social partners need to act to enhance the image of TVET and the occupations it serves, including by promoting WBL experiences as legitimate, worthwhile and essential elements of preparation for work and occupations.

#### Rationale

Engaging in action at the national and local level to communicate about TVET, its qualities and outcomes, and promoting the worth of the occupations it serves through schemes directed at employers, young people, and their parents; organizing activities at the local level through partnerships between training institutions and enterprises to enhance the worth of specific TVET programs and their relationship to occupations and employment; securing articulation arrangements between these programs and higher technical and higher education programs.

#### Country experience and promising practices

A number of countries are taking action to attempt to elevate the standing of vocational education. Some examples are as follows. Denmark has trialled the raising of the entry requirements of TVET programs and improved educational facilities and institutions that are modern and attractive to young people (Aarkrog). The success of the first measure is not yet clear, but the second reflects a concern to respond to the relative unattractiveness of TVET, when compared with university campuses. In England, it is reported that young people who have engaged in trade-related occupations - Ambassadors - are being recruited and the speed and speak at local schools to encourage young people to consider TVET. In addition, more pathways are being directed to higher education (Unwin). In the Netherlands - some elements of vocational education with high-level qualifications already have high status, but lower qualification levels have low status. Fourth level MBOs can lead to either good jobs or to universities of applied sciences (de Bruijn). In Germany, some vocational technical courses are now offered through universities of applied sciences as these are seen as being

more attractive than the dual system approach. Moreover, the Chambers of Commerce and large employers are advertising to make a range of occupations more attractive to young people (Deissinger). In Switzerland, it has been suggested that the standing of VET is improving because of societal concerns (expressed in newspapers and television) about the number of young people enrolling in university courses with no link to the labour market (Stadler). In Finland - the rise of applied universities assists elevate the standing VET and the occupation it serves (Nokelainen). In Norway, it is proposed that preparing VET teachers in specialised institutions that offer Masters programs and pathways through to PhD has supported its standing (Hiim). (see (Nägele & Stalder, 2018). Global agencies are also working to assist the standing of achievement through conference provisions BiBB/Cedefop conference (2017), and reports (Clement 2014) identifying issues that inhibit the standing of TVET and how this can be addressed to improve the image of TVET: Making TVET attractive to youth (UNESCO-UNEVOC, 2018).

There are also nationally-based initiatives that seek to address the issues of the relatively low standing of TVET. In Australia, the federal government has the National Centre for Vocational Education Research programme to identify strategies for enhancing the status of TVET. [www.ncver.edu.au/\\_\\_data/assets/pdf\\_file/0029/5241809/NCVERWebinar\\_EnhancingTheStatusOfVET\\_SlidesForDistribution.pdf](http://www.ncver.edu.au/__data/assets/pdf_file/0029/5241809/NCVERWebinar_EnhancingTheStatusOfVET_SlidesForDistribution.pdf), there is the 'Get VET' campaign from Victoria (<https://www.vcaa.vic.edu.au/Pages/vet/GetVET/index.aspx>) and work of foundations, such as the Skilling Australia Foundation (<https://saf.org.au>).

#### Further Reading

- Billett, S. (2014). The standing of vocational education: Sources of its societal esteem and implications for its enactment. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 66 (1), 1-21.
- Clement, U. (2014). Improving the image of technical and vocational education and training Retrieved from Bonn, Germany:
- National Centre for Vocational Education Research, Adelaide, Australia- Enhancing the status of VET. [www.ncver.edu.au/\\_\\_data/assets/pdf\\_file/0029/5241809/NCVERWebinar\\_EnhancingTheStatusOfVET\\_SlidesForDistribution.pdf](http://www.ncver.edu.au/__data/assets/pdf_file/0029/5241809/NCVERWebinar_EnhancingTheStatusOfVET_SlidesForDistribution.pdf)
- UNESCO-UNEVOC. (2018). Short summary of the Virtual Conference on improving the image of TVET: Making TVET attractive to youth. Retrieved from Bonn, Germany:
- Victorian Department of Education, Get VET' campaign from Victoria (<https://www.vcaa.vic.edu.au/Pages/vet/GetVET/index.aspx>)
- Wyman, N., McCrindle, M., Whatmore, S., Gedge, J., & Edwards, T. (2017). Perceptions are not reality: myths, realities & the critical role of vocational education & training in Australia. Retrieved from Melbourne, Australia:

## Policy Recommendation 4: Develop the capacity of workplaces to provide effective learning experiences

Given the key role of WBL experiences and the unpreparedness of many workplaces to provide and support these experiences effectively, it is necessary to develop capacities within workplaces, including identifying and enacting support for learning that is appropriate for work settings, and provide recognition to those who undertake this support task.

### Measure 4.1

#### Develop the capacity of workplaces to provide effective learning experiences

The preparedness of workplaces to provide and support effective WBL experiences is a necessary quality for effective preparation for working and specific occupations and the recognition of that learning.

### Rationale

Organising and enacting shared cost distribution to assist sustainable development of capacities in workplaces to support young people's learning, including consideration of the organisation and ordering of workplace experiences and developing staff skills to support learning; this includes preparing and enacting national programs for developing mentors, supervisors, and co-workers' skills to assist the development of skills through the use of workplace pedagogic practices, and engaging learners in effective processes of learning that require effort and agency on their part. At the Rabat technical workshop, some practical strategies were proposed to assist workplaces to provide effective WBL.

Manuals – It was suggested that preparing and widely distributing practical manuals about how to implement WBL arrangements would be helpful to support its implementation by workplaces as well as TVET institutions and staff. These manuals could refer to; i) principles associated with learning through work, ii) sets of practices for enacting and improving learning in the workplace, and iii) advice about how those arrangements could best be enacted in workplaces.

These manuals could include how workplace supervisors, trainers and managers can utilize work activities to support students' WBL. Importantly, to be successful, these strategies need to be embedded in work activities and not seen as being separate from those everyday work activities and interactions, except when it is essential to do so. For instance, if something needs to be learnt before being applied in practice (e.g. some medical procedures).

So, these manuals would need to set out a range of procedures such as coaching, modelling and scaffolding, and the use of specific strategies to develop specific kinds of learning. It is also suggested that these manuals should provide bases by which effectiveness of these learning experiences could be evaluated.

Necessarily, these manuals would need to be short in length, plain and clear in language and have an engaging format and be useful for both TVET teachers and those assisting learning in workplaces (i.e. experienced workers, supervisors, managers). They might also be available in online formats and those that can be engage with through smart phones.

### Technical expertise to assist workplace implement WBL

Having available expertise to assist both TVET institutions and workplaces about implementing WBL would be helpful.

That expert role would extend from:

- analysing the needs and potentials of workplaces to provide rich learning experiences to students,
- preparing both TVET staff and workplace trainers to support that learning,
- identifying specific strategies to be used in the workplace to achieve the kind of learning outcomes that students and the workplaces want, and
- assist in evaluating the outcomes of those learning experiences.

Consequently, this role requires the ability to conduct training needs analysis within the framework of WBL, preparing teachers and workplace practitioners to use curriculum and pedagogic strategies and approaches to support WBL, having a range of strategies available to address different kinds of learning needs and learners; and being able to monitor, evaluate and arrive at judgements about the effectiveness of the approaches and strategies in achieving the kinds of outcomes that workplaces want and students need.

### *In the number of Country experience and promising practices*

A number of countries (e.g. **Australia** and Singapore) have implemented wide scale training programs to develop capacities for supporting learning in the workplace. In **Australia**, a well-established short certificate focused on providing educational foundation part-time teachers in the VET system, was converted to a program for improving quality of learning experiences in Australian workplaces (Certificate IV in Training and Assessment) <https://tafeqld.edu.au/courses/17694/certificate-iv-in-training-and->



assessment. In **Singapore**, the Advanced Certificate of Training and Assessment was developed by the Workforce Development Agency, within the Ministry of Manpower to perform similar purposes. <https://www.ial.edu.sg/learn-at-ial/ial-programmes/certificate/training-assessment-acta.html>

Elsewhere, initiatives associated with developing and preparing the workplace as an effective learning environment have arisen from programs of research (Billett 2016), and have generated resources that can be used for these purposes, and is available in English, French, Chinese and Portuguese. [https://vocationsandlearning.files.wordpress.com/2018/12/Leaflet\\_English.pdf](https://vocationsandlearning.files.wordpress.com/2018/12/Leaflet_English.pdf)

## Gender inclusivity

The manuals and the practices mentioned above would also need to consider how gender inclusivity can be realised so as access to workplace experiences for young women can be increased, and the kinds of support needed to ensure that they have opportunities to successfully learn through these workplace experiences are likely to be central here. Instances of success and examples of practices in ways that young women can be involved in aspects of workplace activities are likely to be a welcomed feature of such support.

## Further Reading

- (Billett 2016) Learning occupations through practice: Curriculum, Pedagogy and Epistemology of Practice, available in English, French, Chinese and Portuguese. [https://vocationsandlearning.files.wordpress.com/2018/12/Leaflet\\_English.pdf](https://vocationsandlearning.files.wordpress.com/2018/12/Leaflet_English.pdf)
- Billett, S. (2001). Learning in the workplace: Strategies for effective practice. Sydney: Allen and Unwin.
- Dochy, F., Gijbels, D., Segers, M., & van den Bossche, P. (Eds.). (2011). Theories of learning for the workplace. Building blocks for training and professional development programs. . London: Routledge.
- Fuller, A., & Unwin, L. (2002). Developing pedagogies for the workplace. In K. Evans, P. Hodkinson, & L. Unwin (Eds.), Working to learn: Transforming workplace learning. London: Kogan-Page.
- Teunissen, P. W., & Wilkinson, T. J. (2010). Learning and teaching in workplaces. . In T. Dornan, K. Mann, A. Scherpbier, & J. Spencer (Eds.), Medical education: Theory and practice. (pp. 199-203). Edinburgh: Churchill.

## Policy Recommendation 5: Recognise, embrace, and enhance the traditional model of apprenticeship

The central role played by informal (i.e., traditional) apprenticeship arrangements needs to be acknowledged, and this model of occupational preparation embraced within the TVET system and enhanced. This needs to occur in ways that do justice to and respect that this model of learning is different from what occurs in TVET programs and other models of apprenticeship, support its progression, and also offers enhancements and recognition to young people participating in them.

### Measure 5.1 – Recognise, embrace, and enhance the traditional model of apprenticeship

The central role played by traditional apprenticeship needs to be acknowledged, embraced as a model within the TVET system, enhanced in ways that respects and builds on its effective qualities, and provides recognition for young people who complete them.

### Rationale

Identifying how to understand and effectively augment the traditional model of apprenticeship, its processes of instruction and learning, and enterprise commitment to it as a model of learning without disrupting or destroying these qualities. In addition, identifying the purpose for and how any off-job learning experiences might best be organised, and also how the recognition of learning in and through this form of apprenticeship can be credentialed. In addition, means by which this model can be extended to other occupations, including higher technical skills, can be explored. Beyond the establishment of frameworks to provide this support, its enactment would be required to occur at the local level, and in ways that are sensitive to this existing model and the abilities of those in training institutes to provide support to workplaces, this model of learning, and the apprentices.

### Country experience and promising practices

The International Labour Organisation (ILO) undertook a study to identify how traditional apprenticeships in Jordan could be engaged with more effectively and become part of a more systematic approach to TVET. The report identifies issues to be addressed to utilise these forms of young people's workplace learning - [https://www.iyfn.net/sites/default/files/library/ILO-IYF\\_EquipYouth\\_Pilot\\_Study\\_Report.pdf](https://www.iyfn.net/sites/default/files/library/ILO-IYF_EquipYouth_Pilot_Study_Report.pdf)

### Further Reading

- Billett, S. (2016). Apprenticeship as a mode of learning and model of education. *Education & Training*, 58 (6), 613-628.
- Business Europe. (2018). A European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships. Retrieved from Brussels:
- Chan, S. (2013). Learning through apprenticeship: belonging to a workplace, becoming and being. *Vocations and Learning*, 6(3), 367-383.
- Gott, S. (1989). Apprenticeship instruction for real-world tasks: The co-ordination of procedures, mental models, and strategies. *Review of Research in Education*, 15, 97-169.
- International Labour Organisation. (2015). Upgrading informal apprenticeships: A bottom up approach. Retrieved from Beirut, Lebanon:
- International Labour Organisation. (2015a). Policy brief: Main findings from a pilot on upgrading informal apprenticeships in Jordan: a bottom-up approach Retrieved from Beirut: [www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---arabstates/---ro-beirut/documents/publication/wcms\\_364567.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---arabstates/---ro-beirut/documents/publication/wcms_364567.pdf)

## Policy Recommendation 6: Align TVET provisions with employment opportunities

A key imperative is to more closely align TVET provisions and employment opportunities, through enacting employment-enhancing initiatives within TVET programs and secure a balance between young people's needs and those of the workplaces that might employ them. This includes further developing the skills of the TVET workforces in terms of pedagogy, occupational currency and ability to design and enact local initiatives.

### Measure 6.1 - Aligning TVET provisions with employment opportunities

TVET provisions and employment opportunities need to be closely aligned by initiatives that secure a balance amongst young people's aspirations and workplace needs and occupational requirements.

### Rationale

To promote young people's employment might require a review of TVET programs and courses to identify their alignment between potential employment opportunities in terms of the needs of industry sectors and occupational fields. In addition, a review of curriculum models, course objectives, and content, as well as approaches to teaching and supporting learning to more readily align the outcomes of these courses to graduates' employability. This initiative includes informing and advising young people about potential employment opportunities and the prospects of different educational pathways leading to employment.

### Country experience and promising practices

There are good examples from across the globe of effective practice for these kinds of alignments from organisations such as **Global Apprentice Network (GAN)**, which although based in **Switzerland**, has a global reach. GAN seeks to build alignments between TVET WBL programs from through engaging large employers in programs of recruitment and supporting apprentices. (see <https://www.gan-global.org>). Similar practices are being enacted in **America** through the Institute for Workplace Skills and Innovation's work on 'new apprenticeships' (see - [www.iwsiamerica.org](http://www.iwsiamerica.org)). Attempts to align the provision of TVET with employment opportunities also necessarily involve close coordination across a number of the government departments and social partners. This will always be a difficult and potentially imprecise process because it is all difficult to predict the demand for particular occupations in years to come. However, countries that have effective tripartite arrangements (i.e., government,

employers' representatives and unions) and when working together towards common goals are likely to get as close to the supply-demand requirements as is possible. In countries that have quite small populations, such as the **Scandinavian** countries achieving those outcomes may be able to be addressed by single national processes. However, countries with large populations and greater regional or geographical spread (e.g. **Australia, Germany, Netherlands, Morocco**) will most likely need processes that operate both at the national and local level.

### Further Reading

- Billett, S., Ovens, C., Clemans, A., & Seddon, T. (2007). Collaborative working and contested practices: Forming, developing and sustaining social partnerships in education. *Journal of Education Policy*, 22(6), 637-656.
- Edwards, A., & Mutton, T. (2007). Looking forward: rethinking professional learning through partnership arrangements in Initial Teacher Education. *Oxford Review of Education*, 33(4), 503-519.
- European Training Foundation. (2009). Work-based learning programs for young people in the Mediterranean region. Retrieved from Turin, Italy:
- European Training Foundation. (2014). WORK-BASED LEARNING: A HANDBOOK FOR POLICY MAKERS AND SOCIAL PARTNERS IN ETF PARTNER COUNTRIES. Retrieved from Turin:
- Institute for Workplace Skills and Innovation America. (2018). Its time: Using new apprenticeships to re-skill America. Retrieved from Washington, USA:
- van der Meer, M., van den Toren, J. P., & Lie, T. (2017). Transforming VET: Encouraging innovation via public private partnerships. In E. de Bruijn, S. Billett, & J. Onstenk (Eds.), *Enhancing teaching and learning in the Dutch vocational education system: Reforms enacted*. Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Springer.
- Veillard, L. (2015). University-corporate partnerships for designing workplace curriculum: Alternance training course in tertiary education. In L. Fillietaz & S. Billett (Eds.), *Francophone perspectives of learning through work: Conceptions, traditions and practices*. Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Springer.

## **Policy Recommendation 7: Build and sustain social partnerships at national, regional and local levels**

Social partnerships, including representatives of employers and employees at national, regional and local levels are essential to securing alignments amongst models of WBL, local enterprise needs for skill development, and strategies to promote engagement in TVET, including sharing the costs of WBL experiences across government, enterprises and individuals who benefits from them.

### **Measure 7.1:**

#### **Build and sustain social partnerships at national, regional and local levels**

National and local social partnerships, including employers and employees representatives, are essential for alignments amongst models of WBL, local enterprise needs for skill development, and strategies promoting the image of and participation in TVET.

### **Rationale**

A national strategy associated with building social partnerships that support TVET and WBL experiences is required to be supported by key industry and professional bodies, yet enacted at the local level in ways that secure reciprocal benefits for both the educational provision (i.e., students' learning) and also secure productive outcomes for workplaces. At both a national and local level, the quality of partnerships will be based upon reciprocity and sustaining these partnerships will be most likely found in their ability to generate outcomes for all parties. That is, evidence that workplaces support and provide rich learning experiences for young people, and that there are tangible benefits to enterprises from that engagement, including the selection of new employees and their contributions to sustaining the viability of the enterprise, will be essential.

### **Country experience and promising practices**

A number of countries have processes that build and sustain partnerships at the local level between enterprises and TVET providers. In some instances, these arrangements are based around significant institutional provisions, such as the Chambers of Commerce in Germany. These institutions, seemingly, are bipartite – representing the interests of both employers and employees - at the local level and are accepted as having key roles in assisting the provisions of key that meeting local needs and providing effective educational experiences. For instance, it is not unusual in Germany for the Chambers of Commerce to conduct the examinations of students from TVET programs and thereby provide external verification of the outcomes of these programs.

A different model is available in the state of Victoria in **Australia** that has formed Local Learning and Employment Networks (LLENS) that bring together representatives of the local community, employers and tertiary education institutions and their key mandate is to assist young people move smoothly from schooling and tertiary education into paid employment. These particular arrangements operate very much locally/regionally albeit shaped by the needs of local communities. For details - <https://www.education.vic.gov.au/about/programs/Pages/llens.aspx>

### **Further Reading**

- Billett, S., Ovens, C., Clemans, A., & Seddon, T. (2007). Collaborative working and contested practices: Forming, developing and sustaining social partnerships in education. *Journal of Education Policy*, 22(6), 637-656.
- Billett, S., & Seddon, T. (2004). Building community through social partnerships around vocational education and training. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 56(1), 51- 67.
- European Training Foundation. (2014). *WORK-BASED LEARNING: A HANDBOOK FOR POLICY MAKERS AND SOCIAL PARTNERS IN ETF PARTNER COUNTRIES*. Retrieved from Turin:
- Local Learning and Employment Networks. <https://www.education.vic.gov.au/about/programs/Pages/llens.aspx>
- Seddon, T., & Billett, S. (2004). *Social Partnerships in Vocational Education: Building Community Capacity*. Retrieved from Adelaide, :
- Seddon, T., Billett, S., & Clemans, A. (2004). Politics of social partnerships: A framework for theorising. *Journal of Education Policy*, 19(2), 123-142.

## Policy Recommendation 8: Promote localised engagement between TVET institutions and workplaces

There is a need to promote and organise locally, stronger linkages between TVET institutions and nearby industry sectors and enterprises, including small and micro businesses, so that shared understandings can arise and mutual benefits can be realised in terms of young people's skill development and employability.

### Measure 8.1 Promote localised engagement between TVET institutions and workplaces

Engaged social partnerships, including employers and employees representatives, need to be generated locally are essential for alignments amongst models of WBL, local enterprise needs for skill development, and strategies promoting the image of and participation in TVET. In particular, localised engagements between TVET institutions and workplaces are essential for effective WBL.

### Rationale

A national strategy associated with building social partnerships that support TVET and WBL experiences is required to be supported by key industry and professional bodies, yet enacted at the local level in ways that secure reciprocal benefits for both the educational provision (i.e., students' learning) and also secure productive outcomes for workplaces. At both a national and local level, the quality of partnerships will be based upon reciprocity and sustaining these partnerships will be most likely found in their ability to generate outcomes for all parties. That is, evidence that workplaces support and provide rich learning experiences for young people, and that there are tangible benefits to enterprises from that engagement, including the selection of new employees and their contributions to sustaining the viability of the enterprise, will be essential.

Some guidelines for achieving these outcomes are as follows.

Having 'brokers' working across workplaces and TVET institutions

Across all six countries represented at the Rabat technical workshop, offered a consistent message about the needs of local enterprises to be provided with support by TVET institutions to implement and secure quality outcomes through WBL. Concurrently, concerns were expressed that both these enterprises and many TVET institutions were not ready or prepared to fulfill this role and responsibility.

Consequently, given the need to develop capacities in both TVET institutions and workplaces, developing and piloting a process of brokerage might be helpful. That is, having suitably qualified and experienced individuals ('orientation officers') performing bridging role between TVET institutions and workplaces, and any local industry or professional bodies.

In prospect, this role could comprise:

- 'boundary riding' (i.e. engaging with local enterprises), understanding their needs, capacities and aspirations)
- finding ways of brokering arrangements whereby the workplaces are informed about the available TVET programs and assisted become ready to engage productively with WBL students and to meet both students and the enterprise needs.
- ensuring students are suitably briefed and prepared before their workplace experiences, including being guided in how to have productive experiences in workplaces.
- after the completion of their work experiences when students return to TVET institutions, that they have opportunities to debrief, and then share and compare their learning experience peers and teachers. This is a role that brokers could enact in facilitating these discussions and modelling processes that, subsequently, teachers could adopt.
- assist and inform teachers further about contemporary work requirements and identify how teachers can already respond to their students' needs, and those of workplaces; and
- play a role in engaging with workplaces in following up to evaluate what has happened and assist further develop shared understandings, identify how processes can best proceed to sustain working relationships between TVET institutions and workplaces.

All of this constitutes a demanding role, and there may be a shortage of suitably qualified and experienced staff to fulfil it. Even those broadly qualified for this role would likely need some specific preparation and then on-going support to perform it effectively. Hence, a developmental process would be required for these brokers.

### **Country experience and promising practices**

A number of countries have processes that build and sustain partnerships at the local level between enterprises and TVET providers. In some instances, these arrangements are based around significant institutional provisions, such as the Regional Education and Training

Centres (ROCs) in the Netherlands (<https://www.rocmn.nl/over-roc-midden-nederland/corporate-information-central-netherlands-regional-education-and-training>) or Chambers of Commerce in Germany. The ROCs have a very specific regional focus in a country that, albeit is small in geographical terms, has diverse regions and industry sectors within those regions. Hence, the need to build localised arrangements between TVET institutions and local industry. A great strength of the German Chambers of Commerce is that they act locally/regionally and do much to build working relationships between local industries and enterprises with TVET institutions. As noted, these chambers are bipartite – representing the interests of both employers and employees - at the local level and are accepted as having key roles in assisting the provisions of key that meeting local needs and providing effective educational experiences. For instance, it is not unusual in Germany for the Chambers of Commerce to conduct the examinations of students from TVET programs and thereby provide external verification of the outcomes of these programs.

As noted above, a different model is available in the state of Victoria in Australia that has formed Local Learning and Employment Networks (LLENS) that bring together representatives of the local community, employers and also tertiary education institutions and their key mandate is to assist young people to move smoothly from schooling and tertiary education into paid employment. These particular arrangements operate very much locally/regionally, albeit shaped by the needs of local communities. However, they do so within national frameworks for TVET and meeting State-based education and training priorities - <https://www.education.vic.gov.au/about/programs/Pages/llens.aspx>.

### Further Reading

- Billett, S., Ovens, C., Clemans, A., & Seddon, T. (2007). Collaborative working and contested practices: Forming, developing and sustaining social partnerships in education. *Journal of Education Policy*, 22(6), 637-656.
- Billett, S., & Seddon, T. (2004). Building community through social partnerships around vocational education and training. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 56(1), 51- 67.
- Local Learning and Employment Networks. <https://www.education.vic.gov.au/about/programs/Pages/llens.aspx>
- Seddon, T., & Billett, S. (2004). Social Partnerships in Vocational Education: Building Community Capacity. Retrieved from Adelaide.
- Seddon, T., Billett, S., & Clemans, A. (2004). Politics of social partnerships: A framework for theorising. *Journal of Education Policy*, 19(2), 123-142.

## **Policy Recommendation 9: Implement strategies to improve TVET workforce capacity**

There is a need to plan and implement both shorter-term and long-term strategies to develop the industry and occupational expertise, and pedagogic skills of TVET teachers, including their familiarity with workplace practices and associations with social partners to generate locally appropriate, but effective and viable TVET provisions.

### **Measure 9.1 - Implement strategies to improve TVET workforce capacity**

Developing industry and occupational expertise, the skills of TVET teachers, including their familiarity with workplace practices and engagements with social partners to generate mature TVET systems requires long-term planning.

### **Rationale**

The kind and extent of arrangements, actions, and outcomes being proposed here can only be achieved in the longer term and through careful planning and implementation of effective strategies to develop capacities within training institutions, social partners, workplaces, and also within communities. This includes promoting the standing and status of TVET and the occupations it serves, but also the engagement with young people to position them as active and focused learners.

### ***Country experience and promising practices***

A feature of countries that have mature vocational education systems is specialised teacher education programs and ongoing professional development of teachers in TVET. Often, those programs require applicants to have extensive industry experience and are used to develop their professional education capacities. These arrangements differ across countries and in focuses. For instance, in Germany there are specialist universities that prepare vocational educators for specific disciplines. Often, the teacher education occurs allied to or associated with a particular faculty within the University that has an occupational focus. So, for instance, the preparation of vocational teachers in business administration may well occur in university that has a strong focus on teaching business administration. The same is the case for faculties of engineering that would have strong alliances with a program preparing TVET teachers in the field. However, in many other countries, such as the United Kingdom and Australia, the practice has been for a specific preparation of vocational educators. Entrance into these programs included possession relevant industry

qualifications and experiences, and the program is largely focused on professional education preparation. It is reported that in both Norway (Hiim) and Finland (Nokelainen) the use of higher education institutions for TVET teacher development and professional development programs is an important step in elevating their competence and standing. The ongoing development of these teachers' skills is often a complex and vexed situation. To remain current and competent in content requires extensive engagement with the occupational field, and most likely areas of industry release. However, these are often quite difficult to accommodate within the funding parameters of vocational education institutions.

## Policy Recommendation 10: Support and engage with informed accounts from research and evaluation

Decision-making about TVET policies and practices at the national, regional and local level and how it might proceed likely requires informed accounts based upon research and evaluation, including critical appraisals of initiatives being conducted in other countries and societal contexts and that are likely applicable to the particular country, region, or locality.

### Measure 10.1 Support and engage with informed accounts from research and evaluation

Effective decision-making about TVET policies and practices, nationally and locally, requires informed accounts based upon research and evaluations that are likely applicable to the particular country, region, or locality.

### Rationale

A systematic approach to research and evaluation around key topics such as those represented here is likely to be helpful for informed decision-making at a national and local level, by training institutions, social partners, and workplaces. In particular, the kinds and models of workplace curriculum, processes for supporting learning in the workplace, and also for promoting engagement by young people will only come from a growing body of evidence founded upon evaluation and research. Generating the capacity to undertake research and evaluation needs to be supported so that it becomes an integral element of the TVET provision and an extension of teachers' roles and skills and actions undertaken by social partners and government agencies.

### Country experience and promising practices

A number of countries have well-established agencies whose role is to identify relevant research and inform the development and enactment of TVET provisions. An example of this is BiBB that is used to inform the German vocational education system. A regional example of this is CEDEFOP and others such as the European Training Foundation, and also the International Labour Organisation. In the country studies reported in the full report, Algeria established Central administrative arrangements (e.g. 5 levels of qualification), a range of distinct institutions offered TVET programs and localised employment-educational arrangements including cost-sharing processes and inspectors that operate at the local level to try and better aligning the TVET provision with the needs of local enterprises (Sennou, 2017). In Egypt, it is claimed that contracted arrangements between employers and novices and is regulated by the state, and supported by financial incentives serve similar purposes, and to promote young women's employment.

#### Further Reading

Wolf, A. (2016). Remaking tertiary education: Can we create a system that is fair and fit for purpose. Retrieved from London:

Wolf, A. (2011). Review of vocational education: the Wolf report. [https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/180504/DFE-00031-2011.pdf](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/180504/DFE-00031-2011.pdf)



## WBL Experiences: Actors, Roles, & Actions

Aligned with the above set of recommendations is actions to be taken by a series of actors to achieve these outcomes. Table 2 below sets out a list of actors, the roles they play, and the actions they need to take to promote greater engagement in TVET and WBL experiences by young people. This set of roles and actions is drawn from the data in discussions presented in this report, and is intended as

the premise for considering policy and practice initiatives to promote greater participation in WBL experiences in these and other countries. While this list might be seen as idealistic, it suggests is a set of imperatives that could be used as benchmarks for the roles and actions of the different actors.

**Table 2. WBL Experiences: Actors, Roles, and Actions**

Actors	Roles	Actions
National government	Organising legislation and institutional frameworks that support the provision of WBL experiences at the national and local levels, adequately funded training organisations and social partners, providing frameworks for responsive TVET provisions, and encouraging greater participation in TVET and workplace learning arrangements	<p>Pass, implement, monitor, refine, and sustain effective legal and institutional frameworks</p> <p>Provide adequate and shared funding arrangements for training institutions, support for workplaces, and young people</p> <p>Organise and enact an effective TVET provision, including the quality of content, equipment, and teaching, and the ongoing evaluation and improvement of that provision</p> <p>Initiate, build, and sustain effective social partnerships at the national and local level and engage them in organising and evaluating TVET provisions</p> <p>Enact processes to inform the community, business, parents, and young people about the benefits of TVET and the occupation it serves</p>
Government departments	Working collaboratively and interdependently to realise positive outcomes across areas such as schooling, post-school education, industry development, and employment	<p>Establish and enact collaborative practices across departments that influence the provision of TVET, including WBL experiences</p> <p>Enact those practices both at the national and local level</p>
Social partners	Working collaboratively at national and local levels to realise collective outcomes that include sector-specific imperatives and needs, but also addressing broader social goals such as young people's skill development, unemployment, enterprise, and economic development	<p>Engage in processes that demonstrate a collective commitment to the purpose for which the social partnerships have been established, including being willing to engage effectively with other partners, whilst being respectful of their needs, contributions, and imperatives</p> <p>Be willing to make concessions and even sacrifice some of their own interests in the interests of broader outcomes and collective good</p>

Training institutions	Providing experiences for young people from which they will develop worklife capacities including specific occupational skills, providing and integrating those experiences in work settings, and engaging with industry and employers in the design and enactment of their programs	Engage in processes that provide purposeful, planned, and effective learning experiences for young people, including those in workplaces  Provide, monitor, and refine or augment experiences to achieve outcomes of occupational competence and workplace employability  Demonstrate the capacity to respond to the local student and workplace needs through adapting the national curricula to meet those needs
Teachers	Being occupationally competent and workplace oriented as a basis for effective teaching that will arise from engagement in workplaces outside of educational institutions	Be open and responsive to developing further skills associated with occupational competence and workplace familiarity  Adopt and effectively enact a broad range of curriculum roles and instructional skills to meet the need of national prescription and local requirements  Work collaboratively with local enterprises
Workplaces	Providing experiences for young people that deliver quality learning outcomes for them and benefits for the workplace	Be open and responsive to developing the capacity of the workplace to provide effective learning experiences for young people and also the ongoing development of its workforce through engaging with local training institutions and social partners
Community/ Parents	Informing young people about post-school options and the potential of TVET as a viable form of occupational preparation	Be open and informed about the advice given to young people about post-school options, the potential of TVET, and the occupations it serves
Young people	Being informed about post-school pathways and engagement in post-school education and workplace learning	Be active and critical in making informed decisions about post-school pathways, the prospects of TVET, and the occupations it serves

## References

- Al-Mujaini, A. O. (2017). *Investigation of work-based learning programs for young people in Oman*. Beirut: UNESCO.
- Billett, S. (2013). Towards a mature provision of vocational education. *International Journal of Training Research*, 11( 2), 184-194.
- Billett, S., & Seddon, T. (2004). Building community through social partnerships around vocational education and training. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 56(1), 51- 67.
- Business Europe. (2018). *A European Framework for Quality and Effective Apprenticeships*. Retrieved from Brussels:
- Chelbi, A. (2017). *Work Based Learning in Tunisia*: Eropean Training Foundation.
- Deissinger, T., & Hellwig, S. (2005). Apprenticeships in Germany: modernising the Dual System. *Education and Training* 47(4/5), 312-324.
- El-ASHmawi, A. (2017). *Reviewing work-based learning programs for young people: Republic of Egypt*. Beirut: UNESCO.
- European Training Foundation. (2009). *Work-based learning programs for young people in the Mediterranean region*. Turin, Italy: European Training Foundation.
- Ghneim, O. (2017). *Reviewing work-based learning programs for young people: Lebanon*. Beirut: UNESCO.
- International Labour Organisation. (2015). *Upgrading informal apprenticeships: A bottom up approach*. Retrieved from Beirut, Lebanon:
- Jweiles, Z. (2017). *Studies for reviewing work-based learning programs for young people: Palestine*. Beirut: UNESCO.
- Nägele, C., & Stalder, B. E. (2018). *Trends in vocational education and training research. Proceedings of the European Conference on Educational Research (ECER), Vocational Education and Training Network (VETNET)*. Paper presented at the Proceedings of the European Conference on Educational Research (ECER, Bolzano).
- UNESCO-UNEVOC. (2018). *Short summary of the Virtual Conference on improving the image of TVET: Making TVET attractive to youth*. Retrieved from Bonn, Germany:
- UNESCO. (2018). *Work-based learning programmes for young people in the Arab region: A comparative and longitudinal analysis - Full report*. Retrieved from Paris:
- Rawashdeh, H. (2017). *Work-based learning in Jordan*. Beirut: UNESCO.
- Sennou, S. S. (2017). *Work-based training systems in the Maghreb countries*. Turino, Italy: European Training Foundation.
- The European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network. (2014). *Work based Learning and Lifelong Guidance Policies*. Jyvaskala, Finland: University of Jyvaskala.



# unesco

United Nations  
Educational, Scientific  
and Cultural Organization

## Stay in touch

UNESCO Regional Bureau for Education in the Arab States  
Sports City Avenue, Bir Hassan  
P. O. Box 11-5244  
Beirut - Lebanon  
Tel: 961.1.850013/4/5  
Fax: 961.1.824854

 [beirut@unesco.org](mailto:beirut@unesco.org)

 [www.unesco.org/new/beirut](http://www.unesco.org/new/beirut)  
<https://unevoc.unesco.org/yem/YEM+Home>

 UNESCO Office in Beirut

 @UNESCOBEIRUT

With the support of:



European Union

