Self-determination: Using Agency, Efficacy and Resilience (AER) to Counter Novice Teachers’ Experiences of Intensification

Jayne Keogh
Griffith University, j.keogh@griffith.edu.au

Susanne Garvis
Griffith University

Donna Pendergast
Griffith University

Pat Diamond
Griffith University

Recommended Citation
Available at: http://ro.ecu.edu.au/ajte/vol37/iss8/4

This Journal Article is posted at Research Online.
http://ro.ecu.edu.au/ajte/vol37/iss8/4
Self-determination: Using Agency, Efficacy and Resilience (AER) to Counter Novice Teachers’ Experiences of Intensification

Jayne Keogh
Susanne Garvis
Donna Pendergast
Pat Diamond
Griffith University

Abstract: The intensification process associated with the first year of teaching has a significant impact on beginning teachers’ personal and professional lives. This paper uses a narrative approach to investigate the electronic conversations of 16 beginning teachers on a self-initiated group email site. The participants’ electronic exchanges demonstrated their qualities of agency, efficacy and resilience (AER), and an increased sense of self-determination as they journeyed through the five phases typical of first year teacher experience. Findings suggest that the provision of similar peer-based support mechanisms would benefit other beginning teachers, perhaps working to counteract current high attrition rates from the profession.

Introduction: Entry into the Profession: The First Year of Teaching

Even though teachers face many and varied challenges throughout their careers, “few experiences … have such a tremendous impact on the personal and professional life of a teacher as does the first year of teaching” (Gold, 1996, p. 548). This paper traces the experiences of a group of 16 new teacher graduates as they navigated the complexities and challenges of their initial teaching year, documented in their entries on a self-initiated group email site. Moir (1999) describes the first year of a teacher as involving five phases. First is the anticipation phase before starting the year, often characterised by feelings of romance and anxiety. Then, when the teaching term starts, a “reality” (Veenman, 1984) and “culture” shock (Huberman, 1993) is encountered, with novice teachers struggling to move into a survival phase. Towards the end of the first term, beginning teachers retreat into a disillusionment phase evidencing low morale and physical exhaustion. The rejuvenation phase that occurs after the first ‘break’ in the school year allows beginning teachers a brief spell in which to recover and regain motivation, and the first year ends with a reflection phase, with plans being made for the following year. Indeed, it is not until the end of the teaching year that novice teachers are able to begin reducing self-focus, allowing them to concentrate on the future planning and individual students’ needs (Marshall, Fittinghoff and Cheney (1990).

Previous studies have painted a bleak picture for beginning teachers over the past 25 years (see Anderson 2000; Wright, 2000; Ingersoll & Smith, 2003; Maciejewski, 2007; Le Maistre & Pare, 2010), involving both personal and professional costs. Halford (1998, p.33), for instance, refers to teaching as “the profession that eats its young”. Researchers have focussed on the school context, with its often desperate lack of resources, professional development opportunities, parent involvement, and community support, to explain why so
many beginning teachers leave the profession (Ingersoll, 2001; Buckley, Schneider & Shang, 2004; Johnson, Berg & Donaldson, 2005; Loeb, Darling-Hammond, & Luczak, 2005; Scheriff, 2008; Smethem, 2007). Furthermore, the professional challenges confronting teachers have increased in recent years. Stressors include: greater societal expectations but lower societal recognition, greater accountability to policy makers, continual pedagogical and curriculum change, an increased need for technological competence, an ever-increasing diversity of students, and an intensification of the workload, including the burden of administration (see Dussault, Deudelin, Royer & Loiselle, 1999; Hargreaves, 1992, 1994; Lortie, 1975; Nias, 1989). Apple (1986) argues that a neo-liberal education policy has driven a relentless economic logic or imperative to do more with less, describing the ever-increasing pressure on schools and teachers brought about by the ever-intensifying demands of policy makers and society on teachers as the hothouse effect. As such, beginning teachers are especially vulnerable to the intensification of the professional environment.

The high attrition rate of novice teachers during their beginning years of teaching is a widespread concern in Australia, as elsewhere. Currently, 25% of teachers are reported to leave within the first five years of commencing a teaching position (Department of Education, Science and Training, 2003). It is particularly worrying that so many teachers exit prematurely given that teacher effectiveness spikes only after the first years in the profession (Worthy, 2005).

When novice teachers commence practice, they confront the same responsibilities as teachers with many years of experience (Worthy, 2005). For some, formal induction processes may be in place. Most, however, experience no formal transition or induction program to support entry into the profession (Feiman-Nemser, 2001; Britton, Raizen, Paine & Huntley, 2006). Consequently, novice teachers often are left to devise their own coping strategies. Such evidence suggests the need for improved professional and emotional support to buffer and minimise the potentially traumatic initial challenges that are common to beginning teacher experiences. While official and efficient school-based mentoring programs are effective (Feiman-Nemser, 2001), informal, voluntary peer-mentoring mechanisms can also work to address novice teacher needs, particularly during their early years (Caplan-Moskovich, 1992).

A Theory of Self-determination: Agency, Efficacy and Resilience (AER)

The intensity of initial teaching experiences may be moderated by using agency, efficacy and resilience (AER), providing the novice with protective layers. These three qualities are crucial components of the theoretical construct of personal causation (DeCharms, 1968, 1976) and autonomy. This combination of internal affective “determinants” of behaviour is of special relevance in the hotspot of a beginning teacher’s classroom. Both agency and efficacy promote greater hope of success. Resilience or perseverance represents a reasonable strategy when the teacher’s inner motivational framework is energised by the likelihood of positive outcomes and can work against the “they won’t let me!” or other-directed attitude in which “they” (pupils, other teachers, parents, university preparation, and policies) are conjured up as thwarting the best of a beginning teacher’s intentions.

Teachers are enabled to resist unreasonable outside demands and enact best practice through the exercise of personal agency. Agency “starts with the belief that human beings have the ability to influence their lives and environment while they are also shaped by social and individual factors” (Lasky, 2005, p. 900). To be an agent is to influence, intentionally, one’s functioning and life circumstances (Bandura, 2006). Beliefs of personal efficacy (the
ability to succeed) are central to agency (Bandura, 1997), creating a secure platform from which to launch action. By exhibiting agency, teachers can address and overcome many challenges. Self-efficacy beliefs are influenced by the conditions of the sorts of environments that teachers encounter (Schunk & Meece, 2006), clearly affecting teachers’ goals and behaviours, and determining, in part, how environmental (school-based) opportunities and impediments may be perceived (Bandura, 2006). If beginning teachers believe they can produce a desired effect through their own actions, they have an incentive to act. However, if they lack such belief, they may increasingly disengage.

Efficacy beliefs influence and are capable of predicting the outcomes that teachers expect of themselves (Bandura, 1997). These beliefs are positively associated with teacher behaviour, with higher efficacy leading to decreased burnout (Brouwers & Tomic, 2000), increased job satisfaction (Caprara, Barbaranelli, Borgogni & Steca, 2003), better commitment to teaching (Coladarci, 1992), greater levels of planning and organisation (Allinder, 1994), being less critical of students when they make errors (Ashton & Webb, 1986), working longer with students who are struggling (Gibson & Dembo, 1984), and with using a wider variety of teaching material and innovative teaching methods when applying new teaching formulae (Ghaith & Yaghi, 1997; Wertheim & Leyser, 2002). Teachers’ beliefs regarding their personal teaching capabilities thus constitute powerful influences on their overall effectiveness with students.

Teacher efficacy has also been shown to correlate with student achievement (Armor et al., 1976; Ashton & Webb, 1986; Moore & Esselman, 1992; Ross, 1992), student motivation (Midgley, Feldman & Eccles, 1989), student attitude towards school and teachers (Woolfolk, Rosoff & Hoy, 1990) and with students’ own sense of efficacy (Anderson, Green & Loewen, 1988). Since teachers’ efficacy beliefs affect student learning, in addition to their professional abilities, inquiry into their origins, supports and challenges are crucially important.

Resilience is a quality which either continues to develop or withers throughout a person’s lifespan (Richardson, Neiger, Jensen, & Kumpfer, 1990). Teacher resilience is defined as “using energy productively to achieve school goals [even] in the face of adverse conditions” (Patterson, Collins & Abbott, 2004, p. 3). As Williams observed, “many teachers are affected by the same conditions that contribute to their colleagues leaving the profession, but chose to stay” (2003, p. 74). Teachers who chose to remain exhibited resilience, a dynamic process whereby individuals employ specific coping strategies when experiencing disruption and anxiety as a result of adverse situations (Henderson & Milstein, 1996). Such teachers stay, proverbially ‘getting going when the going gets tough’.

Strategies for building resilience are especially important for overcoming beginning teacher adversities as it is during their initial years that teachers are at greatest risk. In a recent study of novice teachers employed in high needs areas in North America, Castro, Kelly & Shih showed that “resilient teachers’ demonstrated agency in the process of overcoming adversity” (2010, p.622). In particular, these teachers demonstrated resilience skills including problem solving, help-seeking, managing difficult relationships and seeking rejuvenation and renewal. Such findings provide a variety of options for teacher educators, school administrators and policy makers to foster teacher self-determination or AER, thereby potentially reducing the current high beginning teacher attrition rates (Castro, Kelly & Shih, 2010).

As evident from the research cited above, agency, efficacy and resilience (AER) work largely together, each attribute drawing on the other in a symbiotic arrangement. Increased self-determination may enable teachers, particularly those at the beginning of their careers, to cope with and even thrive in the face of intense and often challenging events. As such, these attributes are worthy of further investigation.
Study: Local Context and Site of the Present Case Study

Extensive previous research regarding teacher induction has largely focussed on mentorship and professional development programs (Roehrig, Bohn, Turner & Pressley, 2008; Valencic Zuljan & Vogrinc, 2007; Veenman, Denessen, Gerrits & Kenter, 2001). However, little is currently known about how beginning teachers themselves use agency, efficacy and resilience (AER) when taking up their initial appointments. This study partially addresses this gap in research, focusing on the experiences, perceptions and feelings of a particular group of novice teachers during initial year of teaching. Their experiences were recorded as conversational entries on a self-initiated group email site over the course of a single year. The participants’ exchanges documented their experiences as they journeyed through five discrete phases of development, those of anticipation, survival, disillusionment, rejuvenation, and reflection, that typify a teacher’s first year (Moir, 1999).

The Use of Electronic Email Sites

On-line group email sites provide an electronic location onto which participants can post and / or read messages either singly or as developing themes presented under different subject headers or “threads” (Antaki, Ardevol, Nunez & Vayreda, 2005). Limited research literature regarding the use of such communicative modes by beginning teachers (Sunderland, 2002; Helsel DeWert, Babinski & Jones, 2003; Skulstad, 2005; Irwin & Hramiak, 2010) generally acknowledge the advantages of using such means to facilitate learning (Sutherland, Howard & Markauskaite, 2010), and in providing on-going support. Because online or computer-mediated communication can “overcome the barriers of time and distance and offer advantages of convenience and flexibility” (Helsel DeWert, Babinski & Jones, 2003, p.312), it can provide a means whereby beginning teachers develop supportive and non-threatening personal and professional communities of practice, co-constructing aspects of their professional identities, including AER. Within their electronic conversations, beginning teachers are able to tell stories of school events and voice concerns in ways that build shared understandings. Participants’ “storied selves” are presented within and through such electronic dialogic exchanges (Benwell & Stokoe, 2006), the narratives demonstrating developing professional interests and concerns in sympathetic and mutually helpful ways, validating their shared concerns, experiences and practices as beginning teachers.

The Participants

In Queensland, Australia, novice teachers are employed as either permanent, contract or relief teachers after graduation from their respective pre-service teacher education programs. New teachers take up appointments in a variety of schools in primary, middle and secondary school settings. The sixteen beginning teachers who participated in this study graduated in 2006 with a Bachelor of Education degree from a large metropolitan university in Australia. This particular teacher education program had been designed to answer the call for preparing teachers graduates to meet the particular needs of early adolescents (Keogh, Whitehead, De Jong, Newhouse-Maiden & Bahr, 2007) and to retain them in the profession.
A Narrative Approach

Narrative is viewed here as a frame of reference, a way of reflecting during the entire inquiry process, a research method and a mode for representing the research study (Moen, 2006). Accordingly, this study focuses on, in this instance, initial teaching and the development of AER. As such, it examines the “autobiographical, historical, cultural and political and [takes] ... a thoughtful look at texts read, experiences had, people known and ideas considered” (Hamilton & Pinnegar, 1998, p.236).

Narrative inquiry (see Clandinin & Connelly, 2000; Craig, 2007) was employed for this study. This approach offers a personal experience method in which story provides the phenomenon, the form, and the method (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990). As Riessman (1993) notes, narrative inquiry does not sit neatly within the boundaries of any one scholarly field but is, rather, interdisciplinary. It can, thus, be considered to be a link between theory, personal knowledge and practice, and can be used to enable conversation about their connections (Webster & Mertova, 2007). Narrative inquiry was adopted for the following six reasons: stories rely on tacit knowledge to be understood, they take place in meaningful contexts, they call in story telling traditions which give structure to expression, they involve moral lessons that can be learned, they can voice criticism in socially acceptable ways, and they reflect the inseparability of thought and action in storytelling - the dialogue between the teller and the audience (Elbaz, 1990). According to Clandinin and Connelly (2000), the narrative approach can capture the quality and “multiplicity of voices” involved in creating the plot lines of stories, such as those involving AER during initial teaching experiences. As such, a narrative approach was considered particularly suitable for this study of beginning teacher experience and the evolution of AEL.

The Research Design

In 2006, as a promising presage of developing greater self-efficacy, sixteen pre-service teachers who were about to graduate from their teacher education program initiated an email group to maintain contact after they had dispersed. Group participants also included Sam, one of their university teacher educators, and Mina, one of the university practicum coordinators, both of whom had been invited to join discussions by the student members of the email group (for reasons of confidentiality, all names included in the reported data are pseudonyms). Although these two university personnel were occasionally addressed directly by the beginning teachers who were members of the group and did, at times, offer direct advice, as participant observers they kept their contributions to the minimum. At times they responded to questions directed to them by responding in the form of further questions, thereby encouraging the other beginning teacher group members to continue discussion. In such ways the two university staff members reduced possibilities of being positioned, or positioning themselves, as experts in the on-line discussions.

In keeping with ethical clearance procedures, all participating members of the email discussion group gave permission for their online discussions to be used as data for a study focussing on the induction of novice teachers into the profession. Seventeen of the eighteen members of the group posted messages onto their electronic discussion board between December 2006 and January 2008. One set of research field text data (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990) consisted of the group members’ ongoing electronic conversations. The participating beginning teachers were posted to various schooling contexts throughout Queensland during the first year of their first appointments as teachers. Their electronic conversations consisted, in the main, of reported episodes, shared in the form of anecdotes and small stories (Bamberg, 2007) or local, mini-narratives about their experiences as novice teachers. These
co-constructed narratives organised and gave meaning to the participants’ initial school experiences in many ways, displaying the complexities of their first year of teaching, while sharing their developing understandings of themselves as professionals, their beginning teacher identities, their professional roles, and their need and ability in developing self-determination. Quotes are presented exactly as written in the original discussion board entries, including typographical and grammatical errors.

Narrative Analysis

Narrative analysis was adopted as a suitable approach to study beginning teacher experiences. The goal of narrative analysis is to “uncover themes or plots in the data [and] analysis is carried out using hermeneutic techniques for noting underlying patterns across examples of stories” (Polkinghorne, 1988, p.177). In particular, this study uses Yoder-Wise and Kowalski (2003) techniques for analysis that include:

- Looking for recurring themes - what actions have occurred that represent one’s values, priorities, concerns, interests and experiences;
- Looking for consequences - examining the cause and effect of choices that have been made;
- Looking for lessons - what was learnt that influenced subsequent actions or behaviour;
- Looking for what worked - recall and reflection on personal and professional successes;
- Looking for vulnerability - identify any mistakes, failure to stimulate, listen to advice, explore better approaches to problems;
- Building for future experiences - how to create scenarios for handling certain situations; and
- Exploring other resources.

The data were analysed holistically to shed light on the development of AER in these beginning teacher participants. Field texts were read numerous times to identify themes, lessons, consequences, vulnerabilities and future expectations, and these insights were pooled. The academic literature was also drawn upon to try to understand and respect the stories. A number of key themes surrounding personal agency, efficacy and resilience (AER) in relation to the participants’ initial teaching experiences emerged. These were categorised, and are presented below in the form of a series of vignettes, also known as verbal portraits, of lived experience.

Results: Findings and Analysis

The email discussion entries covered a diverse range of topics. Seven key thematic threads, selected for their high levels of frequency and intensity, emerged from the participants’ small stories and narrative reflections during their first year of practice, namely: expectations; induction and first week experiences; student behaviour; end of term 1; relationships with staff; relationships with parents; and dealing with the unexpected (grief). The vignettes are presented verbatim (in italics) to show things from the novice teachers’ perspectives, including “the tone, the language, the quality, the feeling” (Butt, Raymond, McCue & Yamagishi, 1992, p.57). In each vignette it is possible to glimpse the gap between these novice teachers’ expectations and the realities of the teaching situations they confronted. To create a coherent narrative text or self/group portrait, the vignettes are
presented chronologically and grouped together according to their respective themes. In this way, the report writing provides an interpretative process (Ezzy, 2002). The frequent use of “we” shows how sociality within a supportive community of understanding was co-constructed over the year. Agency, efficacy and resiliency (AER) were built progressively within and through their entries on the discussion board, as are Moir’s (1999) five phases typical of first year teacher experience, signposting the participants’ initial journeys over time and place.

Expectations

Email conversations between group members commenced in December 2006. Only a few messages were exchanged during the time that immediately preceded the commencement of their first teaching appointments, the period Moir (1999) views as the anticipation phase of the initial teaching year. The following two entries were the first to be posted onto the newly established group email site under the message subject header Teaching Position:

Subject: Teaching Position. Date: Friday, 15 December 2006 3:20 PM
Hey Sam [university researcher] and Mina [university practicum coordinator]. Just letting you know .... I’m taking Year 9 SoSE/English at Smithside (Middle School). ..... The school contacted me about a month ago to offer me a six month contract, we’ll see where it goes from there. Hope you’re not working too hard. Enjoy your christmas! (Jo)

Jo’s message seemed largely devoid of emotion, describing her position and school location somewhat dispassionately. However, Peter’s entry under the same subject header fore-grounded his emotions in relation to his new position:

Date: Tuesday 19 December 2006 5:04 PM
Hey Sam just thought i would let you know that i have lined up work for next year at Collinswood College.i had an interview with them last friday and they offered me a contract for next year. they were quite open in stating some of the drawbacks they have experienced by using some of their specific teaching methods, but i will be engaged in most of the team teaching with experienced teachers so i hope to learn a lot from them along the way. i am both excited and nervous, and i can’t wait to start planning with the other teachers early next year. (Peter)

Peter’s developing sense of AER is demonstrated explicitly: “i will be engaged in most of the team teaching with experienced teachers so i hope to learn a lot from them ... ”. Similarly, in the few messages that continued to be exchanged during the 2006/2007 Christmas and New Year school vacation period, the participants shared information mostly about their employment situations, conveying excitement, hopes, apprehensions and fears about their first teaching appointments.

Induction and First Week Blues

The new school term commenced during the last week of January, 2007. The end of this first full week of teaching (Friday 2 February) was marked by a flurry of exchanges, the participants highlighting some of their first week experiences. They disclosed information and feelings about how they had coped with their initial challenges, in keeping with expectations regarding what might be seen as typical for new teachers who have reached the phase of survival (see Moir, 1999). Although some positive experiences were reported, many more were devoted to disappointments, demonstrating that some had, perhaps, moved very swiftly on to Moir’s third phase of disillusionment. Members of the group shared and
supported each other with their various stories about their first week under a variety of subject headers:

Subject: First week.  
Date: Friday, 2 February 2007 5:04 PM  
Dear Trish. I think my major issue is that there are so many different systems operating in one school. If I have someone absent from my class in year 9, it is dealt differently to having someone missing from my year 10 or 11 class. All the paper work and process is what is getting me down. (Chloe)

Erin empathises with Chloe’s feelings of despondency in her response:

Date: Friday, 2 February, 2007 5:08 PM  
Oh boy, I hear you Chloe! It’s frustrating, isn’t it? I have different processes for students who are self-funded as opposed to those who are in migrant English as opposed to those who are literacy and numeracy and today I discovered on the role students who are classified as ‘state’ whatever that means! It really does my head in! (Erin)

In this turn-taking, Erin confirms that Chloe’s response to her situation is reasonable, adding a parallel story and echoing Chloe’s description as being “down” with her description of her situation that “does … [her] head in!”. There seems to be a lack of AER in both these communications. However, Danielle Pock’s entry immediately following Erin’s in this thread demonstrates a sense of agency and efficacy with her story about how she had responded to her year 9 class, despite describing them as “the spawn of Satan”.

Date: Friday 2 February 2007 6:31PM  
Hi All. Glad to hear that you have survived the first week. My week has been an experience and a half, but for the most part pretty good. I am teaching year 8, 9 and 11 maths and have frankly been flying by the seat of my pants all week. The staff are really wonderful people and I don’t think the kids here are as bad as one would imagine. Having said that, my year 9 class are all the spawn of Satan! Evil Mrs Pock nearly reared her head yesterday but come next lesson, they will know who is the queen of the castle. (Danielle)

Indeed, Danielle appears confident that she will be able to overcome her students’ unacceptable behaviour, and that they will soon know that “Evil Mrs Pock … is the queen of the castle”, despite her having “been flying by the seat of … [her] pants all week”.

Date: Friday, 2 February 2007 7:03 PM  
‘Flying by the seat of my pants’ is a term that describes my week as well. I am hoping to catch up this weekend, but there is a lot of work to get done. (Chloe)

Chloe’s response suggests that she, too, has some sense of agency, echoing Danielle’s “Flying by the seat of my pants”, but implying that she would “catch up this weekend” despite the amount of work needed, demonstrating her growing sense of efficacy and resilience, perhaps prompted by Danielle’s example.

During the second week, a new subject header was initiated, Induction process. In these entries, the participants continued to describe their stories of classroom experiences, with some critiquing the ways that they had been inducted into their respective schools. One strand was directed to Sam, the teacher educator, and commenced with an implied criticism regarding a perceived gap within their previous teacher education program:

Subject: Induction process.  
Date: Wednesday, 7 February 2007 6:43 PM  
Dear Sam. One thing I think is really important to get across to everyone is how little we know about the specific process that runs in schools and that just glossing over the processes doesn’t equip us with the knowledge to competently follow them. Silly little things can add to the frustration - not being able to find someone who can tell you how to put a message in the morning notices. Much more support is needed because we walk out of uni pretty much empty handed and thrust into an environment that
requires us to function, mostly alone. Other jobs have training processes, ours
doesn’t. Keep smiling. (Chloe)

Chloe argues here that her difficulties were not of her own making, but the result of
having had insufficient “support” and “training”. This suggestion of the need for increased,
site-specific course content conveys little sense of efficacy. However, despite having walked
out of uni “pretty much empty handed”, Chloe’s suggestions for improved teacher
educational practice demonstrates an implied determination to go on and to overcome her
difficulties, both marks of resilience: “Keep smiling.”

The next entry also was addressed to Sam:

Date: Thursday, 8 February 2007 6:36 PM
Hi Sam. As fantastic as all of the induction was, there was also the small things, like
which days the library laminates things and what are the channels I am to go through
to get that sort of things done? Which coffee mug can I use? When should we go to the
main common room? How do the students enter the lecture theatre without causing a
stampede? The little things I am just picking up as I go. I guess just mirroring the
experienced teachers. (Sally)

Sally’s story of coping by “just picking up as … [she goes] … mirroring the
experienced teachers”, similarly demonstrates a slowly developing sense of AER in the face
of her difficulties.

Chloe, however, projects more despondency in her entry that immediately followed
Sally’s in this thread (above). She wrote this just over 24 hours after her previous message
bemoaning the lack of “training processes”, with her self-description indicating a definite
lack of AER:

Date: Thursday, 8 February 2007 10:08 PM
Hi Everyone! Prior to school starting we had an induction day which involved
meeting people and finding out where we belong ... but nothing else really happened.
That was followed by the student free day which was equally as uninsightful. I didn’t
know until day 2 the topics that I was teaching for most of the classes. Needless to say
I am stressed out of my mind, have had a teary with Mum and my skin is breaking out.
Woe is me. (Chloe)

On Friday 16 February, at 2007 8:07 PM, Chloe sent another message, including the
following extracts, further conveying her distress and lack of self-determination:

Some days I wish I was a relief teacher...that way I would never have to see them
again. … today was rough for me. … It has been extremely difficult, especially
because I went in thinking I would have no problems connecting with students, as I
have done so well previously and that has been pointed out to me. I try to go into
every class with them with a fresh outlook, but it is getting harder and harder. Today
I broke down. … I was completing behaviour monitoring sheets, so my head was
down, they couldn't see the tears. ... I never saw myself being one of these people.
One of those teachers that cry. But I have this class often, and it is extremely stressful
and I have felt completely alone and unsupported in my efforts ... I’ve run out of
ideas. … Tips would be more than welcome!

Messages posted on the discussion board in response to Chloe’s pleas for sympathy
(as below) seemed to slowly sooth her distress, validating her feelings as reasonable under
the circumstances. Indeed, over her first term of teaching, Chloe’s messages demonstrated
increasing levels of AER, so that by 2 March she was able to express a positive response
about her situation after a professional development session:
Subject: Professional development.  

Date: Friday, 2 March 2007 8:46 PM

Gee, I thought I was lucky to be sent to a one day conference by Bill Rogers … Will be attending a conference on the 23rd and I signed myself up for the QAMT new teachers night on the same day. Anyone else attending those?

Clearly Chloe was not giving up on teaching. She was addressing her current difficulties by taking action to increase her professional knowledge and skills.

Evidence of the beginnings of the development of agency, efficacy and resilience appeared in each of the beginning teachers’ stories, even at the start of the teaching year. Most of the participants seemed enthusiastic about teaching students even though they were new to the teaching profession and did not know the students in their class or the school community. Their developing AER may well have resulted from the positive support they had exchanged via this group email site. Such an effect is in keeping with Caplan-Moskovich’s (1992) contention that peer support, particularly during the beginning phase of teacher development, is important and useful.

Student Behaviour

The novice teachers used their electronic conversations as a means to describe and reflect on their daily struggles with classroom management, offering suggestions to each other regarding how to cope during their first semester. As the first school term continued, email conversations focused increasingly on student misbehaviour as an issue of concern including, for instance, in Chloe’s full entry, first discussed above:

Subject: Re: Hello  

Date: Friday, February 16, 2007 8:07 PM

Dear Sam. … How many weeks until I see some benefit from this terrier mentality stuff? In all seriousness today was rough for me. I have one class that is a specialist sport class, they therefore have been pains in my bum since day one because they don’t see the relevance of maths or science to the outcome of their lives...this is something I have tried to show simply isn’t true. It has been extremely difficult, especially because I went in thinking I would have no problems connecting with students, as I had done so well previously and that has been pointed out to me. I try to go into every class with them with a fresh outlook, but it is getting harder and harder. …. But I have this class often and it is extremely stressful and I have felt completely unsupported in my efforts to reign them in and form some sort of bond. I’ve run out of ideas. They are on a seating plan...some of them are on behaviours sheets ... I’ve been a nazi for most of the time and have tried to chat with students outside of class.

(Chloe)

Danielle responded to Chloe’s call for help with the following message:

Date: Friday, 16 February 2007 8:46 PM

I’m so sorry to hear you are having a rough time, but I have been there and done that with my year 11 maths A class. The very first day I had them I wanted to go out and buy a cattle prod … and zap a few of my little darlings. All was going reasonably well until the late arrival of a very challenging student. From then on it was all down hill. I could physically feel the blood rushing to my head. I was so stressed and had a terrible night. I came to the conclusion that it wasn’t worth it. …. I was not going to be the one leaving miserable every lesson. ... So I took the advice of a friend and didn’t try to teach anything new in this time. …. I have more and more students listening and working well, every lesson. This is a battle you will never completely win, but you need to be proud of every little bit of ground you gain. Chin up and I hope that some of my advice might be of help to you.
Danielle empathised with and validated the reasonableness of Chloe’s feelings in this instance. However, Danielle’s continuing narrative entry regarding her conclusion that “it wasn’t worth it … So [she]… took the advice of a friend…”, also, and very subtly, provided implicit advice to Chloe regarding what she might try to do to overcome her classroom difficulties. Other novice teachers also began to respond to Chloe’s call for help.

Subject: Hello
Date: Friday, 16 February 2007 8:46 PM

Hi Chloe. I lol when I read your first comment (about never having to see them again). Until this week I felt like this every time I saw my year tens. Thankfully it is the weekend and you don’t have to go in tomorrow to teach them. The class just does my head in … For me the answer was technology … I hope you find the key to your class soon, try anything and everything, at this stage you haven’t much to lose.

(Katrina)

Again, Katrina showed support through her story both of shared suffering of how she confronted and overcame her fears through the use of technology. As such, Katrina modelled the possibility of using AER to deal with difficult classroom experiences, delicately suggesting that Chloe might also prevail.

More stories of negative student behaviour followed these entries, including the following example:

Subject: Hello
Date: Friday, 16 February 2007 8:22 PM

Hey Chloe. Well I got my first day of supply at a state high school and it was horrible. Having to work and be in a school was excellent- just the students were disgusting. I got sworn at, had a pen thrown at me and the students did absolutely no work …. I was battling with them just to sit down. The work the teachers set was either not explained well or not long enough for the hour lesson. Interestingly at the beginning of the day I was offered a 12 month contract. I said yes(ish) but by the end of the day I never wanted to go there again! After completing prac I got the feel for primary school and know I’m more interested in the younger years. (Katie)

Katie demonstrates her sense of AER indirectly in this entry through her expression of interest in students “in the younger years”. She did not intend to give up teaching completely, but, rather, devised a plan to work with younger rather than with students in high school.

Just over a week later, conversation about student behaviour continued, under a different subject header:

Subject: Hey!
Date: Tuesday, 27 February 2007 7:47 PM

Dear Trish. Life at [school] gets better and better. I made it into my fourth week as a teacher before being physically assaulted. One of my kids in my year 3/4 class slapped me on the arm last week after I tried to take a ruler off her and she was at the sink washing it because she didn’t want to do her work. She has ADD and had not taken her Ritolin that day. There’s another boy in my class who flatly refuses to do anything but PE so he now spends his time wandering around the school and playing with the Lego in the library. I asked him to put on his shoes today before the Arts Council performance but he refused and told me that he didn’t give a shit. I did raise my voice at him when he didn’t comply and then his mother phoned the school this afternoon to complain about me screaming at him. Gotta love the place! (Mary)

Mary takes an ironic tone, in that her examples of life at school getting “better and better” included “being physically assaulted”. However, her ironic tone suggests that Mary is not yet ready to give up teaching, despite her difficult students, implying her developing sense of AER.

Other disaster stories about examples of negative student behaviours were shared between the discussion group members, as below:
Australian Journal of Teacher Education

Date: Wednesday, 28 February 2007 6:46 PM

Trish, thanks for your message, it made me feel a little better … My ADD girl took her pill this morning and was great in the first session but then she lost it big time in the final session when we were doing art. She ruined another kid’s work and when I refused to let her take part in the game we played in the final hour she went ballistic and tipped furniture all over the room. Nice one. (Mary)

Date: Wednesday, February 28, 2007 5:17 PM.

Hey Mary. Today I had another relief day and had the CLASS FROM HELL!!! By 9.30am I had 6 students already on level three and with the headmaster. It was mental! I walked into the classroom where there was absolutely nothing for me, not even the timetable so that was cool. I had stuff in my little plastic box but we started off playing dodge ball for the first half hour as per their usual routine. But there are so many competitive boys who simply denied ever being got that when they lost they got the S*#@s big time and then simply refused to line up, refused to walk with the class, took little baby steps and ended up crawling up the stairs into the room. They abused me, other students and were absolute little B’s. So that kinda set the tone for the day. …. Apparently their usual teacher said yesterday afternoon that she wanted to kill them all and had had enough, then she was away today. Hmm, not planning on going there if they call. (Trish)

These and similar stories containing descriptions of disruptive student behaviours and the novice teachers’ responses continued throughout the first school term, in keeping with expected behaviours associated with Moir’s (1999) beginning teacher survival and disillusionment phases. They also exemplify the beginner’s reliance on a “they won’t let me!” explanation of difficulties, their stories being entered under various subject headers, including ‘A message for Trish’, which commenced with the following entry:

Subject: A message for Trish. Date: Monday, 5 March 2007 8:45 PM

Hi, Trish, How was your first day at High Valley? It was good to chat yesterday; made me feel a lot better! Good luck! (Mary)

Trish, who was positioned increasingly as a major contributor and major provider of advice and peer support among the email group members, replied:

Date: Tuesday, 6 March 2007 4:52 PM

Hey Mary! First and second day were good. I rearranged the classroom today and re-organised all the seating as there were so many disruptive students seated together in the centre of the class etc. So I have taken care of that this arvo. Teaching grade three is rather different to teaching the upper grades and high school and unfortunately they don’t get sarcasm yet so sometimes my comments fall on blank minds (in so many ways). It is fun though and I do enjoy the class. (Trish)

In this entry, Trish demonstrated a developing sense of AER in her descriptions of her classroom practices, showing, despite her difficulties, that teaching “is fun though” and that she did “enjoy the class”.

Student misbehaviour coloured many of the vignettes included in the emails, the beginning teachers often evidencing concerns about classroom management and control. This is consistent with previous efficacy research showing that beginning teachers tend to focus largely on misbehaviour (Ashton & Webb, 1986) and student challenges to their developing sense of self-determination. However, their entries also showed that the participants became less focussed on student behaviour and more on other classroom teaching issues such as marking student assignments, gaining greater capabilities, their entries suggesting ever-increasing levels of AER during their first teaching year. Fewer disaster and more success stories were included in their later entries. Indeed, the participants marked the end of their first term as teachers with enthusiasm and greater self-determination (“Queen of the Castle” above and “all mine now” below).
End of Term 1

Although stories of fatigue appeared common amongst novice teachers at the end of their first term, the possibility of entering Moir’s (1999) rejuvenation phase was suggested in the following entry:

**Subject: hols  Date: Monday, 9 Apr 2007 07:35 AM**

Hey All. Well I don’t know about anyone else but I was soooo looking forward to the holidays. The last week was totally mental with testing/marking, reports, assignments etc that I just couldn’t wait to get home and collapse. And I’m only teaching one 23 student year three class. I can’t imagine how much work must be involved when you have different classes to do all that for. Anyway, I am excited about next term as it is all mine now...completely my class, my unit plan finally ... How did everyone else go and how welcome were the holidays?? How prepared did you feel for the end of term stuff from uni and prac? I have to say that I felt like I was playing a catch up because it wasn’t really made clear what was expected. I guess I haven’t even had any orientation or induction that doesn’t help. I have just felt like I have been working if all out as I go. I’m sure I’m not alone...Anywho, gotta cruise. (Trish).

This, and other entries under this subject header, suggested a sense of excitement about the next term, showing the participants’ greater sense of AER, despite the difficulties they had earlier described. As such, their co-constructed narratives of developing teaching skills and improved classroom practices showed both the need for and the growth of AER. However, despite their increasing competence in dealing with students, relationships with other members of their schools were not always easy, as shown in the next section. A new “they” now provided the thwarting obstacle.

Relationships with Staff

As the term drew on, one teacher described difficulties associated with staffroom culture. She described a desire to “move staffrooms” because of a perceived lack of support shown by the Head of Department (HOD) and other staff members, as described in her message below, entered towards the end of term two:

**Subject: aaaaargh  Date: Thursday, 7 June 2007 7:53 PM**

Dear Sam. I want to move staffrooms. The HOD and staff are bagging me and another new staff member while we aren’t there and then later on we will be told by someone. The crappy thing is they won’t say it to my face- they lie blatantly if they overhear me telling someone what I have just done and they criticise. But regardless I hate the ‘feel’ in there and don’t want to work with people I can’t trust. And that’s the whole thing I can’t trust them. Anyway I have had my whinge. At least tomorrow I am having a day away-taking two girls to an ICT thing ... Peace day!! (Naomi)

Despite her developing dislike and expressed mistrust of other staff members, indicating some loss of confidence and an implied questioning of career choice, Naomi demonstrated some self-awareness with her statement that she had “had my whinge”, mentioning what she described as “a day away” about which she was positive. As such, threats to her resilience were overcome by her being proactive and moving on to a happier event, “tomorrow”. 
Relationships with Parents

Participants continued to email each other sporadically throughout their first year of teaching, and stories of relationships with the wider school community figured within their email messages. With the arrival of each new message, glimpses were provided into the novice teachers’ days. Early in the second term, relationships with parents appeared as a hot discussion topic. So, for instance, similar to Naomi (above), things would also become “great” for Trish, as below.

Subject: position available Date: Saturday, 5 May 2007 8:25 PM
Hi. I haven’t done parent interviews yet but I regularly have parents coming to see me re their precious little one. I have some very challenging students with real problems and some that have experienced some horrors in their short lives and so there is a constant concern for them and there are constant reports and conversations which is great as I have been able to build some very good communications and relationships with the parents. I felt like this is half the battle at times. The students know that I am in constant communication with their parents and carers and that I am very honest with them about what happens in class. For those who can’t believe their little ones aren’t perfect I simply invite them along to a class to watch/help. Surprisingly they only come once and from then on they have no problem believing anything I tell them about their child. So to reports …what I would like to say is your dear child is truly a pain in the whatsit and needs to pull his finger out and get with the program but instead I am telling parents that “XXXy will experience increased success as she develops a sense of personal responsibility towards her learning” etc etc. Oh what fun … Luckily for me I don’t have any other life apart from school, staff meetings, cluster meetings and my kids so reports fit in there with every other weekend taken up with planning, preparing and marking. (Trish)

Regular and successful communication with parents / carers supports positive home-school partnerships. Trish showed how her helpful relationships with parents and her well developed organisational skills helped her overcome her difficulties with “some very challenging students with real problems and some that have experienced some horrors in their short lives”, exemplifying the development of AER. This, and other stories included on the email site, suggests that success gathers momentum, leading to further success and increasing confidence in beginning teachers’ knowledges, skills and school-related practices. However, as demonstrated in the final section, events in term 2 were not Hollywood-perfect for some.

Dealing with the Unexpected (Grief)

Towards the end that term, Trish wrote about a sad school event:

Subject: [no subject provided] Date: Sunday, 3 June 2007 4:54 AM
Hi Everyone. I just wanted to tell you all … our [school administrator] died recently, just over five weeks after being diagnosed with aggressive [cancer]. It was sudden although the staff were given about a days notice it would be soon. The news was passed onto the students that same day and we had grief councillors at school with us for the next three days….., we made as a class a big and beautiful tribute that we placed at the area assigned for it and we had a minute’s silence. The funeral was this past Tuesday and there were so many past and present students there ... The really weird thing is how quite the school has been. It’s actually eerie, …. It also came home to me how much of a role we have as teachers as well as being facilitators of learning experiences. I had to help soothe and calm upset children, use language that they...
could understand and do my best (following the counsellors info sheets and advice) to help the students accept and understand what had happened. Obviously that’s mainly the parents job but when they’re at school in your care and they start crying etc you have to step in and do your best. (Trish)

The email discussion site provided an important place for these beginning teachers to explore their emotions associated with distressing school events. By sharing such experiences, the participants were able to help each other. In this example, Trish showed her coping with an emotion-filled situation at school, showing a commitment to helping her students work through their grief rather than giving in to her own sense of loss. Her story demonstrated the values she held regarding her professional role, responsibilities and commitment as a teacher. At this stage of the school year she was able to use these values as a way to foreground a stronger sense of AER.

Throughout the discussion threads, Moir’s cycle aligns with the various participants’ experiences and their different levels of agency, efficacy and resiliency. At the start of their initial year of teaching (anticipation phase), these beginning teachers demonstrated hints of agency, efficacy and resiliency. After this period the teachers invoked the alibi of “they won’t let me!” as they moved into a survival phase, becoming more focused on behaviour and control in the classroom. The participants then moved into a combination of the disillusionment and rejuvenation phases during their first school term. After their first break from school, despite describing themselves as having been physically exhausted, they also expressed excitement and optimism about the second term, demonstrating increasing self-determination. While there may have been perceived threats during term one, as they became more familiar with their schooling contexts and more confident of their classroom practices throughout the school year, there was a corresponding increase in AER development. During the second school term the electronic conversations showed that these beginning teachers became increasingly less self-absorbed and more focused on external issues, such as relationships with other staff and parents. The participants’ emails suggested that they were coping mostly effectively, although to differing degrees, when dealing with “others”, demonstrating stronger resiliency strategies, and feelings of growing agency and efficacy. Employing such productive strategies, the teachers were able to demonstrate in their stories that they had gained a greater sense of their perceived capability (efficacy) leading to stronger agency. In the final beginning teacher phase of reflection, the teachers unpacked some of their other emotions, such as dealing with grief, demonstrating a consolidation and strengthening of AER, both as individuals and as members of this professional discussion group.

Conclusions: Implications and Directions for the Future

In a returning cycle, resilience can be viewed as a product of developing teacher self-efficacy which, in turn, contributes towards their feelings of positive agency and their ability to intervene proactively in the classroom. Opportunities to understand and develop teacher qualities including AER need to be embedded both in teacher education programs and in beginning teacher mentoring and induction programs, thereby facilitating a less stressful entry into the profession.

Findings from this research demonstrate how a group email site provided the occasion for beginning teachers to share and support their induction into the profession. As contributing members of a safe and supportive electronic community of practice, the participants were able to recount their various stories of classroom and school encounters, venting their difficulties and frustrations while celebrating their various successes. Despite
differences in their school contexts, their shared stories enabled them to realise that they were not alone and exposed in the hothouse. Through their resonating stories they sympathised with each other’s situations and empathised with each other’s feelings. Their stories co-constructed versions of what it is like to be a beginning teacher, and ways of managing their challenging experiences. Their stories further confirmed and consolidated their mutual understandings of the need for AER, particularly during initial practice. Within and through their mutually supportive communications, the participants demonstrated that they were able to use personal agency to address some of the challenges they were experiencing. This further developed their feelings of self-efficacy, consolidating their resilience without fear of appearing weak or merit ing official retribution.

Narrative inquiry highlighted these beginning teachers’ voices, and the sixteen beginning teacher-participants were heard, in their own word, as becoming increasingly self-determined throughout their initial year as teachers. Narrative analysis revealed that the email group members had participated in a shared journey through their first year of teaching, in keeping with Moir’s (1999) five phases of development. This and previous research shows the need to reduce the culture shock and protect new teachers commencing their professional careers. As here, peer-based support mechanisms help novice teachers to foreground their improved understandings of agency and self-efficacy as aids to promoting their resiliency (AER). These three qualities are central constituents of a developing sense of self-determination or individuation. Similar electronic discussion groups, such as the one that is the focus of this paper, could be usefully embedded within both teacher education and other beginning teacher mentoring programs. The current study has demonstrated that this model provided effective support for this particular group of pre-service and novice teachers during the first year of teaching. The development of improved levels of AER would help further safeguard novice teachers against being overwhelmed by the daily pressures of hothouse intensification. Greater self-determination and autonomy might also help reduce current high rates of teacher attrition, particularly during the early stages of their careers.

References


Vol 37, 8, August 2012 64


